Contemplative Leadership Formation

Pam Bush

Submitted to the faculty of Western Theological Seminary
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree Doctor of Ministry

Holland, Michigan
2017
WESTERN THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

HOLLAND, MI

D.MIN. PROJECT

Title of Project: Contemplative Leadership Formation

Author: PAMELA JOY BUSH

Project Committee:

_______________________________  ______________________
Kyle Small, Advisor  Date

_______________________________  ______________________
Duane Loynes, DMin Director  Date

Internal Reader: Tom Boogaart

External Reader: Ann McKnight
Abstract

Global instability, national turmoil, and ecclesial ambivalence mark our current day. What is the church to do? This project emerges as more germane than I ever imagined, proposing the answer to that question as, “Contemplation.” The project begins broadly with the questions, “What is contemplation?” and “Why might contemplation be crucial for Christ-followers?” Contemplation is prayer, presence, and a carriage into loving connection with God, others, and self with whole heart, mind, soul, and body. Having assessed that contemplation is crucial, the project explores, “What does deliberate contemplation imply for the formation of ministry leaders?” a question particularly relevant to my seminary context. The work narrows to a proposed strategy for contemplative leadership development: a four day formation retreat for first year Master of Divinity students, with enneagram content and contemplative framing. Next, research addresses the question of the effectiveness of such a strategy in forming contemplative leaders. By all accounts, the formation retreat strategy turns out to be very effective. The project concludes with a personal accounting of my own prayer journey into contemplation; a journey which has shaped the quality of my relationship with God, the course of my vocation, and the characteristics of my leadership. I firmly believe that if the church becomes ever more present to Christ in every moment, then she will be a transformative presence of Christ in the world.
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter One</th>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Two</td>
<td>Biblical and Theological Underpinnings of Contemplation</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defining Contemplation</td>
<td>37</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Describing Contemplation</td>
<td>39</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crucial Nature of Contemplation</td>
<td>51</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Three</td>
<td>Contemplative Leadership: A Spirituality of Leading</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defining Leadership</td>
<td>74</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contemplative Leaders</td>
<td>79</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Four</td>
<td>The Enneagram</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defining the Enneagram</td>
<td>93</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value of the Enneagram</td>
<td>96</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Five</td>
<td>A Strategy for Developing Contemplative Leadership: A Formation Retreat with Enneagram Content and Contemplative Framing</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Origin</td>
<td>105</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design</td>
<td>107</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparation</td>
<td>109</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schedules</td>
<td>121</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Components</td>
<td>126</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter Six  An Exploration of the Effect of a Formation Retreat with Enneagram Content and Contemplative Framing on Developing Contemplative Leadership

Results of the Research  156
Impressions  170
Examining the Other Side  171

Chapter Seven  Conclusion  178

Chapter Eight  Epilogue: Path into Prayer  205

Appendix A  Introductory Enneagram Presentation Prior to Retreat  234
Appendix B  Participant Manuel  237
Appendix C  Detailed Master Schedule  292
Appendix D  Session Details  297
Appendix E  Pre and Post Retreat Surveys and Reflection Assignment  354
Appendix F  Focus Groups  357
Appendix G  Informed Consent  360
Appendix H  Resources for Learning More about the Enneagram  365
Bibliography  367
Chapter One
Introduction

What’s a Blacktop?

A couple of decades ago a group of summer camp counselors in northwest Iowa piled into a car on their day off, heading for the little league game of one of their recent campers. The driver was Josh, a born and bred California boy, and the group was lost, looking for the designated small town amongst fields of soybeans and corn. At a corner gas station in another such town, Josh ventured out to ask for directions. He jumped back into the driver’s seat confidently. “OK we’re all set. I know where to go. We turn left at the next blacktop.” He enthusiastically clicked his seat belt, then turned tentatively to his passengers and asked, “What’s a blacktop?”

A couple of years ago, a large group of learners were piled into a conference center to hear Richard Rohr and Russ Hudson teach about the enneagram and grace.1 The two ennea-experts were casually seated in easy chairs on the stage. At one point, as an aside, Rohr referred to a phone call he had received from Henri Nouwen shortly before Nouwen died. Rohr said Nouwen urged him to stop everything he was doing and only teach contemplation, because Nouwen believed contemplation was the only thing that would awaken America and the church.2

Something in me knew instantly that this was true, and to this day I have not been able to shake the haunting call of that short admonition. “OK,” I mused, “I’m all set. I know what to do. The church needs contemplation.” Shortly following my confident and enthusiastic reverie, I turned tentatively to my soul and asked, “What’s contemplation?”

---


2 Ibid.
Thus began my conscious personal process of discovering contemplation. I say conscious because the Spirit had begun the work in me much earlier, unbeknownst to me. But that predestined conference day was the day I knew I must investigate; for the sake of my own soul and for the sake of our soul; the soul of the church.

**What is Contemplation?**

Thomas Merton, a twentieth century Trappist monk, who was instrumental in translating contemplation into the context of the modern era, describes contemplation this way.

Contemplation is the highest expression of man’s intellectual and spiritual life….fully awake, fully active, fully aware that it is alive. It is spiritual wonder. It is spontaneous awe at the sacredness of life, of being. It is gratitude for life, for awareness and for being…. Contemplation is always beyond our knowledge, beyond our own light, beyond systems, beyond explanations, beyond discourse, beyond dialogue, beyond our own self….contemplation reaches out to the knowledge and even to the experience of the transcendent and inexpressible God….It knows [God] as if it had been invisibly touched by [God].

Clearly, according to this description, contemplation is potent, mysterious, and magnificent. The following definition is a synthesis and distillation of my learning and experience of contemplation over the past few years.

**Definition of Contemplation**

Contemplation is a way of being which is humble, open, and present in the moment, allowing one to connect wholly with God. Humble implies not thinking of oneself more highly than one ought to think, and considering others more important than oneself. Humble means recognizing that one is created of dust. Open suggests a

---


4 Rom 12:3.

5 Phil. 2:3.
nonresistant, non-defensive heart.⁷ *Open* describes a person who is perpetually desirous of self-knowledge and malleable for transformation into Christ-likeness.⁸ *Present in the moment* connotes full, undistracted awareness.⁹ *Present in the moment* means attentiveness to what is, at any given time.¹⁰ Humility, openness, and presence allow – potentiate; create the conditions for – connection. In this definition *connecting wholly with God* means being united to Father, Son, and Holy Spirit in a bond of love,¹¹ which is undivided and includes body, heart, mind, soul, and spirit.¹²

**Genre of the Project**

Contemplation by its very nature resists solely cerebral experience and expression. Richard Rohr contends, “If you observe wise people, you see that they actually lose a certain interest in gathering more and more information, books and news, [which] can clutter what is already a clear field, open sight, and simple presence to the moment.”¹³ John Calvin, theologian and scholar, recognized the futility of using only our minds to connect with God, when he asserted, “We ought not to rack our brains about

---

⁶ For he knows how we were made; he remembers that we are dust. Psalm 103:14 (NRSV).

⁷ “A new heart I will give you, and a new spirit I will put within you; and I will remove from your body the heart of stone and give you a heart of flesh.” Ezra 36:26 (NRSV).

⁸ “…be transformed by the renewing of your minds…” Rom. 12:2 (NRSV).

⁹ Devote yourselves to prayer, keeping alert in it with thanksgiving. Col 4:2 (NRSV).

¹⁰ “…it is now the moment for you to wake from sleep.…” Rom. 13:11 (NRSV).

¹¹ …anyone united to the Lord becomes one spirit with him. 1 Cor. 6:17 (NRSV).

¹² “Oh that you would love the Lord your God with all your heart and all your being and all your strength!” Duet. 6:5 (Translation mine).

God; but rather, we should contemplate him in his works,"\textsuperscript{14} Augustine iterates, from the fifth century, the futility of trying to grasp God. "We are talking about God. What wonder is it that you do not understand? If you do understand, then it is not God."\textsuperscript{15}

Parker Palmer eloquently observes, "Inner truth is best conveyed by the language of the heart, of image and metaphor, of poetry, and it is best understood by people for whom poetry is a second language."\textsuperscript{16} Intrator and Scribner ask, in regard to the Bible, "Is it not significant that the biblical prophets and psalmists were all poets?"\textsuperscript{17} And Rohr points out that Jesus, himself, "largely communicates through parables, stories, aphorisms, and often deeply obscure riddles."\textsuperscript{18} The following Lenten invocation beautifully expresses the difficulty of talking about God:

\begin{quote}
O God of Life, eternity cannot hold you,
Nor can our little words catch the magnificence of your mercy.
Yet in the space of our small hearts, and in silence,
You can come close and repair us.\textsuperscript{19}
\end{quote}

I am tiptoeing meekly into the unfamiliar territory of contemplation with more intuition than scholarly impulses. Consequently, I have sometimes used the genres which are the most conducive to communicating what I have been experiencing and learning about contemplation, hoping to "get right to the heart of the experience so that it


\textsuperscript{15} Augustine, \textit{Sermon 52}, c.6,16,PL38,360.


\textsuperscript{17} Eugene H Peterson, \textit{The Contemplative Pastor: Returning to the Art of Spiritual Direction} (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1989), 155.

\textsuperscript{18} Rohr, \textit{The Naked Now}, 75.

\textsuperscript{19} Western Theological Seminary Lenten Liturgy 2016: Prayer of Invocation.
resonates with one's own inner knowing,” as Rohr puts it.\(^{20}\) The heart of the message comes through the genres of essay, sketch, image, and poetry. These genres were previously very much outside my usual realm of writing and analysis. So I offer them as a novice, hoping that the spirit of the expression will overcome the lack of aptitude and that eventually, poetry will become a fluent language for me. I invite the reader to move through the analytical and into a liminal space between head and heart.

**How I Got Involved**

In the months prior to entering the Doctor of Ministry program, I had several exposures that seemed to spotlight a specific new portal of learning, which I sensed I was being nudged toward. *The Courage to Teach*, a plea from Parker Palmer for authenticity and spaciousness through attention to the inner landscape of our lives, inspired in me a deep desire for genuineness in my life and faith.\(^ {21}\) Concurrently, my paradigm of healing was being challenged. I was introduced to Emotional Polarity Technique (EPT),\(^ {22}\) a healing forgiveness tool that has great potential for ushering people toward wholeness. EPT utilizes methods such as muscle testing and magnetic therapy, which are well outside the traditional medical model in which I was originally trained as a registered nurse. I also completed a home study nursing course on alternative therapies that defied my compartmentalization of body, heart, spirit, and mind.\(^ {23}\) Early on in that study, I was

\(^{20}\) Richard Rohr, Daily Meditations, October 1, 2015. Meditations@cac.org.


\(^{22}\) Emotional Polarity Technique (EPT) is a natural holistic healing method that addresses the emotional aspect of health and disease and defuses the pathological physiology that accompanies negative emotional patterns. EPTworks, Accessed February 8, 2017, http://www.eptworks.com/.

struck by a phrase that resonated with my growing recognition of the necessity of experiencing God with all we are: “Healing is the process of becoming whole, including mind, body, and spirit.” I finally recognized that since God created us as whole integrated beings, we cannot ignore the mind, heart, spirit, or soul when we try to heal the body. In fact it is a Western myth that we can separate them at all. We cannot disregard the unity of body, emotions, psyche, or senses when we approach spiritual healing.

This holistic perspective was being deeply reinforced as I engaged the Hebrew language, which lays a firm foundation for non-compartmentalization. Through Richard Rohr I encountered the enneagram, which seemed to offer a peculiar back door into contemplation, via self-awareness and repentance. Rohr also made a stunningly coherent diagnosis of why the church has lost much of her relevance and transformative power. His description of the false-self put such a striking spin on sin that I sensed my eyes being opened and the condition of the church coming into focus. Finally, I engaged Mark Yaconelli’s book, Contemplative Youth Ministry, which made it actually seem possible for leadership to grow from a center of contemplation. These experiences –and especially the layering of them - were life altering and led straight to the focus of this project. I have no doubt they were orchestrated.

24 Ibid., 4.
26 Mark Yaconelli, Contemplative Youth Ministry: Practicing the Presence of Jesus (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2006).
The initial questions animating this Doctor of Ministry project were the actual questions born out of the experience of my encounter with Rohr and the enneagram:

- What is contemplation?
- Why is contemplation crucial to the flourishing of the church?²⁷
- How can I experience contemplation?

In the evolution of these questions in my own soul, many experiences congealed to open my mind and heart to a vastly different way of being than I had previously considered. The following series of poems attempts to capture that opening and its significance for this project.

²⁷ By flourishing I mean living well into the restoration of all creation, which God is bringing and will fully bring to completion. By church I mean the universal body of Christ-followers.
Wonder Weekend

An enneagram conference with Richard Rohr
As soon as we saw it, we knew we would go
   Intuition
   Spirit
The conference – really good
The experience – incredible

We stay with a ministry friend, Andrea
She and her housemate both practitioners of ‘EPT’
We are intrigued
   Memories stored in the body
   Magnetic adjustment of energy
   Miraculous healing forgiveness
Out of my comfort zone
Out of my medical model formation
Out of my realm of experience

At the conference the next day
Singing bowls
   Soothing
   Summoning
   Strange
Quiet Meditation
One mystical moment,
In which I see the Light
As sparkles
   Connecting all of time and space
   Connecting everyone to everyone
   Connecting everything to the Spirit
A light that cannot be overcome!
No matter what!
Praise to you o Christ, the Light of the world!

Dinner with Andrea
Honest talk
I admit that I have issues with power
That my counselor instructed me to ponder why
   I didn’t plan to be ordained
   I pretend I don’t have power
   I am habitually leery of power
Andrea volunteers to do EPT
I am open
She pinpoints my age at the time of a formational incident
I know immediately what she is detecting
Even though I haven’t thought of it in forty-some years
A time when I gave up my power
And let others use theirs unbecomingly
Two neighborhood boys
She leads me through forgiveness statements
That’s it

Is forgiveness really this easy?
   She tells me what to say and I do?
   And that’s it?
   All taken care of?

I let it go
The analysis, doubt, and reasoning
I will let the Spirit do as the Spirit wishes
Ca’asher chaphatsah’ asitah
I go to bed

A night of restless dreaming
Nightmare, really
Jr. High days and Jr High students
I am new in school
And outside, up the hill
EVIL
   Ominous
   Hideous
   Terrifying
I perceive it, but no one listens
They keep moving us towards it, thinking it is docile
“Listen! This is not safe!”
I am attacked
   And alone
I will die if no one comes
Someone does
   Two dream boys
   Perhaps the two from my real childhood neighborhood
They save me
But one of them dies in the process

I wake in a sweat
   Paralyzed with dread
What have I done?
Is EPT the adult equivalent of the childhood Ouija board?

Have I opened my soul to evil?
Is EPT ‘of the devil?’

In the light of day, my panic dissipates
I entertain a question
Can true forgiveness ever be evil?
I cannot imagine so

I sense that the evil in my dream was coming from the church
  There IS an evil use of power
  I am wise to be leery
But not all power is evil
I must discern!

Back to the conference
At one point, Richard explains
There is a ceiling above which thinking cannot take us
Above that ceiling are things like
  Life
  Love
  Death
  Eternity
  God
It is the domain of non-dualism
  The domain of unity
  The domain of pure compassion
One might say, the kingdom of God

Then Richard imparts the anecdote I cannot shake
Before he died, Henri Nouwen called and pleaded,
  “Stop everything else you are doing and only teach contemplation
It is the only thing that will awaken the church
  And the nation”

Contemplation lodges in my brain
  Even though I really have no idea what contemplation actually is

We return home
A great experience we say
But forcing us to reconsider a plethora of old assumptions
  How does God heal?
  Who are we?
  What is faith?
  How is the universe constituted?

I go back to campus
The leaves outside my office window are brilliant red
   The leaves are God’s love
   The leaves are overwhelming
I feel freed up to say what needs to be said, when it needs to be said
   I say it
   I am still saying it
I am filled with compassion for a colleague who doubts me
   The compassion is effortless
   The compassion is supernatural
I have an intuition to lead a struggling student through statements of forgiveness
   I do it
   She is released from her anxiety

I am a different leader now
I accept (sometimes) that I have an incredible amount of power
   With many people
   In many spheres
And it’s okay

I am a different pastor now
I accept that God wants to heal
   Through many channels, familiar and strange
   Through many people, remarkable and ordinary
And it’s okay

I am a different Christ-follower now
I accept that the Spirit is present
   In all the spaces of the universe
   In all the ways everything connects
And it’s fantastic!

I can connect with God through my soul
The Hermitage

I ponder the experience of the wonder weekend
I want to exist in the space above the ceiling
Where love and beauty and eternity live
I don’t know how
I intuit that I cannot make it happen
It is something that can only happen to me

But it is more open to me now.
   The God space
   The Light space
Before, I had seen it as though through pin pricks in the ceiling
Now, I had seen it as though through pencil holes
The image congeals
   The pin holes
   The pencil hole

Contemplation lodges in my soul
   Even though I didn’t see it coming

The middle of the night
I am being summoned
   From my restful slumber
   From my snug bed
   From my cozy hermitage dwelling place
I respond
   (After some resistant inner dialogue)
I stroll up the grassy knoll
The brightness is astonishing
I glance up to crystal clear heavens
And I see it across the black canopy of the night
   The stars – pin holes of sparkling Light
   The moon – a pencil hole of Glory
Hashamayim mesprim hakevod El

I can connect with God through my senses

29 The heavens are narrating the glory of God (Psalm 19:1).
The phone call
    All is not well
    We should go

A stroke
    Not responsive
    Wait and see

He knew
    Grasped my hand
    Pleased with his eyes

The nurse calls
    Struggling to breathe
    I don’t want him to die alone

A sacred conference
    We want to let him go
    We don’t want to let him go

We know what he wants
    He loved his life
    He wants to be whole

The blessing of Ben
    Reading Scriptures
    Grampa’s favorites

Ben at his best
    At watch in the night
    Spiritually sensitive

Sacred Care
    Ben stays connected
    Like no one else can

New information
    A whole shower of strokes
    And some old ones

No improvement
    Or much hope of any
    Time to lock a decision
Move to Hospice
    We can do this
        It’s not terrifying

A sacred world
    Everyone tender here
        Everyone respected here

Helping people die gently
    Not scrapping for life
        All are welcome

We start the vigil
    Every single person comes
        It is where we want to be

How will we accompany him?
    With what it is in us to do
        With what he loves the most

Antics and anecdotes
    Laughing and loving
        Puzzles and puns and pictures

Sendoff words
    We say what we want to say
        We say what we need to say

Sacred waiting
    It is a balm to our souls
        It is a bond extraordinaire

Gratitude
    Gratitude
        Gratitude

Critical moment
    Cheyne – Stokes
        Fading pressure

Sacred concert
    Singing his favorites
        We sound good
Four part harmony
  We learned it from him
  We hear him in our souls

Farewell precious father
  We release you in peace
  We release you to joy
But wait!
Rising pressure
Pinker color
Steady breathing

He is rallying to the music
He is responding to the love
O Henry!

Sacred night
Sleeping father
Quiet soul

Silent snowfall
Stunning moon shine
Intense awareness

Must we all leave this God-splendor?
The physical grandeur you invent?
Yes, and

It is a pale depiction of the actual
It becomes MORE beautiful
It becomes more REAL

Around the bedside
Chatting and comfortable
“Pam, look”

Sacred moment
The final breath
Tranquil and easy

The Spirit is THICK
And we are IN it.
And it is IN us.

And the dust returns to the ground it came from
And the spirit returns to God who gave it

Gratitude
Gratitude
Gratitude
I can connect with God through death
Contemplation lodges in my being

30 Ecc. 12:7 (NIV).
Body Work

“What is your stomach trying to say to you?”
I have no idea!
I have no idea what my stomach is saying
It doesn’t talk
Are you kidding?
I have no idea what is going on in my body

The awkward affair begins
Dragging my awareness
Kicking and screaming
From my head to my body
Necessity is making its claim
The only way I will agree to it

At the utter end of my personal resources
Exhausted
Grasping twigs to keep from going over the edge
The cliff’s edge overhanging despair
Enmeshed with the pain and struggle of a beloved son
Trying everything I know to do
Everything I’ve researched
Everything I’ve designed

“She’s making me swim,” I complain to my people
Exercising my body is fine
While simultaneously stoking my mind with books
But books and swimming don’t merge well
She suggests meditation
The quiet of underwater gradually becomes a refuge
Laps become respite
Water becomes Spirit’s womb
Hebrew phrases become life

Contemplation finds my body through water
All this he did for you, little one,
Though you know nothing of it as yet

Then yoga
Tadasana
Mountain pose
Firm Foundation
Surya Namaskara

---

Sun salutation
Meeting Light
Shavasana
    Relaxation, finally
    Body melds into earth
Roll upon the Lord your path\textsuperscript{32}
    Upon the Ground
    Upon the Substance
Here is the Lord!

Thanks be to God who has rescued me from the pit\textsuperscript{33}
I can connect with God through my body

\textsuperscript{32} Psalm 37:5 (Translation mine).
\textsuperscript{33} Psalm 40:2.
Theological Impulses and Assumptions

I acknowledge from the outset that I bring theological biases into this project. I operate out of a lifetime of formation in Reformed contexts. I believe in humankind’s utter contingency upon God, God’s irresistible love for all creation—most blatantly manifest in Jesus as Savior, and the eventual righting of the universe by the triune God. By believe I do not mean that I merely assent to a set of truths. Rather, I intend believe to indicate what I give my life to, what I depend upon, and what defines me. I believe that God desires to be known and thus self-reveals in the written word, Scripture; the Incarnate Word, Jesus, the Christ; and the material word, creation. I believe the Word—Scripture—is, like Jesus, human and divine; written by people in concert with the influence of the Spirit. I believe the Word—Jesus—is God in the flesh, the first fruits of what it means to be fully human. I believe the word—creation—is infused with the glory of God and sustained by the breath of God.

And I believe that God desires to be in connection with humankind, to love and be loved by us and to heal and restore us. I also operate under the assumptions that the Bible is living and active, and that the Spirit continues to reveal God in our day. I have an unquenchable hope—despite all evidence to the contrary—that eventually all things will come ‘round to how God intends them; to peace, wholeness, reconciliation, beauty, and love.

I attempt to hold what I know, and especially what I say, lightly. Thomas Aquinas asserts, “He knows God best who owns that whatever he thinks and says falls short of what God really is.”34 Therefore, I proceed faltering into unfamiliar territory, to meet

34 Thomas Gilby, St Thomas Aquinas Philosophical Texts (London: Oxford University Press, 1952), 89.
an unfathomable Presence, following the lead of John Calvin, “The Christian religion asks us to place our trust not in ideas, and certainly not in ideologies, but in a God who was vulnerable enough to become human and die.”\textsuperscript{35} I assume anything I think or write will be inadequate in communicating the fullness of the glory and love of God, which contemplation enables us to glimpse.

**What I mean by God**

The necessity of clarifying what I mean by *God* has surfaced on occasion throughout the evolution of this project so I wish to clarify it at the outset. In referring to *God*, I mean *The Triune God of Grace; Father, Son and Holy Spirit*. The same definition applies to other words referencing God, such as *Source, Divine*, and *Ground*. The Trinity is clearly in view in every such reference.

**Purpose and Significance of this Project**

The purposes of this project flow from general to specific. Initially, I encounter the original project questions\textsuperscript{36} by exploring a broad sweep of Christian contemplation and contemplative leadership development. Then I consider the enneagram as a possible entry point for contemplation that influences leadership development. Finally, I hone in on a specific strategy for taking contemplation and the formative value of the enneagram definitively into the lives of seminary students. The research evaluates the effectiveness of such an experience toward potentiating contemplative leadership.


\textsuperscript{36} What is contemplation? Why is contemplation crucial to the flourishing of the church? How can I experience contemplation?
The significance of this project is multi-layered. First, I am learning to connect more fully with God via contemplative practices, desiring to live and lead out of my true God-created self. Second, I am hoping that both an overall environment and a variety of specific opportunities are being created for seminary students to do the same. Ideally, this will then result in more humble, open, present, connected leadership in the church. Third, I also long for these students-turning-leaders to help people in their ministry contexts connect more fully with God and live and lead out of their true selves. These are lofty goals, and I realize they can be reached only in small measure. But if even a few students become more able to live and lead out of their true selves via connection to God, the project will have been worth it.

**Context and Role**

The context for this project is Western Theological Seminary (WTS). WTS is a medium-sized, theologically Reformed, evangelical seminary in Western Michigan. WTS is a denominational seminary of the Reformed Church in America, with approximately three hundred students. WTS has in-residence and distance learning programs for Masters of Divinity, Masters of Theology, Master of Arts, and Doctor of Ministry degrees.

---

37 “In solitude we stop believing our own press. We discover that we are not as good as we thought but we are also more than we thought.” Ruth Haley Barton, *Strengthening the Soul of Your Leadership: Seeking God in the Crucible of Ministry* (Downers Grove: IVP Books, 2008), 51.

38 “It is impossible to overstate how dangerous we become as leaders if we are not routinely inviting God to search us and know us and lead us in a new way.” Ibid., 127.


as well as certificates in urban ministry and disability ministry. Some of the distinctive features of the seminary include vibrant liturgical worship, residential incorporation of young adults with disabilities, and a formational Hebrew program which utilizes interactive method, memorization, and collaboration.

Western Theological Seminary is committed to seven curricular values, as stated on the website, which shape identity, world view, and life together:

Reformed – We are committed to a generously Reformed theological identity and seek to shape our students in this tradition.
Biblical – We are committed to a curriculum that is soaked in Scripture. We believe that Scripture is not an “object” to be analyzed, but a living document that transforms us.
Theological – Connected with the two values above, we believe that our curriculum is thoroughly theological. We do not perpetuate the division and silos of traditional fields. Rather, we seek deep integration of biblical courses, ministry courses, and theology courses.
Sacramental – We celebrate the Lord’s Supper each Friday and remember our baptisms each day in the worship life of our school, which fundamentally shapes our identity and ethos.
Missional – The church is called to participate in God’s mission in the world. We are committed to building a curriculum that explores that central theme of the Christian faith.
Formational – We do not simply “deliver” a degree program. We are called to form students into deeper, wiser, more pastorally aware, more skilled practitioners of ministry practices, and more committed disciples of Jesus.
Contextual – Theology and ministry always happens in a particular time and a particular place with a particular people. We help our students see the thoroughly contextual nature of theology, Scripture, church, and their own selves.\(^\text{41}\)

Contemplation has not been a primary focus at Western Theological Seminary historically, though contemplative considerations have been making inroads at WTS for the past several years. The context presents a trio of challenges. First, the highly intellectual nature of the academy downplays the integration of heart and body in faith formation. Second, rigorous curricular requirements mitigate against students embracing

silence, solitude, presence practices, or anything else that can easily be judged as nonproductive. Third, the majority of WTS students come, as I did, from a background largely devoid of contemplative impulses and students are often skeptical about practices that don’t fit their usual faith paradigms.

My multiple roles at the seminary, however, involve some of the most formational arenas of the seminary. I have contact with students via student care, which includes pastoral care, vocational and theological discernment, and spiritual direction. I am part of the Formation for Ministry team, which affords me an avenue for speaking into significant formation questions and the creation of formational opportunities. I am also part of the Hebrew teaching team, which is profoundly dedicated to providing an experience for students to encounter God in whole-bodied and heart-conscious ways. As a result of my various roles, I have had the privilege of introducing and supporting practices and experiences that can be doorways to the formation of more open-hearted, self-aware leaders.

**Limits of the Project**

I limited this project to contemplation from an expressly Christian perspective. I am confident that contemplative practices emerging from other realms—especially the East—not claiming to be specifically Christian, offer much of value toward a broader grasp of this topic. However, my context, not being widely versed in contemplation, is currently most amenable to explicitly Christian understandings and practices, and I have mostly confined my study to that arena for now.

Exhaustive consideration of leadership definitions and paradigms is also beyond the scope of this project. However, the leadership connection of this project is embedded
in the fact that the seminary context is primarily about forming ministry leaders. This reality is reflected in the mission statement: “the purpose of Western Theological Seminary is to prepare Christians called by God to lead the church in mission.”\textsuperscript{42} The operating principle in this project is a conviction that what forms a person spiritually will have an inevitable impact on their leadership, for better or worse. I contend that leadership flows by default out of who and what a person is and is becoming. Thus this project focuses on \textit{contemplative} leadership, which will be defined in upcoming chapters.

The research for this project comprises a narrow stripe of contemplative leadership experience, namely, a formation retreat for first year M. Div. students utilizing enneagram content within a contemplative framework. The connection between the enneagram and contemplation for leadership development may not be immediately obvious. The project will elucidate the link.

\textbf{Method and Framework}

I am using Richard Osmer’s model for practical theology as a framework for this project.\textsuperscript{43} Osmer’s methodology is particularly fitting for consideration of contemplation in the seminary context because Osmer considers leadership in Christian contexts as “inherently a spiritual matter.”\textsuperscript{44} He defines spirituality as having “openness to the guidance of the Holy Spirit as she forms and transforms … toward the image of Christ.”\textsuperscript{45}

\textsuperscript{42} Western Theological Seminary, Mission and Vision, Accessed Feb 19, 2017, \url{http://www.westernsem.edu/about/mission-vision/}


\textsuperscript{44} Ibid., 27.

\textsuperscript{45} Ibid.
For this project the practical theology tasks are ordered as follows; normative, interpretive, pragmatic, and empirical-descriptive.

Chapter Two begins the normative task, which Osmer describes as addressing, from a theological perspective, the question, “What ought to be happening?”46 In this case, the questions can be framed as, “Should contemplation (prayer/presence) be happening among Christ-followers?” and “Why?” Chapter Two presents biblical and theological consideration of those questions. Abraham Joshua Heschel and Father Richard Rohr provide impetus, which seems appropriate given that Osmer labels the normative task as “prophetic discernment.”47 Chapter Two defines and then describes contemplation. It offers a resounding “Yes!” to the question of whether contemplation should be happening among Christ-followers.

Chapter Three continues the normative task by asking the question, “What does the assertion that contemplation should be happening among Christ-followers imply for ministry leadership?” Parker Palmer and Henry Nouwen afford valuable insights on leadership formation, leading to the conclusion that contemplative leadership is normative for Christ-following communities. Chapter Three defines ministry leadership and then describes what contemplative leadership looks like.

Chapter Four moves to the interpretive task and attempts to discover what Osmer calls “sagely wisdom” from the arts and sciences.48 It broaches one possible answer to the question, “Now can contemplative leadership be developed?” Chapter Four explores

46 Ibid., 4.
47 Ibid., 129.
48 Ibid., 81.
the usefulness of the wisdom of the enneagram in training for contemplative leadership. Russ Hudson and Don Riso, founders of the Enneagram Institute, contribute to the explanation of the enneagram. The chapter defines the Enneagram, including a brief history, and then explores the value of the enneagram, including biblical and theological interpretation. Chapter Four, in the end, discovers the enneagram to be a viable means for developing contemplative leadership.

Chapter Five moves to the pragmatic task of Osmer’s model, which he labels as “servant leadership.” The pragmatic task seeks an applied strategy toward the implications of the normative task. Osmer defines the pragmatic task as “determining strategies of action that will influence situations in ways that are desirable” and then “entering into a reflective conversation” as they are employed. Chapter Five contains a description of the development and implementation of a four day formation retreat for first year seminary students, utilizing the enneagram as content and contemplation as a frame. It also taps back into the interpretive task by employing sagely pedagogical wisdom from various educational experts including bell hooks and Steven Brookfield.

Chapter Six unfolds the descriptive-empirical task, described by Osmer as “gathering information that helps us discern patterns and dynamics in particular... contexts.” Chapter Six reveals the results of research on the impact of the formation retreat on student’s leadership formation. “The descriptive-empirical task asks us to attend to others, in the presence of God, with openness and prayerfulness.”

49 Ibid., 175.
50 Ibid., 4.
51 Ibid.
52 Ibid., 34.
names this attention as “priestly listening.”\textsuperscript{53} Chapter Six is a summation of priestly listening to the experiences of students who have been exposed, by curricular requirement, to an experience largely outside their usual faith paradigms. The chapter seeks to answer the question, “Does the strategy of a formation retreat with enneagram content and contemplative rhythms foster contemplative ministry leadership?” Chapter Six defines the research, reports the results, and offers some impressions.

Chapter Seven rewinds Osmer’s practical theology model, incrementally bringing the project back to the broader focus of the significance of contemplation in Christ-following. The chapter then offers a series of seminary specific suggestions gleaned from the work. Chapter Seven concludes with questions that were raised while engaging the project. It is the conclusion of the practical theology method.

Chapter Eight offers a glimpse of my own personal path of contemplation over the years of this project. It veers back to the contemplative genres. The chapter contributes my specific experience of the journey into prayer, in order to personalize the theoretical and empirical assertions of the project. Chapter Eight is an offering of my heart and soul.

\textbf{Defining the Research}

The researcher explores qualitative questions using intensive qualitative research that, in Osmer’s words, “seeks to understand the actions and practices in which individuals and groups engage everyday life and the meanings they ascribe to their experience.”\textsuperscript{54} Osmer defines \textit{intensive research} as research “in which the field being

\textsuperscript{53} Ibid., 35.

\textsuperscript{54} Ibid., 49.
investigated is very narrow but is studied in great depth.” An intensive qualitative approach is fitting for exploration into the formative value of a particular strategy with a defined group of WTS students.

The research participants included sixty-four Western Theological Seminary in-residence M.Div. students. The group includes students who vary in age, gender, race, ethnicity, and life experience. The participants are those who took a required January term course, either in 2015 or 2016, which originated from the formation for ministry office at WTS.

The mandatory nature of the retreat experience raised questions about voluntary participation in the research. The course is necessary for graduation and some of the data sources are a required part of the course. Thus, participation was not voluntary in regard to providing some of the sources of data. But participation was voluntary with regard to allowing individual data to be utilized for the research. For both groups, 2015 and 2106, it was clearly explained to students that the information they provided was being utilized as research data for this project. I was willing to remove the contributions of anyone who objected. However, none of the participants registered objection to the inclusion of their individual data.

It is also feasible that the mandatory nature of the retreat experience may have affected the level of engagement students were willing to bring to the experience thereby affecting the data. I was aware of this dynamic and, as a matter of pedagogical practice, I did my best to present the various aspects of the experience in an invitational, non-threatening way. I incorporated activities for multiple learning styles, with an eye toward

55 Ibid., 50.
interaction and engagement. I made every effort to frame the experience in vocabulary and theology that would mitigate resistance as much as possible. However, due to the nature of the topic, it was impossible to eliminate all resistance, since self-awareness work inevitably creates internal discomfort.56

I utilized interview type methods of inquiry for the research, including multiple interviewing tools for data collection as displayed in the table below.

56 “We fear encounters in which the other is free to be itself, to speak its own truth, to tell us what we may not wish to hear. We want those encounters on our own terms, so that we can control their outcomes, so that they will not threaten our view of world and self.” Parker Palmer, The Courage to Teach: Exploring the Inner Landscape of a Teacher’s Life (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1998), 37.
### Table 6.1. Research Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data Collected</th>
<th>Data Source</th>
<th>When Collected</th>
<th>Used Formally for Research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-retreat Survey</td>
<td>2015 Participants</td>
<td>During the Month Before the Retreat</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-retreat Survey</td>
<td>2016 Participants</td>
<td>On the Way to Retreat</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical Incident Reports</td>
<td>2015 and 2016 Participants</td>
<td>During Retreat</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes During Sessions</td>
<td>2015 and 2016 Participants</td>
<td>During Retreat</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Observations</td>
<td>2015 and 2016 Participants</td>
<td>During Retreat</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retreat Evaluation</td>
<td>2015 and 2016 Participants</td>
<td>End of Retreat</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-retreat Survey</td>
<td>2015 Participants</td>
<td>After Retreat</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-retreat Survey</td>
<td>2016 Participants</td>
<td>End of Retreat</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflection Papers</td>
<td>2016 Participants</td>
<td>One Week After Retreat</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FR 122 Discussion Notes</td>
<td>2015 Participants</td>
<td>February, 2015</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MN 105 Discussion Notes</td>
<td>2015 Participants</td>
<td>March, 2015</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus Group Discussions</td>
<td>2015 Participants</td>
<td>November, 2015</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Before the retreat, participants completed a pre-retreat survey. During the retreat, Critical Incident Questionnaires (CIQs) were completed at the end of each day. At each session, members of the formation staff took notes on pertinent contributions made by students. I also made personal observation notes at the end of each day. At the end of the retreat, participants completed an evaluation questionnaire. Students filled out a post-

---

57 Stephen D. Brookfield, *Becoming a Critically Reflective Teacher* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1995). CIQs ask five questions, which help to gauge the experience and level of engagement of the participants.
retreat survey that largely paralleled the pre-retreat survey, with 2015 participants completing the survey in the week following the retreat and 2016 participants completing the survey during the last session of the retreat. 2016 retreat participants also wrote reflection papers approximately a week after returning home from the retreat. Further follow-up data was gathered via large group reflection in two classroom forums after the 2015 retreat. A one month follow-up took place in early February, during FR 122, Exploring Ministry. A two and a half month follow-up occurred around the end of March, during MN105, Pastor as Person.\textsuperscript{58} Finally, I held three focus group interviews ten months after the 2015 retreat, at which retreat participants had opportunity to \textsuperscript{59}reflect on the effects of the learning on their lives and ministries.

Not all of the data gathered was formally utilized in the reporting. However, all the data tools are mentioned because they have undoubtedly affected my interpretation of the formal data. Three versions of data sources were formally included in the reporting for this project: pre- and post-retreat surveys, reflection papers, and focus groups.\textsuperscript{60} The pre- and post-retreat surveys were conducted on-line utilizing SurveyMonkey for the 2015 retreat,\textsuperscript{61} and were hand written for the 2016 retreat. The 2016 group submitted reflection papers online via Instructure Canvas, the WTS educational network. The three focus group interviews took place in November 2015 and involved three or four student participants.

\textsuperscript{58} MN 105, Pastor as Person, is a required course in the Christian Ministries Field, which addresses personal wholeness.

\textsuperscript{59} Instructure Canvas is the WTS educational network.

\textsuperscript{60} See Appendix E for the pre and post-retreat survey and reflection paper assignment.

volunteers per group. Consent forms were signed and the groups were audio recorded and later transcribed by an outside transcriptionist.

Due to the very personal nature of the self-discovery resulting from participants engaging the retreat experience, videotaping and audio recording were not utilized during the retreat because of the likelihood of compromising the effectiveness of the experience for the participants. Although the enneagram retreat served the purposes of this doctoral project, my first priority was that students would have a fruitful encounter with God, others, and self. Creating a conducive space for self-discovery and sharing was of utmost importance.

The formally utilized data was organized and analyzed with the help of a student research assistant, Jenna Harms. Jenna has a bachelor’s degree in social work and experience in three major research projects during her undergraduate work, two of which involved qualitative research. Only Jenna and I have had access to the data used formally in the study. The fact that Jenna was a participant in the 2015 retreat experience had originally raised some ethical considerations since data was gathered from her and her classmates. For the sake of anonymity, I concealed the names of the participants on most of the data, before Jenna received it. Jenna is in full agreement and understanding about the necessity of confidentiality within the research framework, having dealt with confidentiality concerns in her previous research projects.

The findings have also been reported with protection of confidentiality as a significant consideration. Actual names and identifying information have not been

---

62 A See Appendix F for invitation and agenda for focus groups.

63 See Appendix G for informed consent forms.
included. Even so, because of the intimate nature of the community at Western Theological Seminary and the small number of participants, complete anonymity could not be guaranteed.

Another significant consideration of this research was the power differential that existed between researcher and participant. I was the teacher of the content and the leader of the retreat, and the participants were students. I had control of the grading for the course. This could tempt students to hold back in their reflective and evaluative input, for fear of ramifications. In response to this dynamic and especially for pedagogical purposes, I agreed to assign a passing grade when students attended the retreat and engaged fully in the process. In that way, the fear of grade reduction would not affect the data nor would grade anxiety cause barriers to learning. I also reassured students that their sharing and reflections would not become part of the seminary files used to determine fitness for ministry or for other evaluative purposes.

Guided by the project questions, Jenna and I read and reviewed the data for common themes and categories. We coded these by hand individually and then discussed them with one another to check for accuracy. Since the primary questions of this research project revolve around the capacity of students to connect with God, others, and self, those became the broad etic categories for reporting. The titles of the broad categories are lifted from Jesus’ summary of the Torah, “You shall love the LORD your God with all your heart, and with all your soul, and with all your mind. This is the great and foremost commandment. The second is like it, you shall love your neighbor as yourself.”64 The sub-categories, however, arose largely from the data itself. Even so, etic

coding titles were frequently superimposed, in order to capture the meaning suggested by varying expressions.
Chapter Two
Biblical and Theological Underpinnings of Contemplation

Introduction

How ought contemplation shape Christ followers? This Chapter explores the biblical and theological underpinnings of contemplation. Osmer enumerates three spiritual dimensions of the normative task. The first is sympathy; “human participation in God’s pathos.”¹ Second is discernment; “the activity of seeking God’s guidance….to weight the words of the prophets, to test the spirits and to make decisions…..”² Third is theological and ethical reflection.³ This chapter blends all three spiritual dimensions.

Contemplation is a mysterious engagement which defies explanation, as does the God contemplation discloses. Rohr offers an earnest assertion about speaking of God:

When we speak of God and things transcendent, all we can do is use metaphors and pointers. No language is adequate to describe the holy…..We must place a hushing finger over our lips to remind ourselves that God is finally unspeakable and ineffable.”⁴

Many authors have endeavored to assign language, inadequate though it may be, to contemplation. Thomas Merton chooses the word gift to explain contemplation, from two perspectives. He says contemplation is a gift of God “in which the soul, purified by [God’s] infused love, suddenly and inexplicable experiences the presence of God within itself”⁵ Merton asserts that Contemplation is “produced through the grace of an intimate


² Ibid., 137.

³ Ibid., 139.


⁵ Thomas Merton, Bread in the Wilderness (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1993), 143.
union with Christ”\(^6\) and always “a work produced in us by the Holy Spirit….”\(^7\) Merton also describes contemplation as a gift of ourselves to God.\(^8\) Teresa of Avila speaks of the prayer of quiet,\(^9\) which she describes as a fountain whose source is God and whose water we cannot be produce; “it is given only to whom God wills to give it and often when the soul is not thinking of it at all.”\(^10\) Peter Toon defines contemplation as “– gazing upon, beholding, experiencing, and seeing by faith God through Jesus Christ.”\(^11\) Thomas Keating explains contemplation as prayer in the Spirit:

*Prayer in the Spirit* [is] that prayer in which the inspiration of the Spirit is given directly to our spirit without the intermediary of our own reflections or acts of will. In other words, the Spirit prays in us and we consent.

Mother Theresa of Calcutta encourages a simple understanding of contemplation, “We complicate prayer as we complicate many things. It is to love Jesus with undivided love—for you, for me, for all of us.”\(^12\)

Metaphor

Metaphorical language befits contemplation for multiple reasons. First language about God is precarious.\(^13\) Certitude and authority with regard to God lends to the

---

\(^6\) Ibid., 143.

\(^7\) Ibid., 56.

\(^8\) Ibid., 64.

\(^9\) “The prayer of quiet is a supernatural state that cannot be obtained simply by our trying hard to reach it. It is a state when the soul enters into peace, being offered the gift of peace through God’s presence. Without being aware of it in the senses, the soul realizes that it is now very close to God, and if it were just a little closer it would become one through union.” Elizabeth Ruth Obbard, *Teresa of Avila's Way of Perfection-- for Everyone* (Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, ©2007), 48.


\(^12\) Teresa, *Words to Love By* (Notre Dame, Ind.: Ave Maria Press, 1983), 46.
impression that God can be captured, contained, and controlled. It is garish and arrogant.\textsuperscript{14} Metaphor speaks of God the way Moses encountered God at Sinai. God’s hand covered Moses in the cleft of the rock as God passed by.\textsuperscript{15} God is too potently glorious to see full on or to speak of directly.\textsuperscript{16} Like an eclipse of the sun, if we look directly, we actually see nothing, but are blinded by the brightness. Yet if we use a simple elementary science class contraption of white paper with a pinhole, we can catch a glimpse of something magnificent. Metaphorical language is the contraption. Second, metaphor opens meaning by nudging us back toward a symbolic and sacred world view, in which words and the Word have multiple layers of meaning and multiple connections.\textsuperscript{17} Metaphors point to truth that is both connected to and beyond the words themselves. They prick the imagination and open the heart.

**Defining Contemplation**

Contemplation is a way of being which is humble, open, and present to the moment, allowing one to connect wholly with God. *Contemplation* is another word for *prayer*. However, the word *prayer* is not prioritized in this project because in much of our

\textsuperscript{13} Metaphorical language here implies language that uses association and allusion, symbolism and suggestion, and poetry and parable to convey meaning.


\textsuperscript{15} Exod. 33.

\textsuperscript{16} “You cannot see my face; for no one shall see me and live.” Exod 33:20 (NRSV).

\textsuperscript{17} Sallie McFague explains that, “a symbolic sensibility…sees multilayered realities, with the literal level suggestive of meanings beyond itself….The ancients were less literalistic than we are, aware that truth has many levels…Ours is a literalistic mentality; theirs was a symbolical mentality. Sallie McFague, *Metaphorical Theology: Models of God in Religious Language* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, ©1982), 5.
current Christian culture prayer has come to have the very specific meaning of talking to God, which is sometimes predominated with a long list of things we want God to do for us. Contemplation is much more and much less than that. It is much more from the perspective that contemplation can include a plethora of practices.\textsuperscript{18} It is much less in that the basis of contemplation is simply being present and undividedly aware of the moment, often including no talking at all. Prayer is a way of being which is humble, open, and present to the moment, allowing one to connect wholly with God.

\textit{Contemplation} is another word for presence: presence to the ubiquitous God in the world, in others, and in us. Presence is as challenging to describe as it is to experience. It entails being fully engaged with a moment and all that is encompassed in it. Cynthia Bourgeault speaks of “entrust[ing] ourselves to a deeper aliveness.”\textsuperscript{19} Gerald May describes contemplation as “simply trying to face life in a truly undefended and open-eyed way” or “direct perception without any manipulation of that perception.”\textsuperscript{20} Thomas Merton talks about “life itself, fully awake, fully active, fully aware that it is alive.”\textsuperscript{21} Richard Rohr employs the term “pure experience.”\textsuperscript{22} Presence is a way of being which is humble, open, and present to the moment, allowing one to connect wholly with God. \textit{Prayer, presence, and contemplation} are different ways of saying the same thing.

---

\textsuperscript{18} Richard Rohr defines prayer as an “umbrella word for any interior journey or practices that allow you to experience faith, hope, and love within yourself.” Richard Rohr, \textit{The Naked Now: Learning to See as the Mystics See} (New York: Crossroad Publishing Co., 2009), 23.


\textsuperscript{22} Rohr, \textit{The Naked Now}, 50.
Contemplation—prayer, presence—is not confined to a specific time frame or formula. Rather it is a way of being that little by little begins to affect every moment and every action. Thus can the Apostle Paul admonish, “Pray without ceasing.”

**Describing Contemplation**

**Contemplation is Being Loved by God: Rocking Babies**

*Can a woman forget her nursing child?*  

The downy head of a newborn nestled against my neck is an exquisite memory, which evokes affection and elation every time I have another chance to hold a tiny babe. Rocking babies easily ranks in my top three favorite activities. When my own children were rock-able, I used to imagine pouring love into them with every pat and sway, willing it to the depths of their little beings. I would whisper to them in the silence of my heart, “Whatever happens to you later in this world, at least you have this: “your mommy utterly loves you!”

I suspect that Mother God, before birthing each of us into the world, may have a similar ritual, instilling love so deeply in our souls that no matter what happens to us later in this world, our true, created essence still senses that our Mommy loves us. Sadly, the world does not always mimic the world maker, and sin in the world makes it seem necessary for each of us to build crusts over our exquisite diamond souls, to assuage the brutal disappointments of fallen-ness.

---

23 I Thess. 5:17 (NRSV).

24 Isa. 49:15 (NRSV).

25 “Can a woman forget her nursing child, or show no compassion for the child of her womb? Even these may forget, yet I will not forget you.” Isa. 49:15 (NRSV).
The love instilled by the Creator cannot be quelled, damaged, or dissolved. It calls out to Creator all our days. The interplay of love implanted and love reaching back could appropriately be called prayer. It may seem obvious that thoughts and words alone are not sufficient to tap into the currents of love that flow unendingly between Creator and creature. This love is a whole bodied love; all our hearts, all our souls, all our minds, all our strength. Another word for this kind of prayer is contemplation.

Contemplation intuits that our Mommy still utterly loves us. Contemplation is being loved by God.

**Contemplation is Loving God: Marriage of Longings**

*As the deer pants longingly in front of the water channels,*

*Indeed my whole-self pants longingly for you.*

Contemplation is a highly responsive endeavor from the perspective of both humankind responding to God and God responding to humankind. It is a marriage of longings. Abraham Joshua Heschel asserts that “the craving for God has never subsided

---

26 “Because Essence is the nature of the soul, the fall is not an actual loss of Essence – rather, we simply lose touch with it. This is an important discernment, because it means that the essential realm is present all the time; we have just “forgotten” it or screened it out of awareness.” Sandra Maitri, *The Spiritual Dimension of the Enneagram: Nine Faces of the Soul* (New York: Penguin Putnam Inc., 2000), 30.

27 “In most of us this Heart lies dormant and undeveloped. If it were to be awakened it would be constantly straining toward God and, given a chance, would impel the whole of our being toward him. But for this, it needs to be developed, it needs to have the dross that surrounds it removed so that it can be attracted toward the Eternal Magnet.” Anthony de Mello, *Sadhana, A Way to God: Christian Exercises in Eastern Form* (Garden City, NY: Image Books, 1978), 30.

28 “Likewise the Spirit helps us in our weakness; for we do not know how to pray as we ought, but that very Spirit intercedes with sighs too deep for words. And God, who searches the heart, knows what is the mind of the Spirit, because the Spirit intercedes for the saints according to the will of God” Rom. 8:26-27.

29 Ps. 42:1 (Translation mine).
in the Jewish soul.”

I contend that the craving for God has never subsided in the human soul. The Psalmist captures the deep seated desire:

O God, thou art my God, earnestly will I seek Thee,
My soul thirsteth for Thee, my flesh longeth for Thee,
In a dry and weary land, where no water is.

A longing exists in all of humanity to be re-united with the maker, the source from which our image and existence come. The psalmist cries, “Whom have I in heaven but you?
And there is nothing on earth that I desire other than you.”

John Calvin, too, recognizes the innateness of this recognition, “There is within the human mind, and indeed by natural instinct, an awareness of divinity.” Calvin goes on to say, “it is not a doctrine that must first be learned in school, but one of which each of us is master from his mother’s womb and which nature itself permits no one to forget…. [A]ll [people] are born and live to the end that they may know God. . . .”

The longing we carry comes also from the other direction. Hosea gives voice to God’s mother-love toward God’s people;

Yet it was I who taught Ephraim to walk, I took them up in my arms; but they did not know that I healed them. I led them with cords of human kindness, with bands

---

30 Abraham Joshua Heschel, God in Search of Man: a Philosophy of Judaism, Reprint ed. (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1976), 29. Note: Written in the 1950’s, the book uses gendered language throughout. I have chosen not to amend the language for risk of disturbing the flow of understanding. The reader is invited, with me, to interpret the masculine language inclusively.

31 “You have made us for yourself, O Lord, and our heart is restless until it rests in you.” St. Augustine’s Confessions (Lib 1,1-2,2.5,5: CSEL 33, 1-5).

32 Ps. 63:2 (KJV).

33 Ps. 73:25 (NRSV).


35 Calvin, 1.3.3.
of love. I was to them like those who lift infants to their cheeks. I bent down to
them and fed them.\(^{36}\)

The evocative nature of the responsiveness of God to humanity is uttered in the entire
book of Hosea, as God laments over being rejected as lover, “They have forsaken the
Lord to devote themselves to whoredom…. For a spirit of whoredom has led them astray,
and they have played the whore, forsaking their God.”\(^{37}\) But even in profound anger and
ache, God’s reluctance to lose them prevails, “I will heal their disloyalty; I will love them
freely….They shall again live beneath my shadow, they shall flourish as a garden; they
shall blossom like the vine, their fragrance shall be like the wine of Lebanon.”\(^{38}\) God
continues to love because love is what God is.\(^{39}\) Heschel encapsulates; “All of human
history as described in the Bible may be summarized in one phrase: God is in search of
man.”\(^{40}\) Contemplation marries mutual longing; our longing for God and God’s longing
for us, or as the prophet Jeremiah witnesses, “They shall be my people and I will be their
God.”\(^{41}\) Herein lies the most compelling of all reasons for contemplation: God desires
us.\(^{42}\) Contemplation is loving God.

\[^{36}\text{Hosea 11:3-4 (NRSV).}\]

\[^{37}\text{Hosea 4:10-12 (NRSV).}\]

\[^{38}\text{Hosea 14:4, 7 (NRSV).}\]

\[^{39}\text{I John 4:8 (NRSV).}\]

\[^{40}\text{Heschel, God in Search of Man, 136.}\]

\[^{41}\text{Jer. 32:38 (NRSV).}\]

\[^{42}\text{“The ultimate intention of religious thinking is…to satisfy God’s need for man.” Heschel, God in Search of Man, 16.}\]
Contemplation is Being Seen by God: Gone Missing

And they walked, the two of them, together

It remains a great mystery why the God of the universe, the creator of all that lives and moves and breathes, would be so desperate to connect with us, creatures. Yet it never stops; God reaching out to us. God persistently sets humanity up for success in uniting with the Divine, pleading, “Please listen to me! Long for me! Love me!” The covenant-making God relentlessly initiates relationship. God seeks Noah, while he lives among ruthless people. God seeks out Abraham and Sarah, while they are still settled in there native land; God pursues Moses, as he trembles at the un-burnable bush; God finds the woman at the well, as she awaits yet another rejection. God recklessly pursues humankind across the ages. God is the shameless father who runs to reclaim his derelict son. God is the mother hen who longs to gather her chicks under her protective wings. God is the flesh and bone version of divinity, who wears diapers, learns the aleph-bet,

---

43 *And they walked, the two of them, together.* From Genesis 22:6 in reference to Abraham and Isaac walking toward Moriah.

44 “What is mankind that you are mindful of them, human beings that you care for them?” Ps. 8:4 (NIV).

45 “…everything (and I mean, precisely, everything) we do is a response to God’s first work, his initiating act.” Eugene Peterson, *The Contemplative Pastor: Returning to the Art of Spiritual Direction* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1989), 61.

46 Gen. 6.

47 Gen. 17.

48 Exod. 3.

49 John 4.


51 Matt. 23:37.
and suffocates to death. Whether it makes sense or not, God desires to be connected with us.

From that perspective, the fall is as sad for God as it is for humanity. Imagine God, walking in the garden in the delicate breezes of the evening, seeking the usual company of close friends. “Adam, Where art thou?” God calls, only to find they have gone missing; gone missing in a most inaccessible and incurable way. Tragically, they have gone missing beneath a shell of falsehood designed to protect them from going missing.

In the ultimate deceitful twist, the snake convinces humans, who are the perfect result of God’s ingenious imagination, that they are not enough. And they spend the rest of their frustrating and frustrated days and eras building unconscious schemes to become what they already are and regain what they could never lose. They are so preoccupied with their schemes that the former garden breezes fairly fade from memory and they are no longer able to hear the beckon, see the desire, or feel the passion of their ardent lover. And God is left alone to lament the loss of loving intimacy.

52 John 1.

53 The Hebrew word Adam (אָדָם) means humanity.

54 Gen. 3:9 (KJV).

55 “The kingdom of the self is heavily defended territory.” Peterson, 31.

56 I am referring here to the false self, which the ego constructs in an effort to recapture what is most precious and feels to humanity like it is lost.

57 False self.

58 True self.

59 The true self – the image of God in humankind is that part that is indestructible.
Contemplation is a call to come out of hiding; to become, once again, naked and not ashamed.⁶⁰ Contemplation is a summons to walk in the garden; to reconnect with the image in us and the imaginer that implanted it; to walk, the two of us together; God and humankind.⁶¹ Contemplation is an invitation to hear and heed the still small voice that beckons, to recognize our enough-ness, and to feel our union. Contemplation is a yes to being seen by God.

**Contemplation is Seeing God: Magic Eye**

> God’s splendor covers the heavens, and the earth is full of His praise.⁶²

Everything in reality, when we are able to perceive it, directs us straight to the presence of God.⁶³ Contemplation focuses one’s capacity to perceive the lovingkindness of the Lord; like the once popular *Magic Eye* pictures, in which a figure emerges only after the eyes change their focus from the patterns to the image. The way we conceive of the world—whether as closed, with God in some other realm or as open, with the love and mercy of God breathing incessantly into it—affects both how we experience God and how we experience the world.

Reformed theology contends that God is omnipresent. John Calvin puts it this way; “One of the ancients seems aptly to have remarked, ‘Whatever we see, and whatever we do not see, is God.’ According to this, he fancied that divinity was poured

---

⁶⁰ “The incidents recorded in the Bible...are episodes of one great drama: the quest of God for man; His search for man, and man’s flight from Him.” Heschel, *God in Search of Man*, 197.

⁶¹ “The striving is always the same: the quest for unity, a return to the inmost self, united with the Absolute, a quest for Him Who is above all, and in all...” Thomas Merton, *The Inner Experience: Notes on Contemplation* (San Francisco: Harper Collins Publishers, 2003), 30.

⁶² Hab.3:3 (NASB).

⁶³ “And yet as [God] is incomprehensible he also fills the earth itself.” Calvin, 1.13.1.
out into the various parts of the world." Yet most of us are blind to God in the physical world because our modern, scientific world-view mitigates against seeing the world as God-infused. Generally speaking, we humans no longer consider ourselves to be living in a world permeated with God. Rather, we think we live in a closed system that is self-sustaining, and God is somewhere out there occasionally asserting some action that affects us.

The Hebrew Bible suggests otherwise, assuming the earth is full of God’s love, mercy and glory. The psalmist declares, “The earth is full of the lovingkindness of the LORD.” and “The earth, O LORD, is full of Thy mercy.” Isaiah, in the throes of his heavenly vision, hears the seraphim calling to one another, “Holy, holy, holy is the LORD of hosts; the whole earth is full of [God’s] glory.” Therefore, the universe is more helpfully envisioned as an open system into which constantly flows the breath of God, like a balloon receiving a constant, gentle inflow of air. The breath of God enlivens the atmosphere, creating a living space for all things. The attention of God sustains the universe and the glory of God brightens the world. Heschel offers that, “[Mystery] is a dimension of all existence and may be experienced everywhere and at all

---

64 Calvin, 1.13.1.
65 Ps.33:5 (NASB).
66 Ps.19:64 (KJV).
67 Isa.6:3 (NRSV).
68 Dr. Tom Boogaart, Western Theological Seminary Dennis and Betty Voskuil Old Testament Chair, from in-class lecture. February, 2015.
69 Ibid.
70 Ibid.
times.” Contemplation is the magic eye that focuses us to see mystery. Contemplation is seeing God.

**Contemplation is Being Known by God: Knowing as Touching**

*Now... you have come to know God, or rather to be known by God.*

Biblical knowing is not the sort of knowing we typically consider in our culture. We think of *knowing* as gathering facts and details, processing information, and understanding concepts. Heschel explains that, to the contrary, “Biblical knowing is more akin to face-to-face presence. It is a full-body knowing, a cellular knowing.” The Hebrew word for *knowing* (*yadah*) is a derivative of the Hebrew word for *hand* (*yad*), suggesting that being known by God involves a reciprocal touching; a personal, mutually responsive exchange. It is the same word used to denote sexual intimacy, which is anything but mere facts, information, and concepts and always involves mutual touching.

Knowing God and being known by God are inextricably linked. Being known by God is loving God. Knowing God is being loved by God. Rohr illuminates:

> God refuses to be an object of knowledge like all other objects of knowledge. God cannot be known the way we know a tree, a scientific fact or a book. God can only be known as a fellow subject. That’s a reciprocal knowing, where we “know as fully as we are known” (I Cor. 13:12). It will feel like you are being ‘known through’ more than you are knowing something yourself.

---

71 Heschel, *God in Search of Man*, 57.

72 Gal. 4:9.

73 Rohr, *Things Hidden*, 63.

74 יָדַה

75 יָד


77 Rohr, *Things Hidden*, 130.
When we recognize that we are being known by God, we can feel it in our chest, in our
gut, and in our bones. Contemplation is being known by God.

**Contemplation is Knowing God: Knowing by Not Knowing**

*Then the people stood at a distance, while Moses drew near to
the thick darkness where God was*.78

This *yad* kind of loving is the knowing God most desires, “For I desire steadfast
love and not sacrifice, the knowledge of God rather than burnt offerings.”79 *Yad* knowing
does not take place primarily in the brain. Rohr expounds on this beyond-thinking
manner of knowing:

Healthy religion knows that there are many essential things you can only know by
a different path than cerebral knowing….The really great truths, like love and
inner freedom are not fully conceptual, and they can never be understood by
reason alone….They are known holistically, that is—when *all* of you is there!”80

Contemplation is a mode of loving God with all our heart, soul, mind, and strength.81

Ironically, this holistic knowing of God largely requires non-knowing. The
fourteenth century mystic and author of *The Cloud of Unknowing* explains as follows:

Created things are visible while God is invisible, hidden, as it were, behind a dark
cloud of unknowing. So what you have to do is remain in this darkness as long as
necessary, just crying out to the One you love. For if you are ever to feel or see
God it will be within this darkness.”82

---

78 Exod. 20:21 (NRSV).
79 Hosea 6:6 (NRSV).
81 “Love is the great power behind and within all life.” Obbard, 24.
82 Obbard, 23.
God has long been known to dwell in deep darkness; in the cloud by day,\(^{83}\) on Mount Sinai,\(^{84}\) and behind the curtain of the Holy of Holies.\(^{85}\) Stepping blindly into the darkness of the presence of an all-powerful God necessitates trust which could only be aroused by an all-loving God. It requires the letting go of control and certainty; a letting go made possible by contemplation. Contemplation is knowing God by not knowing.

**Contemplation is Presence: Plunge into Wonder**

*For you, O LORD, have made me glad by your work; at the works of your hands I sing for joy.*\(^ {86}\)

A vehicle for transport into the presence of the searching God who dwells in deep darkness is wonder, or in other words, radical amazement.\(^ {87}\) Heschel laments the demystifying of the world by modernity:

> The modern man fell into the trap of believing that everything can be explained; that reality is a simple affair which has only to be organized in order to be mastered….\(^ {88}\) Modern man…abhors the idea of a mystery. Obstinately he ignores the fact that we are all surrounded by things which we apprehend but cannot comprehend, that even reason is a mystery to itself. He is sure of his ability to explain all mystery away.\(^ {89}\)

Isaiah speaks to the contrary, on behalf of God, "For as the heavens are higher than the earth, so are my ways higher than your ways and my thoughts than your

---

\(^{83}\) "The LORD went in front of them in a pillar of cloud by day, to lead them along the way.” Exod. 13:21 (NRSV).

\(^{84}\) “Then the people stood at a distance, while Moses drew near to the thick darkness where God was.” Exod. 20:21 (NRSV).

\(^{85}\) “Behind the second curtain was a tent called the Holy of Holies.” Heb. 9:3 (NRSV).

\(^{86}\) Ps. 92:4 (NRSV).

\(^{87}\) Heschel, *God in Search of Man*, 45-47.

\(^{88}\) Ibid., 43.

\(^{89}\) Ibid., 34.
thoughts.”90 The Psalmist recognizes the source of the mystery, “from the Lord this happened. It is wondrously extraordinary in our eyes.”91 Calvin, too, challenges our modern penchant toward eradication of mystery, “Surely [God’s] infinity ought to make us afraid to try to measure him by our own senses.”92

Heschel calls mystery the sublime. “The sublime is that which we see and are unable to convey. It is the silent allusion of things to a meaning greater than themselves….It is that which our words, our forms, our categories can never reach.”93

Wonder inspires attention to the massive and to the miniscule. The Psalmist identifies the massive in Psalm 19:

The heavens are telling of the glory of God; and their expanse is declaring the work of His hands. Day to day pours forth speech, and night to night reveals knowledge.”94 This is a telling heard not by the ears but by the heart.

Wonder turns the telescope into a prompt for worship. Wonder is in the massive.

Wonder is also in the miniscule as Heschel appreciates:

The sublime, furthermore, is not necessarily related to the vast and the overwhelming. It can be sensed in every grain of sand, in every drop of water. Every flower in the summer, every snow flake in the winter, may arouse in us the sense of wonder that is our response to the sublime.”95

90 Isa. 55:9 (NRSV).
91 Ps. 118:23 (Translation mine).
92 Calvin, 1.13.1.
93 Heschel, God in Search of Man, 39.
94 Ps. 19:1-2 (NASB).
95 Heschel, God in Search of Man, 39.
The detail with which God has bothered to dress the world is a summons to our souls. Even the details inaccessible to the naked eye carry sublime beauty. The microscope, like the telescope, wakens wonder and stirs gratitude.

The Apostle Paul sees the wonder of God in the world, “Ever since the creation of the world his eternal power and divine nature, invisible though they are, have been understood and seen through the things he has made.”\(^{96}\) Science, with this perspective, is the study of God. Creation reveals the creator, even as art discloses the artist. Contemplation is a plunge into wonder. And wonder opens us to detecting God.\(^{97}\) Wonder slows us down and lets us attend to the moment; lets us become aware and awake. Contemplation is presence.

**Crucial Nature of Contemplation**

**Present to Christ: Gentle Wake-up**

*It is now the moment for you to wake from sleep.*\(^ {98}\)

Some wake-up calls are shocking, like when a parent bursts into the room of a sleeping child, flicking the light switch and singing garishly, “School days, school days, happy golden rule days.” Contemplation is more like waking up to a parent sitting quietly on the edge of the bed, gently rubbing the back and whispering words of affection.

Most people are asleep to their craving for God, having submersed themselves in a sea of numbing distractions unknowingly adopted to quell the pain of separation from

\(^{96}\) Rom. 1:20.

\(^{97}\) “Awareness of the divine begins with wonder.” Heschel, *God in Search of Man,* 46.

\(^{98}\) Rom. 13:11 (NRSV).
the One who birthed them into existence. Consequently, humankind floats aimlessly through life without noticing God’s attendance or activity. As Heschel names, “small is the world that most of us pay attention to, and limited is our concern.” The awakening power of contemplation is crucial because we are asleep to our lives, asleep to our world, and asleep to our God.

Humanity needs a wake-up. Ephesians calls for one. “Wake up, you, the one who is sleeping, and arise from the dead, and the Christ will appear to you.” Waking up is simply paying attention, noticing what is right in front of us. Rabbi Lawrence Kushner invites us to “learn how to do again what you hadn’t done since you were a small child: pay close attention to the obvious” because “when you look closely and for a long time, you discover things that are invisible to others.” Namely, you discover the Christ. Contemplation offers a gentle wake-up to the presence of Christ in our world and in our lives.

---

99 “Therefore the LORD God sent him forth from the garden of Eden, to till the ground from which he was taken.” Gen. 3:23 (NRSV).

100 Heschel, God in Search of Man, 33.

101 Eph. 5:14 (Translation mine).

102 “There is another world, right here within this one, whenever we pay attention” Lawrence Kushner, God was in the Place and I, I Did Not Know: Finding Self, Spirituality and Ultimate Meaning (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 1994), 25.

103 Ibid., 22.
Present to Spirit: Wind Vane

God's love has been poured into our hearts through the Holy Spirit that has been given to us.104

The North American church appears to be losing the ability to hear the Spirit. Controversies rage in denominations, with all parties digging in to the foxholes of their opinions. Church members spew hostile judgement and ostracize their brothers and sisters in the name of Christ. A steady stream of people are leaving the church for lack of meaning, like air leaking from a punctured tire. Contemplation is a wind vane, which offers the ability to detect the Spirit. The world is perpetually animated and sustained by the Spirit of God. In the beginning, Ruach (Spirit of God; breath of God)105 vibrates and everything comes into being.106 God breathes between the waters and forms the Rachia (dome; firmament; living space)107 without which life could not exist.108 God breathes into the newly created human beings and imparts life.109 The creation stories portray a universe alive with the Spirit and fully contingent upon her. Jesus breathes on his disciples the breath of forgiveness and shalom, the Holy Spirit.110 The Spirit is poured out at Pentecost and changes how humankind connects with God.111

---

104 Rom. 5:5 (NRSV).
105 רַעַח
106 Gen. 1:2.
107 רַקִיעַ
110 John 20:20-23.
111 Acts 2.
The New Testament writers insist that the Spirit indwells us: “You are not in the flesh; you are in the Spirit, since the Spirit of God dwells in you”¹¹² and “Do you not know that your body is a temple of the Holy Spirit who is in you, whom you have from God, and that you are not your own?”¹¹³ If then, the Spirit indwells us; it behooves us to pay attention to what is going on inside us. Contemplation helps us become present to God - via the Holy Spirit - in us. This sort of presence, or perception, involves more than cerebral comprehension. It entails mystery and mutuality.

Jesus knows that the spirit of humankind will veer naturally toward division, distinction, and discord. And that it takes the Spirit of God to close the gap and open mystery in the human heart. Jesus is trying to coax Nicodemus into mystery on the night Nicodemus slips over to get the story straight from Jesus:

Do not be astonished that I said to you, “You must be born from above. The wind blows where it chooses, and you hear the sound of it, but you do not know where it comes from or where it goes. So it is with everyone who is born of the Spirit.”¹¹⁴

We don’t direct the wind. We don’t control the wind. But we can detect the wind when it blows, if we are paying attention. Contemplation is crucial because it offers the ability to detect the Spirit as it blows wherever it wishes. Detecting the Spirit makes it possible to hear and cooperate with the Spirit, even in the midst of a culture and a church to the contrary. Contemplation is a wind vein for the presence of Spirit.

¹¹² Rom. 8:9 (NRSV).
¹¹³ 1Cor. 6:19 (NASB).
¹¹⁴ John 3:7-8 (NRSV).
Present to the Word: Apples of Gold

Indeed, the word of God is living and active.\textsuperscript{115}

The presence of the Spirit is indispensable in our approach to Scripture. Much of the disintegrating controversy in the church today stems from disagreements about what the Bible is and how it should be regarded. Jewish physicist, Gerald Schroeder presents an exquisite depiction of the layers of meaning in the Scriptures. He reflects on King Solomon’s wisdom, “A word fitly spoken is like apples of gold in settings of silver.”\textsuperscript{116} Schroeder suggests that from a distance we see only the silver dish—the settings of silver—which is beautiful and valuable in itself; the literal meaning of the text. But when we draw near, the contents—the rare and priceless apples of gold—can be discovered.\textsuperscript{117}

Contemplation draws us near. Contemplative—that is to say, prayerful and meditative—engagement with the Bible is both absorbing the Word and being absorbed by the Word. Contemplation is a spiritual approach to a spiritual Scripture.\textsuperscript{118} Paul explains it to the Corinthians this way:

Now we have received not the spirit of the world, but the Spirit that is from God, so that we may understand the gifts bestowed on us by God. And we speak of these things in words not taught by human wisdom but taught by the Spirit, interpreting spiritual things to those who are spiritual.\textsuperscript{119}

Calvin too, even though deeply committed to reason and explanation, vies for the mysterious work of the Spirit in regard to Scripture. “We ought to seek our conviction in

\begin{footnotes}
\item[115] Heb. 4:12 (NRSV).
\item[116] Prov. 25:11 9 (NKJV).
\item[117] Gerald Schroeder, God According to God; A Scientist Discovers We’ve Been Wrong About God All Along (New York: HarperCollins, 2009), 184.
\item[118] “Approach the Scriptures with humility and patience, with our own agenda out of the way, and allow the Spirit to stir the deeper meaning for us.” Rohr, Things Hidden, 125.
\item[119] 1Cor. 2:12-13 (NRSV).
\end{footnotes}
a higher place than human reasons, judgments, or conjectures, that is, in the secret
testimony of the Spirit.”

Left to our usual devices, we see in the text what we usually see, or what we have
been taught to see, or what we need to see in order to support the habits of our sinful
selves. On the one hand, this is not a problem of making the Scripture too literal, but
rather not literal enough. The concrete expressions, especially of the Hebrew Bible,
often lose their potency when construed as abstract concepts. On the other hand, in
referring to the words of the prophets, Heschel contends,

   Indeed, their words must not be taken literally, because a literal understanding
   would be a partial, shallow understanding; because the literal meaning is but a
   minimum of meaning…The speech of God is not less but more than literally
   real. The surest way of misunderstanding revelation is to take it literally, to
   imagine that God spoke to the prophet on a long-distance telephone. …The error
   of literal-mindedness is in assuming that things and words have only one
   meaning…. The language of faith employs only a few words coined in its own
   spirit; most of its terms are borrowed from the general sphere of human
   experience and endowed with new meaning. Consequently, in taking these terms
   literally we miss the unique connotations which they assumed in the religious
   usage.

   

120 Calvin, I. vii. 4.
121 “You see the text through your available eyes. You hear a text from your own level of
development and consciousness. Punitive people love punitive texts; loving people hear in the same texts
calls to discernment, clarity, choice, and decision. ‘And between the two there is a great gulf, not allowing
one to cross from one side to another’ (Luke 16:26). All we can do is help people grow up, and then they
hear Scripture maturely…We do not see things as they are; we see things as we are.” Richard Rohr, The
Naked Now: Learning to See as the Mystics See (New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company,
2009), 82.

122 Boogaart Lectures.
123 Heschel, God in Search of Man, 180.
124 Ibid. 178-179.
Contemplation is crucial because immersing in and internalizing the Word through contemplation carries us into what is more real. It results in a vivid and lively encounter with the Bible and the God revealed in the Bible. Contemplation enables us to be present to the Word by bringing us close enough to glimpse the hidden mystery of golden apples.
Present to Creation: Anesthesia

*Wake up, sleeper, rise from the dead*\(^{125}\)

Grand Valley State University parking lot G is twenty-nine minutes from my driveway in Holland, Michigan, under ideal traffic and weather conditions. Between the two locations is a spectacular seasonally revolving landscape. A dazzling white-wrapped world frames diamond dipped branches after a winter ice storm. Lush black loam fields sprout aromatic green onions in spring. An electrifying backdrop of brilliant hues broadcasts autumn. Matching maple trees in one front yard stand three times the height of the accompanying two story house. The visual impact of the sun on the expansive golden branches is staggering. Yet, most times, all this was lost to me, as I made the daily trek to fill my role as campus minister. I could literally make the half-hour trip without registering a single leaf or snowflake. Obviously, I noticed it on some occasions, evidenced by the fact that I can still marvel at the memories. And of course, I technically saw everything; since I had to have my eyes open in order to keep my car on the road. But most times I was virtually asleep to the splendor of God displayed incessantly around me.

Such is the condition of our souls. We are asleep to God in our world, to beauty and love, and even to our own lives.\(^{126}\) It is understandable, really. As little ones we each came to a point where the divine unity with which we were welcomed into being, felt threatened.\(^{127}\) The disconnect was so painful that we could not bear it. It threatened to

\(^{125}\) Eph. 5:14 (NIV).

\(^{126}\) “...the actual loss of contact with our True Nature...is often referred to in spiritual work as falling asleep.” Maitri, 24.

\(^{127}\) “We come to experience ourselves as ultimately separate, and thus cut off and estranged from the rest of reality.” Ibid., 26.
unravel our very survival. So our ego went to work, creating strategies to reconstruct whatever we sensed we had lost; a cover to protect the tender and very real person we were created to be. But the strategies became an imperceptible form of anesthesia and we gradually fell unconscious.

I remember a time when my anesthesia was temporarily turned off somehow. I was participating in a short guided meditation at a large conference. Suddenly, I perceived sparkly bits of light all around; miniscule stars whose glimmers interconnected. I was enfolded with a potent, fleeting sensation of being undeniably connected with everyone in the room. This experience cohered an entire weekend of inexplicable encounters. When I went back to campus, I felt like I was in a different life. My soul was still, yet I was alert and perceptive. I noticed, for what seemed like the first time, a teenaged silver maple in full fall-red radiance outside the wall-sized window of our campus ministry office. Amazingly, every crimson leaf seemed to be transmitting the love of God; as though the color – the leaves – the tree, were the love of God.

Contemplation is a recovery room in which we can wake up from the anesthesia under which we have put ourselves so we don’t feel the pain of existence.

---

128 “Survival anxiety kicks in, and the infant goes into red alert mode to try to protect himself from pain and remove its cause.” Ibid., 27.

129 “The process of losing contact with that which is innate and unconditioned occurs gradually during the first few years of life, and by the time we are four years old, Essence is mostly lost to perception.” Ibid., 25.

130 “If eternity touched you, if all the trappings of time and self were stripped away and you were all soul, if God ‘happened’ to you – then isn’t it possible that the experience could not be translated back into the daily round…?” Christian Wiman, My Bright Abyss: Meditation of a Modern Believer (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2013), 6.

131 In the surgical recovery room conditions are ideal for waking up, including oxygen for clearing the body of anesthesia, lights for seeing clearly, nurses gently speaking patients’ names, a soft touch on the
Contemplation is crucial because it bids us reawaken to the world and to our own lives, and to God, all of which are inextricably intertwined. And what we see and hear and feel when we come to, defies formula, description, and reason because it is God.

Present to Self: Window or Wall

[You] have put on the new self, which is being renewed in knowledge in the image of its Creator.

Christians sometimes say that contemplation is self-centered, self-absorbed and self-aggrandizing, directing one’s attention away from God and others, where it should rightly be affixed. A criticism of naval gazing surfaces, particularly in regard to practices intended to lead to self-awareness. Narcissistic naval gazing is a genuine danger in the pursuit of self-awareness and can be a strategy of the false self. In such a case, the false-self acts as a wall that stops our vision of and participation with God.

Elizabeth O’Conner says it this way:

arm or shoulder to awaken the senses, and care for the pain and discomfort that will accompany the wake up.

132 “Maybe [God] happened – and goes on happening- at the cellular level and means not nothing but everything to me. Maybe…I don’t remember it but it remembers me.” Wiman, 6.

133 “The beginning of knowing about God, in other words, is simply paying attention, being fully present where you are, or as Rashi suggests, waking up.” Kushner, 26.

134 Col. 3:10 (NIV).

135 “Instead of plunging into the depths of one’s true freedom and spirituality, one simply withdraws into the darker subterranean levels of the exterior self, which remains alienated and subject to powers from the outside. Thomas Merton, The Inner Experience: Notes on Contemplation (San Francisco: Harper Collins Publishers, 2003), 25.

136 It is important at all times to keep clear the distinction between true and false religion, true and false interiority, holiness and possession, love and frenzy, contemplation and magic. In every case there is an aspiration toward inner awakening and the same means, good or indifferent in themselves may be used for good or evil, health or sickness, freedom or obsession. Ibid., 27.

137 “…instead of plunging into the depths of one’s true freedom and spirituality, one simply withdraws into the darker subterranean levels of the exterior self.” Ibid., 25.
If engagement with ourselves does not push back horizons so that we see neighbors we did not see before, then we need to examine the appointment kept with self. If prayer does not drive us out into some concrete involvement at a point of the world’s need, then we must question prayer.\footnote{O’Conner, Elizabeth. \textit{Journey Inward, Journey Outward} (New York: Harper and Row Publishers, 1968), 28.}

True Christian contemplation,\footnote{We need to become friendly again toward ourselves and not to be weighted with guilt by the heretical doctrine that labels the meditative man selfish or self-centered. Ibid., 36.} creates a window in which awareness of self, reveals God.\footnote{“Though by and large the Church has not known how integral the search for self is to the search for God, her saints have always preached that the two are inextricably bound together.” Elizabeth O Conner, \textit{Our Many Selves: A Handbook for Self Discovery} (New York: Harper and Row, 1971), 103.} In coming face to face with the image of God in oneself, the love of God is illumined, like a solarium on a sunny day; the love of God toward the contemplative and the love of God toward all creation. The inevitable response is then, loving God back,\footnote{“We love because he first loved us.” 1 John 4:19 (NRSV).} meaning loving who and what God loves.\footnote{“Self-awareness is a powerful means for increasing in love of God and of neighbor. The self-awareness heightens the love. The love, when it is genuine, fosters deeper self-awareness.” Merton, \textit{The Inner Experience}, 51.}

The transparency of self-awareness is not, however, all sunshine. For when the light of Christ shines through, sin is painfully exposed, much like a neglected room, which seemed fine in the dark, looks filthy and dilapidated when daylight comes. This exposure helps us, as the author of \textit{The Cloud of Unknowing} puts it, “learn then to live meekly in humble gratitude, not thinking that [we] are better than others just because [we] are called to solitude.”\footnote{Elizabeth Ruth Obbard, \textit{The Cloud of Unknowing for Everyone}. (Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 2007), 22.} Humility and gratitude are results, not of naval gazing, but
of surrender and suffering. Contemplation is crucial because it creates a window through which the light of Christ can stream.

**Present to Paradox: Third Eye Seeing**

*Do you have eyes, and fail to see?*144

The light of Christ nudges the contemplative away from dualism and toward mystery and paradox. Paradox challenges speech, and mystery confounds language. Heschel speaks of:

…*indicative* words which stand in a fluid relation to ineffable meanings and, instead of describing, merely intimate something which we intuit but cannot fully comprehend. The content of words such as God, time, beauty, eternity, cannot be faithfully imagined or reproduced in our minds. … What [indicative words] call forth is a *response.*”145

Rohr calls this kind of intuitive responding, third eye seeing. First eye seeing revolves around thought or sight, the obvious or physically literal. The second eye also incorporates imagination, intuition, and reason. The third eye sees all of that, but from a bearing of awe in the face of mystery, harmony, and capaciousness.146 Third eye seeing results in an awareness of unified connectedness, in which “our heart space, our mind space, and our body awareness are all simultaneously open and nonresistant.”147

This is not the kind of seeing which is usually promoted by typical Christian faith formation practices, which often center on accumulating religious information, agreeing with certain concepts, and knowing how to live morally. Such training is heavily

---

144 Mark 8:18 (NRSV).


147 Ibid., 28.
concentrated on differences and delineations; right and wrong, in and out, good and bad, us and them. Such containers may have merit in the development of young children but they also tend to shut down the imaginativeness and spaciousness of the second and third eye seeing. Rohr explains the danger:

I cannot emphasize strongly enough that the separation and loss of these three necessary eyes is at the basis of much of the short-sight-edness and religious crises of the Western world. Lacking such wisdom, it is very difficult for churches, governments, and leaders to move beyond ego, the desire for control, and public posturing. Everything divides into oppositions such as liberal vs. conservative, with vested interests pulling against one another. Truth is no longer possible at this level of conversation. Even theology becomes more a quest for power than a search for God and mystery.148

Contemplation is an antidote to short-sightedness. It offers the opportunity to unify disparate truths and move toward transformation. Rohr elaborates:

The early but learned pattern of dualistic thinking can get us only so far; so all religions at the more mature levels have discovered another ‘software’ for processing the really big questions like death, love, infinity, suffering and God. Many of us call this access “contemplation.” It is a non-dualistic way of seeing the moment. Originally, the word was simply “prayer.”149

Perhaps Jesus refers to this open, connected, non-dualistic way of being in the world and in the moment in Matthew chapter seven. "Enter by the narrow gate; for the gate is wide, and the way is broad that leads to destruction, and many are those who enter by it. For the gate is small, and the way is narrow that leads to life, and few are those who find it.”150 Contemplation is crucial because it nurtures the third eye, an alternative to our usual dualistic, cerebrally confined thinking. It makes us present to paradox.

148 Ibid., 29.
149 Ibid., 12.
150 Matt. 7:13-14 (NASB).
Present to Humanness: Dirt

*Then the LORD God formed man of dust from the ground*¹⁵¹

Ash Wednesday reminds us—humans—that we were built from dirt. It is curious that we think of ourselves as something different, something separate from the world we live in. Our western, enlightenment-conditioned minds consider us independent from the trees that shade us, the ground that supports us, and the water that sustains us.

The Ash Wednesday mantra reminds us that we are dust and to dust we shall return. Yet in relation to the rest of creation, we think our needs and wants are supreme. We believe the natural world is here to give to us whatever we wish to take. We think the earth and everything in it is commodity, something to own, sell, and use. In actuality we are the same substance, *homo-ousious*, with the earth.¹⁵²

Strangely, being dirt doesn’t diminish our value or our sacredness, because the earth—and, for that matter, the entire universe—is the spoken word of God made material.¹⁵³ We, too, are the invention of God’s imagination albeit with the added touch of God’s breath in our being.¹⁵⁴ Being dirt is a precious thing. Being dust is a privilege. And it is a bidding to humility and reality.

---

¹⁵¹ Gen. 2:7 (NASB).

¹⁵² “You see the Pitjantjatjara don’t own the land, they belong to it. It’s like their mother.” John Cornel. *Crocodile Dundee*. DVD. Directed by Peter Faiman, Paramount, 1986.

¹⁵³ “Judaism sees only one world, which is material and spiritual at the same time. The material world is always potentially spiritual. For Judaism all things — including and, especially, such apparently non-spiritual and grossly material things as garbage, sweat, dirt, and bushes — are not impediments to but dimensions of spirituality. To paraphrase the Psalmist, ‘The whole world is full of God.’ The business of religion is to keep that awesome truth ever before us.” Kushner, 28.

¹⁵⁴ “The Lord God… breathed into his nostrils the breath of life; and man became a living being.” Gen. 2:7 (NASB).
We need contemplation to help us get a grasp on our contingency, our relative insignificance, and our brevity.\textsuperscript{155} We need contemplation to remind us of our similarities and symbiosis with the rest of God’s cosmos. Certainly we need contemplation to recapture our sense of connectedness with the universe and thus, with the God of the universe.

Contemplation slows us down enough to realize we are not the Creator, but rather the created. Contemplation gently pries loose our illusions of independence and self-sufficiency and shows us instead our mutuality with the world in utter dependence upon God. Contemplation is crucial because it makes us present to our humanity and reminds us that we are sacred dirt.

**Present to Wholeness: Fragmented and Exhausted**

All your lev, all your nephesh, all your miod\textsuperscript{156}

We are built as whole persons in a wholesome world by a (w)holy God. But we live lives of rush and rift in which our true integrated selves are buried and the persona we are to the world is frenzied and disjointed. Our energy is sapped and our resources are depleted. The symptoms of fragmentation and exhaustion are many.\textsuperscript{157} They show up in our google calendars, our relationships, and our medicine cabinets. The battered bits of the self are then prone to scattering by the winds of adversity.

\textsuperscript{155} “Powerlessness is our greatest treasure.” Thomas Keating, Powerlessness, *Contemplative Outreach*, June 2014, 1.

\textsuperscript{156} Deut. 6:5 (Translation mine).

\textsuperscript{157} “There are a thousand warnings, however, to the man who walks away from himself and his own destiny. Restlessness, sleepless nights, discontent anger, meaninglessness, boredom – these are the cries of the violated self.” Elizabeth O’Conner, *Journey Inward, Journey Outward* (New York: Harper and Row Publishers, 1968), 33.
Fragmentation and exhaustion are the default state of the culture. Even the church expects its leaders to be perpetually occupied and relentlessly productive. Leadership often demands priorities and pace that are diametrically opposed to wholeness and vitality. Elizabeth O’Conner offers a lament of the result of such habits:

We are not present as the Church in the world because we are not present to the indwelling Lord of the Church. We cannot call another into that Presence because we ourselves have lost awareness of it. We are running down a million avenues, instead of standing in the moment with the moment God.  

The God who desires us is undivided - congruent, cohesive, and consistent. This God entreats us to be whole as well: undivided in lev, that is mind, will, conscience, affections; undivided in nephesh, that is life, self, breath, desires, person; undivided in miod, that is force, power, resources. The picture is of a person whose powers, pursuits, passions, and very breath are streamlined toward one single enterprise – love of God and neighbor.

Contemplation offers an antidote for fragmentation and exhaustion. Contemplation is an opportunity to withdraw from the frenzy and become collected. We don’t collect ourselves. Rather, the gentle Spirit gradually gathers our broken beings into

---

158 Ibid., 70.

159 “Hear Israel, the Lord is your God. The Lord is one.” Deut. 6:4 (Translation mine).

160 בָּלָה Commonly translated heart.

161 נפש Commonly translated soul.

162 מְאֹד Commonly translated strength.

163 “The inward journey is “the journey of becoming more conscious, or more whole or more holy. It is change we must struggle for, but when it comes it is always by the grace of God.” O Conner, Our Many Selves, 59.
When we become present to God in the moment, we are stopped and steadied. The gales of difficulty, while still blowing, no longer scatter us, and we can be a calm and collected presence in an agitated world.

Present to Others: Molten Core

_The glory that you have given me I have given them, so that they may be one, as we are one._

Some might say that contemplation, being typically imagined as a solitary experience, is antithetical to community by its very nature and therefore supports the troublesome value of individualism which pervades our culture. The vision of a detached Christian sitting for hours alone and silent seems antagonistic to mutuality and contrary to love. Certainly, one who is simply uncomfortable with other people could withdraw from community under the guise of contemplation, with unhappy results as Dietrich Bonhoeffer warns. “Let him who is not in community beware of being alone.... the one who seeks solitude without fellowship perishes in the abyss of vanity, self-infatuation and despair.” Authentic contemplation, however, is actually an antidote for individualism and narcissism.

---

164 “We also need to remember that the antidote to exhaustion isn’t rest. It’s wholeheartedness. A life of unity and union. A life undivided.” Chuck DeGroat, _Wholeheartedness: Busyness, Exhaustion, and Healing the Divided Self_ (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2016), 192.

165 John 17:22 (RSV).

166 “Individualism has undone Christianity more than anything.” Quote from Richard Rohr at the Enneagram and Grace Conference, Lexington, Kentucky, 2012.


168 Go far enough on the inner journey…and you end up not lost in narcissism but returning to the world, bearing more gracefully the responsibilities that come with being human. Parker J. Palmer, _Let Your Life Speak: Listening for the Voice of Vocation_ (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2000), 73.
The earth’s core is thought to be composed of liquid rock, melted by extremely high temperatures. If it were possible to drill deeply enough to pass through the earth’s crust, any such borehole would converge with this molten center. In the same way, the reaching of the soul into the depths of love through God-enabled contemplation eventually breaks into the collectivity of souls united in Christ.\textsuperscript{169} The person who practices contemplation, awakens to the reality that, as Merton puts it, his or her “inner self is, in fact, inseparable from Christ and hence it is in a mysterious and unique way inseparable from all the [others] who live in Christ…”\textsuperscript{170}

A realization of our universal connectedness ignites our love for one another, melting our hearts of stone in the heat of divine love. Merton helps us understand why:

The awakening of the inner self is purely the work of love, and there can be no love where there is not ‘another’ to love. Furthermore, one does not awaken his inmost ‘I’ by loving God alone, but by loving other [people].\textsuperscript{171}

Recognition of our unity frees us from the illusion of self-importance. Without the weight of self-sufficiency we can float into humility, interdependence, and servanthood with the flesh and blood people who pass through our lives. Contemplation, rather than resisting community, restores it. Rather than individualism, contemplation breeds indivisibility. Contemplation is crucial because it makes us present to others by connecting us to the molten core of Christ.

\textsuperscript{169} “The glory that you have given me I have given them, so that they may be one, as we are one…” John 17:22 (NRSV).

\textsuperscript{170} Merton, 22.

\textsuperscript{171} Merton, 24.
Present in the Church: Wax Museum

For those who want to save their life will lose it, and those who lose their life for my sake will find it.¹⁷²

Many years ago a new pastor came to the rural area church we were part of. He launched his tenure with the church by preaching a series of sermons on the early church and then illustrating how we are just like them. “They devoted themselves to the Apostles’ teaching and to fellowship. We have an education committee and coffee hour. They shared their possessions. We take an offering. They broke bread together. We have communion.” I don’t actually remember the point of the sermons, but I do remember the horror that accompanied my thought that modern day church life is much like a wax museum. On the surface, things appear real. But in actuality there is no life.

Perhaps we seem dead on the inside because we are functioning mainly from a false self; a waxy version of the real church God created us to be. Our false self is a hollow sculpture with which our ego surrounded us, in order to deal with the pain and confusion of the fallen world. Our ego originally meant it as a protection, but it turned out to be an obstructive shell,¹⁷³ concealing the image of God in us. Unhappily, we aren’t prone to recognize this tragic exchange of true for false. Almost everyone lives there, inside the church and out. It is the status quo, or as the Apostle Paul liked to say, the world. The culture commands it. The media magnifies it. And the church cheers it.

¹⁷² Matt. 16:25 (NRSV).
¹⁷³ “The barrier between us and God is our ego.” Kushner, 47.
A tremendous amount of effort goes into maintaining our wax church;\textsuperscript{174} to keep things under control, to make things look convincing and holy, and to prevent meltdowns – or at least prevent meltdowns from showing. Perhaps we are so preoccupied with freshening up the wax that we can hardly find God anymore. Maybe we put so much exertion into maintaining this sculpture that we have little energy left to actually be Christ in the world; to bind up the broken hearted, to proclaim liberty to the captives, to bring sight to the blind.

The rest of the world is not as easily fooled by our waxen monuments as we are. The bleeding world longs for the authenticity of love, and for real people to be present with them in their real lives. But often they see only empty mock ups of the living community they long for.

Ironically, rather than avoiding meltdowns, the soul of the church desperately needs, perhaps even craves, a meltdown: a dissolving of the wax encasement that is keeping us from God and keeping the world from us.\textsuperscript{175} But this cannot happen as long as we stay focused on the outward and oblivious to the inward.\textsuperscript{176} The church needs contemplation.\textsuperscript{177} Contemplation can cause a meltdown. On the other side of such a

\textsuperscript{174}“It is a very fragile self, this false self, made up of what we have, what we do and what other people think of us.” M. Basil Pennington, \textit{The Way Back Home} (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press. 1989), 11.

\textsuperscript{175}“…[R]enewal cannot come to the church unless its people are on an inward journey.” O’Conner, \textit{Journey Inward, Journey Outward}, 9.

\textsuperscript{176}In 1971, Pope Paul VI admonished the leaders of the monasteries of the world – “Do all you can to help all the sons and daughters of the church, all the pilgrim people of God, to rediscover this ancient way of prayer, to discover their true selves centered in God so that they could ground their lives in truth – the really real – and in love and in the power of God.” Pennington, 18.

\textsuperscript{177}“It used to be the work of the churches to proclaim the Kingdom at hand and then to provide the direction and the structures that nurtured growth in the inner life. But except for rare instances they have forgotten how to do this. In Protestantism it is very difficult to find any help in drawing closer to the real self.” O’Conner, \textit{Journey Inward Journey Outward}, 29.
catastrophe, we just might discover that the wax was not an encasement of nothing real, but rather of the really real: the pure, potent, potentiating love of God in us, which we can then offer to an anguished world. Contemplation is crucial because the church needs presence in order to be the church.

**Present in the World: Action’s Twin**

*Faith apart from works is barren.*

Contemplation is a way of being, which is inextricably linked with doing.

Action is a natural outflow of contemplation. Father Richard Rohr, the founder of The Center for Action and Contemplation says this about the organization,

> The most important word in our Center's name is not Action nor is it Contemplation, but the word *and*. We need both action *and* contemplation to have a whole spiritual journey. It doesn't matter which comes first; action may lead you to contemplation and contemplation may lead you to action. But finally, they need and feed each other.

Action is not only a consequence of contemplation but also a source, from two perspectives. First, the contemplative is able to see the presence of God in even the most mundane of good deeds. On the other hand, the pain encountered in acting for justice drives the doer to the heart of Christ for solace and rest.

---

178 James 2:20 (NRSV).

179 “[The active life—good honest works of mercy and charity—and the contemplative life] are joined together so that it is impossible to have one alone; each contains some part of the other.” Obbard, 29-30.


181 “This is one of the goals of the Jewish way of living: to experience commonplace deeds as spiritual adventures, to feel the hidden love and wisdom in all things.” Heschel, *God in Search of Man*, 49.

182 Rohr speaks of people who “entered into the pain of society and had to go to God to find rest for their soul, because their soul was so torn by the broken, split nature of almost everything, including themselves.” Rohr, Daily Meditation, May 13, 2016.
Rohr pairs inward conversion and societal change:

The state of the communal soul is the state of the social order. As Jack Jezreel, founder of JustFaith puts it, “The world cannot be changed by love to become just unless we are changed by love to become whole, but we cannot be made whole without engaging in the work of making the world whole. Personal transformation and social transformation are one piece.”

Mother Theresa of Calcutta pairs prayer and action, “[Prayer] is to love Jesus with undivided love—for you, for me, for all of us. And that undivided love is put into action when we do as Jesus said, “love as I have loved you.” She explains that love has no meaning without action, which she calls service. Contemplation and action are inseparable twins articulated in the great commandments. “You shall love the LORD your God with all your heart, and with all your soul, and with all your might.” and “you shall love your neighbor as yourself: I am the LORD.” Contemplation is crucial because it allows us to be present in the world via loving action.

Summary

Contemplation is a way of being which is humble, open, and present to the moment, allowing one to connect wholly with God. Contemplation is prayer, which leads to seeing, knowing, and loving God. Contemplation is presence, which is critical to waking up, sensing the Spirit, and encountering the Word. It turns self, paradox, and

---

183 Rohr, Daily Meditation, May 9, 2016.
184 Teresa, 46.
185 Ibid., 75.
186 Deut. 6:5 (NRSV).
187 Lev. 19:18 (NRSV).
188 “…there is not true mysticism without charity and there is not charity without incorporation of the Mystical Body of Christ.” Merton, Bread in the Wilderness, 24.
humanness from foes to friends. It leads to wholeness, unity, authenticity, and action. Contemplation—prayer, presence—should be a priority among Christ-followers. The following chapter connects this normative assertion with the implications for ministry leadership.
Chapter Three
Contemplative Leadership: A Spirituality of Leading

Introduction

Ministry, for the purposes of this project, refers to a context in which the stated intention is participating in the redemptive work of the Triune God.¹ This chapter continues and focuses the normative task in light of the seminary context. It frames ministry leaders as contemplative leaders.² The chapter begins by presenting an unfolding definition of leadership and then moves to what ministry leadership looks like in light of contemplation.

Defining Leadership

Parker Palmer offers a potent definition of leadership in Let Your Life Speak:

[A leader is] someone with the power to project either shadow or light onto some part of the world and onto the lives of the people who dwell there. A leader shapes the ethos in which others must live, an ethos as life-filled as heaven or as shadowy as hell.³

The leader’s propensity to project light into the world hinges on how fully the God-created essence of the leader reflects the Creator-God. In other words, it depends on who

---

¹ George Hunsberger describes the mission of the church as being “a unique community of those who live under the reign of God….displaying] the firstfruits of the forgiven and forgiving people of God…..and being] a harbinger of the new humanity that lives in genuine community, a form of companionship and wholeness that humanity craves.” Darrell Guder, Ed., Missional Church: A Vision for the Sending of the Church in North America (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1998), 103.


the leader is as a person and what actions consequently flow from that.\(^4\) William Ayot poetically concurs in “The Contract: A word from the led:”

And in the end we follow them—
not because we are paid,
not because we might see some advantage,
not because of the things they have accomplished,
not even because of the dreams they dream,
but simply because of who they are:
the man, the woman, the leader, the boss,
standing up there when the wave hits the rock,
passing out faith and confidence like life jackets,
knowing the currents, holding the doubts,
imagining the delights and terrors of every landfall;
captain, pirate, and parent by turns,
the bearer of our countless hopes and expectations.
We give them our trust. We give them our effort.
What we ask in return is that they stay true.\(^5\)

Others absorb the values, qualities, characteristics, habits, and energy exuded by leaders. Parenting offers a prime example of how leadership influence flows out of who leaders are and what actions result. This truth is captured in the ironic mantra, “Do as I say, not as I do.”\(^6\) Parents intuit that their children are less likely to follow their instructions than to mimic their being as persons.

---

\(^4\) Kyle Small sets out an understanding of flow from being to doing when he talks about theological education through the lens of \textit{paideia}; “a process of culturing the soul.” In the process of \textit{paideia} the student leader develops a “second nature” which is “a disposition of redemption; it is a baptismal identity.” Kyle Small in \textit{The Missional Church and Leadership Formation}, edited by Craig Van Gelder (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing, 2009), 52.


\(^6\) “[The process of creating] rhythms designed to foster a way of life in community that is deeply good for the human soul…is led in very [practical ways by leaders who are living within limits themselves, who are in touch with their own humanity and wrestling honestly with the realities of their own life. There is no way to circumvent the personal honesty and struggle that are required in order to lead others in this way with integrity. It is not good enough to say, ‘Don’t do as I do, do as I say.’ In this case, our lives must speak before our mouths do.” Ruth Haley Barton, \textit{Strengthening the Soul of Your Leadership: Seeking God in the Crucible of Ministry} (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Books, 2008) 129.
Leaders’ power can be for good or ill; for light or shadow; for life and healing or for death and harm. Leadership which grows from greed, hatred, fear, pride, or selfish ambition veers universally toward harm. This is true of ministry leadership—the intention of which is participating in the redemptive work of the Triune God—as well as leadership which claims no affiliation with God. This project suggests characteristics of leadership for light and for life.

Life-giving ministry leadership frees others to live into their God-intended fullness. The term life-giving, as used here, assumes a world-view in which life is always of God and in which Jesus is the Way, the Truth, and the Life. God-intended fullness has triple meaning in this definition. First, it means the full humanity for which humankind was created, as exemplified by Jesus and delineated by the fruits of the Spirit. Full humanity comprises love, joy, peace, patience, gentleness, goodness, faith, humility, and self-control. Second, God-intended fullness encompasses the true self, or essence, each individual person has embedded within them. The true self is the indestructible core of each person designed by God in the image of God. Third, God-intended fullness refers to God-given vocation in the world, both individually and communally. The vocation for which every person comes into this world is loving God and loving neighbor. Under that all-encompassing umbrella, individuals and communities are invited to live into love in infinite forms. Individuals are gifted to be apostles, prophets, pastors,

7 Peter refers to Jesus as “the Author of life” in Acts 3:15.
8 John 14:6.
9 Gal. 5:22-23.
10 “Calling is first and foremost the calling to be yourself, that self that God created you to be.” Barton, 77.
Likewise, God invites each community to do justice, love mercy, and walk humbly with God according to what people and concerns come across their path.¹²

Life-giving leadership flows from relationship. The Imago Dei calls us to an imagination of an interconnected relationship between leaders and followers. The perichoretic relationship of the Trinity is a model for leadership in which mutuality becomes the underlayment and beauty is the result. The intertwining choresis, or dance, of the persons of the Trinity conveys loving interdependence, mutual regard, and a whole greater than the sum of the parts.¹³ This sort of relationship between leader and others could be visualized as follows.

Figure 3.3.

The flow of the mutuality in this illustration—and in the Imago Dei inspired vision of leadership—is artistic and creative. The whole is a beautiful blend of the parts, which becomes something beyond our ability to delineate and define. Those who lead in

---

¹¹ Eph. 4:11.

¹² Mic. 6:8.

¹³ Biblical expressions of the intertwining of the Trinity: "I and the Father are one" (John 10:30, NASB). "When the Helper comes, whom I will send to you from the Father, that is the Spirit of truth, who proceeds from the Father, He will bear witness of Me" (John 15:26, NASB). "But if the Spirit of Him who raised Jesus from the dead dwells in you, He who raised Christ Jesus from the dead will also give life to your mortal bodies through His Spirit who indwells you" (Rom. 8:11, NASB). “The grace of the Lord Jesus Christ, and the love of God, and the fellowship of the Holy Spirit, be with you all” 2Cor. 13:14-1 (NASB).
mutuality help to create conditions where all are supported, encouraged, and considered equally significant. Power flows freely within parameters of respect, trust, and mutual submission. All participants are free to be authentic and accountable. Roles are determined in light of the gifts, talents, and needs of each person. Under such conditions, creativity blossoms and fear withers. Most significantly, love is the underpinning and the umbrella.

Leading people to discover and live out their original design is a significant challenge which requires leaders to tend to their own God-created essence, whence comes their greatest potential for good. That is why contemplation is crucial to leadership development. Nouwen explains:

It is not enough for priests and ministers of the future to be moral people, well trained, eager to help their fellow humans, and able to respond creatively to the burning issues of their time. All of that is very valuable and important, but it is not the heart of Christian leadership. The central question is, Are the leaders of the

---

14 “Therefore encourage one another, and build up one another, just as you also are doing. I Thess. 5:11 (NASB).

“Do nothing from selfish ambition or conceit, but in humility regard others as better than yourselves. Let each of you look not to your own interests, but to the interests of others” Phil. 2:3-4 (NRSV).

15 “But Jesus called them to Himself, and said, “You know that the rulers of the Gentiles lord it over them, and their great men exercise authority over them. It is not so among you, but whoever wishes to become great among you shall be your servant. Mat t.20:25-26 (NASB).

16 “Do not lie to one another, since you laid aside the old self with its evil practices, and have put on the new self who is being renewed to a true knowledge according to the image of the One who created him.” Col. 3:9-10 (NASB).

“The temptation to compromise basic Christian values—love, community, truth-telling, confession and reconciliation, silent listening and waiting on God for discernment—for the sake of expedience is very great.” Barton , 27.

17 “And since we have gifts that differ according to the grace given to us, let each exercise them accordingly:” Rom. 12:6 (NASB)

18 “Beloved, let us love one another, for love is from God; and everyone who loves is born of God and knows God.” 1John 4:7 (NASB)

19 “But one of the things I know for sure is that those who are looking to us for spiritual sustenance need us first and foremost to be spiritual seekers ourselves.” Barton, 29.
future truly men and women of God, people with an ardent desire to dwell in God’s presence, to listen to God’s voice, to look at God’s beauty, to touch God’s incarnate Word, and to taste fully God’s infinite goodness?²⁰

This sort of attention and intention will be referred to hereafter as *contemplative leadership*. Contemplative leadership requires leaders to be present to God, others, self, and the world. Being present means being connected. Being connected means loving. God, self, others, and the world, though distinct, are not separate. We love God by loving others. Being present to the world makes us present to God. Loving others requires loving self. We are made of the stuff of the world. Contemplative leaders sense the connection and help others experience it as well.

**Contemplative Leaders**

What follows is a description of contemplative leaders; leaders who lead from the core of their true God-created selves. These leaders have a way of being that is humble, open, and present in the moment, allowing them to connect wholly with God. Of course, no leader lives fully from the true self. No leader is totally humble, open, or present. However, the traits the Spirit is longing to unearth in today’s leaders are both beautiful and compelling. The world and the church are desperate for leaders who embody them. We have need of leaders who are humble enough to lead communally and collaboratively. We are desperate for leaders who are open enough to love and act with integrity. We require leaders who are present enough to listen and to confront.

Humble

**Contemplative Leaders are Communal**

Contemplative leaders are herd animals. They are humble enough to know they cannot survive alone. They know they are designed to exist in community. They need others. They have begun to unlearn the cultural mandate of independence. Their worldview has been altered by tapping into the molten core of the world, where “our universal connectedness ignites our love for one another.” They allow themselves to become deeply interwoven with those in their context, choosing not to keep the distance often suggested by professional standards. Nouwen boldly and adamantly rejects such standards:

*When the members of a community of faith cannot truly know and love their shepherd, shepherding quickly becomes a subtle way of exercising power over others and begins to show authoritarian and dictatorial traits. The world in which we live—a world of efficiency and control—has no models to offer to those who want to be shepherds in the way Jesus was a shepherd. Even the so-called “helping professions” have been so thoroughly secularized that mutuality can only be seen as a weakness and a dangerous form of role confusion.*

Communal leaders do not conceive of the responsibilities of ministry as primarily resting on their shoulders. They know that “we are called to proclaim the gospel together, in community,” as Nouwen puts it. They humbly lead from the perspective of we and us, rather than I and me.

---


22 See “Presence to Others: Molten Core” in Chapter Two.

23 Nouwen, *In the Name of Jesus*, 62.

24 Ibid., 59.
Contemplative Leaders Collaborate

Contemplative leaders cooperate. They are not in leadership for the maintaining of their egos, one version of which Nouwen names as looking spectacular in order to draw applause.\textsuperscript{25} Contemplative leaders are not superstars. They can draw the creativity of others to the collaboration table and entice even the most reserved to contribute and invest. They live from a humble mind and heart, which allows them to entertain ideas other than their own. Collaborative leaders lead teams that bring out the best in everyone, without requiring recognition. Collaborative leaders know that “all creativity comes from love,” as Dr. Tom Boogaart once posited, and that together, a team who truly loves each other can generate ideas that far outweigh the sum of the individual work of many.\textsuperscript{26}

Collaborative leaders fail and encourage others to do so as well. They embrace risk. They also applaud others who take the courageous step out onto the bridge of risk, which may either link them to new horizons or plunge them into failure creek. Mistakes are considered as means of discernment, and disappointments as stepping stones to maturity. Humble leaders are able to allow themselves to fail because their identity is not synonymous with their accomplishments and successes.

Contemplative leaders draw out the true essence of others. They recognize a person’s gifts, often before that person does. They name the gifts, orchestrate opportunities to employ them, and then support and empower the exercise of the gifts. Contemplative leaders can see others’ talents and abilities because they have trained to see beyond the obvious. They can encourage others’ gifts because they are not

\textsuperscript{25} Ibid., 53.

\textsuperscript{26} Dr. Tom Boogaart, in a discussion about teamwork.
threatened. It is not unusual for another to blossom under the warmth of a collaborative leader’s reassurance.

Contemplative leaders intuit that, in order to lead, they must learn and be led. Learning is a lifestyle they never move beyond. They cultivate curiosity. They invite others to lead them; to probe, advise, and correct them. They are often led by the ones least likely to be considered leaders, like those who are very young, mentally impaired, or marginalized. Being led, demands an innate humility. It concedes that the leader is not omniscient. It admits to limitations and liabilities. Contemplative leaders become humble when they allow the Spirit to put them in perspective. They are the pot and not the potter. They are human beings and not god. They are dust.

Contemplative leaders are not control mongers. They can share power, relinquish power, and empower others. Nouwen goes so far as to imply that, when it comes to leadership, good power is an oxymoron. Surely, situations in which power in the hands of Christians led to death and destruction are legion, including devastation of native tribes, domination of African peoples, and denigration of LGBT persons. Nouwen expounds:

The temptation to consider power an apt instrument for the proclamation of the Gospel is the greatest of all. We keep hearing from others as well as saying to ourselves, that having power—provided it is used in the service of God and your fellow human beings—is a good thing….Every time we see a major crisis in the history of the church…, we always see that a major cause of rupture is the power exercised by those who claim to be followers of the poor and powerless Jesus.28

Nouwen’s assessment of the history of the church is alarmingly accurate. Yet, ministry leaders wield power whether they want to or not. Contemplative leaders have a sober recognition of their power and its potential for destructiveness. They do not accept the

---

27 Nouwen, In the Name of Jesus, 71-90.

28 Ibid., 76-77.
substitute that power offers to “the hard task of love,” to echo Nouwen. Instead, they do the work of developing healthy intimate relationships that will prompt them to set aside their power in favor of humility and collaboration. Nouwen calls it “a leadership in which power is constantly abandoned in favor of love.”

Open

**Contemplative Leaders Love**

Love is the first and foremost act of leaders. Contemplative leaders love because they can’t help it. Their hearts are soft and open. Their individual souls and bodies cannot contain the volume of love that is being poured into them by their Maker. Like a tiered fountain, their reciprocal love for God spills over onto all who get in the way. Nouwen narrates it like this:

Knowing the heart of Jesus and loving him are the same thing. The knowledge of Jesus’ heart is a knowledge of the heart. And when we live in the world with that knowledge, we cannot do other than bring healing, reconciliation, new life, and hope wherever we go. The desire to be relevant and successful will gradually disappear, and our only desire will be to say with our whole being to our brothers and sisters of the human race, “You are loved.”

God-derived love causes genuine affection for the other, an openness to see God’s imprint in the other, and a desire for the flourishing of the other. It is irresistible and automatically enlivens and encourages. Loving leaders touch lives simply by showing up. All other characteristics of the contemplative leader flow from the spring of love which wells up inside the leader and originates from God.

---

29 Ibid., 77.

30 Ibid., 82.

31 Ibid., 41.
Contemplative leaders are compassionate. They are open enough to sense the suffering of others and feel it with them. They recognize the roots of pain and resist judgement. They acknowledge their mutual humanity and hold the other’s heartache gently. They are slow to become angry and quick to forgive. Contemplative leaders can be compassionate because they are already facing their shadows, so they have no need to foist them onto the other. Palmer champions the importance of the leader’s openness to inner work, for just this reason:

Why must we go in and down? Because as we do so, we will meet the darkness that we carry within ourselves—the ultimate source of the shadows that we project onto other people. If we do not understand that the enemy is within, we will find a thousand ways of making someone “out there” into the enemy, becoming leaders who oppress rather than liberate others.32

Compassionate leaders have no need to criticize another in order to elevate themselves. They have little urge to either envy or chastise. They default to empathy, having seen in themselves the patterns that trip so many and having been drenched anyway in the grace of God.

**Contemplative Leaders are Integrated**

Contemplative leaders live and lead with integrity. They seem to others like the same person in every situation.33 They do not need a different persona for different occasions, because they operate out of the openness of their true God-created essence, which is congruent and consistent. They do not cling to an image that requires maneuvering and covering, so they can relate openly and honestly what is happening

---


inside them, inspiring others to do the same. Authenticity rings like a clear bell from their lives and generates authenticity in those they love.

Contemplative leaders know they have bodies and that bodies were God’s idea. Sometimes this awareness is long in coming because leaders are so prone to living in their heads. Feeling the sunshine on the face, the grass beneath the feet, or the burn of love in the chest are gifts afforded by paying attention in silence. Leaders who are open to living in and loving their bodies become grounded in the created world, connected to the healing powers of God’s earth, and grateful for the physicality of reality.

Integrated leaders are undivided. They live fully from heart, soul, mind, and body, which are united in utter devotion to God. Their actions spring directly from their true essence, which blesses their communities and the world. Their words and their actions coincide. Contemplative leaders do not weigh their words in the balance of what people want to hear, or what will get people to do what the leader wants, or what will make the leader most likable. People feel secure that what the leader says is what the leader believes, unlike the gentleman, as defined in the movie, Zorro. “A gentleman is simply someone who says one thing and thinks another.”

Contemplative leaders weigh their words with care. They know that words still create worlds, as when God spoke the universe into being. They know that words of

---

34 “When we are rooted in true self, we can act in ways that are life-giving for us and all whose lies we touch. Whatever we do to care for true self is, in the long run, a gift to the world.” Palmer, Hidden Wholeness, 39.


36 “Those of us who preach and teach and minister to each other need to focus on the word—on words—more explicitly, intentionally and caringly as part of the practice of our trade. This is necessary and urgent activism: to resist “newspeak,” to insist on precision and clarity…We are stewards of the treasures
blessing bring life, as when Isaac blessed Jacob. They know that words of cursing bring
destruction, as when Elisha cursed Gehazi and he went away “as white as snow.”
Integrated leaders use words frugally and choose their words wisely. Children grow into
the people their parents tell them they are. So too, the stories a leader spins influence how
the community views themselves and, consequently, how they relate to each other and
the world.

Contemplative leaders are not compartmentalized. Integrated means not separated
or scattered. It means whole. Leaders must be undivided because the cost of being
divided is severe for them and for those around them. Palmer paints the dismal picture:

I pay a steep price when I live a divided life—feeling fraudulent, anxious about
being found out, and depressed by the fact that I am denying my own selfhood. The
people around me pay a price as well, for now they walk on ground made
unstable by my dividedness. …A fault line runs down the middle of my life, and
whenever it cracks open—divorcing my words and actions from the truth I hold
within—things around me get shaky and start to fall apart.

Contemplative leaders confess. They are not afraid to tell the truth about their
shadows. They admit their sins. They have learned that ignoring and denying their
shadows gives the shadows free reign and that sin is like shiitake mushrooms: it grows
best in the dark. These lessons are very painful. They require the leader to look openly
and squarely at sin, name, and claim it. The leader must let go of his or her illusions of
perfection, spiritual maturity, superiority, or whatever other favorite illusion the leader

that have been put into our keeping.” Marilyn Chandler McEntyre, Caring for Words in a Culture of
Lies (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2009), 20.

37 Gen. 1.
38 Gen. 27.
39 II Kings 5.
40 Palmer, Hidden Wholeness, 5.
has secretly nursed over the years. However, integrated leaders discover that letting go of their illusions will free them from the unmitigated power of their shadows. The light of confession overcomes the darkness of sin. When shadows are exposed to the light, they lose their shadowiness and become light.

Contemplative leaders open themselves for accountability to others. They extend implicit and explicit permission for trusted others to test their values and opinions, challenge their behaviors, and question their motives. Nouwen asserts that priests and ministers cannot “feel really loved and cared for when they have to hide their own sins and failings from the people to whom they minister.” Yet he offers a vital nuance to confession and accountability in regard to leadership.

All of this does not mean that ministers or priests must, explicitly, bring their own sins or failures into the pulpit or into their daily ministries. That would be unhealthy and imprudent….I am convinced that priests and ministers, especially those who relate to many anguishing people, need a truly safe place for themselves. They need a place where they can share their deep pain and struggle with people who do not need them, but who can guide them ever deeper into the mystery of God’s love. 

Integral leaders intuit when and where to confess their sins. But they do it and when they do they model courage and openness, and receive grace in their time of need.

Contemplative leaders change. They seek personal transformation by opening their hearts to new opportunities and new understandings. They also nurture communities into change. They can manage the anxiety of the community around change because they are non-anxious. Silence and solitude have trained their hearts to stay grounded when the community reacts. They are flexible and adaptable. Integral leaders do not encourage

41 Nouwen, In the Name of Jesus, 65.
42 Ibid., 69-70.
change for change sake, but in order to help the community continually align with the community’s mission and values. They help the community sense the nudging of the Spirit and then offer empathy and reassurance as the community submits to the nudging.

Contemplative leaders are open enough to hold tension. They expand beyond the craving for black and white, right and wrong, in and out. By letting go of their attachments and their ego’s demands, they have allowed the Spirit to open a large inner space in them. They can hold in their bodies two truths that seem to be mutually exclusive. They know that every person is both light and shadow and they need not force anyone into a category. Integral leaders enter what Rohr refers to as the second half of life, a condition that allows them to live quite happily in paradox, mystery, and non-dualism.

Present

**Contemplative Leaders Listen**

Contemplative leaders listen to others. They are able to listen because the noise within them is routinely dialed down by connection with God and awareness of self. They need not take on the anxiety of the other person. They need not maintain their image or make an impression. Rather, listening leaders can offer full presence to the

---

43 The foundation of good leadership is “an identity formed through refusing the easy answer. It is a way of holding seemingly discordant elements together by making the conversation between seeming contradictions everyday and real.” David Whyte in Intrator and Scribner, 239.


45 “I attempt to remember, every day, that leadership is not about the ‘traffic,’ but about encouraging the flowering of spirit in those whose lives I touch.” Betty Sue Flowers in Intrator and Scribner, 122.
other, hearing both what is said and what is left unsaid. In doing so, they confirm the value of the other.46

Contemplative leaders also listen on behalf of others. They eavesdrop on the soul, hearing in the person what she or he had not yet identified. They recognize the Spirit in the sacred space of loving human connection and ask questions that help the other to spot the Spirit as well. Nouwen explains:

God’s presence is often a hidden presence, a presence that needs to be discovered. The loud boisterous noises of the world make us deaf to the soft, gentle and loving voice of God. A Christian leader is called to help people to hear that voice and so be comforted and consoled.47

Listening leaders help others hear the soft, gentle, and loving voice because they have slowed down enough to hear it themselves, even though almost all things ministry related thwart it. Cramped schedules, myriad expectations, and striving for significance crowd the calendar, the mind, and the emotions. Rarely does anyone encourage ministry leaders to withdraw, be quiet, and do less. Contemplative leaders practice silence and solitude anyway, against the grain and sometimes against the advice of those who pay them. It doesn’t take long for leaders to discover that, when they are silent, they can’t help but hear God. They become present to the Spirit who is always communicating but rarely screams.

**Contemplative Leaders Confront**

Contemplative leaders confront difficult relational dynamics. Conflict is a springboard for growth and relationship. Avoiding conflict makes for spiritual mediocrity

---

46 “When people listened to me I felt like I was somebody worth hearing.” Estrus Tucker in Intrator and Scribner, 64.

47 Nouwen, *In the Name of Jesus*, 89-90.
and fragile friendships. Contemplative leaders remain present to confrontational situations with humility and openness because they have an underground river of peace that calms and sustains them. They are able to help those in conflict with each other or with the leader identify what they feel and need, and express clearly what matters to them. Contemplative leaders are able to hear, and help others hear, the pain inherent in all sides of a conflict. They are able to speak difficult truth, while acknowledging the positive motives and traits of the other. Contemplative leaders take ownership for their part in a broken relationship and invite the one they offended to share how the leader’s action affected them. They say, “I’m sorry, forgive me.” They also say, “I forgive you. Let’s go forward together.” Contemplative leaders are courageous that way.

Contemplative leaders confront evil and injustice. Because they routinely draw near to God, the heart of God rubs off on them. They begin to see the world as God sees and feel the emotions God feels. Injustices they didn’t notice before, and which most consider normal, grate on their souls and they are prompted to speak, with firmness and frankness but also with mercy and measure. Controversial issues are not a reason to retreat. Rather, they are a call to presence and courage. Potentially divisive topics are not an opportunity to dig in and prove one’s opinions right. Rather, they are an invitation, as Nouwen beautifully puts it, “to remain flexible without being relativistic, convinced without being rigid, willing to confront without being offensive, gentle and forgiving without being soft, and true witnesses without being manipulative.”

---

48 “I don’t want to take [students] to the edge of the existential abyss. But if we do not speak about hard things in the classroom and from the pulpit, where will the leadership come from to help each other distinguish truth from lies?” McEntyre, 63.

49 Nouwen, In the Name of Jesus, 47.
asserts that future leaders need to be, not more moral, but more mystical, defined by him as having an identity “deeply rooted in God’s first love.”\textsuperscript{50}

Summary

Life-giving ministry leadership is influencing others toward living into their God-designed fullness. Contemplative leadership requires leaders to be humble, open, and present, and thus connected to and loving God, others, self, and the world. Contemplative leaders are humble enough to be communal and collaborative. They are open enough to be loving and integrated. They are present enough to listen and confront. Chapter Four incorporates wisdom from the discipline of the arts to begin addressing the question of how contemplative leadership can be nurtured.

\textsuperscript{50} Ibid., 42.
Chapter Four  
The Enneagram  

Introduction

Chapter Three asserted that contemplative leadership is the appropriate response to the conclusion that contemplation is normative and formative among Christ-followers. Chapter Four begins the interpretive task by exploring the wisdom of the enneagram in an effort to determine its usefulness in training for contemplative leadership. Osmer explains theoretical interpretation as follows:

This is the ability to draw on theories of the arts and sciences to understand and respond to particular episodes, situations, or contexts….My approach…presupposes fallibilist and perspectival understandings of theoretical knowledge. By fallibilist I mean an awareness that the theories constructed by human reason offer an approximation of the truth, not truth itself….By perspectival I mean that theories construct knowledge from a particular perspective, or position.¹

The enneagram is a theory of the arts which stands to help us understand one way to respond to the need for developing contemplative leadership in the seminary context. The wisdom of the enneagram offers an approximation of the truth which is constructed from a particular perspective and it falls in the category of “theories most relevant to the case and their contribution to the realization of moral ends defined theologically” as Osmer says.² Chapter Four begins by defining the enneagram, including a brief history, and continues by addressing the value of the enneagram for contemplative leadership formation. For an extensive list of resources for learning more about the enneagram, see Appendix H.

² Ibid., 85.
Defining the Enneagram

The enneagram is a geometric figure that maps out nine fundamental patterns in which human beings try to counteract the brokenness of the world. (See Fig 4.1.) Riso and Hudson, founders of the Enneagram Institute, describe the enneagram as “a tool for transformation that uses the clarity and insight of psychology as a point of entry into a profound universal spirituality.” However, the enneagram is not scientific psychology at its core. Rather, the enneagram evolved from an amalgamation of ancient wisdom sources. The history is somewhat of a mystery since those who transmitted the knowledge across the ages are said to have maintained high levels of secrecy, presumably due to the potent nature of wisdom. The roots of the ideas leading to the enneagram go back at least to the 3rd Century. The symbol as we have it today was brought to the

---


5 Riso and Hudson, 22.
Western world by Ivanovich Gurdjieff in 1916. He, along with several colleagues, searched for ancient wisdom Gurdjieff believed had been lost over the centuries. They traveled extensively to places like Egypt, Afghanistan, Greece, Persia, India, and Tibet, visiting monasteries and sanctuaries. Upon compiling the hard won wisdom, Gurdjieff taught the enneagram as a model of natural processes, not a psychological typology as it is sometimes considered today. The wisdom that Gurdjieff synthesized was not expressly Christian, although early Christian sources were among his chief findings. The history and meaning of the enneagram need to be considered in two segments: the symbol and the nine types.

The enneagram symbol is composed of three figures; circle, triangle and hexad.

![Enneagram Symbol](image)

**Figure 4.2**

According to Gurdjieff, the meaning of the symbols is as follows. The circle represents unity, wholeness and oneness. In Christian terms this resonates with the deeper meaning

---

6 Rohr and Ebert, 6.
7 Riso and Hudson, 20.
8 Ibid.
9 Ibid.
of the shema.\textsuperscript{10} The shema declares that God is one, indicating not only monotheism but also an integral completeness of God, and follows with a call to us for the same. The triangle illustrates the expression of the universe in triads. Gurdjieff is said to have discovered that everything that exists is the result of the interaction of three forces.\textsuperscript{11} Of course, Christian tradition gifts us with the trio of Father, Son, and Holy Spirit. For Gurdjieff the hexad represented the law of seven, which states that nothing is static but rather, everything is dynamic.\textsuperscript{12} In Christian rhetoric this may be akin to sanctification and transformation. The second half of the denominational mantra of the Reformed Church in America, \textit{reformed and reforming}—and more recently \textit{transformed and transforming}—fosters this principle.

The nine types were first linked to the symbol in the 1950s by Oscar Ichazo, who saw the types as human reflections of godly attributes\textsuperscript{13} This concept probably originates from third century Plotinus and others.\textsuperscript{14} These attributes first came into Christianity, however, via the desert fathers and mothers, as their opposites, in the fourth Century; the seven deadly sins, to which are added fear and deceit.\textsuperscript{15} The Kabbalah, teachings of the Jewish mystics in the twelfth through fourteenth centuries, represents nine qualities of

\begin{itemize}
    \item \textsuperscript{10} “Hear O, Israel, the Lord is your God. The Lord is one.” Deut. 6:4 (Translation mine).
    \item \textsuperscript{11} Riso and Hudson, 21.
    \item \textsuperscript{12} Ibid.
    \item \textsuperscript{13} Ibid.
    \item \textsuperscript{14} Ibid.
    \item \textsuperscript{15} It is noteworthy that the Christian inventory of characteristics came from the perspective of depravity and not from the perspective of the image of God, a trend which seems to continue today in many Christian circles.
\end{itemize}
God plus the Cosmic Messiah, as the Tree of Life. The story goes that Sufi mysticism was also a significant contributor to the wisdom expressed in the enneagram and was also one of Gurdjieff’s primary sources. While this is very likely true, empirical proof to that effect is still lacking. In 1970, Claudio Naranjo correlated the enneagram types to psychological categories he was already familiar with and researched his proposed connections with panels of people representing each type. It could easily be argued that the enneagram is yet another method of categorizing human behavior into what can become narrow and confining classifications. A variety of such classifications exist today, many of which are quite helpful in gaining self-understanding, but which, like the enneagram, can become prescriptive and limiting.

Value of the Enneagram

Given the relative nebulousness concerning the origins of the enneagram, the limited amount of empirical research, and the temptation toward what Rohr calls, “crude reduction of human behavior to a limited number of character types,” one might wonder about the value of becoming familiar with the enneagram; “Can it possibly make any significant contribution toward contemplative leadership formation?”

One way to conceive theologically of what the enneagram expresses is in terms of the image of God. From this perspective, each person comes into the world carrying the

---

16 Rohr, *The Enneagram*, 7 and 16.

17 “…in the whole body of Sufi literature there is not the faintest allusion to the enneagram.” Rohr, *The Enneagram*, 8.

18 Riso and Hudson, 24.

19 For example: Meyers Briggs, The Colby Inventory, and Strength Finders.

20 Rohr, *The Enneagram*, 3.
image of God. Each person bears the undivided Imago Dei, and also specially embodies and cherishes a particular aspect of the image of God, what Ichazo had referred to as the divine attributes. The enneagram then becomes a lovely and intriguing representation of humankind in the likeness of God, mirroring the essence and beauty of God.

The narrative moves biblically from Imago Dei to Fall. Each child makes two tragic and disorienting discoveries at some point early in life. First, the essence they have been created to most cherish in the image of God is threatened in their world. And second, the quality of the image of God they treasure is threatened in themselves. Because this primal catastrophe, or fall, is both devastating and terrifying to the child, the defenses of the child go to work creating strategies to compensate for the perceived loss. The strategies become patterns, and the patterns become habitual. The strategies initially serve to protect the child, yet the patterns continue into adulthood and become damaging to the person and to others.

Each of the nine patterns, or types, explicates the preferred set of strategies utilized by the person with that type in an effort to reconnect with the desired quality of the image of God, which feels lost. Since every person is the bearer of the undivided

---

21 “So God created humankind in his image, in the image of God he created them; “ Gen. 1:27(NRSV).

22 Riso and Hudson, 22.

23 “We know that the whole creation has been groaning as in the pains of childbirth right up to the present time.” Rom. 8:22 (NIV)

24 “Therefore, just as through one man sin entered into the world, and death through sin, and so death spread to all men, because all sinned….“ Rom. 5:12 (NASB)

25 “This loss of contact with our depths is called the fall in some of the spiritual schools.” Sandra Maitri, The Spiritual Dimension of the Enneagram: Nine Faces of the Soul (New York: Penguin Putnam Inc., 2000), 30.

26 Like a desperate Adam and Eve in the garden after encountering the serpent and succumbing to temptation.
image of God, all of the compensatory strategies function to some degree in each person. However, the patterns identified by each person’s type are more predominant than the others for that person. Because the patterns have become habitual, they happen without conscious thought or decision. They are a way of being.

The patterns can be referred to with multiple labels, for instance, *obsessions*, *pitfalls*, or *barriers*. Richard Rohr, however, calls them *sins*. Sins is a powerful and sobering theological expression for understanding the enneagram types because it names our most usual and automatic behaviors as a missing of the mark of God’s will. The *sins* the enneagram names are far more insidious, dangerous, and fundamental than the moral failings Christians are most often concerned with and preach against. Elizabeth O’Conner beautifully expresses this view:

> It is the amazing love of God that wills a man grow straight and tall in his soul [sic]. This is why in the cataloguing of sins some are called deadly. Not, as we thought, for moralistic reasons, but because they block growth in us, and in others.

Here the value of the enneagram in Christian leadership formation comes clear, for it offers a direct route to discovering and owning our most basic sins, thereby disarming and disempowering them.

---

27 Rohr, *The Enneagram*, 27.

28 On a personal note - somehow, in *The Enneagram, A Christian Perspective*, Richard Rohr managed to put words on my growing uneasiness about the contemporary Western church. He laments our preoccupation with the popular definition of sin as moral failure, because it prevents us from recognizing the real sins. It seems to me that if we can recognize, admit and confront these sins, we stand a chance of transformation.


30 “Removing every obstacle to union first requires us to see that we harbor internal obstacles, parts of ourselves that act out of accord with our deepest, truest self. Identifying and naming these divided
Theologically, the enneagram can also be considered in terms of community and the body of Christ. If various God-qualities are most embodied in certain people, the whole of the community can be a portrait of Christ in the world. The enneagram calls attention to the diversity of humankind in the types, and the unity of humankind in the circle that connects them. Paul explains: “Now there are varieties of gifts, but the same Spirit.”\(^\text{31}\) We need each other, in order to fulfill our mission of compassion, justice, and love in the world.

Rohr explains how wholeness, as pictured and prompted by the enneagram, matters for the world: “By forcing us to face our own darkness, it soon leads us to address that same darkness as it shows itself in culture, oppression, injustice, and human degradation.”\(^\text{32}\) In the end, the wholeness and connection afforded by contemplation becomes a compass for action. Palmer calls it living “undivided lives that are joined to the needs of the world.”\(^\text{33}\) The enneagram affords an organic connection between contemplation and action, as understood by the writer of Hebrews: “Let us also lay aside every weight and the sin that clings so closely, and let us run with perseverance the race that is set before us.”\(^\text{34}\)

The idea of laying aside weights leads to yet another way to think theologically about the enneagram; in terms of the true self and the false self. The term “true self”

\(^{31}\) 1Cor. 12:4 (NRSV).

\(^{32}\) Rohr, *The Enneagram*, xxi.


\(^{34}\) Heb. 12:1 (NRSV).
refers to the fullness of the person God created each to be, in God’s own image. Paul uses the term new self: “Clothe yourselves with the new self, created according to the likeness of God in true righteousness and holiness.” The false self, then, is everything that interferes with the God-designed person being manifest, “You were taught to put away your former way of life, your old self, corrupt and deluded by its lusts.”

If the true self were pictured as a beautiful, pure, and reflective diamond, the false self might be like a shell of scales, which covers the brilliance of the diamond. The process of shedding the false/old self and the emerging of the true/new self describes sanctification. Rohr puts it this way. “Sins are fixations that prevent the energy of life, God’s love, from flowing freely…” and create “…self-erected blockades that cut us off from God and hence from our own authentic potential.” The enneagram offers an opening for the Spirit to bring self-awareness that can loosen the scales of the false self and unveil the beauty of the God-created true self. Christ is the first fruits of the true self, being fully human and without sin. In this way, the enneagram is a tool toward Christ-likeness. C.S. Lewis poignantly captures the pain and beauty of the Spirit’s work

35 Eph. 4:24 (NRSV).

36 Eph.4:22 (NRSV).

37 Rohr, 34.

38 “Do not lie to one another, seeing that you have stripped off the old self with its practices.” Col. 3:9 (NRSV)

39 “Therefore, He had to be made like His brethren in all things, that He might become a merciful and faithful high priest in things pertaining to God, to make propitiation for the sins of the people.” Heb 2:17 (NASB).

40 “For we do not have a high priest who is unable to sympathize with our weaknesses, but we have one who in every respect has been tested as we are, yet without sin.” Heb 4:15 (NRSV).
of transformation in uncovering the true self. Lewis tells the story of the encounter of Eustace, boy turned dragon, with the fierce and compassionate Aslan:

The very first tear he made was so deep that I thought it had gone right into my heart. And when he began pulling the skin off, it hurt worse than anything I’ve ever felt. The only thing that made me able to bear it was just the pleasure of feeling the stuff peel off…. And there it was lying on the grass; only so much thicker, and darker, and more knobly looking …and there I was as smooth and soft as a peeled switch and smaller than I had been. Then he caught hold of me—I didn’t like that much for I was very tender underneath now that I’d no skin on—and threw me into the water. It smarted like anything but only for a moment. After that it became perfectly delicious and as soon as I started swimming and splashing I found that all the pain had gone….And then I saw why. I’d turned into a boy again.41

It is vital to understand the agency of work involving the enneagram. The enneagram can easily be regarded as another self-help tool. In the rhetoric of secular humanism, it sounds like a self-improvement plan for recognizing and changing one’s shortcomings. However, from a Christian perspective, it becomes a theological necessity, as always, to hold the tension between what humans do; “Work out your own salvation with fear and trembling,”42 and what God does; “for it is God who works in you to will and to act in order to fulfill his good purpose.”43 Elizabeth O’Conner addresses the paradox this way. “…becoming more conscious, more whole, or more holy…. is change that we must struggle for, but when it comes it is always by the grace of God.”44 It could be said that the enneagram helps us to nurture an openness in which the Holy Spirit can both be heard and have transformative sway.45


42 Phil. 2:12 (NRSV).

43 Phil. 2:13 (NIV).

44 O’Conner, Our Many Selves, 59.
All of these theological images illuminate why the enneagram can be a pathway to contemplation. The enneagram can serve to connect us more deeply with God; “Love the Lord your God with all your heart, soul, and strength.” It paves the way for removing barriers between us and God. The enneagram can serve to connect us more deeply to each other; “and love your neighbor.” It inspires compassion in our differences, unity in our similarities and authenticity in our relationships. The enneagram can serve to connect us more deeply to ourselves; “as yourself.” It brings to consciousness what we never noticed before, potentially allowing our true, God-designed essence to emerge.

Summary

The wisdom of the enneagram, is a valuable theory in training for contemplative ministry leadership. The enneagram draws from multiple sources and proves to be theologically compelling. It is the contemplative potential of the enneagram that led to the designing of a retreat experience for first year seminary students. The following

---

45 “With the Enneagram it’s a matter of inner work that can lend authenticity to our spiritual path.” Rohr, The Enneagram, 25.

46 Duet. 6:5.

47 Lev. 18:19.

48 Lev. 18:19.

49 Richard Rohr claims that his first exposure to the Enneagram was a “great overwhelming spiritual experience” (23). I have to admit that to be true for myself, as well. The book prompted me to attend the conference, ‘The Enneagram and Grace,’ led by Richard Rohr, and Russ Hudson. I came away a different person, more compassionate and more consciously connected to God than ever before, as a result of the conference and other providential events of the weekend. Rohr says the Enneagram can be transformative because all of us “have abandoned our soul… for a false identity that is defended and deceitful, and so we are trapped” (45). I see tremendous potential for the Enneagram as a tool toward mature spirituality, healthy leader development, and recovery of the church. Rohr, The Enneagram, 23 and 45.
chapter offers a plan for a formation retreat with enneagram content as one specific way to apply the enneagram in inviting seminary students into contemplative leadership.
Chapter Five
A Strategy for Developing Contemplative Leadership

Introduction

Chapter Four explored the enneagram as a theory which informs contemplative leadership development. This chapter presents a pragmatic strategy for cultivating contemplative leadership within a seminary context: a formation retreat with both enneagram content and contemplative rhythms. Osmer describes the pragmatic task as “the task of forming and enacting strategies of action that influence events in ways that are desirable.”

Osmer then talks about transforming leadership, which he sees as the leadership “most needed” in congregations today. Transforming leadership—leadership for deep change—is apropos to the enneagram retreat because it prompts conversion. Leaders must experience personal transformation if the ministries they lead are to be transformed, because the hurdles are many as Osmer explains:

Leading deep change is costly and risky…. [Leaders] must confront their own hypocrisy in failing to embody the values they espouse and must alter their behavior to model with integrity the sorts of changes they would like to see in their organization. Such leadership is also costly and risky because it almost inevitably encounters resistance…..Moreover, deep change is messy…. Such times often are filled with conflict, failures and dissatisfaction, as well as new vitality and experimentation. During such periods, transformational leaders must remain committed to their internal vision, even as they empower others to reshape their vision.

This chapter provides a detailed description of a formation retreat designed to potentiate deep change. The description includes the origination, preparation, schedules, components, and follow-up of the retreat.

---


2 Ibid., 178.

3 Ibid.
This chapter also contains pedagogical rationale which continues the interpretive task by drawing upon contemporary pedagogical theory. Osmer iterates the importance of wise judgement in practical theological interpretation.4

Interpretive guides are wise to bring with them theoretical maps when they are leading others…. [They] must learn to choose a map that is suitable for their purposes…. Interpretive guides, thus, must be wise in discerning which theoretical maps will be most helpful in guiding others through the territory they are entering.”5

The pedagogical theories integrated in the retreat description proved to be extremely helpful in guiding seminary students through the territory of self-awareness and contemplation in the unfolding of the retreat experience. The chapter also includes occasional personal reflections that illuminate the retreat process.

**Origin of the Enneagram Retreat**

The Master of Divinity program at Western Theological Seminary (WTS) requires junior students to participate in a four-day formation retreat during the January term. Beginning in 2015, the retreat has been shaped according to contemplative practices and rhythms, with content focusing on the enneagram. The retreat continues to occur each year utilizing continuously improving versions of both format and focus. The third iteration of the retreat happened in January 2017. The enneagram was chosen for specific application with Western Theological Seminary students because it offers a powerful opportunity for self-awareness, which can serve to open the way to mature discipleship and faithful leadership. As Don Riso writes, “If we observe ourselves truthfully and

---

4 Ibid., 80.

5 Ibid., 80-81.
nonjudgmentally, seeing the mechanisms of our personality in action we can wake up, and our lives can be a miraculous unfolding of beauty and joy.”6

The expertise of the Enneagram Institute has been heavily incorporated into this project.7 The institute was founded in 1997 by Don Riso, a social psychologist and developer of the modern day enneagram, along with innovative enneagram scholar, Russ Hudson. I have utilized The Enneagram Institute’s information from both published materials and face-to-face training.8

John Calvin expresses a vital link, at the very beginning of his Institutes, between self-awareness and God-awareness: “Without knowledge of self there is no knowledge of God.”9 Calvin goes on to explain the necessity of self-examination, from the negative perspective:

Each of us must, then, be so stung by the consciousness of his own unhappiness as to attain at least some knowledge of God. Thus from the feeling of our own ignorance, vanity, poverty, infirmity, and—what is more—depravity and corruption, we recognize that the true light of wisdom, sound virtue, full abundance of every good, and purity of righteousness rest in the Lord alone.10

Calvin adds that negative self-knowledge is needed in order for transformation to unfold:

We cannot seriously aspire to [God] before we begin to become displeased with ourselves. For what man in all the world would not gladly remain as he is—what man does not remain as he is—so long as he does not know himself, that is, while content with his own gifts, and either ignorant or unmindful of his own misery?11

---

10 Ibid.
11 Ibid.
The enneagram was chosen as the content of the formation retreat because of its potential to open the way for transformation via the Spirit.

**Design**

Three objectives originally inspired the creation of the retreat experience: that the retreat be formational, enlivening, and relational. The first objective is that the experience create the potential for transformation. Stephen Brookfield and Mary Hess offer two significant foci for formation: 1) “the awakening and deepening of spiritual awareness” and 2) “the development of human qualities of empathy, compassion, and love deemed central to pastoral work.” The retreat should move students toward becoming more humble, open, present, and connected.

Pedagogy can be effectually bent toward transformation. Bell hooks contends that “the classroom remains the most radical space of possibility in the academy.” The pedagogy of the retreat should inspire the courage it takes for students to look soberly at their inner world, open students’ hearts to each other, and slow things down enough for students to hear from God.

The second original objective is that the retreat be as engaging and enlivening as possible. Bell hooks is lobbying for excitement:

The first paradigm that shaped my pedagogy was the idea that the classroom should be an exciting place, never boring. And if boredom should prevail, then

---


14 “I was seen by [students] as a teacher who worked hard to create a dynamic learning experience for all of us.” hooks, 11.
pedagogical strategies were needed that would intervene, alter, even disrupt the atmosphere.¹⁵

No learning experience need be dull and lackluster, especially when it happens in the context of retreat, where students are out of their usual learning context, and the bounds of creative options are far-flung.

The third objective is to create space for solid interpersonal relationships among the students and staff. These students will spend the next two and one half years together preparing for ministry. Their formational experience will be significantly deeper and more lasting if they form mutually nurturing bonds now, in their first year. The learning at the retreat stimulates community. Reciprocally, community also stimulates learning. In describing engaged pedagogy, hooks contends:

As a classroom community, our capacity to generate excitement is deeply affected by our interest in one another, in hearing one another’s voices, in recognizing one another’s presence. ... Any radical pedagogy must insist that everyone’s presence is acknowledged.¹⁶

Another reciprocal relationship exists in the design of the retreat, between the enneagram and the contemplative rhythms. On the one hand, self-awareness afforded by learning the enneagram can lead to the removal of barriers to connection with God, self, and others. This connection is presence. Thus, learning the enneagram potentiates contemplation. On the other hand, the rhythms and practices of the retreat allow students time and space to enter into presence and reflect deeply on truths about themselves that are usually obscured. Thus, contemplation potentiates the effectiveness of learning the

---

¹⁵ Ibid., 7.

¹⁶ Ibid., 8. “I enter the classroom with the assumption that we must build ‘community’ in order to create a climate of openness and intellectual rigor… [and] a sense that there is shared commitment and a common good that binds us.” Ibid., 40.

108
enneagram. A carefully orchestrated process will feel like a respite and a retreat, even while learning is taking place. In fact, the sense of respite augments the capacity for learning.

The flow of the learning sessions is designed with a balance of new information, small group sharing time, and self-reflection. Intentional interactive elements serve to keep students engaged with a sizeable quantity of new information. Small groups provide a supportive and nurturing milieu for authenticity and exploration. Solitude, silence and guided prayer practices invite the Spirit-work of self-awareness.

**Preparation**

**Introduction**

The enneagram and the upcoming formation retreat are introduced to the students in late November during a session of the junior formation course. The presentation provides basic information about the retreat as well as an entry point into the enneagram and the work students are assigned to do prior to the retreat. Following, in Fig 5.1, is an outline of the content presented during the introductory session. Fuller contents of the presentation can be seen in Appendix A. Details and rationale for the various pieces of the retreat will be supplied later in this chapter.
Introduction to the Formation Retreat and the Enneagram

General Retreat Information

Purpose of retreat
- Learn and experience something that will help to form you in Christ-likeness for life and for ministry
- Build relationships with those you are traveling with through seminary and into ministry
- Offer respite and refreshment

Basic design – it’s a retreat
- Avoid electronics/social media – tell your people you will be basically out of touch
- Bring what will help you pay attention to God, others, and yourself

Basic schedule
- Morning silence – pay attention to body, feelings, surroundings. Listen for the Spirit.
- First words of the day at Morning Prayers
- Morning prayers and evening prayers
- Worship
- Sessions in morning, afternoon and evening
- Large afternoon break - for respite and rejuvenation/ Many options available
- Hang out in the evenings

What to bring

Activities available

Sign up for leading prayers/worship

Travel and departure time

Pre-retreat survey

Intro to Enneagram

Basic premise of the enneagram
- Each born with one facet of the image of God being most precious to us
- At some point – we realize the world is not just THAT and it is devastating
- Ego starts to build strategies to fix it
- Patterns become imbedded and eventually prevent us from living into that facet

Why bother?
- To be healthy leaders who bring life to those we lead
- If we are not self-aware we WILL hurt people
- Being self-aware, being WELL and WHOLE should not be optional, it is an obligation

Enneagram is ONE tool
- Purpose is not to define us
- Purpose is to free us

Explanation of pre-assignments

Intro to WEPSS

Basic procedure for discovering your type
- When you have come to a possible type or two, read the applicable chapters.
- Observe yourself and note how you display the characteristics of that/those types.
- Write down your observations. Bring your notes with you to the retreat.

Panel of each type at the retreat – the more you observe your behaviors, the better you will be able to participate in your panel.
Discovery

In preparation for the retreat, WTS students complete the *Wagner Enneagram Personality Style Scales* (WEPSS), which “measures both the positive and negative dimensions of these nine styles, [so that] test-takers can see which styles they most identify with and which ones they least identify with.”¹ The inventory costs each student ten dollars and can be completed in approximately 20-30 minutes. Other effective inventories are also available.²

Several days before the retreat, students complete an online pre-retreat survey.³ The purpose of the survey is to help students and retreat leaders become aware of presuppositions and theological attitudes students carry with them into the experience. Students access the pre-retreat survey via SurveyMonkey.⁴ The pre-retreat survey follows in Figure 5.2.

---


² In designing the experience the formation team and student planners took two different enneagram typing inventories in order to determine which test would be most helpful for our purposes; the Riso-Hudson Enneagram Type Indicator ([www.enneagraminstitute.com](http://www.enneagraminstitute.com)) and the Wagner Enneagram Personality Style Scales ([www.wepss.com](http://www.wepss.com)). The WEPSS was selected for several reasons. The test-takers found the WEPSS less frustrating due to absence of forced-choice questions. Also, the WEPSS feedback report offers helpful information related to level of health, and the type results seemed quite accurate, as assessed by the test-takers, including myself. The factor found most problematic about the WEPSS was that the results are much more difficult to decipher than those of the RHETI. However, the advantages of the WEPSS outweighed that inconvenience and we made a plan to give assistance in interpreting and utilizing the results. Another tool, which could be selected for initial inventory purposes is *The Essential Enneagram: The Definitive Personality Test and Self-Discovery Guide* by David Daniels and Virginia Price. (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 2000). This book contains a descriptive paragraph format survey followed by a four-page description of each type.

³ The student planners recommended that instead of a reflection paper before and after the retreat, a survey format be utilized. They indicated that even if the survey required just as much time as a written reflection, students would perceive it as less cumbersome and intimidating.

⁴ [www.surveymonkey.com](http://www.surveymonkey.com)
Pre-Retreat Survey

1. Name

2. In what kinds of experiences or practices have you been most aware of your connection to God (Father, Son and Holy Spirit)?

3. What does it mean to be connected to God?

4. How aware are you of the following?
   Scale of 1 – 10. 1 = “I am completely unaware” 10 = “I am completely aware”
   your body
   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10
   your emotions
   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10
   your acceptance of other people’s perspectives
   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10
   how you think and act in order to make sure things are all right in your world
   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10
   God’s presence
   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

5. How do you feel about:
   your body?
   your emotions?
   your thoughts?
   your actions?
   your connection with God?

6. Do you have any prior experience with the Enneagram? YES/NO
   a. If YES, what was your prior experience like?
   b. How do you feel about the prospect of studying the Enneagram?

7. What is prayer?
Prework

The pre-work for the retreat reflects multiple goals. First, the students will become familiar enough with the Enneagram to be conversant in Enneagram vernacular. Second, students will have enough exposure to the Enneagram types to get a reasonably good idea of their own type or perhaps two or three most likely types. Third, students will not be over-burdened with assignments over Christmas break. To meet these potentially conflicting goals, reading assignments are very specific. The assigned pre-retreat work includes completion of self-inventory tools, selected readings from *The Enneagram: A Christian Perspective* by Rohr and Ebert, \(^5\) and steps for discovering and observing Enneagram type. \(^6\) The complete pre-retreat assignment follows in Figure 5.3.

---


Pre-retreat Preparation

1. Complete a pre-retreat reflection via survey monkey.
2. Read from Richard Rohr and Andreas Ebert, *The Enneagram: A Christian Perspective*.
   a. Prefaces – Pages ix – xv
   b. Part One – Starting at “A Sobering Aha-Experience.” Pages 23 – 42
   c. Part Three - Pages 199-227.
   d. Optional - If you would like to see how the enneagram types play out in Jesus, also read pages 232- 246.
3. As you read these sections, ask yourself and journal answers to the following:
   a. What rings true to me?
   b. About what do I feel resistance in myself?
   c. What do I sense God is speaking to me through my encounter with these ideas?

Bring your musings and your textbook along to the retreat for discussion.

4. Complete the enneagram survey during Abby class time on Dec 15

The results of the survey are not a diagnosis, but rather a starting point for discovering your enneagram type. You cannot assume that the survey has identified you accurately. Only YOU can determine what your type is. This is not always easy and sometimes happens over time. Bring your survey results with you to the retreat.

5. Following are steps to help you determine your type.
   a. Read through the results of your survey, taking note of the types the survey identifies as most likely.
   b. In the Rohr book – read the chapters for the top two or three types indicated by the results of your survey. As you read:
      Mark the statements that seem to fit you.
      Particularly note where you feel uneasy, embarrassed or even humiliated.
   c. If none of the types you read about feel like a fit, continue to read about each type until something strikes you.
   d. When you have a sense of what your type might be, or have it narrowed down to a couple possibilities, talk to someone who knows and loves you about which characteristics they see in you.
   e. If you are older and recognize characteristics from several types in your life, think back to your early adulthood, especially your early twenties. Ask yourself, “What was I like back then?”
   f. If you still feel confused, make an appointment with Pam Bush for before Christmas break. pam@westernsem.edu

6. When you have come to a possible type or two, observe yourself and note how you display the characteristics of that/those types. Write down your most striking observations. Bring all your observation notes with you to the retreat.

Plan for morning/evening prayers or worship times for the retreat according to what you signed up for.
Participant Binders

Student binders are pre-assembled with materials students will need during the retreat. The binders include space for note-taking. Figure 5.4 shows the table of contents.

Full contents of the binders can be seen in Appendix B.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Red Tab</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing Assignments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map of Gull Lake Conference Center</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clear Tab</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peer Group, Type Group and Personal Reflection Guides</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session #2 Guide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feeling words</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type Panel questions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Blue Tab</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Instinctual Stack</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wings, Arrows, Filters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Levels of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three Centers of Intelligence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Dinner Party</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Orange Tab</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enneagram Types</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ennea-grid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Levels of Health Diagram</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type Specific Levels of Health Descriptions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yellow Tab</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enneagram Prayer Resources and Practices</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Green Tab</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CIQs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retreat Evaluation Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-retreat Survey</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pink Tab</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blank Pages</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 5.4.
Setting

The setting of the retreat is crucial to creating an environment conducive to courage, community, and contemplation. Clean and comfortable facilities prevent distraction. Beautiful and natural surroundings foster connection with creation and the Creator. Relaxed and communal lodging options enable relationship building. Bright and well equipped meeting spaces support learning. Spaces and equipment for physical activity build camaraderie and offer a physical release amidst the internal tension occurring as a result of self-reflection. Well-appointed worship space sets a tone for sacred engagement.

Good food and attentive hospitality elicit a sense of well-being. Mealtimes during the retreat are especially conducive to relationship building. Retreat participants relax, initiate meaningful conversations, and laugh together. Faculty, staff, and students get to know each other on a more human level. Food that is attractive and delicious, with all special dietary needs taken into account helps maintain high morale throughout the retreat.
Set-up

Preparation of the space is vital for creating a less anxious space learning environment. Playfulness, hospitality, and connection are driving factors for augmenting learning. When students arrive, it should be abundantly obvious that care has been taken to create a hospitable environment and to fashion the experience thoughtfully. The meeting room set up begins with the crafting of a giant enneagram figure on the floor with masking tape, using different colors for each of the centers of intelligence. An alternative to masking tape is a pre-painted enneagram Canvas. See Figure 5.6.

![Masking Tape Enneagram](image1.png) ![Painted Canvas Enneagram](image2.png)

In the center of the circle stands a visual representation of the nine levels of freedom. See Figure 5.7. Chairs are set in a large circle around the outside the Enneagram diagram with the participant binders on them. On the periphery of the room are snack tables, which make the space more invitational and relaxed, and a book table with several resources students are welcome to investigate for further learning and discernment. In another area, participants have access to items like art supplies and playdough, which can address restlessness and kinesthetic needs. Students are invited to stay comfortable and engaged by moving around, standing, sitting on the floor, or utilizing the manipulatives.

---

1 Enneagram Canvas designed and created by Jessica LaMer, WTS student.
The festive environment of the meeting room invites playful, interactive, relational learning.
The room designated as the chapel becomes a sacred space in which to meet God communally and personally throughout the days of the retreat. The symbols familiar to worship in the Western Theological Seminary context become the focal point. See Figure 5.8. A circle of chairs invites intimacy in corporate experience. Tables in the periphery of this room and facing a beautiful outdoor view are equipped with materials—such as mandalas and colored pencils, Bibles and inspirational writings, and paints and paper—for artistic expressions of prayer. Retreat participants are asked to remove their shoes upon entering the room. The space is specifically dedicated to worship, music, prayer, and silence throughout the entire retreat.

An attentively prepared registration area greets students when they arrive. Premade nametags and careful lodging assignments imply that each student is specifically expected. Schedules and maps help to allay anxiety, which is inevitably high due to the

---

2 The symbols include Christ candle, Bible, cross, font, and perhaps chalice and platter.
unusual nature of the experience. Familiar faces and enthusiastic welcome communicate that leaders are energized, engaged, and expectant. In short, all the painstaking preparation and thoughtfulness communicates that students are respected and loved, the ideal conditions for entering into a significant formational opportunity.

Schedules

Participant Schedule

The student schedule shows the general flow of the retreat components and gives a sense of the overall rhythm See Figure 5.9. The schedule is distributed in order to allay anxiety, assist participants who function better when they understand overall structure, and assist the flow of the retreat by keeping participants abreast of starting times and locations.

Master Schedule

The master schedule shows the timing and components for the entire retreat. The schedule is color-coded according to type of activity, for ease of reference for retreat leaders See pages 119-122. A complete version of the master schedule, which includes questions and guidelines for group and individual pieces, can be seen in Appendix C.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Monday January 12</th>
<th>Tuesday January 13</th>
<th>Wednesday January 14</th>
<th>Thursday January 15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>MORNING</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7:30 AM</td>
<td>Pray, load, depart</td>
<td>8:00 AM BREAKFAST</td>
<td>8:00 AM BREAKFAST</td>
<td>8:00 AM BREAKFAST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(silence)</td>
<td>(silence)</td>
<td>(silence)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:30 AM</td>
<td>Arrive, settle</td>
<td>9:00 AM MORNING</td>
<td>9:00 AM MORNING</td>
<td>9:00 AM MORNING</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>WORSHIP</td>
<td>PRAYERS</td>
<td>PRAYERS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00 AM</td>
<td>OPENING WORSHIP</td>
<td>9:20 – 11:45 AM</td>
<td>9:20 – 11:45 AM</td>
<td>9:20 – 11:45 AM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30-11:45 AM</td>
<td>SESSION #1</td>
<td>SESSION #5</td>
<td>SESSION #8</td>
<td>SESSION #11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Types 8 &amp; 9</td>
<td>Types 5 &amp; 6</td>
<td>Moving Forward</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&amp; Tear Down</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AFTERNOON</strong></td>
<td>Noon LUNCH</td>
<td>Noon LUNCH</td>
<td>Noon LUNCH</td>
<td>Noon LUNCH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:00 – 2:00 PM</td>
<td>SESSION #2</td>
<td>12:30 – 3:30 PM</td>
<td>12:30 – 3:30 PM</td>
<td>1:00 - 2:00 PM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Individual Reflection</td>
<td>RESPITE Alone Time</td>
<td>RESPITE Alone Time</td>
<td>SESSION #12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1–1:30</td>
<td>1–1:30</td>
<td>Eval &amp; Sharing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:00 – 4:30 PM</td>
<td>SESSION #3</td>
<td>3:30 – 5:45 PM</td>
<td>3:30 – 5:45 PM</td>
<td>2:00 PM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Type Groups</td>
<td>SESSION #6</td>
<td>SESSION #9</td>
<td>CLOSING WORSHIP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:30 – 5:45 PM</td>
<td>RESPITE</td>
<td>Types 1 &amp; 2</td>
<td>Type 7 &amp; Implications for Ministry</td>
<td>3:00 PM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Load and depart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5:00 PM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Arrive in Holland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EVENING</strong></td>
<td>6:00 PM DINNER</td>
<td>6:00 PM DINNER</td>
<td>6:00 PM DINNER</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7:00 – 8:30 PM</td>
<td>SESSION #4</td>
<td>7:00 – 8:30 PM</td>
<td>7:00 – 8:30 PM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Complexities</td>
<td>SESSION #7</td>
<td>SESSION #10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:30 PM</td>
<td>EVENING PRAYERS</td>
<td>Types 3 &amp; 4</td>
<td>Self-Awareness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:00 PM</td>
<td>COMMUNITY HANG OUT</td>
<td>9:00 PM PRAYERS</td>
<td>8:30 PM PRAYERS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9:00 PM SKIT NIGHT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Participant Schedule
Figure 5.9.
Formation Retreat
Master Schedule

MONDAY

7:30 AM - Pray, load, depart

9:30 AM - Arrive, settle

10:00 AM - OPENING WORSHIP

10:30 - 11:45 AM - SESSION #1
10:30 Welcome
10:35 Presence Intro
10:50 Practicing Presence
11:00 Yes/No in Pairs
11:05 Brief introduction to Enneagram - Brown Paper Person
11:20 Overview of the retreat process
11:25 Housekeeping
11:30 Peer Groups – #1
11:50 Dismiss for Lunch

Noon - LUNCH

1:00 – 2:00 PM - SESSION #2
Individual Reflection
* Formation team available to help students talk through types

2:00 PM - SESSION #3
2:00 Practicing Presence
2:10 Testimonies
2:15 Instinctual Stack
2:35 Peer Groups #3
2:55 Large group check in
3:00 Type Group collage
3:30 Type Group presentations
4:00 Type Groups #3

4:30 PM - RESPITE

6:00 PM - DINNER

7:00 – 8:30 PM - SESSION #4
7:00 Practicing Presence
7:05 Instinctual Stack Charades
7:15 Complexities – Wings, Arrows, Filters, Levels of Health
7:45 Peer Groups #4
8:10 Dinner party quiz
8:20 CIQ

8:30 PM - EVENING PRAYERS

9:00 PM - COMMUNITY HANG OUT

TUESDAY

8:00 AM - BREAKFAST

9:00 AM - MORNING PRAYERS

9:20 – 11:45 AM - SESSION #5
9:20 Practicing Presence
9:25 CIQ discussion
9:40 Intro Centers
9:45 Gut Center
9:40 Type EIGHT
10:20 Skipping
10:25 Break
10:35 Type NINE
11:15 Personal Prayer practice

Noon - LUNCH

12:30 – 3:30 PM - RESPITE
Personal alone time 1:00 – 1:30
Climbing wall open 1:30-3:00

3:30 – 5:45 PM - SESSION # 6
3:30 Practicing Presence
3:35 Type ONE
4:15 Peer Group #6
4:45 Break
4:55 Heart Center
5:00 Type TWO

6:00 PM - DINNER

7:00 – 8:30 PM - SESSION #7
7:00 Practicing Presence
7:05 Type THREE
7:40 Skipping
7:45 Type FOUR
CIQ

8:30 PM - EVENING PRAYERS

9:00 PM - COMMUNITY HANG OUT
9:00 – Peer Group Facilitators meet with Retreat Leader

WEDNESDAY

8:00 AM - BREAKFAST

9:00 AM - MORNING PRAYERS

9:20 – 11:45 AM - SESSION #8
9:20 Practicing Presence
9:25 CIQ discussion
9:40 Head Center Review
9:45 Type FIVE
10:25 Break
10:35 Type SIX
11:15 Peer groups #8

Noon - LUNCH

12:30 – 3:30 PM - RESPITE
Personal alone time 1:00 – 1:30
Bowling open 1:30 -3:00

3:30 – 5:45 PM - SESSION # 9
3:30 Practicing Presence
3:35 Type SEVEN
4:15 Personal Reflection #9
4:45 Type Group Discussion #9
5:30 Large Group Follow Up

6:00 PM - DINNER

7:00 – 8:30 PM - SESSION #10
7:00 Practicing Presence
7:05 What do you still need to know?
7:30 Things that got missed previously
7: 50 Type Groups #10 - Create Skits
8:20 CIQ
8:30 PM - EVENING PRAYERS

9:00 PM – SKIT NITE

THURSDAY

8:00 AM - BREAKFAST

9:00 AM - MORNING PRAYERS

9:20 – 11:45 AM - SESSION #11
9:20 Practicing Presence
9:25 Reflection on the morning silence and CIQ discussion
9:35 Answers to Remaining Questions
9:45 Individual Reflection #11 Moving Forward -Personal Journaling
10:20 Peer groups #11
11:20 Large Group - covenant
11:45 Resources available to students on return to WTS

Noon – LUNCH

1-2 PM SESSION #12
1:00 Type Groups #12
1:20 Individuals - Post Retreat survey
1:30 Tear Down
1:50 Move to chapel

2:00 PM - CLOSING WORSHIP including large group sharing

3:00 PM - Load and depart

Retreat Components

Following is explanation and rationale of the basic components of the retreat. The titles are lifted directly from the master schedule and appear in the order of the master schedule. Personal reflection is included when appropriate. A complete version of the plans and content for each session appears in Appendix D.
Pray, Load, Depart

The students travel from the seminary together early Monday morning. Charter bus transportation helps students conceive of the retreat as a whole experience with all students participating fully from start to finish, which is critical to effectiveness. Someone from the formation team coordinates the loading of the bus to assure that all participants have arrived and to initiate the trip with prayer. Breakfast type foods are provided on the bus. Traveling together expresses unity and encourages comradery.3

Opening Worship

The retreat experience launches with worship, as an expression that worship of the triune God is prioritized. Worship can be planned and led by the retreat leaders or by students with the guidance of a leader. Guidelines for worship are minimal, encouraging creativity. When students lead worship or morning and evening prayers, a designated retreat leader meets with them prior, to help them reflect carefully on their plan. Thus, students can be intentional and thoughtful in their design and implementation.

Introduction to Practicing Presence

Every gathering and regathering of the large group in the retreat meeting room begins with a centering practice, 4 which involves ringing a singing bowl chime and then talking the group through a process for becoming present to the time and space. The goal

---

3 In my experience, the advantages of not requiring several students to drive in potentially dangerous winter weather and the consequence of enabling everyone to stay physically present have outweighed the limitations of extra expense and dealing with possible emergencies. Occasional exceptions are made allowing a student to drive separately, as family situations warrant.

4 “Mindfulness is a way of being in which one is highly aware (of what is inside yourself and outside yourself in the environment) and focused on the reality of the present moment, accepting and acknowledging it without getting caught up in thoughts about the situation or emotional reactions to the situation.” Daniel Barbezat and Mirabai Bush, Contemplative Practices in Higher Education: Powerful Methods to Transform Teaching and Learning (San Francisco, California: Jossey-Bass, 2014), 95-96.
is to set a contemplative rhythm, help students learn what presence feels like, and create a silent space for the Spirit to be noticed. Each time, the practice ends when the sound of a second ringing of the chime has faded to the point of inaudibility. The practice is an invitation to mindfulness; being calmly and continuously aware of the moment without judgement, analysis, or evaluation. These few moments of being present change the energy in the room from scattered and chaotic to unified, calm, and attentive. The brief times of silence also calm the soul of the leader, get her ready to engage fully with the participants, and connect her with the Spirit.\(^5\)

Yes and No in Pairs

People usually come to experiences like this retreat with both positive and negative expectations. In this activity, participants pair up and answer the question “Where do you sense the \textit{no}—resistance, anxiety, or fear—in you, as you think about this retreat?” Each person talks for 1 minute, timed by the leader, while the other simply listens. Listeners are not allowed to comment but may thank the speaker at the end of the minute. Then the roles reverse. Next the process is repeated, this time with the question, “Where do you sense the \textit{yes}—enthusiasm or anticipation—in you, as you think about this retreat?\(^6\) The purpose of the exercise is to help participants become aware of what attitudes and expectations they are bringing to the retreat.

Introduction to the Enneagram

This segment launches by addressing the question, “What is the Enneagram?” The presenter narrates a brief enneagram history and invites students to contribute answers to

\(^5\) “The teacher’s presence is the heart of teaching.” Ibid., 91.

\(^6\) This activity is adapted from a similar exercise at the Enneagram Institute Training, Part 3, Chester, CN, June 2015.
the crucial question, “Why bother?” Answers can be recorded on a large whiteboard or flipchart.

Leaders encourage students to conceive of the environment of the retreat not as safe space—since it is actually impossible to guarantee safety, which relies on the actions of others—but rather brave space, a space in which participants exercise courage in response to the invitation to vulnerability and authenticity. The presenter then discusses more and less helpful terminology that is commonly used in speaking about the Enneagram. For instance, good and bad are unhelpful categories when it comes to talking about different types or levels of freedom, because they impose judgement. Also, using an expression like, “I am a six” is constricting instead of freeing. Saying, “I identify with six patterns” or “I have a lot of six energy” preserves the notion that every person has every energy in some measure and prevents people from identifying themselves as their dominant energy type. Lastly, the presenter articulates the hopes of the formation team in order to give students a clear picture of the whys of the process.

Peer Groups

At Western Theological Seminary, M. Div. students participate weekly in assigned peer groups for two years. At the retreat these groups serve the function of reflection and processing. Each group finds a gathering space conducive to sharing and processing.

---

7 Nouwen and Riso/Hudson offer possible answers that could be included in this segment. Nouwen says, "I am deeply convinced that the Christian leader of the future is called to be completely irrelevant and to stand in this world with nothing to offer but his or her own vulnerable self.” Nouwen, In the Name of Jesus, 30. Riso and Hudson remind us that, "Once we understand the nature of our personality's mechanisms, we begin to have a choice about identifying with them or not. If we are not aware of them, clearly no choice is possible.” Riso and Hudson, The Wisdom of the Enneagram, 38.

8 Small groups of four to six could also be groups of the same types or varied types, assigned groups or voluntary groups, friend groups or those who knew each other least well, or groups focused on affinity or diversity. Participants can divide themselves into groups with each person in the group being a different type.
listening. The participant binder includes guiding questions which are used as a springboard for sharing. Prior to the retreat, the retreat planners select a student from each peer group to act as a facilitator for their group. This includes a facilitator orientation. See Figure 5.10. The agenda also serves here to enumerate the purposes of the peer group segments.
Peer Group Facilitator Orientation Agenda

Purpose of small groups at the retreat
Provide mutual support as people engage self-discovery
Foster honesty and authenticity
Help each other process the experience
Develop systems of accountability for moving forward

Role of the facilitator
Be intentional about helping to make it possible for each participant in your peer group, including you, to get the support they need to be fully engaged in the retreat.

Intentionally ask questions during the peer group times to find out how people are doing spiritually, emotionally, socially, and physically.

Do what you can to help people speak honestly.

Do what you can to help nurture respect and empathy for each other, especially when there is disagreement or lack of understanding.

Help participants move from head to heart and body.

Encourage students to seek out the formation team when that seems helpful.

Meet with the retreat leader at 9pm each evening to check in on how your peer group is doing.

Q & A

Figure 5.10.

Session Two

Session Two involves individual reflection, including reviewing the predominate energy type, pre-reading, and reflection questions.¹ This time may be redundant, yet the session is included in order to assure that all participants have similar knowledge levels before discussion of various aspects of the enneagram begins and to create a reflective atmosphere.

¹ The focus of contemplation is “the self of the scholar or the student, the inner dynamics of those who teach and learn—and then, for better or worse, deploy their knowledge as power in the world. Students whose minds and hearts have been formed by contemplation of self as well as world are much more likely to become the kinds of ethical actors we need at a time when basic human values...are so widely threatened.” Barbezat and Bush, ix.
space for students to process their pre-retreat learning. Students come with varying levels of preparedness and some have done the pre-work much earlier than others. Session Two allows time to reacquaint, or worse-case scenario, acquaint students with the introductory enneagram materials. See the Session Two Guide in Figure 5.11.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Session Two Guide</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Utilize the following questions and instructions to review your reading and observation notes and direct your individual reflection time.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. What do you think your predominate Enneagram Type is and why do you think so? (If you are vacillating between multiple types, answer this question for each of those types)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. What characteristics of your predominate type are you resistant to accepting or cause you the most distress?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. What do you find comforting about the characteristics of your predominate type?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 4. Reflect and journal on the italicized questions in the *Practice Receptive Awareness* section of your determined type in *The Essential Enneagram.*  
Type 1 – Page 83  
Type 2 – Page 86  
Type 3 – Page 89  
Type 4 – Page 92  
Type 5 – Page 95  
Type 6 – Page 98  
Type 7 – Page 101  
Type 8 – Page 104  
Type 9 – Page 107 |

Figure 5.11.

Enneagram Testimonies

A professor and a student, who are respected and trusted by the participants and who have personal experience with the enneagram, share how work with the enneagram has influenced their lives and ministry. Honest yet appropriate vulnerability sets the tone for the depth of sharing for the week and lively humor proves valuable for relieving
anxiety and creating a playful environment.² Playfulness can be wildly effective in maximizing learning. Since the participants already know and trust these presenters, they will generally consider the task of learning about the enneagram as both credible and worthwhile.

Instinctual Stack

Instinctual stack refers to the order of dominance of three primary instincts which occur across the animal kingdom; self-preservation (survival), sexual (continuation of the species), and social (adaptability). Humans tend to function out of an overemphasis on one instinct and an under-emphasis of another, all at the unconscious level. Which instinct is dominant will influence the expression of the energy for each type. This piece does not give much detail, but primarily emphasizes the complexity of the type patterns. Curious students then have an opportunity to discover more on their own.

² “It is often productive if professors take the first risk, linking confessional narratives to academic discussions so as to show how experience can illuminate and enhance our understanding of academic material.” hooks, 21.
Type Group Collage

For this activity, participants divide themselves into groups according to the type each thinks best represents them. Each group is provided with a piece of poster board, scissors, glue sticks and a variety of old magazines. They are instructed to use the supplies to make a collage representing their type energy, come up with six one-word descriptors for their type, and prepare a 2 ½ minute presentation. This activity generates lots of energy and creativity. ³ Many students verbalize a dramatic sense of relief in having discovered, while working with their type group, that others have views and responses to life very similar to their own. At the same time some embarrassment inevitably surfaces as those tendencies are discovered and exposed. The characteristics of each type energy can be clearly experienced when each group stands together to present. ⁴ The posters also strongly channel the particular energies. ⁵ See Figure 5.13.

³ “It is rare that any professor, no matter how eloquent a lecturer, can generate through his or her actions enough excitement to create an exciting classroom. Excitement is generated through collective effort.” Ibid., 8.

⁴ For instance, once when the type SEVEN group presented, we noticed that each one of them was wearing footwear that was bright, festive and zany manifesting the seven energy characteristic of party spirit.

⁵ An alternative type group activity is making the collage on a mask. Students create the outside of the mask in response to the question, “What do you want people to see?” At the same time or later in the week, students decorate the inside of the mask in response to the question, “What do you want to prevent others from seeing?”
This segment explains how we tend to display some of the characteristics of one of the two types directly adjacent to ours on the enneagram circle; the wings. Students participate in an activity utilizing personal whiteboards. The leader reads a description of a fictitious person, whose type energy has already

---

6 Personal whiteboards were handmade by cutting 4 x 8 sheets of whiteboard into twenty-four 16” squares. Participants write on their boards with regular dry erase markers and erase with washcloths.
been identified. The participants then write on their whiteboards which wing energy they suspect this person is displaying. The activity helps students become familiar with the concept of wings and with the characteristics of the types.

Arrows

People tend to take on the characteristics of other types, either when they are under a great deal of stress or when they are under very little stress. The direction of disintegration, which one might experience during increased stress, is *in* the direction of the arrow. The direction of integration, which one might experience during times of very low stress, is *against* the direction of the arrow. See Figure 5.14. Students do an exercise in which participants walk on the arrows of the giant enneagram on the floor, in the directions of disintegration (high stress) or integration (low stress) according to stories of hypothetical situations.

![Direction of Disintegration](image)

**Figure 5.14.**

---

7 I refer often to type *energy*. This is done to avoid the impression of a person being wholly one type. Rather, since we all have some energy of each of the types, using the word *energy* helps to prevent us from thinking of ourselves and others too narrowly.
Filters

Certain types are more or less open to the stimulus of the environment. This concept can be helpful in understanding certain impulses in the types. Using this analogy, three types—Four, Five, and Nine—have very open filters that admit a large quantity of environmental stimulation. People with those energy types become easily overstimulated in chaotic situations and seek withdrawal. People with Three, Seven, or Eight energy have fine filters that admit much less stimulus, leading to a hunger for stimulation and incessant activity. Types One, Two, and Six have average filters. This piece becomes more relevant as the description of the types unfold.

| Types Four, Five, Nine | Types One, Two, Six | Types Three, Seven, Eight |

This segment communicates how each of the nine types looks different, depending on an individual’s level of freedom from typical ego strategies. The model in the center of the enneagram circle on the floor of the retreat room illustrates the nine levels. See Figure 5.7. The terminology of freedom and constriction is included because it links the levels more closely with the idea of ego strategies and how much control they

---

8 These levels are referred to by the Enneagram Institute as Levels of Development, using the language healthy, average, and unhealthy to describe the levels. Riso and Hudson, 75 – 86.
have.

Levels of Freedom
Figure 5.16.

The leader describes the nine levels of freedom using broad descriptions and type nine as a specific example. A volunteer comes forward for each level of freedom and sits in a chair labeled with that level. Volunteers take a physical posture that portrays a person with type nine tendencies at that level. At the end, while all nine volunteers are holding their positions, the group is asked to observe and express what they were seeing. The students’ reflections are typically astute and insightful, making this activity very valuable.

During the Dinner Party

This short segment involves projecting a picture from *The Enneagram Made Easy*. The dinner party slide is included for the sake of playfulness, to lighten the mood after a serious introductory segment, and to highlight practical characteristics of the nine

---

types. Students receive it with laughter and amusement when descriptions hit close to home.

Figure 4.17.

CIQ

Participants and leaders complete a Critical Incident Questionnaire (CIQ) each day. Five reflection questions compose the CIQ, which was originally designed by Stephen Brookfield.10 See Figure 5.18.

---

Critical Incident Questionnaire

1. When (since the retreat began or since the last CIQ) did you feel most engaged with what was happening?

2. When did you feel most distanced from what was happening?

3. What action that anyone (teacher/student/other) took did you find most affirming or helpful?

4. What action that anyone took did you find most puzzling or confusing?

5. What surprised you the most? (This could be about your own reactions to what went on, something that someone did, or anything else that occurred.)

Figure 5.18.

The retreat leadership team utilizes CIQs for several reasons. First, CIQ’s teach students how to reflect on their experiences and be more attentive to what is happening inside them. Second, CIQs create mutuality in learning, promoting a learning community.¹¹ Using CIQs offers an open invitation for student input and direction.¹² Third, leaders can model honesty and vulnerability in addressing the CIQ responses, which inspires students to the same.¹³ Lastly, the team desires to hear what students are experiencing and is

---

¹¹ “It’s not just my job to make this class work. It’s everyone’s responsibility.” hooks, 155.

¹² Formation focused pedagogy emphasizes “a deliberate attempt to treat learners as adults with the attitude of respectful attention to students’ experiences this implies….” Brookfield and Hess, 4.

¹³ “When education is the practice of freedom, students are not the only ones who are asked to share, to confess….Any classroom that employs a holistic model of learning will also be a place where teachers grow and are empowered by the process….I do not expect students to take any risks that I would not take….” hooks, 21.
genuinely committed to making changes along the way to enhance learning and wellbeing. 14

Participants complete the CIQ at the end of each day, in view of all the experiences since the beginning of the retreat or since the previous CIQ. Leaders participate fully in the CIQ process, including completing the questionnaire and contributing to the discussion the next day. At the conclusion of the day’s activities the entire leadership team collaborates in reading and compiling the responses in preparation for the discussion the next morning. They begin imagining together how to address concerns and patterns that show up in the responses. 15

      Evening and Morning Prayers

      Evening and morning prayers bookend each day’s communal activities and reflect a high value for student participation. One or more students volunteer, prior to the retreat, to create each prayer time. Preaching is discouraged since the days already consist of considerable amounts of monologue. Guidelines are few, but do include simplicity, creativity, and authenticity. As with opening worship, a retreat leader helps students think through the plan in advance. These prayer times become gentle and focused places for participants to connect with God as a community. On the final evening the momentum and energy generated by the skits may not be conducive to the reflective prayer time students usually have planned. Therefore evening prayers precedes skit presentations on that night.

14 “A commitment to assisting student’s formation requires us to understand how those students experience the emotional and cognitive rhythms of learning and how they interpret our actions as teachers.” Brookfield and Hess, 4. Critical Incident Questionnaires are “a commitment to continuously researching the pedagogical contexts in which we work and to responding publically to what we learn from this research.” Ibid., 8.

15 For our team, this time spent late into the night is precious, and rich with creativity, collaboration, and humor.
Community Hang-Out Time

Community hang-out time induces release from the mental and emotional engagements of the day. The interactions create bonds between students who will be journeying together through the seminary experience. The team envisions community hang-out time as a space where each person can be themselves and enjoy the company of others in fun and laughter. Though it has very little structure, it is a non-negotiable element of the retreat and generates a life-giving atmosphere that cannot be duplicated without the overnight format of the retreat. Community hang out time evolves as students become more comfortable and trusting of each other. Silly games become the norm. Students and leaders become uninhibited and joyous as they play together.

Morning Silence

Silence ushers in each morning. All refrain from talking from the time of awakening, through breakfast, until morning prayers. The silence is intended as a gift. It affords space for noticing the Spirit, being present to one’s surroundings and inner person, and experiencing peace. Silence gets mixed reviews from students. Some are deeply appreciative and others highly resistant. Certain enneagram energy types fall neatly into these categories, with five energy people being most comfortable. Participants with predominate three and seven energy are most unsettled. Leaders must model

---

16 So when I talk about teaching in this book I’m talking about any intentional act designed to help someone learn something….much of the time I’m teaching with my mouthy shut. Stephen Brookfield, Powerful Techniques for Teaching Adults (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2013), 16.

17 “To teach in a manner that respects and cares for the souls of our students is essential if we are to provide the necessary conditions where learning can most deeply and intimately begin.” hooks, 13.
persistence and a solid belief in the necessity of silence in Christian formation, in order to weather the inevitable discomfort.\textsuperscript{18}

Each morning after the presence practice and before the CIQ discussion participants answer the question, “What was it like to be in silence this morning?” Many express difficulty with the practice at first. Later, stories come forth of meaningful times of presence and communion with God, including significant insights, making it well worth holding firm to the practice in the face of pleas about “wanting to get to know each other better,” “need to process out loud,” or “feeling rude to our hosts.” Great comfort grows up in the silence once resistance gives way to peace. Eating together in non-anxious silence nurtures deep connection.

CIQ Discussions

The most potent piece of the CIQ process is undoubtedly the discussion. It generates an opportunity for clarification, negotiation, candor, and reassurance. It insists that students take agency for learning.\textsuperscript{19} Maximizing the potential of the CIQ requires a good deal of flexibility. The first discussion time can feel stiff and awkward as students test the waters of how much vulnerability will be appropriate or tolerated. Leaders reveal all the answers given by participants, one question at a time. Participants respond by making observations, asking questions, clarifying what was meant by a certain response,

\textsuperscript{18} “I had to surrender my need for immediate affirmation of successful teaching…and accept that students may not appreciate the value of a certain standpoint or process straightaway.” Ibid., 42.

\textsuperscript{19} One of the core elements of a democratic system is that “its participants engage in a constant discussion of how best to organize the community’s affairs.” Brookfield, \textit{Powerful Techniques for Teaching Adults}, 120.
or expressing appreciation or discomfort. Leaders clear confusion, help students ask good questions, speak authentically, and especially, listen.

As the week unfolds, the CIQ responses gradually reflect more humor—good-natured teasing and inside jokes—while at the same time the discussions tend to become increasingly honest and fruitful. CIQs are indispensable to meeting students where they are, and to giving them agency in their own learning. Persistence occasions authenticity and creativity.

Sometimes honesty leads to pain and conflict as students dare to talk about actions and statements that have hurt or angered them. Practices of reconciliation and forgiveness may need to be employed as students work through the difficulties. Leaders must also hold criticism lightly and navigate wisely when students express resistance to the retreat process, content, or leaders.

Three Centers of Intelligence

Human beings operate out of three centers of intelligence; body center, heart center, and head center. Each of the enneagram types tends to prioritize one of these centers. See Figure 5.19. The ideal is for the centers to be in balance. Interestingly, our predominate center of intelligence—according to our type—is not where we function the most healthfully. Rather, we often have the least freedom in that center, because our constricting strategies largely group around that function. For instance, Type Six falls squarely in the middle of the head center. People with Six energy tend to struggle with

---

20 Compiled answers can be revealed by providing printed copies, showing answers on slides, or reading the answers aloud. I prefer the latter because all participants hear the answers at the same time and because students read at very different rates, meaning that with the other methods some will not get the full scope of their classmates’ answers. Reading aloud however can be quite time consuming with larger class sizes.

21 Enneagram Institute Training, Part 3, Chester, CN, June, 2015.
obsessive and oppressive thoughts, because the strategies they have developed to address fear include persistent worrying and incessant planning for worst case scenarios. This information is introduced because it helps with grasping the kinds of strategies developed by each type. After the presenter briefly describes the centers, participants pair up and take turns talking for one minute about which center they most identify with and why, while the other person listens attentively without comment.

Gut/Intuition Center

Head/Thinking Center

Heart/Feeling Center

Figure 5.19

Type Presentations

The presenter invites all the participants with a certain energy type to sit together in the circle at the beginning of each type presentation. She invites them to talk about how they identify with what they are hearing, as she describes the characteristics and development of their type. Participants contribute stories that exemplify the type. This practice transforms the presentation from monologue to dynamic interaction and allows participants to feel what it is like to be a particular type. Plus, the presenter can address the participants of each type more directly with eye contact and empathy. The panel participants usually share with honesty and vulnerability. The listeners typically engage
attentively and then affirm compassionately. The pedagogy is tricky in that the presenter must constantly strike a balance between the value of giving necessary information and the value of student participation and personalization. This balancing act requires adjusting and creating up to the last minute and even mid-session as the presenter reads the needs of the group.

Following the description of a type, the panel answers specific questions that will help everyone gain an even fuller understanding of that energy.22 As one student succinctly put it, “I could see and feel the energy rather than just hear about it.” The participant binder includes the pre-planned questions for each type, so that those who do better having had some preparation can be aware of what to expect. However, listeners can be allowed to organically ask other questions of the panel in an effort to better understand and support their classmates.23 This risk of allowing unplanned questions must be weighed carefully, because being on the panel is an extremely vulnerable enterprise and questions might hit exposed nerves. However, compassion and encouragement are often lovely side-effects of using the panel method.

One of the most powerful moves of the type presentations is asking the audience at the end of each panel, “What was it like for you to experience this energy in this way?” This question tends to open the floodgates of affirmation and care towards the students on

---

22 “When one speaks from the perspective of one’s immediate experiences, something’s created in the classroom for students, sometimes for the very first time. Focusing on experience allows student to claim a knowledge base from which they can speak.” hooks, 148.

23 “[T]he weight is on me to establish that our purpose is to be, for however brief a time, a community of learners together. It positions me as a learner.” Ibid., 153.
the current panel. On day two, the amount of engagement with the types can feel quite overwhelming. Leaders may be concerned at this point about whether participants can stay engaged for the entirety of the day’s schedule. Leaders should periodically solicit input from students on how they are faring and make decisions accordingly.

The presenter does constant adjusting of plans during the course of the presentations of the types, listening for the Spirit on when to let things go longer than intended, when to eliminate certain pieces, and when to spontaneously add something that occurs to her in the moment. Watching the time very closely, starting at the scheduled time, and always ending in time for the next scheduled activity become increasingly challenging as students became more relaxed and involved. The presenter often finds it progressively more difficult to know when to stop vibrant and passionate exchange with the panels.

24 For example, one year, for the Nine energy participants in particular, the affirmation was very powerful. The students on the Type Nine panel had been particularly honest about the pain inherent in their default patterns. Participants assured their Type Nine classmates that they wanted to hear more from them in class and encouraged them to give voice to their ideas, because they are valuable. A student spontaneously suggested that we lay hands on them and pray for them. The students experienced the prayers as very meaningful and uplifting and this sacred time ended with grateful tears and affirming hugs.

25 The chief decision makers involved in a situation are those who are most affected by the consequences of that decision. Brookfield, Powerful Techniques for Teaching Adults, 21.

26 “I had learned then to let the methods emerge from the context....” Barbezat and Bush, 42.

27 That tension is at its maximum during the Type Five panel. Listeners usually express so much interest, and it is such a gift to hear the students with high Five energy share, that I become extremely reluctant to end the discussion even when the time is getting very crunched. We understand so little about Type Five individuals because they are generally very reticent to share themselves. Affirmation and love toward the Five energy panel is the result of allotting precious extra time. I now realize that certain types need more time allotted for the panel interaction, including Nine, Five, and Four—all the types that carry a penchant for withdrawal.
Personal Prayer Practice

This time period gives participants quiet but guided personal time to interact with God. The participant binder presents several options. Some prayer practices target those from a certain center on the enneagram. Another practice gives specific directions by type, and others are more general in nature. Most include instructions for some journaling. Some students report that the personal prayer practices are particularly difficult and at the same time immeasurably valuable.

Respite

The two middle days of the retreat include a large afternoon break. After lunch often proves to be a difficult time to stay engaged with focused learning. The respite begins with a thirty minute alone time, added to the schedule after a few extroverted students expressed difficulty bringing themselves to spend time alone, even when they knew it would be helpful for them. According to them, the social draw overpowers their need for solitude. That tension is relieved by having solitude scheduled. Alone time implies only lack of interaction. Beyond that participants are free to utilize the time as they desire. After those first thirty minutes alone, participants are urged to do whatever is life-giving for them during the respite. This could include reading, napping, chatting, sports, reflection, gaming, walking, puzzles, prayer, music, artwork, needlework, exercise, or any other respite activity. Scheduling the long break during daylight hours makes outdoor activities an option. The participants embrace the longer than usual break from the mental alertness required to do the work they are engaging. The leaders also value this time to recover and regroup before pressing forward.

---

28 For details see Personal Prayer Practices in the Participant Binder in Appendix B.
Personal Reflection

Participants receive information, gleaned from the Enneagram Institute training binder, about what each type looks like at the various levels of health/freedom.

Participants respond to the description of their type as seen in Figure 5.20.

| 1.  | Review the Levels of Health handout for your Type.          |
| 2.  | Mark statements that describe you now.                    |
| 3.  | Use another method/color to mark statements that have described you in the past. |
| 4.  | As best you can tell, what is your level of health? Where do you think your set point is? |
| 5.  | Take your psychological testing into consideration. How do your Enneagram type and level of health help to inform the results? |
| 6.  | What sorts of circumstances usually lead you to healthier behaviors and patterns? |
| 7.  | What sorts of circumstances tend to lead you to less healthy behaviors and patterns? |
| 8.  | Bring all this to God and listen for God’s response.       |
| 9.  | Write down what you imagine God saying to you.             |

Figure 5.20.

Creating Skits and Skit Night

When the time comes for planning the skits students are typically emotionally drained and do not believe they have enough energy to create skits.\(^{29}\) Pressing forward is imperative even though students resist verbally and leaders can feel the exhaustion in both the students and in themselves. The energy swells palpably as the creating process begins and students re-engage enthusiastically. Participants work in enneagram type groups to create a skit that demonstrates, usually in exaggerated and light-hearted ways, what it looks like to have that type energy, highlighting their type’s ego strategies and temptations. Leaders encourage props, costumes, humor, and creativity. The skits typically evoke tremendous release, laughter, and freedom as skit behaviors hit close to

\(^{29}\) “Pleasure in the classroom is feared….To prove your academic seriousness, students should be almost dead, quiet, asleep, not up, excited and buzzing, lingering around the classroom.” hooks, 145.
home. These are exactly the goals. Students report that the humor is healing and restoring, and insist that the skits are a *must-do* for every year.\(^{30}\)

**Answers to Remaining Questions**

Retreat leaders address issues during this segment which were raised by the students in Session Ten. This includes any topic or question about which students feel unsettled or under-informed.\(^{31}\) Leaders decide the night before how to meet those requests and who will speak to each one. The topics that students articulate reveal what is important to them and where possible voids exist in the content of the retreat.

**Closing Worship**

Closing worship is a sweet time of connection and communion. Students and retreat leaders lead together. Worship cements a group that has grown in self-awareness, in cohesiveness, and in love and appreciation for God and each other.

**Post Retreat Survey and Reflection**

The post-retreat survey has dual purpose: helping students reflect on the experience they have just had and helping leaders evaluate the formational effect of the retreat experience. Students respond to questions that largely parallel the pre-retreat...

---

\(^{30}\) One year, the Type Sevens—the last skit of the evening—ended their skit with a dance that evolved into a dance party in which everyone participated. The love and joy expressed during that event were palpable.

\(^{31}\) For example, in 2015 I spoke to the question – “What do we do with these open wounds now?” — with two answers. First, grace is like water, it pools in the low places. (Richard Rohr, Enneagram and Grace Conference). So, look for Jesus when you face your shadows. Second, I encouraged participants to give to their own inner selves the pastoral sensitivity and compassion they offer to others. Another leader, Dr John Brogan, addressed the question, “Where is God in all this?” by gently inviting us into several texts tying the Enneagram with sanctification. Then the group discussed the need to covenant with each other going forward, in order to hold each other’s stories respectfully and supportively.
survey. See Figure 5.21. Students are also asked to write a retreat reflection one week after returning from the experience. See the retreat reflection assignment in Appendix E.

**Summary**

The Formation retreat makes use of enneagram content and contemplative framing. It creates a pragmatic opportunity for seminary students to grow in their connection with God, others, and self. Pedagogical and formational considerations are paramount in the retreat design. Retreat leaders continually assess and refine the elements of the retreat in order to enhance the formational potential. The following chapter investigates retreat effectiveness at Western Theological Seminary via qualitative research.
Figure 4.22.

The Formation retreat makes use of Enneagram content and contemplative framing. It creates a pragmatic opportunity for seminary students to grow in their connection with God, others, and self. The retreat leaders continually assess and refine the elements of the retreat in order to enhance the formational potential. The following chapter investigates retreat effectiveness at Western Theological Seminary via qualitative research.

Figure 5.21.

Post-Retreat Survey

1. Name

2. In what experiences this week, have you been most aware of your connection to God (Father, Son and Holy Spirit)?

3. What does it mean to be connected to God?

4. How much has your awareness of the following increased this week?
   Scale of 1 – 10. 1 = “My awareness has not increased at all.” 10 = “My awareness has increased as much as it would ever be possible for a person’s awareness to increase.”
   - your body
     1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10
   - your emotions
     1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10
   - your acceptance of other people’s perspectives
     1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10
   - how you think and act in order to make sure things are all right in your world
     1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10
   - God’s presence
     1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

5. How have you experienced a change in how you feel about:
   a. your body?
   b. your emotions?
   c. your thoughts?
   d. your actions?
   e. your connection with God?

6. How has learning the Enneagram been helpful to you?

7. What is prayer?

8. How do you imagine this retreat experience will impact your life and ministry?

9. What do you sense God is nudging you toward being and doing as a result of this retreat experience?
Chapter Six
An Exploration of the Effect of a Formation Retreat with Enneagram Content and Contemplative Framing on Developing Contemplative Leadership

Introduction

Chapter Five offered one practical plan—a formation retreat with enneagram content and contemplative framing—for developing contemplative leadership within the seminary context, given the need for contemplation among Christ followers and the implication that has for ministry leadership. Chapter Six asks the descriptive-empirical question of whether that strategy actually fosters contemplative ministry leadership, summarized as love of God, others, and self. Osmer frames the descriptive-empirical task as “a spirituality of presence…a spiritual orientation of attending to others in their particularity and otherness within the presence of God. Thus, Chapter Six attends to the experiences of the students who participated in the formation retreat. Chapter Six begins by defining the research and its methods, moves to the results of the research and finally offers impressions of the research.

The categories of love of God, love of others, and love of self are being reported separately. However, it is crucial to recognize that love of God, others, and self are inextricably intertwined, which the data will show. The distinctions used for research purposes are relatively artificial. One student gave this moving testimonial to intertwining:

1 This project seeks to explore the following animating questions. How does utilizing the Enneagram in the formative process at Western Theological Seminary provide a valuable means for dismantling barriers to and creating space for connecting wholly to God, others and self? And more specifically, how does a four-day retreat for M.Div. students, focused on the Enneagram and framed in contemplative rhythms, increase the capacity of students to connect wholly with God, others and self and thus live and lead out of their true, God-created selves?
I’ve come to realize that it is God dwelling within me… it is Father, Son, and Holy Spirit living inside of me, breathing within me, closer than my breath itself. And that’s been really beautiful and I feel like, as that shift in my prayer and my understanding of God’s presence in my life has impacted the way that I see God at work in the world, the way that I see myself, and my relationship with God and with others, it’s been incredibly transformative!

Another student also gave voice to the interplay of connection to God, others, and self:

Walking out of the retreat…I felt more like a whole person. I felt like I had more self-understanding, and I had better understanding of others, and perhaps better understanding of the creativity and the work of God in our lives.

From a theological perspective, the inseparability of the categories is a necessity. Love of God is expressed via love of others. “Beloved, let us love one another, because love is from God; everyone who loves is born of God and knows God.”\(^2\) Love of others, including self, is predicated upon love of God. “We love because [God] first loved us.”\(^3\) God is love, therefore all true love, no matter for whom or from whom, is of one source.\(^4\)

For the purpose of this research, the *Love of God* category focuses specifically on awareness and connection with God, as well as recognition of both how the Spirit of God is making changes internally and what purpose God has called one to. *Love of Others* encompasses valuing and respecting others as well as recognition of human interdependence and unity. *Love of Self* includes appreciative self-regard and cognizance of personal patterns, motivations, and behaviors.

In the report, each of the three broad categories begins with an assessment of *awareness*. Students from both the 2015 and 2016 retreats were asked to report, on the post-retreat survey, about the amount of increase in awareness they experienced in

\(^2\) 1John 4:7 (NRSV).

\(^3\) I John 4:19 (NRSV).

\(^4\) “God is love, and those who abide in love abide in God, and God abides in them.” 1Jo 4:16 (NRSV).
several areas as a result of the work of the retreat. Forty-four students\(^5\) responded to the following question.

How much has your awareness of the following areas increased this week on a scale of 1-10 with 1 being “my awareness has not increased at all” and 10 being “my awareness has increased as much as it would ever be possible for a person’s awareness to increase”?

In this research report, a rating of 1 is termed no increase. Ratings of 2 or 3 are called minimal increase. Responses of 4, 5 and 6 are classified as moderate increase. Ratings of 7, 8, 9 and 10 are assigned the label substantial increase.

In each of the three main categories specific themes also arose, which will be illuminated. In the category of Love of God, themes of sanctification and vocational clarity arose. Increased capacity to love and the body of Christ emerged as themes under the category of Love of Others. The additional theme of self-acceptance appeared in regard to Love of Self.

Finally, each category has been gleaned with regard to implications for ministry leadership, remembering that love of God, others, and self are tightly tied.

---

\(^5\) The spread of the enneagram types that students identified with at the time of the retreat is as follows: type one – 3, type two – 9, type three – 8, type four – 6, type five – 7, type six – 3, type seven – 10, type eight – 4, type nine – 12.
Results of the Research

Love of God

Awareness of God

Table 6.2.
Increase in Awareness of God by Number of Students

On the post-retreat survey students were asked to rate the increase in their awareness of the presence of God on a scale of 1 to 10. All but one of the respondents reported an increase in awareness. Nine reported minimal increase, eight reported moderate increase, and twenty-six reported substantial increase. The average increase among the students was 6. Awareness of God and connection with God were considered together in the data. Post-retreat surveys specifically mentioned experiences such as “feeling deeply loved by God,” “moving towards greater union with the Lord,” and “hearing God’s call to enjoy the present moment.” In response to the question, “How have you experienced a change in how you feel about your connection with God, one
student made a powerful and expressive summative statement. “God feels so much more present. So. Much. MORE.”

More than a third of the 2016 participants mentioned specific experiences of awareness of God in their retreat reflections. One student wrote:

The moment that I experienced God the most was at the point where I could do nothing but weep. In that moment, over and over again, I heard God saying, “My grace is sufficient for you, for my power is made perfect in weakness.”

Another offered this:

During the sessions, you could feel God working….In our moments of weakness God was there comforting us. In our moments of pride God was knocking us down a rung or two…. [God] was the one at work.

When the focus groups were asked to comment on the effects of the retreat on their relationship with God one student responded:

…for me to name [my pain] while being aware that I’m in the presence of God has been really impactful. And with that, I feel like I’m more aware of God’s presence in moments where I haven’t always been aware that God is present.”

Sanctification

In the 2015 post-retreat surveys, sanctification showed up in specific comments. For example, one student said, “My thoughts have become less judgmental.” Another said, “I sense that God is asking me to pay attention and be quiet instead of trying to fix everything now and all at once.” One post-retreat respondent expressed hope for continuing sanctification in sensing God’s nudging to “stop doubting the work that [God] has already done in me and look forward to the work [God] is going to do.”

More than half of the participants made statements in their retreat reflection papers about changes they sensed God making. Students referenced things like

---

6 Sanctification is defined here as changes God makes, via the Spirit, in one’s way of living.
addressing personal pride, living into identity as a child of God, becoming more present
to a spouse, moving toward gratitude, and caring for their bodies. One student expressed
God’s invitation to sanctification this way: “I desire to be someone who can love and be
loved without another agenda. I want to do things for others without expecting anything
in return.” Another student wrote:

I think God is inviting me to speak more slowly, to pause and consider whether or
not something needs to be said. God is calling me into quiet, stillness, silence, and
the Word. God is calling me to find my edges, where my thoughts end and God’s
truth begins so that I can speak with caution, grace, and truth.

Ten months after the retreat, the participants of the focus groups were also able to
identify ways that God was working sanctification in them. One student said she had
been empowered to make healthier choices and spoke of daily giving up of pride.

Students also made multiple mentions of the idea of “letting go.” One participant, in
response to his classmates around the idea of letting go, described it as follows.

Both of you brought this up, but just letting go, being in the moment, where all of
a sudden you feel your…main sin coming on, that one that is always more
prevalent. So when all of the sudden you see the stress level and all of the sudden
these sins and this disconnect come up, [contemplation] is this practice where all
of the sudden you connect best to God and you just sit and you let go. You just
kind of stop time and you’re [thinking] ‘here it is. Something’s happening.’ And
for me it’s just this contemplative moment of sitting there and reconnecting and
taking a deep breath….

Vocational Clarity

A few post-retreat respondents reflected on the impact of the retreat experience on
vocation. One said, “I can continue to push forward to this calling God has placed on my
life. I am feeling more confident.” Another specifically imagined the enneagram
becoming part of their vocational calling this way:

I could really see myself using this in the capacity as a chaplain or some kind of spiritual
director. Ultimately, I want people to begin to become self-aware, in order for them to
experience the liberation and freedom that comes with acknowledging your brokenness and beauty.

Also in the 2016 reflection papers, several students indicated a sharpening of their vocational calling. Some mentioned being affirmed in their ministry calling. “Learning more about my natural strengths has helped me feel more confident [about becoming] a church planter and cross-cultural missionary.” Others, unsure of their specific vocational direction, had an experience similar to the student who wrote, “The retreat opened me up to hearing what God is calling me to.”

One woman told a story in her focus group about how, with the understanding gained from the enneagram, she and a friend entered a conversation that led her to the following realization:

I think I know I want to be a pastor, I’m just afraid. But I had never stopped to assess what those fears are, so…I named those fears and realized…they’re not anything that God can’t handle. And so it was kind of this moment, this beautiful moment, where I felt the Holy Spirit and I [knew] this is what I’m supposed to do!

Later this student described “a kind of freedom that translated into vocational discernment coming out of this, which is a really exciting and wonderful thing!”

**Implications for Ministry Leadership**

Several students made statements in their written reflections about God-experiences leading to transformation that is crucial to ministry leadership. One student wrote:

I want to shepherd God’s flock of lost sheep, and be guided through helping others in their suffering. God is transforming me into a more patient and caring person….drawing the bitterness in my heart out like rattlesnake poison….I want to lead by example, through the serving of others.

Another participant shared, “I’m [now] more inclined to be quiet and listen to others….I’m moving toward the peace that I want to have for myself and emulate to
others.” Still another said, “Instead of just focusing on what I have to do, I’ve been focusing on my interactions with the people around me.” One student testified:

I believe God is nudging me toward being better at stepping into pain….My avoidance of pain hurts other people’s growth because I am not willing to take on their burdens. I hope that as I… learn to better step into pain I will be better able to show people God’s love.

Focus group participants also expressed ministry-significant God encounters. One of the focus group participants explained,

God is nudging me towards walking with people to find health again….and helping people figure out where they’re at and how they’re connecting with God and how you live into the practice of this every day.

**Love of Others**

**Awareness of Others**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No Increase</th>
<th>Minimal Increase</th>
<th>Moderate Increase</th>
<th>Substantial Increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Students were asked to rate the increase in their openness to others’ perspectives. On this question all of the forty-four respondents reported some increase in awareness;
four minimal, eleven moderate, and twenty-nine substantial. The average increase expressed on the scale of 1 to 10 was 7. Students mentioned “new ways of thinking about others in my class,” seeing “life through other people’s eyes,” awareness of “different ways in which people connect with God,” and “learning not to judge.”

Over sixty percent of the 2016 reflections contained specific references to increased awareness of others. One student spoke for several others about how surprised they were “to learn how similar we all are in our weaknesses and brokenness.” Paradoxically, comments were especially plentiful in regard to recognizing how differently people think and function. One student put it this way:

The retreat transformed the way I experience people. The way I interact with close friends, family, and strangers will forever be changed due to my understanding of how differently people feel and experience the world. God is guiding me towards a broader acceptance of all his people.

Another claimed, “I have also gained a lot of insight into the joys and struggles of people with different energies.” One student made a lovely theological statement related to awareness of others.

This retreat provided a time and space, as well as tools, for me to realize just how different God has created us all to be and that even when I may dislike those differences, they can still turn out to be beautiful diversities in the midst of our unity. I learned that I was able to see many different facets of God’s character that are not evident in my own life, in the lives of others.

2015 Focus Group participants were still highly influenced, ten months after the retreat, by their growing awareness of others. They all concurred with the value of recognizing differences in others. As one student put it:

This has impacted my relationships with others… in being able to understand others motivations and the way that other people are different from me….Asking [them], ‘Is this the way you see the world then?’ or ‘Is this the way that you’re motivated?’ and just trying to understand better and realizing that I hadn’t really understood before.
One student expressed a perception of how her differences are important for others.

I realized that people come with different motivations….I am [now] aware that other people do not necessarily view the world the same way that I do [and] it is important to share [my] different view and way of participating in the world.

**Increased Capacity to Love**

Some of the 2015 post-retreat surveys alluded to changes in relationships. One student said, “It gives me perspective on how to deal more respectfully and effectively with others.” Another talked of becoming more sensitive to the needs of others.

However, the 2016 reflections *overwhelmingly* expressed an increase in the capacity of the participants to love others. At least fifty direct statements were made about the positive effects of the retreat on regarding others. Following is a display of words used, in order of frequency, left to right and top to bottom.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Understanding</th>
<th>Love</th>
<th>Compassion</th>
<th>Patience</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acceptance</td>
<td>Empathy</td>
<td>Bonding</td>
<td>Connection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grace</td>
<td>Sensitivity</td>
<td>Appreciation</td>
<td>Open-Heartedness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support</td>
<td>Listening</td>
<td>Encouragement</td>
<td>Space-Making</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Student used these expressions in regard to their classmates, family and friends, and ministry relationships. For example, a student shared:

---

7 This set of words powerfully reflects many of the basic needs and desires that are common to humankind, especially in the broad category of interdependence. See Marshall B. Rosenberg, *Nonviolent Communication: a Language of Life*, 2nd ed. (Encinitas, CA: Puddledancer Press, 2003), 54-56.
God desires...me to have relationships with others, and they don’t have to be picture perfect. It has been really encouraging to see God continue to work towards opening my heart to these relationships. I hear [God] telling me, “Go, love!”

Another adds, “I have gained a lot of insight into the joys and struggles of people with different energies. I hope to use this knowledge to be more sensitive and helpful when I am caring for them.” One-third of the reflection papers mentioned relationships with classmates explicitly and many more implicitly. For instance:

I experienced God working in a variety of ways on this retreat, but this was especially true of the relational aspects of our time together. I was able to get to know people on a deeper level...and in understanding people more fully I was able to love them more fully.

And:

The next two and a half years we have here together are ripe with potential for spiritual formation as well as intellectual growth. The process will go smoother for all of us if we continue to build strong and uplifting relationships with one another.

Focus groups also shared strong relational sentiments. One student said, “After this retreat I just found myself more in love with people...so I think that God is using this tool, nudging us to be more unified...and to continue to walk together out of hiding.”

**The Body of Christ**

Another strong theme arising in relationship to connection with others is the body of Christ, represented in the following reflection expressions:

- “We all have different strengths and weaknesses and we need each other to live holistically.”
- “…appreciating and embracing the diversity in the body of Christ.”
- “God has built his body the way that he intended.”
• “I begin to see a new light that we need one another and I have things to offer them and they have things to offer me.”

• “Despite being flawed we still can make a contribution in God’s kingdom.”

• “…the need for every type of energy in the Church body.”

• “All enneagram numbers, and not just numbers, but the people, represent the body of Christ.”

One focus group participant told a story, which powerfully expresses the body of Christ:

When we were talking about [people with eight energy], I remember [a person with eight energy] sharing some personality traits of his and his story, and I remember my palms sweating and I felt sick….I hated it and I was sweaty and …I didn’t like the personality he was describing. So I took some time to reflect on why I had such a response to that and just recognized a pattern in myself of [having] this aversion to people who show eight energy. And I had just identified that as people I didn’t like, and I didn’t think about the pattern that maybe upset me, and also connected it to some history that I have with my own family. My dad’s very much an eight and just has an abusive history, and so I was connecting that with this reality. And it was such a gift to me because what followed immediately after us talking about eights, and eights sort of confessing [they] get a bad rap sometimes, was someone making this beautiful statement about how the kingdom needs those people, and I remember just feeling like crying because the kingdom needs eights so badly. I cannot do what eight energy does, and it was a really cool thing for me because …I always believed…we need all sorts of strengths, we need all sorts of skills, and that’s something I’ve always stood on. But I never thought of it as people! I always thought of it as qualities and strengths and gifts. Of course I need your gift, I can’t do that. But I need you as a whole person for the kingdom as a whole!

Ministry Leadership Implications

The implications of love for others in ministry leadership may seem abundantly clear from the previous data. However many students made direct links, which add to the weight of the consideration of the enneagram and the enneagram retreat as occasioning
living and leading out of one’s God-created self. One reflection writer confessed the following:

It is very easy for me to be friendly with everyone, but then to stay on the fringes of a community and never develop deep relationships….The retreat, however, awakened in me a longing for deeper fellowship and community. I sense God asking me to be willing to open myself up to being in fellowship and community with other believers. I believe that God desires for His children to have this and it is something that will speak volumes to the unbelieving world. I can also see how God wants me to learn this lesson now in order to impact my future ministry.

Another student put it this way,

Implications for ministry are manifold but foremost, for me at least, is accepting people for who they are and not being tempted to encourage them to change into something that is not truly the expression that God designed them to be…. I as a leader will be much more relaxed and accepting of both myself and those around me….I have discovered a beauty in people that I have not really understood before.

Focus groups still recognized the profound implications for ministry of the understandings generated by the retreat experience. Here is how one student posed it:

I didn’t have a frame of reference for how to begin to ask questions of what motivates me, what gets me, or to see the picture of when I’m healthy or when I’m not, so [the enneagram] helped me kind of do that. And… now I have a frame of reference to see others. Now when I look at the church, and the churches that I work in, I don’t see a bunch of people who are competing or who are… driven like me. I see a lot of people being driven by different ideas.
In the category of awareness of self, students were again asked to report the increase they sensed, on a scale of 1 to 10. In regard to body awareness on the post-retreat survey, three students reported no increase in awareness, nine reported minimal increase, thirteen reported moderate increase, and nineteen reported substantial increase. The average increase was 5. In regard to emotional awareness, all students reported an increase in awareness, six reported minimal increase, eleven reported moderate increase, and twenty-seven reported substantial increase, with the average at 7. *Awareness of Thoughts and Behaviors* is “how you think and act to make sure things are all right in your world.” One student reported no increase in awareness, four reported minimal increase, ten reported moderate increase and twenty-nine reported substantial increase,
with an average of 7. 2015 students also included the following areas of self-awareness in the comment section of the post-retreat survey:

- Patterns of emotions
- Triggers of emotions
- Needs
- Healthy and unhealthy patterns
- Motivations
- Fears
- Weaknesses
- Interactions with others
- How others experience me

Not surprisingly, the 2016 retreat reflections were almost completely unanimous in including examples of increased self-awareness. Much of the awareness students wrote about bore with it a measure of pain.

- “I realized that for the past year I have been in an extremely unhealthy place which has kept me from fully living into my calling.”
- “I became acutely aware of how my walls have affected my friendships with people and have caused me to isolate myself completely.”
- “During the retreat, I experienced God as one revealing,…as a surgeon pulling back gauze to show the work he’s doing and what work yet needs doing. God revealed things to me that I had never acknowledged in myself. I felt God pulling some of those places into the light for me to see.”
Another student, who by his/her own admission had done considerable self-awareness work in the past, had this epiphany:

The information about resentment being my root barrier or sin, and the primary way my anger is expressed, was a new and helpful insight for me. As I look back on my life, I can see clearly how my resentment has been woven into many situations. I can identify it still at work in my life now. I rarely express outward anger, and in some ways have come to believe I simply do not feel anger. It was a breakthrough moment for me to realize I do feel anger; it is just expressed internally in resentment.

Focus groups talked extensively about mounting self-awareness, ten months after their retreat. Like the reflection papers, their sharing also revealed the pain that often comes with engaging self-awareness.

I realized over time that those things I had resistance to, were actually true of me and I just didn’t want them to be true. It gave me a deeper understanding of myself, even in my twoness of kind of being self-deceptive about some of those traits that I don’t like about myself.

In response to the question, “How has the experience of the formation retreat impacted you personally, in regard to understanding yourself,” one student responded as follows:

I personally found it really powerful, because I felt identifying with my number so clearly named things that I had never heard before, that I knew, but I never had language for, and that…identified patterns within myself that I still see come up today….I knew what my strengths were, I knew what my weaknesses were, but I didn’t recognize a pattern to so many behaviors that were core to who I was, and the enneagram was the first place I saw that.

**Self-Acceptance**

On the post-retreat survey, 2015 participants shared several indications of growth toward self-acceptance. This includes statements such as “trusting myself,” “loving myself,” and “giving myself grace and compassion.” Other expressions of self-acceptance included “appreciating how God made me,” “better caring for myself,” “validating my emotions,” and “paying attention to my gifts.”
More than half of the reflection papers bore witness to students experiencing *expanding* compassion, grace, and understanding toward themselves. Several vulnerable statements help to illustrate.

- “I don’t have to beat myself up and feel bitter.”
- “I was able to feel compassion for myself.”
- “I am able to forgive myself for mistakes I have made.”
- “I can be loved and appreciated for who I am, not [just] what I do.”
- “The way I treat myself has been transformed.”
- “This helped me to accept that I am the type of person that God wants me to be and not try to be something else.”

One student shared this stirring story.

I couldn’t quite accept or understand how people at the retreat kept being so kind and affirming of who I was. I think God has been trying to show me how He sees me and to help me learn to accept myself, flaws and all, as His precious child. I know that a healthy view of self, one that is honest about both weaknesses and strengths and one that acknowledges God’s great love, is important for leaders in ministry. I wonder if a part of why God led me to WTS was to regain a sense of self-worth.

Participants of the focus groups also reflected on the growing experience of holding themselves more gently, as in the following story:

I found myself having a love for myself, as well [as for other people]. I think for me, probably the biggest thing that came out of the retreat immediately and I’m still growing into, is this challenge to own who I am, to just let myself be who I am and pay attention to who that person is a little bit more than I do sometimes. I can get so focused on trying to do everything that I think I’m supposed to do and do it all right….Recognizing that [this] comes from my six energy allowed me to say, ‘I can be my own person and I can do things the way that works for me.’ That’s been so important to me. I was really stressed out last year with taking 15 credits and my internship was not life giving to me but I was doing a good job, and so I wanted – I felt like I had to do it and keep doing it because….that’s what I was supposed to do. But after this retreat, I decided pretty quickly that I was going to cut back in credits the next year and I found a different internship for this year that’s much more life giving for me, and I started seeing a counselor, so I
was more empowered to start making decisions that are more in line with who I actually am, rather than who I thought I should be. So that has actually been really huge.

**Ministry Leadership Implications**

The 2016 reflections offered specific examples of the implications of the retreat experience on ministry leadership.

- Being fully exposed has given me no other viable option but to acknowledge my emotional habits and strip them away as best I can to be close to others. This will have profound effects on my ministry! I believe in the integrity we do or don’t possess. It filters into the water that the church drinks. If I am being vulnerable in my private life and with my fellow clergy members, that can only serve to help create the same environment between parishioners.

- An implication of this retreat is the basic understanding of …how I respond to different energies. This understanding will help me to discern how my interactions with others come across to others…. I will have a tool for greater social and personal awareness development. I will understand better who to ask for what sorts of things and how to ask them.

Focus group participants also recognized the value of self-awareness in reaching the goal of healthy leadership. One said, “In owning who I am, I’m able to be more fully who I am and that makes me a better leader [emphasis added].” Another bravely disclosed:

> When it comes to my relationships, especially in leadership and ministry, I was able to step back and recognize that I was manipulating people. And so I practice now, assessing – asking myself what my motivation is behind something.

**Impressions**

The compilation of the research findings of the previous sections lends to multiple impressions. First, for the most part, students thoroughly engaged the experience of the retreat. They took the subject matter and the invitation to the contemplative rhythms seriously. Second, retreat participants were willing to undertake significant, but painful, inner work. They displayed courage and humility in doing so. Third, students were able
to articulate the present and future effects of their personal work on their lives and ministries. Their thoughtful synthesis offers clear insight into the themes of transformation. All of these factors lend credence to the research and offer a comprehensive gaze into the value of the experience, which proved to be considerable.

Examining the Other Side

Since the project data looks overwhelmingly positive, two considerations raise their heads: first, possible explanations for the overall positivity and, second, contrary minority voices in the data. For this researcher there exists a most tempting explanation for the predominantly positive data: the answer to the question, “Does a four day retreat for M.Div. students, focused on the enneagram and framed in contemplative rhythms, increase the capacity of students to connect wholly with God, others, and self and thus live and lead out of their true, God-created selves?” is an undisputable “Yes!” Further investigation will, hopefully, mitigate this default assumption and the appeal of ignoring all voices to the contrary.

Other Possible Explanations for Overall Positivity

One conceivable explanation of the positivity reflects back to the formerly mentioned concern about the power differential between the research participants and me. Even with as much encouragement to be genuine as the formation team and I were able to give before, during, and after the retreat, it remains a possibility that some students may have over-slanted the feedback in a positive direction in the, conscious or unconscious, hopes of gaining approval from their teachers.
Another explanation involves a difference in the wording of the pre and post-retreat surveys, which may have led to an inaccurate portrayal of the increase in awareness pieces of the data. In the pre-retreat survey the question four wording was as follows:

4. How aware are you of the following?

Scale of 1 – 10. 1 = “I am completely unaware” 10 = “I am completely aware”

In the pre-retreat survey, the students generally rated themselves at 5 and above in all the areas of awareness questioned: body, emotions, thoughts and actions, other’s perspectives, and God’s presence. A considerable minority of students used a rating of 4 or less. In the post-retreat survey, question number four read:

4. How much has your awareness of the following increased this week?

Scale of 1 – 10. 1 = “My awareness has not increased at all.” 10 = “My awareness has increased as much as it would ever be possible for a person’s awareness to increase.”

The previous bar graphs show the overwhelming estimation of the students in regard to their own increase in awareness. However, it could be possible that the students answered question four on the post-retreat survey as though it asked the same question as the pre-retreat survey. Students did not have access to their pre-retreat surveys at the time of filling out the post survey, but the time frame between the two surveys was only days. One particular comment in the post-retreat surveys raised this suspicion. A student circled a rating of 8 for question four on their post survey, but in question five - “How have you experienced a change in how you feel about your body?” - responded, “Not much change here.” This person had also circled 8 for question four on their pre survey. So either this student thought they were answering the same question four on both
surveys, or this student’s *awareness* of their body had greatly increased but how they *felt* about their body was unchanged.

Another curious phenomenon that lends to the suspicion of misunderstanding on the survey is how consistently students, who rated themselves quite high in awareness in the pre-retreat survey, especially in 2016, also rated their increase in awareness very high. In this case, either the students thought they were answering the same question in both surveys, or they discovered that they had not been as aware as they previously believed. The second possibility is corroborated by at least one student who said, “I thought I was so aware of my body, but I realize that I often just use it as a tool in the day to day tasks.”

One final reason to consider the apparently all-encompassing positive data with a measure of reservation is the recognition that focus groups drew students who had predominantly good feelings toward the enneagram and toward contemplative practices. The voices of those who do not appreciate the enneagram or who question the value of contemplative habits were conspicuously absent from the focus groups. At least one student, when the invitation to the focus groups went out, told me respectfully but plainly that he did not see the value of the enneagram and was not interested in yet another forum for talking about it.

**Minority Voices**

The *minority voices* in this project refer to individuals who either raised resistance to one or more elements of the retreat experience, or indicated little or no formational growth as a result of the experience. Not everyone who participated in the retreat reported transformational growth. One participant wrote:

I don’t think I really learned much about myself….For me, this experience was not a major breakthrough in self-discovery, but rather a slight expanding of
vocabulary for some things I already had a pretty good handle on….The retreat itself wasn’t transformational for me and I don’t have a clear nudge in any direction as a result of it….I am grateful for…the ways it seems to have opened some things in some of my peers.

Another participant lamented as follows:

I had better things to do with my time than sit there for four days and be in school all day….As for the enneagram stuff I really did not get all that was going on….there were times that I felt really disconnected. I know a lot of the practices that we were supposed to do did not really work for me. I also know that there were days that were so long that I tended to tune out….I saw different things that disturbed me that went on at the retreat….

Yet another student wrote about personal discomfort as follows:

There were multiple times where I did not feel that the way I was feeling was genuine….There was a lot of emotion that I was skeptical of in the room. With that much time together focusing on our “problems” with the “number” we are, felt kind of manipulative in my eyes….Overall I enjoyed and disliked the retreat, found it both helpful and harmful.

On the surveys, six students indicated less than significant increase in awareness in all the areas surveyed. Four students indicated less than significant increase in all but one area. However, no single person rated their increase in awareness as none or minimal across all the categories.

Two of the 2016 reflection papers, however, did not contain any comments in the realm of the identified research themes and two papers contained only two or three. One of these papers in particular stands out from the perspective that the majority of the comments related to the student’s skepticism about the validity of the enneagram itself, as follows.

I had a great deal of trouble with the enneagram. From the basic assumptions it stands on to the conclusions it drew, I found myself critical. Beyond this, I had difficulty with the claims of life impact, particularly considering the lack of research I could find on the enneagram. First, the enneagram … had a heaping helping of humanistic philosophy. We are all born good, uncorrupted, with only good intentions. Then we are corrupted by a broken world. This has little basis in
the theological grounding of the reformed tradition, much less psychology and science. From there, there was much talk of the “ego” and its defense mechanisms. This relies on a particular philosophical construction of the human mind put forth by Freud, and since debunked and rejected by a vast majority of the psychological community. Based upon Freudian psychology as it was, it drew the logical conclusions it would. Abnormal psychology (depression, split personalities, etc) is a result of an overemphasis on defense mechanisms….There was little to no discussion of the underlying principles of the enneagram.

This student did concede that the information may be helpful to some people but was hard pressed to recognize any helpfulness of the experience for her/him.

Focus groups were specifically asked to speak about what was not helpful in regard to the retreat experience and what they might suggest to improve it. One of the suggestions that seemed to have traction, and which I have heard anecdotally from several others, was about “continuing the conversation.” Students asked if there are ways to continue the work that is started during the retreat, from two perspectives. One perspective is that the awareness growing from the retreat is so crucial and also so intense that having a forum for ongoing processing feels needed. “Are there resources for people when they come back? Like debriefing? I feel like there are people who really wanted that.” Another take on the need for ongoing encounters with the enneagram is that without reminders it becomes very easy to slip into the less healthy ways of communicating—“baseline and shallow” as one student put it—which lead to stereotyping and judgement. Another student asked it this way, “How do you lose the caricature?”

Another student advocated for better preparation prior to the retreat. “I remember all of us leaving that retreat and going, ‘Oh, my gosh, we didn’t prepare ourselves mentally and spiritually for what just happened.’ It was…a spiritual wakeup call!”
Another concern had to do with “protecting the space for the people who were enjoying the [experience].” This person talked about having:

a really negative experience with several people complaining about it and hating it. And I didn’t care that they hated it, but I didn’t want them to convince me to hate it too. I wanted people to let me have my joy in this really cool thing…. I remember feeling kind of bitter because people weren’t on board.

A situation which has been of particular concern to the researcher is reflected in the words of another student in thinking back upon the time since his retreat experience. He writes:

After the retreat, I definitely became too obsessed with it. I found myself in social situations not asking, “What should I do?” but “What would a nine do?” As if nine energy completely defined me in every way. Although the enneagram is helpful, I have been lately realizing that it is only a tool. It cannot reveal fully who someone is and what makes him or her tick.

**Toward Contemplative Leadership**

The minority voices raise valid concerns, which warrant consideration in going forward with the retreat process. However, the overall thrust of the research indicates detectable movement toward contemplative leadership. Palmer’s definition of a leader, in chapter three, is “someone with the power to project either shadow or light onto some part of the world and onto the lives of the people who dwell there.”\(^8\) The research suggests that many students, who openheartedly encounter the work of the enneagram, connect with the Light of the world. One student wrote about the *shining* of insight “onto the most unhelpful or unhealthy parts of myself in a way that leaves room for truth and hope as to who [God] is every-forming me to be [emphasis mine].” Students also desire to reflect that Light to the people who dwell in their context. A student shared about “a

calling in beauty and in sitting with others in their pain and brokenness.” Another student said, “Ever since the retreat, I have been more compassionate, loving, and aware of the thoughts and feelings of others.” Palmer also claimed that, “A leader shapes the ethos in which others must live, an ethos as life-filled as heaven or as shadowy as hell.”\(^9\) One student talked about the freedom she feels to “welcome others to be who they are, fully and freely and without shame or insecurity.” Another commented about “the ways in which I can offer grace to others.” Surely an ethos shaped by welcome, authenticity, and grace is life-filled and life-giving.

### Summary

In this chapter the results of the post-retreat surveys demonstrated the scope of the increase in awareness that students sensed as a result of the enneagram retreat. And as evidenced above, the pages of the reflections and the transcriptions of the focus groups were replete with examples of how the experience created opportunities for students to grow in love for God, others, and self. Ministry leadership implications are also readily evident. A formation retreat with enneagram content and contemplative framing is very effective for developing contemplative leadership, within the seminary context at Western Theological Seminary. The following chapter offers further suggestions and asks further questions about contemplative leadership.

\(^9\) Ibid.
Chapter Seven
Conclusion

This project attempts to offer a deeper theoretical and theological understanding of what happens when we teach contemplation for leadership formation. The logic of the project started broadly, discussing the value of contemplation in general. The project then narrowed to contemplation related to leadership development, and finally to a specific strategy for developing contemplative leadership.

Chapter Seven begins by recapping Osmer’s practical theology model in reverse order, to re-broaden the focus back to the significance of contemplation.¹ The second section of the chapter offers implications and suggestions for theological seminaries, in general, and for Western Theological Seminary, in particular. Finally, I offer some of the lingering questions raised by this project, one for each practical theology task.

Rewinding the Practical Theology Method

Descriptive-Empirical Task

The research in the previous chapter demonstrated that a formation retreat with enneagram content and contemplative framing can be effective for developing contemplative leadership within a seminary context, by fostering love of God, others, and self. The retreat increased participants’ awareness of and connection with God. They reported becoming more open in multiple ways. Some participants felt the love of God in ways they had not previously experienced. Some sensed the Spirit molding their lives toward godliness. Some encountered a renewed sense of call.

The most surprising finding in the research and the experience at the retreat was the degree to which participants increased in their love for each other; the result of at least three factors. First, vulnerability and authenticity generated tenderness and affection. Second, participants became significantly more compassionate when they discovered that some people have motivations or fears different from their own. Participants found it easier to understand why certain people act in particular ways that previously seemed troublesome to them. The capacity to connect and empathize with others is crucial to ministry leadership. Third, the retreat stimulated delight in diversity in the body of Christ. Participants realized they need each other. A consequence of increased connection with others was more humility.

The retreat was significantly effective when it came to participants’ awareness of self, including behavior patterns, fears, motivations, needs, and level of freedom from type strategies. Significant self-awareness dawned during the retreat, but awareness also increased afterward. Participants became present enough to catch themselves beginning to act out their usual patterns and then make other choices. The retreat also expanded participants’ capacity for compassion, grace, and understanding toward themselves. In this, participants were freed to live into who God made them to be and were led into transformation of attitude and behavior, one of the primary goals of the retreat.

Pragmatic Task

Chapter Five presented the enneagram retreat as one way to foster contemplative leadership. The enneagram potentiates contemplation for multiple reasons. First, fear is the opposite of love. Fear blocks love and connection. Enneagram work exposes fears

---

2 Rejoice with those who rejoice, and weep with those who weep. Be of the same mind toward one another…. Rom. 12:15-16 (NASB).
and brings them out where they can be overcome by love.\textsuperscript{3} Second, contemplation is openness to the moment and thus to God.\textsuperscript{4} The enneagram reveals our barriers to openness; the things that keep us closed.

Exposure to the enneagram is creating a common language and culture in the seminary community. It is a language of attentiveness and a culture of honesty. Students, staff, and faculty are paying attention to what is happening inside them and then speaking about it truthfully.\textsuperscript{5} As a result, patterns that have been creating difficulties and discomfort for years are brought to light and lose their destructive power. The enneagram has also supplied a gauge for stress levels and emotional health. Many, including me, are living in higher levels of freedom as a result.

Trust is high among students, after experiencing a new vulnerability and authenticity. The retreat sets the stage for deep relationships rooted in compassion, which plays out for the remainder of the students’ seminary years. Certainly, conflict, hurt, and disappointment still occur, but even those can often be approached in freer and more straightforward ways. Many students continue to open themselves to self-discovery, and layers of the false self slowly give way to the beauty and stability of each person’s true essence. These self-discoveries are usually painful and difficult to accept. Support and encouragement are essential to the process. Because of the mutuality of the experience,

\textsuperscript{3} “There is no fear in love, but perfect love casts out fear; for fear has to do with punishment, and whoever fears has not reached perfection in love.” 1 John 4:18 (NRSV).

\textsuperscript{4} The definition of \textit{contemplation} in this project is - a way of being which is humble, open, and present in the moment, allowing one to connect wholly with God.

\textsuperscript{5} In December 2016, WTS staff and faculty participated in a one day seminar about the Enneagram, learning about their type energies and those of their co-workers and becoming familiar with the knowledge base students are utilizing in becoming increasingly self-aware.
students can be both supported by and accountable to each other as they experience their years in seminary and, I suspect, well beyond.
Interpretive Task

Chapter Five included interpretive input from a variety of pedagogical experts. The components of the retreat reflect many of the creative teaching strategies of those experts. Chapter Four focused on the wisdom of the enneagram as a helpful theory for informing the development of contemplative leadership. Repeated use of the enneagram in the WTS setting has made evident that the patterns of energy described are accurate and compelling. The enneagram is *descriptive* rather than *prescriptive*. It doesn’t explain how we *should* be. It describes how we are and what we are *created* to be. The enneagram often sounds, in settings that are not expressly religious, like a self-improvement tool. A theologically Christian view encounters the enneagram as an opening for the Spirit to do the work of sanctification. The strategies and patterns described for each type of the enneagram encase the *mirror* in us, preventing us from reflecting the image of God to the world. The enneagram reveals what shrouds our true God-created essence. Consequently, the encasements can no longer operate unnoticed and unchallenged. The enneagram proves to be a compelling opportunity for transformation that leads to contemplative ministry leadership.

Normative Task

Chapter Three developed contemplative leadership as normative and critical to leading those in the ministry context into contemplative lives. Presumably, the loving, listening, and learning, which leaders engage in, will bud in those being led. Hopefully, the integrity, courage, and compassion of leaders will flower in congregations. Ideally, contemplative leaders will escort the church to God through prayer and presence, transforming the essence of the church.
The church needs to—and will—evolve into something very different than she has been in the past few centuries.\(^6\) This change need not be viewed as a tragedy.\(^7\) It need not set us into survival mode. This inevitable conversion is a gentle invitation to pay attention to and participate in the miraculous unfolding of the work of Spirit. This is, perhaps, a call to death and resurrection. What the church will become is, so far, only a through-a-glass-darkly list of characteristics: quieter, slower, simpler, and gentler; less wordy, less frantic, less flashy, and less certain; un-wed from brick and mortar and un-syncretized from cultural norms of consumerism, greed, violence, and dualism.

The leaders we desire to nurture in seminary are the leaders who will guide the church into this new reality. They will be invited to hold loosely the current reality. They will be called to be able to detect the presence of Christ in the world. They will be asked to intuit where Spirit is leading the church and be grounded enough to take her there, into uncharted territory.\(^8\) They will be summoned to love God with all they are, all they have,

\(^6\) Phyllis Tickle suggests that approximately every 500 years, “the empowered structures of institutional Christianity, whatever they may be at that time, become an intolerable carapace that must be shattered in order that renewal and new growth may occur” Phyllis Tickle, *The Great Emergence: How Christianity Is Changing and Why* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 2012), 16.

\(^7\) George Hunsberger describes the situation as follows. “The churches have a great opportunity in these circumstances….The same pressures that threaten the continued survival of some churches, disturb the confidence of others, and devalue the meaning of them all can actually e helpful in providing an opening for new possibilities. Emerging into view on the far side of the church’s long experience of Christendom is a wide vista of potential for the people of God…. The present is a wildly opportune moment for churches to find themselves and to put on the garments of their calling, their vocation. The Chinese character for ‘crisis’ combines two other characters, the for ‘danger’ and the other for ‘opportunity.’” Darrell Guder, Ed., *Missional Church: A Vision for the Sending of the Church in North America* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1998), 78.

\(^8\) Ron Heifitz emphasizes the necessity of adaptive leadership in encountering challenges that have no precedented solutions. The evolving Church will not be able to continue to treat the current challenges as technical problems that can be addressed with the usual mode of operating. Ron Heifetz, *The Practice of Adaptive Leadership: Tools and Tactics for Changing Your Organization and the World* (Boston: Harvard Business Press, 2009). PAGE
and all they do. They will be bidden to instinctively veer toward justice, mercy, and reconciliation.

None of the characteristics that are vital to leading during the metamorphosis of the church are possible without the cultivating of love for God, others, and self. The formation retreat, focusing on enneagram content and framed in contemplative rhythms, has proven to foster the self-awareness and presence necessary for such all-embracing love. The retreat is one efficacious element among many for nurturing contemplative leadership.

Chapter Two proposed that contemplation should be happening among Christ followers. Contemplation is defined as a way of being which is humble, open, and present to the moment, allowing one to connect wholly with God. More succinctly put, contemplation is prayer. More curiously put, contemplation is presence. Recognized leaders are not the only ones needing humility, openness, and presence. The call to love God with whole heart, soul, and strength and to love neighbor as self goes out to every Christ-follower and every church community. Contemplative practices are crucial to engendering love for God and unleashing the love of God in the world, thus enabling the church to live her mission of reconciliation, mercy, and justice in the world.

**Implications of this Project for Leadership Development in the Seminary Context**

Christ-following is a reflection of the triune God to the world. A mirror is an apt metaphor. We are created as mirrors of God, *tsëlem*.9 In the full potential of our created humanness we reflect what God directs toward us.10 This is very different from the common conception of how we live as God-followers. We often think of God—Jesus—

---

9 *צֶלֶם* means *likeness* and is often translated in English as *image*. Gen. 1:26.

10 “We love because [God] first loved us.” 1 John 4:19 (NASB).
as a model to copy. We ask ourselves, “What would Jesus do,” and then make a willful decision to do whatever we imagine that to be. Humanity as tselem; mirror, on the other hand, is about reflecting God instinctively. In the mirror metaphor, our truest essence is tselem. Thus, what is needful is a clearing of everything that covers the tselem or true self. This process is one of release; of letting go. It means letting go of the defenses and structures and control of the false self so that the love of God reaches the mirror to be reflected back out to God and to all creation. Whatever God is—merciful, gracious, slow to anger, and abounding in steadfast love—reflects out to creation through humanity: 11

Leaders are in the business of helping people uncover the mirror so they can reflect God to the world, which means leaders must first be in the business of uncovering their own true essence. Leaders are in the business of helping people relinquish attachments, which means leaders must first be in the business of relinquishing their attachment to the false self that covers tselem. Those who train leaders can primarily concern themselves with helping students learn to release whatever encumbers them and blocks them from reflecting God to the world.

Herein lies a natural difficulty for seminaries. Seminaries are primarily seen as experiences in which students take on. They come to get information, skills, credentials, and competencies. Sometimes they come to gain power, followers, connections, or control. A shift toward releasing could dramatically change the processes of the seminary. What students possess and produce would no longer determine the activities and accolades. Faculty, staff, and administration could slow their pace, letting go of their own barriers to connection with God and the world. Patience, peace, and prayer could

11 Ps. 86:15.
settle in. Restorative rhythms could become more treasured than grades and achievements.

Organizational and pedagogical moves could create the opportunity for contemplation in the seminary context. Seminary communities could begin to perceive themselves differently: not primarily as academic institutions but rather as formational environments, making a move back toward the model of the monastery, the original school for religious leadership formation. That is not to suggest that academic work shouldn’t happen, but rather that academic work is for the purpose of formation.

Contemporary seminaries could become contemplative seminaries, focusing toward formation of the whole person, in community. Formation means shaping and molding of whole leaders. The seminary is a wheel upon which the potter forms the pitcher. In theological terms, formation can be thought of as sanctification that flows into leading communities.

Focus on formation in seminaries invites a cultural shift where academics are not the only or even the primary concern. Intellectual prowess can be placed in perspective and in concert with wholeness and wholeheartedness. Bell Hooks expresses her sense of conflict between intellectual and whole:

---

12 Small suggests a “focus on leadership formation as constituting the central work of theological schools….I argue that theological education should not attempt to function primarily as professional education….” Kyle Small in The Missional Church and Leadership Formation, edited by Craig Van Gelder (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing, 2009), 46.

13 “Yet, O LORD, you are our Father; we are the clay, and you are our potter; we are all the work of your hand.” Isa. 64:8 (NRSV).

14 “When we think about the reforms needed if higher education is to serve our students and our world faithfully and well, I think there should be a litmus test for every project that claims to strengthen the mission of our colleges and universities. Does this proposal deepen our capacity to educate students in a way that supports the inseparable causes of truth, love, and justice? If the answer is no, we should take a pass and redouble our efforts to find a proposal that does.” Daniel Barbezat and Mirabai Bush,
It was difficult to maintain fidelity to the idea of the intellectual as someone who sought to be whole—well-grounded in a context where there was little emphasis on spiritual well-being, on care of the soul. Indeed, the objectification of the teacher within the bourgeois educational structures seemed to denigrate notions of wholeness and uphold the idea of a mind/body split, one that promotes and supports compartmentalization. This support reinforces the dualistic separation of public and private, encouraging teachers and students to see no connection between life practices, habits of being, and the role of professors.\(^\text{15}\)

In longing for something more, we come up against longstanding traditional educational conditioning which has formed students as learners specializing in facts and ideas.\(^\text{16}\)

Since seminaries are designed as academic institutions, everyone involved is prone to overemphasize mind and underemphasize body, soul, and spirit. Barbezat and Bush call this “the objectivist model of knowing.” Accordingly, this model has “dominated, and deformed, higher education.”\(^\text{17}\) In order to develop the whole person, contemplative seminaries could promote cultures where information serves transformation and where formation is not a piece but the point.

At Western Theological Seminary the stated purpose is to “prepare Christians called by God to lead the church in mission.”\(^\text{18}\) The pinnacle of learning for leading the

\(^{15}\) hooks, 16.

\(^{16}\) “The awareness of grandeur and the sublime is all but gone from the modern mind. Our systems of education stress the importance of enabling the student to exploit the power aspect of reality. To some degree they try to develop his ability to appreciate beauty. But there is no education for the sublime. We teach the children how to measure, how to weigh. We fail to teach them how to revere, how to sense wonder and awe. The sense for the sublime, the sign of inward greatness of the human soul and something which is potentially given to all men, is now a rare gift. Yet without it, the work becomes flat and the soul a vacuum.” Abraham Joshua Heschel, \textit{God in Search of Man: A Philosophy of Judaism}, (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1955), 36.

\(^{17}\) Barbezat and Bush, vii.

church in mission is to love the Lord our God with *all* and to love our neighbor as
ourselves. Contemplation is an avenue to love.\(^\text{19}\) However, the work of filling learners
with the fullness of love is not *our* task. We are simply invited to create conditions ripe
for the Spirit to do the forming. Seminaries become seedbeds of transformation as their
name suggests; *semen* meaning *seed* and *seminary* meaning *seed plot*\(^\text{20}\). Every student
endeavor could be aimed at whole-hearted, whole-bodied, whole-minded love.

Western Theological Seminary is currently making significant strides toward
prioritizing formation and incorporating contemplation. Many of the following
suggestions are already unfolding in the life of WTS *because* formation is a significant
value, “We [WTS] do not simply *deliver* a degree program. We are called to form
students into deeper, wiser, more pastorally aware, more skilled practitioners of ministry
practices, and more committed disciples of Jesus.”\(^\text{21}\) Following are several suggestions
for shifting seminary ethos more toward formation, via contemplative
considerations.

**Slowing Down**

Reflection and stillness incubate awareness of God, others, and self. Both
reflection and stillness require a great deal of intentionality in a seminary setting, where

\(^\text{19}\) “God’s ‘invasion’ of the soul gradually makes us more and more aware and capable of ever
deeper love.” Richard Rohr, *Things Hidden: Scripture as Spirituality* (Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger

\(^\text{20}\) Online Etymology Dictionary, Accessed February 19, 2017,

\(^\text{21}\) “Mission and Vision,” Western Theological Seminary, Accessed Nov 23, 2013,
http://www.westernsem.edu/about/mission-vision/
many agendas compete for the attention of students. Practical barriers to contemplative seminary experience abound. Among them stand time constraints, skepticism, impatience, long-standing cultural beliefs, and exhaustion. Some students have so many roles to juggle that they assess they have no time or energy to deal with self-awareness. Some carry fears about what looking inside themselves will reveal. Some worry about criticism and questions rising from others in their lives if they waste time with contemplation. Students, staff, and faculty typically live their lives in high production mode. Thus, this final suggestion—slowing down—seems daunting, if not impossible.

Living life within contemplative rhythms both leads to and necessitates a certain slowness that is foreign to the mainstream of culture and of the church. Because presence is so far out of our modus operandi, it takes the reinforcement of the community to live it out. Barton explains what can happen to those who pursue contemplative leadership in isolation:

When individuals enter into the deeper dynamics of the spiritual journey and begin attending to what is really required for them to be well, but the community of which they are a part is not grappling with these issues together, a terrible dissonance can develop. The pace of life in the community may set them up to make decisions that they don’t want to make and ask questions they don’t want to ask. Do I remain a part of this community where the way of life is killing me, or do I leave in order to survive as a human being? What defense structures do I need to put in place to defend against the influence of this community rather than being able to lean into it and learn from it?

I contend that, for the sake of the church, for the sake of leaders, and for the sake of the world, seminaries could make radical adjustments to programs and expectations, leaning more toward monastic patterns and less toward typical academic paradigms. In this era

---

22 Adapted from Barbezat and Bush, 108.

23 Barton, 128.
of decline in seminary enrollment, congregational membership, and church relevance, the
invitation is to slow rather than frantic; to presence instead of panic; to doing less and
loving more. The call is to offer students contemplative environments in which they can
be transformed by Shalom into bearers of Shalom to the church and to the world.

Communities alter the individuals who are part of them. According to Barton,
“Human beings in community are like rocks in a riverbed; we are shaped by the flow of
life in the communities we are a part of.”24 Slowing down to nurture a more
contemplative seminary environment would entail several countercultural shifts. First,
seminary leaders—staff, faculty, and administrators—would allow their own lives to
slow. The yearning for sanctification would surpass the yen for intellectual knowledge.
Presence would take precedence over production.

Second, contemplative slowness would become the norm of the seminary culture.
Prayerful inactivity would be applauded and over-functioning eschewed. Rush would
become unnecessary. The seminary community would encourage and hold each other
accountable to spacious deliberateness. Barton imagines a new normal:

In a culture of spiritual transformation it becomes normative to take time for
breathing, for prayer, for quiet at the beginning of important meetings….It
becomes normal for people to have a solitude day each month and for supervisors
to talk about this with those who report to them….In such an environment it is
normal to look at job descriptions and ask, Is this realistic for one person in a
normal work week? And what is a normal work week….25

Perhaps practices of less talking could be instituted on a seminary wide basis; maybe a
day per week of practicing silence, outside the necessary engagements of the day, such as
class, worship, and meetings. An invitation to fasting from electronics for a period of

24 Ibid.

25 Ibid., 132.
time could slow the onslaught of news and information, which often becomes overwhelming and contributes to distraction, anxiety, and fragmentation. If slowing happens amidst the seminary community, it will most likely seep into the families and contexts the community is connected to, allowing leaders to steep in the Spirit and stay connected to their own lives.

Third, the seminary curriculum would become looser, with more space for the Spirit to breeze through, like a mesh shirt compared to a nylon windbreaker. Perhaps the workload calculator could include contemplative practice time. Perhaps reading assignments could be scrupulously honed and calculated with fewer pages per hour in the workload calculator, to encourage more careful, meditative reading. Maybe quantity of information could give way to quality of learning. Maybe courses could require less hours outside class. Possibly, guiding students in how to learn would surpass the enterprise of instilling knowledge. Perhaps contemplative rhythms and self-awareness work could translate into credit. Maybe alternative tracks could stretch program requirements over a longer space of time, allowing for reflection and integration along the way, so that the structure supports the value of slowness. Programs that reduce or eliminate tuition costs to students would free students from some of the pressure of extra jobs, as would being paid for required internships.

The recommendation of slowing down is not to be mistaken as a predicator of lifelessness. No place should be livelier than a place where the purpose is preparing people to live reconciliation and love in the world. Humor, playfulness, gratitude, and joy are natural results of presence. Slowing down also does not equal sloth. Rather, it paves the way for intentionality and investment. It leads to the exact opposite of sloth because it
allows us to be fully present and awake to our lives and those in our lives. It gives us time
to detect the still small voice of the Spirit. Slowing down matters because it alters our
relationship to time and allows us to engage contemplative practices such as silence and
meditation.

Silence

The continuous clatter and clamor of our culture keep God at bay. Constant
chatter leans with back against the soul’s door. Silence opens the door of the soul. When
the door opens, God can slip in, shadows can catch light, and the true self can sneak out
into the desperate world. Silence is making an inroad at WTS and fruitfully so. Some
classes begin routinely with silence. I recently heard students discussing the incorporation
of a centering practice—including presence, silence, and a singing bowl chime—at the
beginning of class. Student comments about the practice are listed below:

- I wish every class began with centering. It feels honoring of us as people. I felt
cared for.
- Centering helps us focus and gives us a chance to transition into the formational
space of the class.
- It reminds us of why we are here at seminary in the first place and helps us center
on God.
- Centering is disarming and invites us into a different world. What if every class
began with silence?

These students were discussing a practice that only required one to three minutes of each
class period, yet yielded powerful affects. In the peer group context, students are entering
into a longer version of silence with centering prayer, which facilitates releasing
attachment to thoughts and sitting quietly with God.

Professors could intersperse silence with reading, lecture, and discussion in the
classroom. Chapel worship could routinely consist of less words and more stillness.
Silence could become the preferred entrance into discernment because it allows a hearing
of the still small voice of the Spirit. By making a space for silence in the seminary, students, staff, and faculty could be inspired to practice silence more routinely in all of life.

Contemplative Reading and Meditation

Seminary professors could slow down the reading process in a way that Barbezat and Bush say, “moves the reader into a calm awareness, allowing a more profound experience and understanding.”26 For students, assigned reading often deteriorates into staying awake long enough to push through dozens of pages with just enough alertness to pass a test or write a perfunctory paper. Slower, contemplative reading could help students read for meaning, inspiration, formation, and connection with God. Students could meditatively encounter passages of Scripture and other materials in the classroom by hearing or reading slowly and repetitively. Teachers could allow periods of silence around certain readings, encourage students to reflect on the emotions called forth, and invite students to share the layers of meaning they discover. Lectio Divina27 and Dwelling in the Word28 are meditative reading practices already in use in WTS classrooms. Students could also be asked to read some assignments contemplatively outside of class. Professors could limit required readings to the most meaningful.

26 Barbezat and Bush, 113.

27 Lectio Divina is “a very ancient art, practiced at one time by all Christians, is the technique known as lectio divina ("divine reading") - a slow, contemplative praying of the Scriptures which enables the Bible, the Word of God, to become a means of union with God. This ancient practice has been kept alive in the Christian monastic tradition.” “Lectio Divina: Pray-Read Scripture,” The Prayer Foundation, http://www.prayerfoundation.org/lectio_divina.htm (Accessed Nov 26, 2016).

28 Dwelling in the Word is a meditative practice that includes the reading of a text twice, silent meditation, and sharing with a partner what God is speaking to the community. See Pat Taylor Ellison and Patrick Keifert, Dwelling in the Word (Church Innovations, 2011).
segments of the richest sources, allowing students to read more slowly and absorb more fully.

Contemplative Writing

Writing lends well to contemplation because it is a solitary activity. It requires quiet, stillness, and reflection. *Contemplative* writing is less about the product and more about the process. Journal writing and free writing invite reflection and observation of mental states.29 Creative writing can deepen awareness. Writing poetry can bring one into the present moment, especially when coupled with paying attention to creation. Storytelling opens hearts to compassion and healing.

Contemplative practice can also *prepare* students for writing. Barbezat and Bush suggest a ten minute centering period before and after a reading, followed by writing. In their words, “This encourages insights to arise naturally, unforced by patterned ways of thinking.”30 Students can move into excellence of insight and discernment in writing by practicing attentiveness and quieting the mind.

Whole Body Involvement

Western Theological Seminary already embraces the formational power of physicality in teaching and learning. Some classes utilize Total Physical Response, referred to as TPR, on a regular basis.31 Utilizing this method, students memorize Scripture using motions and objects and create Scripture enactments with playful, full-


30 Barbezat and Bush, 130.

bodied imagination. Total Physical Response can include all the senses in encountering the subject at hand. These practices may look superficial, undisciplined, and shallow at first glance, because play and humor are not the usual bedfellows of the seminary classroom. The invitation to engage the whole person in encountering faith, however, often results in diligence, depth, and clarity not possible with intellect-only exposure. At WTS students have consistently reported transformation in their relationship to Scripture and their world view as a result of this type of experience in Biblical studies.

Art can also be a doorway into the contemplative world. Encountering art employs the senses as well as the soul. Creating art employs the body as well as the heart. Other body based practices, such as the labyrinth, walking, yoga, and mindful eating can also be introduced in order to connect students with their bodies.

Self-Awareness Practices

Students are offered multiple opportunities for increasing in self-awareness over their years at WTS. Students receive invitations to self-learning via psychological

---


33 “Play shapes our brain, helps us foster empathy, helps us navigate complex social groups, and is at the core of creativity and innovation.” Brené Brown, The Gifts of Imperfection: Let Go of Who You Think You’re Supposed to Be and Embrace Who You Are (Center City, MN: Hazelden Publishing, 2010), 100.

testing and mid program reviews. Non-Violent Communication, currently known at WTS as Compassionate Connection, is taught by on-going experience in the context of peer groups. Compassionate Connection teaches students how to identify their reactivity, listen for feelings and needs in themselves and each other, and respond peacefully, wisely, and compassionately. Peer groups also share stories of loss and search for themes and connections with ministry motivation. Students further encounter themselves in pastoral care, formation, and leadership classes in the form of family systems, leadership assessments, family-of-origin work, Restorative Circles, and Critical Incident Questionnaires. And, as conveyed in the previous chapters, first year

35 Each first year M.Div. student at WTS undergoes a battery of psychological testing, followed by a consultation with a psychologist, as a tool for self-awareness and an avenue to healthy leadership.

36 Midway through the M.Div. program each student participates in a mid-program review with faculty and formation staff to explore her or his sense of call and how the seminary experience is shaping it.


38 “Compassionate Connection” is a term suggested by Randy Smit, who facilitates Non-Violent Communication at Western Theological Seminary.

39 Peer groups are groups of approximately six M.Div. students who meet together with a facilitator each week for the first four semesters of the program.


42 Family of origin work identifies patterns in the family of origin and recognizes how they influence one’s development and formation. See: Israel Galindo, Elaine Boomer, and Don Reagan, A Family Genogram Workbook (Educational Consultants, 2006).

43 “A Restorative Circle is a community process for supporting those in conflict. It brings together the three parties to a conflict – those who have acted, those directly impacted and the wider community – within an intentional systemic context, to dialogue as equals.” Restorative Circles, Accessed Nov. 26, 2016, https://www.restorativecircles.org/

44 Critical Incident Questionnaires consist of five questions which help students develop the practice of reflecting on their experiences. See S.D. Brookfield, Becoming a Critically Reflective Teacher. (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1995).
students are being invited to begin the arduous but rewarding work of engaging the enneagram.

**Lingering Questions**

This project offers an invitation to consider a crucial role for contemplation in the formation of ministry leaders. Opening the *wardrobe* of contemplation permits entry into a whole new world. The world of contemplation begs repeated exploration. The following questions arise from the four tasks of practical theology. These inquiries are a small depiction of the multitude of questions which continue to arise.

**The Empirical-Descriptive Task**

**What are the Cultural Nuances of the Enneagram?**

Multiple sub-questions arise around the general awareness of cultural differences. Valuable research could consider the cultural implications of the enneagram via these questions. First, how do cultural values and experiences influence the type energy people identify as predominant? A casual observation made by a student at the first enneagram retreat stands out. He commented, “Did you notice that all the students of color identified as Type 3? I wonder why that is?” Culture is very likely a factor in that phenomenon. Could it be that, because of deeply embedded racial biases and discrimination, persons of color need to achieve far beyond their white counterparts to find their way into higher education? Do they adopt high achievement behaviors out of necessity or do persons of color have predominate energies that lend to achievement? Is it even actually a trend or is it simply a coincidence of a particular retreat group?

Second, how do people of various cultures hear the information about the enneagram and make meaning of it? How do international students receive the learning
differently from students raised in the U.S.? What cultural overlays affect the learning and resultant formation? How does the cultural background of the teacher influence the pedagogy and the expression of the information?

Third, how does considering cultural variation fit with consideration of type variation? Differences in cultural values and practices are another complexity of the enneagram. How do persons of the same type and level of freedom look different from each other because of their cultural background? What additional considerations are necessary when thinking about each person living fully into what God has created them to be? All these questions seem relevant at Western Theological Seminary, because of the stated determination to become a community that is welcoming of cultural differences and the stated desire to form culturally competent leaders.

The Pragmatic Task

**How can Non-Violent Communication (NVC) be Incorporated into the Formation Retreat?**

This question is currently on the formation table at Western Theological Seminary. NVC, or more positively stated, *Compassionate Connection*, provides the platform for interaction in required student peer groups, utilizing the language of *observations, feelings, needs or longings, and requests*. A small group of formation retreat planners are considering how Compassionate Connection intersects with the enneagram. The group will then examine the entire retreat plan to consider how the language of Compassionate Connection can be incorporated, with integrity. The project seems promising, especially in regard to longings, since the deepest desires and fears of each enneagram type are a direct result of the facet of the Image of God that is most
precious to that type. Each enneagram type probably has particular needs that feel most pressing in those with that energy. Being aware of those longings in each person can only serve to help students respond with empathy and connection to others and to themselves.

Also, Compassionate Connection overlaps the enneagram in the realm of self-awareness. Recognizing our type patterns and strategies equals noticing the triggers and reactivity that often lead to *violent* communication. Additionally, it is likely that certain types experience more or less ease in finding compassion toward self or others. Bringing the NVC language into the retreat could be very beneficial in helping students identify these patterns.

Another way Compassionate Connection can be significant to the Formation Retreat is in the processing of difficult comments and feelings that come up as a result of the CIQs and type panel sharing. Helping students identify feelings and needs facilitates honest communication and compassionate listening. Retreat participants are already, in their first year peer groups, doing the challenging work of reorienting their engagement with conflict. Hopefully, they can bring those budding skills to bear in relating to each other in the vulnerable places of the heart. Integrating the language of the enneagram with the language of NVC will lend to consistency and confluence.

The Interpretive Task

**What are the Practical Educational Effects of Contemplation?**

The interpretive task is an exploration of phronesis; practical wisdom for discerning how to move toward prudent, wise and beneficial ends. The body of research
and theory, in the world outside of defined religion, on the benefits of mindfulness in relationship to education is growing. *Time* magazine touted mindfulness in elementary schools as “the antidote to distraction, misbehaving [and] even poor math scores.”

In *Contemplative Practices in Higher Education*, Barbezat and Bush name several effects. Many of them stand to facilitate seminary education in general and formation in particular: increased concentration and attention, deepened understanding of course material, and increased creativity and insight. Some of the effects Barbezat and Bush name are congruent with significant formational goals: increased mental health and psychological well-being, increased connection, generosity, and loving kindness. I sense that Christ-followers are invited into contemplation, first and foremost, as an expression of their relationship to God. The goals of Barbezat and Bush are harmonious with the goals of the seminary. They are using contemplative practices to address a failing, which they lament:

> Somehow we have lost our way in higher education and abandoned our mission to create lives of purpose and strong ethical and creative minds. Look at any university or college’s mission statement, and you’ll see they are filled with that sort of rhetoric. However, in the actual education, where does it happen? It mostly does not. We are cheating our students out of the opportunity to inquire deeply into their own meaning and find themselves in the center of their learning, thus providing them with a clear sense of the meaning of their studies.

Paying attention to suggestions for contemplative practices in higher education in general, could facilitate learning from many different perspectives in the seminary setting and increase our capacity to guide contemplative leaders.

---


46 Barbezat and Bush, 23.

47 Ibid., xv.
The Normative Task

How Might Contemplation be Brought Definitively into the Church?

Contemplation is a foreign word for many long-time Christians, as it was for me at the outset of this project. Concepts like meditation, presence, grounding, and centering smack of new-age in the estimation of many evangelical congregations. A general resistance in the church to all things contemplative will need to be considered if we wish to introduce valuable practices to the church in ways that invite people to stay engaged and open? It will behoove us to distinguish between practices and mindsets that induce faithful Christ-following and those that do not? Faithful practices will render deeper connection with the Triune God and with the physical world, including people. Faithful practices will cause us to be more awake, alive, and real. Faithful practices will generate compassion and turn us toward the pain of the world. Faithful practices will not lead to escapism, indifference, or disconnection. Much practical work could be done on leading congregations gently into broader forms of prayer and devotion. This is the question that addresses the Henri Nouwen comment that launched me into this project in the first place: “Richard, stop everything you are doing and only teach contemplation. It is the only thing that is going to awaken America and the church.”

Contemplative leaders can thoughtfully invite those with whom they have the closest contacts—such as consistories, boards, and staff—into contemplative practices that will sustain their souls and lend to discernment of the Spirit. Silence, meditation, and awareness practices would be a gentle place to start. Worship can be threaded with the same sorts of practices. Scripture can be approached holistically and meditatively. Those in the ministry context who resonate with the cursory practices could be invited into
deeper prayer experiences, such as extended silence, journaling, and retreating. Contemplative leaders can model self-awareness by honest and authentic conversations with those they lead and then provide non-threatening tools to invite people into their own self-exploration, with the support and encouragement of the leader.

Contemplative leaders could also be very intentional about drawing and highlighting the lines between contemplation and action, since each without the other is barren. As compassion increases as a result of contemplation, leaders can help people in the ministry context channel empathy into connection in ways that resonate with their God created being. Leaders can lead the community in contemplatively discerning the Spirit’s leading in where, how, and with whom God is inviting them to serve. Leaders can create a space in which continued presence, reflection, love, and growth in self-awareness sustain the community in times of hardship, weariness, and discouragement, which inevitably accompany compassionate action. The humility that accompanies a contemplative way of being will help leaders mitigate against unhelpful or even harmful forms of action as communities move steadily toward their God given purpose.

Summary

Yearning for God is constructed into the very core of our beings as humans. Sin disconnects us from that yearning and from the God we yearn for. Contemplation—presence, prayer—is essential for Christ followers, because it revitalizes that yearning and reconnects us to God. Contemplative ministry leaders can guide communities of Christ followers into the connection with God, others, and self that they were created for.

48 “After twenty years of listening to the yearnings of people’s hearts, I am convinced that all human beings have an inborn desire for God. Whether we are consciously religious or not, this desire is our deepest longing and our most precious treasure. It gives us meaning.” May, 1.
and which leads to faithful action in God’s world. Seminaries can become contemplative environments where students allow the Spirit to uncover the image of God in their lives and engage God with all their heart and mind, all their nephesh, and all their resources.49

In the following and final chapter, I will share a sampling of pieces that convey my own

49 Duet. 6:5
Chapter Eight
Epilogue: Path into Prayer

Before I entered this project, I did not even know the meaning of the word 
*contemplation*. I entered the project because of an internal conviction that contemplation is crucial to the flourishing of the church. Little did I know the profound effect the experience of contemplation would have on me as a Christ-follower and educator of ministry leaders. The poems, pictures and essays that follow are a humble invitation into my personal experience.

**Stock Tank**

_When we were kids, we lived in a clearly defined spiritual world. As Tevye puts it, “everyone knows who he is and what God expects him to do.” And not do, in our case. If spirituality is water, ours was contained in a well-sealed galvanized stock tank, like the one where the cows on my Grampa’s farm gathered on a hot day._

_It gave us what we needed to survive the heat of the worldly world, namely, good moral direction wrung from sundry Bible stories. The tank was filled by our little white corner church, our Reformed heritage, and our God-fearing parents and grandparents. In this spiritual stock tank—or perhaps more accurately, spiritual think tank—faith consisted of assenting to the correct set of affirmations. And Christian life equaled doing the good stuff: going to church, obeying our parents, and memorizing Bible verses, as well as not doing the bad stuff: swearing, lying, stealing, and the like. Prayer meant saying things to God. I was never very good at the prayer part. (I was really good at the other parts.)_

---


2 Richard Rohr, in a podcast about his book, _Falling Upward_, talks about the necessity of what he calls childhood ‘containers,’ which help us distinguish what we are not, in order to define who we are.
The stock tank gave us parameters on faith. We knew exactly where to go to get what we were told we needed. I was a pretty dedicated thinker, so brain faith felt natural to me. I was a pretty compliant child, so I got lots of reinforcement for saying and doing the right things, including a long string of gold pins for perfect Sunday School attendanc, and the reputation of 'goody two shoes.' It worked for me.

After many years of the challenges and changes of mothering, multiple moves and maturing, spirituality began to seem more like an ocean: uncontrollable and unpredictable, enveloping and all encompassing, dangerous and magnificent. The water came from a mysterious source, the great and glorious God of the universe. In the sacred ocean, faith consisted of following Christ amidst the tension of a thousand contradictions. And Christian life equaled practicing the positive: treating others with compassion, showing mercy, and seeking justice, as well as eschewing the negative: hating, deceiving, demeaning others, and the like. Prayer was a conundrum. I still wasn’t very good at the prayer part.

The spiritual ocean was a gigantic reservoir for a gigantic God. I realized the ocean through losses, uncertainties, and experiences that couldn’t fit in the stock tank. When I went to seminary, many of the things I had previously intuited and suspected, which at the time had seemed outlandish, were confirmed and considered common knowledge.

Recently, the water of spirituality has become more intimate and more internal: a spring bubbling in my own soul.\(^3\) It flows without my bidding. I can do nothing to make it flow. It doesn’t spring primarily from my mind. The source is the Spirit of Christ. The

\(^3\) “The water that I will give will become in them a spring of water gushing up to eternal life” John 4:14 (NRSV).
fount is more mysterious\footnote{“The wind blows where it chooses, and you hear the sound of it, but you do not know where it comes from or where it goes. So it is with everyone who is born of the Spirit” John 3:8 (NRSV).} than the ocean and yet more simple than the stock tank. Faith consists of loving God. And Christian life equals loving others. Prayer is being present to God. I am a novice but it fits me!

The spiritual spring has no boundaries; neither the confines of galvanized steel nor the perimeters of the ocean. It doesn’t fit my former modes of understanding or the strategies of my ego. I don’t channel it. Rather, it sweeps me up into its life.\footnote{“The LORD will guide you continually, and satisfy your needs in parched places, and make your bones strong; and you shall be like a watered garden, like a spring of water, whose waters never fail” Isaiah 8:11 (NRSV).} This spring is in me, yet I am in the spring. My desire is to become more and more present to the spring; the source of life; the Spirit of Christ.

Why I Care

As I tiptoed into contemplation, God began to gently unwrap for me reasons why I was being beckoned. I stumbled upon God at the beach one summer afternoon in a most stunning and palpable way. I had been, most of my life, a fairly inattentive, in-my-head, analytical type. Being present, even for a few moments, felt so intense that I was thoroughly mesmerized. When I tried to capture what I sensed God was doing, to my utter surprise, the words tumbled out, not as prose, my primary default, but as poetry. I am pretty sure no poetry had left my pen since seventh grade limerick assignments. Now it fairly flowed and seemed the only appropriate medium for communicating the things of the soul. The poems began to answer my question about why contemplation mattered to me.

\footnote{“The wind blows where it chooses, and you hear the sound of it, but you do not know where it comes from or where it goes. So it is with everyone who is born of the Spirit” John 3:8 (NRSV).}

\footnote{“The LORD will guide you continually, and satisfy your needs in parched places, and make your bones strong; and you shall be like a watered garden, like a spring of water, whose waters never fail” Isaiah 8:11 (NRSV).}
Why do I care?

Tiny glimpses of gigantic things
Pin holes
In a ceiling of separation
Separation from God
Separation from others
Separation from myself
But only in awareness
Aware of my head
Unaware of my heart
Except the pin holes

Tiny glimpses of glory
The earth is full of the glory of the Lord
If only we see
Glory so potent
It is almost painful
Pin holes, pencil holes
Are all we can bear.
Too much light
Too much beauty
Too much glory

Tiny glimpses of grace
Grace like water
Pooling in the low places
Covering the contemptible
Saturating the shameful
Drenching the despicable
Opening my soul
Closing the courtroom
Waves of mercy
Waves of grace

Tiny glimpses of gratitude
Internal gravity
Holy wonder
For sand
And sun
And sea
For affection
And affliction
For life breath
And last breath

Tiny glimpses of God
Sparkling God
Gentle God
God who comes
God who cares
Ominous God
Compelling God
God of dark
God of bright
Unspeakable
Why Do I Care? (Part 2)

My project in this world
(As best I can discern today)
To be a bridge
  For those who will accompany the church
  From what she has been
  To what she must become
To be a rock
  Like the one that Moses struck
  Which brings forth life water
  To those who are thirsty

A disconnect in the institutional church.
  I sense it
  It makes me squirm
Our kids feel it
  It’s why they are dropping out
Congregations suspect it
  And pretend they don’t know
The institution knows it
  And scrambles to compensate

Where is the disconnect?
  In my imagination?
    Maybe
    But I doubt it
  In styles and programs and buildings and funds?
    Yes, we feel it there
    And try to fix it there
    But no
    I suspect that’s not the cause
Between head and heart and body?
    Likely
    I know it has been true for me
Between word and deed?
    Probably
    The world has been complaining about this for a long time
Between doing and being?
    Undoubtedly
    In this culture, only producing matters

These things are already fundamentally connected
  Head, heart, body
  Word, deed
  Doing, being

Can we facilitate a space
  To experience Divine connection?
Worldview
God Wants to Heal

By His stripes we are healed
God is in the business of restoring
Ever since it all got broken
And God proffers manifold means towards that end

Modern medicine
Ancient antidotes

The stuff of the earth
The stuff of the air

The power of prayer
The capacity of care

Aromas, breath, water, movement, beauty, memory
Talking and walking

Visible friend
Invisible energy

The Spirit of God hovering over the face of the deep
Inviting
Invigorating
Inventing
Revealing
Repairing
Recreating

And wonder of wonders, God chooses to involve US in his persistent mending
Renovating
Restoring
Caring
Curing
Easing
Enlivening
Soothing
Setting right
Journaling

Poetry led to journaling, but not without a little internal battle first, as this journal entry illustrates:

*I am anxious to be more whole. I want to be a mystic. But I have a considerable internal resistance to the practices. They are uncomfortable. They are foreign. They push back on my cultural formation, which says productivity is supreme. They seem frivolous. They push back on my scientific worldview. They push back on my overactive mind. I will need to constantly resist the compulsion to do it right! I am wondering if, for me at least, contemplation will be a continual stream of letting go. Of something – not sure what. Maybe everything.*

Journaling turned into drawing. The sketching that happened, basically unbidden, in my journal, was even more surprising to me than the impulse toward poetry. Again, since junior high I had rehearsed the story that I just can’t draw. Yet my journal is now full of pictures. My faltering sketches are impressions which could not have been adequately expressed with language and which have brought many insights straight into my heart.

The launching point of my journaling was *Our Many Selves* by Elizabeth O Conner, a beguiling and grueling guide to self-awareness.¹ The following journal pages convey some of the most profound self-awareness I encountered.

---

“Each of us tends to be a whole committee of selves. Each of ourselves is a rank individualist, not cooperative but shouting out his own vote loudly for himself.”

“You don’t have to struggle, renounce and train to achieve simplicity. Yield to the center and life becomes simple, synoptic, with singleness of eye. The many selves integrated into a single true self.”

---

2 Ibid., 39.

3 Ibid., 40.
The unconscious is a more powerful detriment in the life of a person than conscious will, attitude, or intention.\textsuperscript{4}

\textsuperscript{4} Ibid., 45.
“We have simply pushed [our dark side] into a place where it has us in its grip.”

 “…a part…which I prefer to keep hidden because it is unacceptable to the world—this is called ‘the shadow.’ It becomes unconscious to myself, although it may be quite obvious to others.”

---

5 Ibid., 73.
6 Ibid., 50.
Plan A – much organized religion including First Reformed, USA.

Plan B – Faith
Ephesians 5:14 – Anything exposed to the light becomes light itself
“We are to take a pastoring, shepherding responsibility toward the lost and broken and ugly in our own inner world.”

Questions about negative selves:
1. What calls them into action?
2. What are their yearnings?
3. What fear are they based on?
4. What is their aim?
5. What is their speech?
6. How do they justify themselves?
7. What keeps them alive/nourishes them?

---

7 Ibid., 44.
8 Ibid.
Centering Prayer

Journaling also provided a canvas for comprehending centering prayer. Centering prayer is a go-on-faith sort of operation, in which there are generally no indicators, during the prayer time itself, of any effect or productivity or anything else, for that matter. I found it very difficult to engage centering prayer, not understanding what I was supposed to be doing. The drawings that follow helped me to eventually settle enough to engage, albeit only a few seconds at a time.

“You don’t have to do anything to prevent their [your thoughts’] coming and going.”10

---


10 Ibid., 36.
5 types of thought 'boats'

1. Ordinary thoughts

2. Attractive (and repulsive) thoughts

3. Insights and Illuminations

4. Self-Reflection

5. Emotions from the unconscious
Though centering prayer feels much like sitting idly, with nothing happening, I sensed a trio of effects after a time. First, I perceived a subtle shift in my willingness to let go of things to which I was pretty firmly attached. If I could let go of thoughts, my constant companions and friends, maybe I could let go of other treasures as well. Second, I became unnervingly conscious of my own spiritual frailty, shadows, and selfishness. This made me irritable and fussy, like a tired baby who doesn’t know what she wants. I was not particularly a fan of this consequence, but at least I was forewarned by the writings of Thomas Keating, Richard Rohr, and others that such a thing was likely.12

11 Ibid., 36.

12 “When Jesus is ‘driven’ by the Spirit into the wilderness, the first things that show up are ‘wild beasts’ (Mark 1:13). Contemplation is not first of all consoling, which is why so many give up. Yes, the truth will set you free, but first it will make you miserable.” Rohr, Daily Meditation, May 10. 2016.
Third, deep places in my soul, long buried out of necessity and fear, opened up, exposing them to light and compassion.

I gradually came to understand centering prayer as something other than a means to growth and sanctification. Centering prayer is sitting with God, like a child resting quietly with its mother, just to be close; to be loved. This sketch expresses the simplicity of that motivation.

My heart is not proud, LORD, my eyes are not haughty; I do not concern myself with great matters or things too wonderful for me. But I have calmed and quieted myself, I am like a weaned child with its mother; like a weaned child I am content. 13

13 Ps. 131:1-2 (NIV).
Reciprocity of Contemplation and Action

In February of 2014 I clearly saw an example of how sitting quietly with God leads to mission. I was a participant in The Soul of Leadership Journey Group, which visited Albuquerque, New Mexico. We stayed at The Norbertine Community, where Catholic brothers are formally committed to contemplation and community, in the midst of the desert. The Norbertine Community emanates palpable peace. I felt no fear there, even though I was staying alone, walking alone in prickly, waterless places, and moving about in the dark. But the peace is even more pervasive than just lack of fear. It is a soul peace, where going slow feels normal and acceptable and possible. It is a mind peace, where sitting in silence feels like an invitation and a gift instead of an anxiety. The following essay illustrates how contemplation results in action.

At Norbertine, thirteen brothers live together, eat together, sing morning and evening prayers together, talk about their lives together, and go to each other immediately with the tiniest of conflicts. All income goes into a common pot. They are deeply devoted to education and have advanced degrees in many fields, both religious and otherwise.

The brothers are organically hospitable. We protestant retreatants were relatively clueless about how to be at a Catholic cloister mass or prayer gathering. They took us in as though they were actually glad we were there. They minimized our foibles, guided us in the routine, and spread unmistakable warmth, all in the context of silence. They told us the Eucharist was open to anyone who believes in the real presence of Christ.

We invited the brothers to share a dinner with us. Three men were able to join us. It was their countenance that I loved most. They are at the same time serenely calm and
full of energetic life and humor. They were attentive to the moment, without apparent judgment of our ignorance and assumptions. Father Thomas shared about coming to this community from India. “Are you homesick?” I asked. “No,” he replied with dancing eyes, “I am with my brothers.” Father Gene, affectionately referred to by his brothers as Geno, gave a patient and simple explanation of how to start contemplative practice. “This prayer isn’t about talking. It’s about listening,” he said. “There is plenty of time for intercession in morning and evening prayers. It’s about being with God.” Brother James, soft spoken and gentle, told about transitioning from his three million dollar a month law firm to a 75 dollar a month novitiate allowance, and from scattered multi-tasking to full attentiveness. It is impossible to describe with words, the calm and contentment that cling to these men or the richness of being with them.

Norbertine is in stark contrast to surrounding Albuquerque, which has a reputation for violence and poverty. Albuquerque’s nickname is, The Land of Enchantment. However, in the city, we were told the locals refer to it, rather, as The Land of Entrapment. “Come on a vacation and stay on probation.” We were warned that people here aren’t necessarily inclined to follow basic rules, like stopping at red lights and not driving drunk.

Into this environment, the Norbertine brothers insert their peaceful selves every day, in the parishes, schools, legal battles, and social distresses of the neighborhoods. After chanting morning prayers in perfectly unified angelic tones, they hang their hooded and caped white robes in the closet and don baseball caps, street clothes, and briefcases for their trek into the city. They look like regular guys, but I imagine to the people they are meeting, they seem like quiet pools of refreshing water. These very intentional
Christians live effectively the inward journey and, simultaneously, the outward journey.

Prayer leads to presence in the neighborhood.

Presence as Prayer

One day God captured my attention with minutia. A tiny piece of white lint drifted into my plane of vision as I sat in stillness in the prayer garden at Mercy Center in Burlingame, California. Because my body had been quiet for several minutes, and because my spirit had been quieting for several days, I actually noticed the speck. As I watched, it became obvious that the tiny bit was not being carried on the gentle morning breeze, but rather it was flying. The lint was a living thing! I felt amazed at the wonder of it. What detail and whimsy God pours into this physical world. How delicate and fragile is this creature. I was delighted.

Haiku has impelled me to notice, appreciate, and express this sort of extraordinary, ordinary moment. It has aided me in becoming fleetingly and deeply aware of the world and the Crafter of the world. I stumbled onto haiku unexpectedly, also at Mercy Center via Haiku-The Sacred Art by Margaret McGee. When I tried my hand at beginner’s haiku, the world opened up to me in astonishing ways I had not experienced in my previous fifty-some years, at least not as I remember. I suspect I constantly had similar experiences in my earliest years.

---


15 “Perhaps the mystery of the presence of God and the Trinity are interlocked with the essential elements of time and space.” Student, Steve Magnason in a discussion post for a WTS Theology class, 2014. Used with permission.

16 “From Rashi you learned how to do again what you hadn’t done since you were a small child: pay close attention to the obvious. ‘When you look closely and for a long time, you discover things that are invisible to others. Most people make the mistake of trying to ‘look deeper’ when all they need is to pay
Upon discovering haiku, the floodgates opened and I saw the imagination of God everywhere\textsuperscript{17}, while lines in five syllables, seven syllables, and five syllables paraded through my heart. I started taking pictures, an activity I had abandoned in my mid-twenties after repeated sets of blurry, partial, and undistinguishable photographs from Walgreens developing department. Suddenly, everything was so beautiful that I felt desperate to capture it: the shredding bark of the eucalyptus trees; the brilliant blue morning glory; the fluttering beach grass plumes.\textsuperscript{18}

In the Star Trek movie, \textit{Insurrection},\textsuperscript{19} the crew of the Enterprise discovers a people who have learned to be so conscious of the moment that occasionally time stands still, allowing them to dwell deeply in the present. As a result, they are a people of vast peace, healing, and reconciliation.\textsuperscript{20} For me haiku is “a way to get around the analytical mind and find a chink or an opening into the heart,” as McGee puts it.\textsuperscript{21} The sense of internal grounded-ness that resulted from these and other practices during that time was

\footnotesize

\textsuperscript{17} “A haiku is a prayer of praise that celebrates God’s work by paying attention and then reflecting back, as simply and clearly as possible, what we experience in God’s created world.” McGee, 29.

\textsuperscript{18} “…[M]oments of significance cannot be planned or foreseen. They can only be received.” Photographer Rolf Maeder in response to a stunning picture he had taken of lighting in \textit{Time Magazine}, December 30, 2013, 42.


\textsuperscript{20} “To see and accept the world just the way it is can be deeply healing – healing both to you and to the world.” McGee, 37.

\textsuperscript{21} Ibid., 112.
palpable. The practice of slowing down enough to notice was deeply invigorating. The world was like a different place: a place of fascination, glory, and glee.

**Mercy Center**

enfolding stillness
so silent it startles -
the soul acclimates

on the air
scent of simple comfort -
cookies baking?

eucalyptus lane -
aroma of vitality
lacing every breath

self-pity like rocks
stuck in favorite shoes -
dump them....or suffer.

fence and foliage
inseparably entwined –
bettering each other

emerging from pool
dripping limbs hug warm concrete- 
old childhood comfort

floating piece of fuzz?
or delicate white bug?
Self-propelled dust speck

---

22 “One of the best ways for me to find peace and a sense of belonging in the world is to look out into the world.” Ibid., 28.
Brown

Today the whole world
Is a carpet of white
Dappled with auburn

Spectacular sight
When winter falls before
Fall resolves

Shades of brown emerge
With patient observation -
Stunning revelation

Bronze, the hill and dale
Even death is beautiful
Who knew?

Stark brown stick shrub
Empty of leaves but full
Of rain pearls

Quiet forest floor -
Spongy brown blanket of peace
Invites repose

Shiny crimson orbs
In the sea of russet -
Spirit spotted

Messy brown milkweeds -
Containers must erupt
To release fresh life

Teeny milkweed seed
Hanging by a silken thread -
Ruach* ready

Petite Purple petals
Stubborn remnant of summer
Time to relinquish

*Ruach is Hebrew for wind, breath, spirit
Potter’s Place

Shiny Greenest Green
    Wet and weighty with vigor
    Rain makes us sturdy

South Carolina
    Farmer’s rain soaks thirsty earth
    Soul stirs and swells

Pine needle tinsel
    Adorning holly tree queue -
    Lovely without effort

Silence as praise
    Only silence is big enough
    To embrace God

Earth, the rain, like
    Baby birds, only receives
    So the soul, God’s love
Leading Leaders into Contemplation

The Advanced Hebrew Summer Intensive Retreat is a three credit course that builds on the learning from the two required Intro to Hebrew and Hebrew Exegesis courses at Western Theological Seminary. It also prepares students who will be Hebrew tutors and lab leaders during the following school year. The course was imagined, designed, and taught by Travis West and me, as members of the Hebrew teaching team. We knew that learning three credits worth of Hebrew in ten days could be overwhelming and exhausting. We wanted the experience to feel more like a retreat than a marathon. We desired that students encounter God in meaningful and transformational ways. Thus, we intentionally designed the schedule with a contemplative rhythm, including life-giving and soul settling practices. Following are my reflections on that experience.

Place and Space

A feeling of profound peace
Infuses physical property.

How does place produce
Such a potent perception
Of serene inner space?

Perhaps it is power
Of prayer and presence.

Whatever the cause,
It has precious air,
Which restores the nephesh.
Silent Awakenings

Wake slowly
  To the peace
    And light of the day

Silence until morning prayers

Leisurely preparation
  (If you get up in time)
    No pressure to chat

Quiet breakfast
  Alone with reflections
    And with textures of favorite morning foods

An emergence into the exquisite new day
  Birdsong and brightness
    And breath

Yeshua Ohr Ha 'aretz
  (Jesus is the light of the world)
    First spoken words of the day

Modei Ani
  (I give thanks)
    First response
Morning Prayers

We enlist our bodies in the day’s dedication of our selves to God.
...You have mercifully returned my soul to me...
...Love the Lord your God with all your heart....
...Have no other gods....
...You have brought us to this moment....
...Behold your keeper neither gets drowsy nor sleeps...
This is the day that the Lord has made

Centering

The ping
of the singing bowl
calls us to stillness,
Like Pavlov’s dogs?
Or like angel invitation?

Feel your feet.
Slow your breath.
Open your heart.
Meet God here.
Now.

Another ping.
The delicate sound
emanating
in waves that
resonate the chest.

Calm
and present.
Todah
(Thank you).
Eyes open slowly.

Ready to learn.
Ready to play.
Ready to care.
Ready to change
(if needs be).
Lectio Divina

An opportunity to brood together on the Shema
Hearing the words repeated gently, layer upon layer
Incubating the Word the Spirit has for us today
It warms us
It lives in us
It opens us
Hatching new potentialities

Lecha Dodi (Come My Beloved)

We made a plan to greet
The Bride,
The Queen,
The Sabbath

We learned our song
And practiced it
A lot

We stood on the knoll and watched for her
Waited in silence
In the glory of the pinks
And the peace of the stillness

At just the right moment
We joined hands
And crooned in tender harmony
Our sincere welcome

Then we took her to the barn
And feasted together
On lamb
And laughter
And love
Through the experience of contemplation, the Spirit has connected me with my body, opened my heart, and augmented my capacity to lead with compassion. I passionately wish to create an environment for seminary students to discover a way of being which is humble, open, and present to the moment, allowing them to connect wholly with God. I deeply desire to be a presence that inspires whole-hearted love of God and God-honoring love of self and others. I believe these love capacities are the heart of the Gospel and the only hope for humankind. Come, Holy Spirit, we need you!
“See the big world,” they say
It will expand your horizons
It will give you other perspectives
It will get you out of your bubble

But I have worlds I have not yet seen in my own backyard.
The world of an ant laden peony
The world of a stuffed cheek chipmunk
The world of a dew strewn spider web

I have worlds I have not seen in my own people
The influence of our histories
The ocean of our emotion
The solace of our habits

I have worlds I have not seen inside me
The tightening of my chest in dis-ease
The tentativeness of my spirit in self-doubt
The tending of my heart by God’s own touch

“Go bigger,” they say
Get the big picture
Gaze from 30,000 feet
God’s perspective

But I sense a call to go smaller
Flicker of a candle in the stillness
Flutter of a dream catcher in a draft
Flood of oxygen when I inhale

“See the little world,” God says
It will expand your horizons
It will give you other perspectives
It will wake you up to life
Appendix A
Introductory Enneagram Presentation Prior to Retreat

Details about retreat

Purpose of retreat
To learn and experience something that will help to form you in Christ-likeness for life and for ministry.
Build relationships with those you are traveling with through seminary and into ministry.
Offer respite and refreshment.

Basic design – it’s a retreat
Avoid electronics/social media – tell your people you will be basically out of touch.
Bring what will help you pay attention to God, others, and yourself.

Basic schedule
Morning silence – Be present. Listen. Pay attention to your food.
First words of the day at Morning Prayers
Rhythm of Morning Prayers and Evening Prayers
Worship
Sessions in morning, afternoon, and evening
Large afternoon break
Hang out in the evenings

What to bring

Activities available at the facility
Sign up for prayers/worship – we will have a chapel room with our usual symbols.

Travel – a chartered bus leaving from the seminary parking lot

Pre-retreat reflection – survey monkey

Intro to Enneagram
Basic premise of the enneagram
Born with one facet of the image of God being most precious to us
At some point – we realize the world is not just THAT
Devastating
Ego starts to build strategies to fix it
Patterns become imbedded and eventually prevent us from living into that facet

Why bother?
To increase compassion and understanding toward others in our lives
To help us lead well (If we are not self-aware we WILL hurt people)
Being self-aware—being WELL and WHOLE—should not be optional. Self-awareness is crucial for ministry leaders.

Enneagram is ONE tool

Purpose is not to define you
Purpose is to free you from patterns you are stuck in

Colossians 3

Do not lie to one another, seeing that you have stripped off the old self with its practices and have clothed yourselves with the new self, which is being renewed in knowledge according to the image of its creator. (Col 3:9-10 NRSV)

Panel for each number – know your type as best you can, but it’s OK if you are not sure.

Pre-assignments - explain

Read from Richard Rohr and Andreas Ebert, *The Enneagram: A Christian Perspective.*

Prefaces – Pages ix – xv

Part One – Starting at “A Sobering Aha-Experience.” Pages 23 – 42

Part Three - Pages 199-227.

Optional - If you would like to see how the Ennegram types play out in Jesus, also read pages 232- 246.

As you read these sections, ask yourself and journal answers to the following:

a. What rings true to me?

b. About what do I feel resistance in myself?

c. What do I sense God is speaking to me through my encounter with these ideas?

Bring your musings and your textbook along to the retreat for discussion.

Complete the Enneagram Survey

The results of the survey are not a diagnosis, but rather a starting point for discovering your enneagram Type. You cannot assume that the survey has identified you accurately. Only YOU can determine what your type is. This is not always easy and sometimes happens over time. Bring your survey results with you to the retreat.

Optional – Think of movies, songs, fairy tales, famous people, etc. which exemplify your type.

Plan for morning/evening prayers or worship times for the retreat according to what you signed up for.

Morning and evening prayers – simple – no preaching 15ish minutes

Opening and Closing Worship – 30ish minutes

Intro to WEPSS

How to use it – show area that tells basic type

Not the final word – a starting point for exploration
Basic procedure for discovering your type
Following are steps to help you **determine your type**.

1. Read through the results of your survey, taking note of the types the survey identifies as most likely.

2. In the Rohr book – read the chapters for the top two or three types indicated by the results of your survey. As you read:
   - Mark the statements that seem to fit you.
   - Particularly note where you feel uneasy, embarrassed or even humiliated.

3. If none of the types you read about feel like a fit, continue to read about each type until something strikes you.

4. When you have a sense of what your type might be, or have it narrowed down to a couple possibilities, talk to someone who knows and loves you about which characteristics they see in you.

5. If you are older and recognize characteristics from several types in your life, think back to your early adulthood, especially your early twenties. Ask yourself, “What was I like back then?”

6. If you still feel confused, make an appointment with Pam Bush for before Christmas break. pam@westernsem.edu

When you have come to a possible type or two, begin to **observe yourself** and note how you display the characteristics of that/those types. Write down your most striking observations. Bring all your observations with you to the retreat.

**Students take the WEPSS**
Appendix B
Participant Manuel

Formation Retreat

The Enneagram
Red Tab
Schedule
Housing Assignments
Map of Venue

Clear Tab
Peer Group, Type Group and Personal Reflection Guides
Session #2 Guide
Feeling words
Type Panel questions

Blue Tab
Instinctual Stack
Wings, Arrows, Filters
Levels of Health
Three Centers of Intelligence
The Dinner Party

Orange Tab
Enneagram Types
Ennea-grid
Levels of Health Diagram
Type Specific Levels of Health Descriptions

Yellow Tab
Enneagram Prayer Resources and Practices

Green Tab
CIQs
Retreat Evaluation Form
Post-retreat Survey

Pink Tab
Bibliography
Blank Pages
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>MONDAY January 12</th>
<th>TUESDAY January 13</th>
<th>WEDNESDAY January 14</th>
<th>THURSDAY January 15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>MORNING</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7:30 AM</td>
<td>Pray, load, depart</td>
<td>8:00 AM BREAKFAST (silence)</td>
<td>8:00 AM BREAKFAST (silence)</td>
<td>8:00 AM BREAKFAST (silence)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:30 AM</td>
<td>Arrive, settle</td>
<td>9:00 AM MORNING PRAYERS</td>
<td>9:00 AM MORNING PRAYERS</td>
<td>9:00 AM MORNING PRAYERS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00 AM</td>
<td>OPENING WORSHIP</td>
<td>9:20 – 11:45 AM SESSION #5 Types 8 &amp; 9</td>
<td>9:20 – 11:45 AM SESSION #8 Types 5 &amp; 6</td>
<td>9:20 – 11:45 AM SESSION #11 Moving Forward &amp; Tear Down</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30 – 11:45 AM</td>
<td>SESSION #1 Introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AFTERNOON</strong></td>
<td>Noon LUNCH</td>
<td>Noon LUNCH</td>
<td>Noon LUNCH</td>
<td>Noon LUNCH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:00 – 2:00 PM</td>
<td>SESSION #2 Individual Reflection</td>
<td>12:30 – 3:30 PM RESPITE Alone Time 1–1:30 Climbing Wall Open 1:30-3</td>
<td>12:30 – 3:30 PM RESPITE Alone Time 1–1:30 Bowling Alley Open 1:30-3</td>
<td>1:00 - 2:00 PM SESSION #12 Eval &amp; Sharing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:00 – 4:30 PM</td>
<td>SESSION #3 Type Groups</td>
<td>3:30 – 5:45 PM SESSION #6 Types 1 &amp; 2</td>
<td>3:30 – 5:45 PM SESSION #9 Type 7 &amp; Implications for Ministry</td>
<td>2:00 PM CLOSING WORSHIP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:30 – 5:45 PM</td>
<td>RESPITE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3:00 PM Load and depart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EVENING</strong></td>
<td>6:00 PM DINNER</td>
<td>6:00 PM DINNER</td>
<td>6:00 PM DINNER</td>
<td>6:00 PM DINNER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7:00 – 8:30 PM</td>
<td>SESSION #4 Complexities</td>
<td>7:00 – 8:30 PM SESSION #7 Types 3 &amp; 4</td>
<td>7:00 – 8:30 PM SESSION #10 Self-Awareness</td>
<td>8:30 PM EVENING PRAYERS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:30 PM</td>
<td>EVENING PRAYERS</td>
<td>8:30 PM EVENING PRAYERS</td>
<td>8:30 PM EVENING PRAYERS</td>
<td>8:30 PM EVENING PRAYERS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:00 PM</td>
<td>COMMUNITY HANG OUT</td>
<td>9:00 PM COMMUNITY HANG OUT</td>
<td>9:00 PM SKIT NIGHT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
One of your group members has been designated to help facilitate the discussions. Following are some suggestions for making the group time meaningful and helpful:

1. Hold what other group members share, in confidence.

2. Communicate respectfully, even if you completely disagree with something others have said. Agree to disagree lovingly.

3. Be as honest as possible. Put difficulties and discomforts on the table and hash them out respectfully.

4. Make sure everyone has an equal opportunity for sharing.

5. If you are a person who tends to talk a lot, try holding back a bit and help others have an opportunity to share.

6. If you are a person who talks very little, try stepping out and saying more.

7. Challenge yourself to share, one small step beyond your usual comfort zone.

8. When others share beyond their comfort zone, receive it as a gift and hold it gently.

9. Offer support and encouragement to each other as helpful.
Group and Individual Reflection Questions

Session 1
Peer Groups #1
1. What is on your heart that you are bringing from Christmas break and/or from last semester?
2. Where do you find resistance in yourself in regard to the retreat or the enneagram?
3. In the best case scenario, what do you hope for?

Session 2
Individual reflection #2
Follow the instructions on the document labeled “Session #2”

Session 3
Peer Groups #3
1. What do you think your predominant instinct is? How do you see yourself living that out?
2. How was the individual reflection time for you? You are invited to share something that was significant for you about your reflection time.
3. What do you sense God is speaking to you at this point?

Type Group #3A
- Get in a group with those who have identified as your type.
- If you have more than five in your group – split into two groups and make two collages.
- Together make a collage that illustrates your type, both negative and positive aspects.
- You can use magazine pictures, drawings, words, poems, are whatever you can put on a piece of poster board. (You can continue to add things during the week if you wish)
- Write a Haiku that creatively expresses your type
  A haiku is a poem composed of three lines, which uses clear sharp images and links something in nature with something human.
  First line - 5 syllables  Second line - 7 syllables  Third line - 5 syllables
  Today’s haiku will be a word picture of your enneagram type.
- Be prepared to give a 2 minute and 15 second presentation of your collage and your haiku.

Type Groups #3B
1. What makes you think you are this type? What did you learn about yourself during the type collage exercise?
2. What advantage might there be to knowing this information?
3. What danger might there be to knowing this information?
4. How is your soul?

Session 4
Peer Groups #4
1. In regard to the three instincts, what tendencies do you notice in yourself? How does this affect your daily functioning?
2. What stood out to you in regard to the discussion on the levels of health?
3. In what range of health do you see yourself hovering? How so?
4. How has this experience been for you so far? How is your heart? When did God seem most present to you? When did God seem most absent from you?

Session 5
Individual Reflection #5
Choose a prayer practice from the suggestion list
Do the practice
What was it like for you to experience that practice?
Will you do it again?

Session 6
Peer Group #6
1. How are you doing so far? What has this experience been like for you?
2. Share as you are willing about the experience with the prayer practice you chose.
3. What do you sense God is speaking to you thus far in the retreat?

Session 8
Peer groups #8
1. What was an AHA moment for you today?
2. What was difficult to hear/learn?
3. How is your soul?

Session 9
Individual Reflection #9
10. Review the Levels of Health handout for your Type
11. Mark statements that describe you now
12. Use another method/color to mark statements that have described you in the past
13. As best you can tell, what is your level of health? Where do you think your set point is?
14. Take your psychological testing into consideration. How do your enneagram type and level of health help to inform the results?
15. What sorts of circumstances usually lead you to healthier behaviors and patterns?
16. What sorts of circumstances tend to lead you to less healthy behaviors and patterns?
17. Bring all this to God and listen for God’s response.
18. Write down what you imagine God saying to you.
Type Groups #9
1. What have you learned about yourself and what might be the implications for your life?
2. What, if anything, do you wish to share from your reflections on the levels of health? (This question is purely invitational. No one is required to share)
3. What are the implications of the enneagram and the levels of health for ministry?

Session 10
Type Groups #10
Create a skit for skit night
Work in type groups
Show us what it looks like to be this type
Highlight the ego strategies and temptations at work
Exaggeration could be helpful
Use whatever materials and props you can find
If you have a larger group you can choose to divide into two groups, if you wish
If you wish, come up with a song for your type and report it to us ASAP so we can try to find it and play it after your skit.

Session 11
Individual Reflection #11
Journal on the following:
1. What will I do with this information and experience, moving forward?
2. What am I willing to commit to regarding my personal formation?
3. What will be my strategies for keeping those commitments?
4. How might those strategies involve others including my peer group?
5. How have I been formed by this retreat experience?
You will have an opportunity this afternoon to share with the large group about your personal experience.

Peer groups #11
Share one person at a time, as you are willing, from your journaling during personal reflection time:
1. What has been your experience this week? How is your heart?
2. What are your commitments and strategies for moving forward?
3. How would you like the peer group to help you?
4. Pray specifically for each person after they share.

Session 12
Type Groups #12
As a group fill out the retreat evaluation form and give it to Beth.
Include everyone in the process
Include areas of disagreement.

Individual Reflection #12
Complete the Post-retreat Survey in the back of your binder and turn it in to Pam for research purposes. THANK YOU!!
Panel Questions

These are the questions you may be asked when you are on the panel for your type. We wanted to give you an opportunity to think about them ahead of time. You will not be required to answer any question. You are simply invited to do so in order to help the rest of us better understand you and the others in our lives who are your type. If you are not sure yet about what your type is, you are welcome to be on more than one panel. Sometimes that can be helpful for making a determination. Thanks in advance, for whatever you are willing to share with us.

Type EIGHT
1. What makes you think this is your type?
2. What’s difficult about being this type?
3. What can you tell us to help us know how to relate to you, especially when we feel a little intimidated?
4. What do you wish we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
5. What is great about being this type?

Type NINE
1. What makes you think this is your type?
2. What’s difficult about being this type?
3. How does Turtle mode work for you? How can we reach you when you start to withdraw?
4. What do you wish we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
5. What is great about being this type?

Type ONE
1. What makes you think this is your type?
2. What’s difficult about being this type?
3. How do you experience the inner critic?
4. What do you wish we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
5. What is great about being this type?

Type TWO
1. What makes you think this is your type?
2. What’s difficult about being this type?
3. How can we help you get in touch with and tend to your own needs?
4. What do you wish we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
5. What is great about being this type?
Type THREE
   1. What makes you think this is your type?
   2. What’s difficult about being this type?
   3. How do you notice the chameleon tendency in your life?
   4. What do you wish we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
   5. What is great about being this type?

Type FOUR
   1. What makes you think this is your type?
   2. What’s difficult about being this type?
   3. What is the experience of envy like for you?
   4. What do you wish we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
   5. What is great about being this type?

Type FIVE
   1. What makes you think this is your type?
   2. What’s difficult about being this type?
   3. What can we do when you start to withdraw into your head?
   4. What do you wish we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
   5. What is great about being this type?

Type SIX
   1. What makes you think this is your type?
   2. What’s difficult about being this type?
   3. How do you make sure you are safe and secure?
   4. What do you wish we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
   5. What is great about being this type?

Type SEVEN
   1. What makes you think this is your type?
   2. What’s difficult about being this type?
   3. How do you go about drumming up excitement in your life?
   4. What do you wish we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
   5. What is great about being this type?
Instinctual Stack

Self-preservation Instinct

Sexual Instinct

Social Instinct
Levels of Freedom

Level 1 – Liberation

Level 2 – Full Potential

Level 3 – Positive impact

Level 4 – Fixation

Level 5 – Interpersonal Conflict

Level 6 – Overcompensation

Level 7 – Violation

Level 8 - Delusion and Compulsion

Level 9 – Pathological destructiveness
Wings

Arrows

Direction of Disintegration

Direction of Integration

Filters

Maximal filters

Moderate filters

Minimal filters
### Three Centers of Intelligence

| Types | Gut Center
| Instinctive/ Body | Heart Center
| Emotional/ Feeling | Head Center
| Cognitive/ Thinking |
|-------|----------------|
| Area of Brain | 
| Concerned with | 
| Problems with | 
| Seek | 
| Carry Lots of |
EIGHT
The Challenger
Power Seeker

Type Story

Image of God

Essential Qualities

Basic Fear

Basic Needs and Desires

Life Script

Average Health

Barrier/Sin

Fixation

Defense Mechanism

Every Five Minutes

*Wake-up Call
Unhealthy

*Red Flag Fear

Hints

Healthy

Virtue

Famous People of this Type

Helpful Hints from the Panel
NINE
The Peacemaker
Peace Seeker

Type Story

Image of God

Essential Qualities

Basic Fear

Basic Needs and Desires

Life Script

Average Health

Barrier/Sin

Fixation

Defense Mechanism

Every Five Minutes

*Wake-up Call
Unhealthy

*Red Flag Fear

Hints

Healthy

Virtue

Famous People of this Type

Helpful Hints from the Panel
ONE

The Reformer
Rightness Seeker

Type Story

Image of God

Essential Qualities

Basic Fear

Basic Needs and Desires

Life Script

Average Health

Barrier/Sin

Fixation

Defense Mechanism

Every Five Minutes

*Wake-up Call
Unhealthy

*Red Flag Fear

Hints

Healthy

Virtue

Famous People of this Type

Helpful Hints from the Panel
TWO
The Helper
Love Seeker

Type Story

Image of God

Essential Qualities

Basic Fear

Basic Needs and Desires

Life Script

Average Health

Barrier/Sin

Fixation

Defense Mechanism

Every Five Minutes

*Wake-up Call
Unhealthy

*Red Flag Fear

Hints

Healthy

Virtue

Famous People of this Type

Helpful Hints from the Panel
THREE
The Achiever
Status Seeker

Type Story

Image of God

Essential Qualities

Basic Fear

Basic Needs and Desires

Life Script

Average Health

Barrier/Sin

Fixation

Defense Mechanism

Every Five Minutes

*Wake-up Call
Unhealthy

*Red Flag Fear

Hints

Healthy

Virtue

Famous People of this Type

Helpful Hints from the Panel
FOUR
The Individualist
Originality Seeker

Type Story

Image of God

Essential Qualities

Basic Fear

Basic Needs and Desires

Life Script

Average Health

Barrier/Sin

Fixation

Defense Mechanism

Every Five Minutes

*Wake-up Call
Unhealthy

Red Flag Fear

Hints

Healthy

Virtue

Famous People of this Type

Helpful Hints from the Panel
FIVE
The Investigator
Knowledge Seeker

Type Story

Image of God

Essential Qualities

Basic Fear

Basic Needs and Desires

Life Script

Average Health

Barrier/Sin

Fixation

Defense Mechanism

Every Five Minutes

*Wake-up Call
Unhealthy

*Red Flag Fear

Hints

Healthy

Virtue

Famous People of this Type

Helpful Hints from the Panel
SIX
The Loyalist
Security Seeker

Type Story

Image of God

Essential Qualities

Basic Fear

Basic Needs and Desires

Life Script

Average Health

Barrier/Sin

Fixation

Defense Mechanism

Every Five Minutes
*Wake-up Call

Unhealthy

*Red Flag Fear

Hints

Healthy

Virtue

Famous People of this Type

Helpful Hints from the Panel
SEVEN
The Enthusiast
Stimulation Seeker

Type Story

Image of God

Essential Qualities

Basic Fear

Basic Needs and Desires

Life Script

Average Health

Barrier/Sin

Fixation

Defense Mechanism

Every Five Minutes

*Wake-up Call
Unhealthy

*Red Flag Fear

Hints

Healthy

Virtue

Famous People of this Type

Helpful Hints from the Panel
### Enneagram Type Characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>The Reformer</td>
<td>The Helper</td>
<td>The Achiever</td>
<td>The Individualist</td>
<td>The Investigator</td>
<td>The Loyalist</td>
<td>The Enthusiast</td>
<td>The Challenger</td>
<td>The Peacemaker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facet of Image of God</td>
<td>Goodness</td>
<td>Love</td>
<td>Being</td>
<td>Beauty</td>
<td>Truth</td>
<td>Faithfulness</td>
<td>Joy</td>
<td>Strength</td>
<td>Peace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Essential Qualities</td>
<td>Goodness, sacredness, integrity</td>
<td>Kindness, goodness, compassion</td>
<td>Existence, value</td>
<td>Radiance, delight</td>
<td>Illumination of what actually is, clarity</td>
<td>Awareness, openness, expansiveness</td>
<td>Joy, freedom, possibility</td>
<td>Strength, vibrancy, confidence</td>
<td>Wholeness and unity, peace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Fear</td>
<td>Being bad or corrupt</td>
<td>Being unloved, unlovable, there is no love</td>
<td>Being worthless, deficient</td>
<td>Being without identity, “I am nobody”</td>
<td>Having no ability to know what’s real and true</td>
<td>Being without guidance of support</td>
<td>Being deprived, trapped in pain</td>
<td>Being harmed, not feeling own life</td>
<td>Being unsettled, fragmented, not unified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Needs/Desires</td>
<td>To align with the good, have integrity</td>
<td>To be loved</td>
<td>To be valuable, have meaning</td>
<td>To be one’s true self</td>
<td>To understand reality</td>
<td>To be secure, trustworthy orientation</td>
<td>To be happy</td>
<td>To protect oneself, to feel alive</td>
<td>To be at peace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life Script</td>
<td>Search for way back to the Garden; establish perfection</td>
<td>Search for closeness, do what it takes for people to love me</td>
<td>Search for positive affirmation</td>
<td>Search for identity, be unique</td>
<td>Search for reality, uncover the essence of things</td>
<td>Search for solid ground</td>
<td>Search for endless experiences</td>
<td>Search for impact and immorality</td>
<td>Search for harmony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barrier/Sin</td>
<td>Resentment</td>
<td>Pride</td>
<td>Vanity</td>
<td>Envy</td>
<td>Avarice</td>
<td>Fear</td>
<td>Gluttony</td>
<td>Lust</td>
<td>Sloth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fixation</td>
<td>Judging</td>
<td>Ingratiation</td>
<td>Deceit</td>
<td>Fantasizing</td>
<td>Retention</td>
<td>Worry and doubt</td>
<td>Planning &amp; anticipation of next thing</td>
<td>Objectification</td>
<td>Ruminating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defense Mechanism</td>
<td>Control of reactions</td>
<td>Repression of needs</td>
<td>Charisma, Identity</td>
<td>Artistic sublimation</td>
<td>Withdrawal</td>
<td>Projection</td>
<td>Rationalization</td>
<td>Denial</td>
<td>Numbing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtue</td>
<td>Serenity</td>
<td>Humility</td>
<td>Authenticity</td>
<td>Equanimity</td>
<td>Non-attachment</td>
<td>Courage</td>
<td>Sobriety (dignity, gravity)</td>
<td>Innocence</td>
<td>Engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Invitation to all</td>
<td>To live for a higher purpose</td>
<td>To nurture yourself and others</td>
<td>To develop yourself and others</td>
<td>To let go of the past and be renewed</td>
<td>To observe without judgement</td>
<td>To have faith</td>
<td>To celebrate existence</td>
<td>To speak out for what you believe</td>
<td>To bring peace and healing into the world</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Enneagram Levels of Freedom

Following is a general description of dynamics at each level of health in all types. We each have a set point and we can move a couple of levels either way from that point, depending on the day, the context, the situation, the stress. Spiritual transformation can help to push the set point to healthier levels.

Level 1 – Liberation (Balance and Freedom)

Level 2 – Full Potential (Identification with values and positive qualities)

Level 3 – Positive impact (Share the riches of our type with others)

Level 4 – Fixation (Losing contact with awareness as the ego strategies go into effect - beginning of “sleep”)

Level 5 – Interpersonal Conflict – (Manipulative and Defended)

**Our behaviors begin to bring us the exact opposite of what we are needing and desiring**

Level 6 – Overcompensation – (Aggressive defense of false self)

Level 7 – Violation – (Willing to violate self and others to maintain the false self – pathology arises)

Level 8 - Delusion and Compulsion (Ego out of control and out of touch with reality – major personality disorders)

Level 9 – Pathological destructiveness (Psychoses and death)

Upper levels – more openness and freedom
Lower levels – more constriction and obsession

1 Adapted from Enneagram Institute Training, Part I, Burlingame, CA. 2014.
Prayer Practices

Prayer is properly understood as an emotion of the heart within, which is poured out and laid open before God, the searcher of hearts. John Calvin

Moving from Self-Violence to Love

In learning about the enneagram, we are learning things about ourselves and our patterns of being in the world that we both celebrate and lament. In learning these things it is easy to turn to self-criticism and even self-loathing and self-violence. Jesus however shows a different way, a way of compassion, love and non-violence toward others and ourselves.

1. In learning about vices/ pitfalls of your particular enneagram energy, what judgments, self-criticism and violent labels have you given yourself? What are your voices of shame and blame? What demands are you tempted to make of yourself (“I should…”, “I ought”…)? List these “jackal” thoughts.

2. What do you feel after listing these violent judgment and labels of yourself?

3. Our feelings are always tied to our needs. What unmet needs may have caused your feelings listed in question two? If you are so moved, confess the ways you have tried to meet those needs that have not honored God or yourself.

- Receive God’s compassion and forgiveness:

  - “The Lord is compassionate and gracious, slow to anger, abounding in love. He will not always accuse, nor will he harbor his anger forever; he does not treat us as our sins deserve or repay us according to our iniquities. For as high as the heavens are above the earth, so great is his love for those who ear him; as far as the east is from the west, so far has he removed our transgressions from us. As a father has compassion on his children, so the Lord has compassion on those who fear him; for he knows how we are formed, he remembers that we are dust…..but from everlasting to everlasting the Lord’s love is with those who fear him, and his righteousness with their children’s children.” – Psalm 103:8-14, 17.

- Take a moment to thank God for God’s love.
Transforming Enemy Images

1. Imagine yourself
   - In this moment what are you feeling and needing? What are your joys, what is your pain? What are your unmet needs? Sit with these feelings and needs for a moment.
   - Now picture yourself resting in the loving arms of God, enveloped by God’s steadfast and everlasting love and compassion. God is holding you even as you identify your feelings and needs. God knows them and has compassion on you. Take a moment to imagine yourself being embraced by God in this way. Rest in this embrace.

2. Imagine someone you love
   - Think of someone that you love. Allow yourself to wonder what they may be feeling or needing in this moment. How might they be experiencing joy or pain, suffering or celebration? Empathize with this person that you love for a moment.
   - Now picture this person you love resting in the loving arms of God, enveloped by God’s steadfast and everlasting love and compassion. God is holding him or her and all their feelings and needs. God knows this person and has compassion on them. Take a moment to imagine this person you love being embraced by God as they rest in God’s embrace.

3. Imagine someone that you see as an enemy.
   - Think of someone that you see as an enemy. This can be someone whom you resent, who has hurt you or has hurt others. This may be someone whom you have written off in your life.
   - Now allow yourself to wonder what this person may be feeling or needing in this moment. How might they be experiencing joy or pain, suffering or celebration? Empathize with this person for a moment.
   - Now picture this person resting in the loving arms of God, enveloped by God’s steadfast and everlasting love and compassion. God is holding him or her and all their feelings and needs. God knows this person and has compassion on them. Take a moment to imagine this person being embraced by God as they rest in God’s embrace.

4. Reflect.
   - How do you feel after resting in God’s embrace? How do you feel towards yourself, your loved one, and your enemy. How do you feel towards God? What prayers arise in you after this exercise? Take a moment to write or speak these prayers.
Transforming Conflict from the Inside Out

Conflict is a natural part of life. Sometimes messy situations of conflict arise from our patterns of un-health. This exercise will practice nonviolent communication in response to conflict, moving towards resolution and compassion for yourself and others.

From what you have learned about your enneagram energy, what happens when you are less free and more constricted? What are your patterns of being and behavior? Now think of a time when you have created conflict or have responded to conflict out of that place of constriction. As you walk through this conflict in these four steps, imagine walking through this with God. You and God observe each moment together.

1. Jackal Towards Other
   - Who was the other party in your situation of conflict? How did they act and respond? What judgments do you have towards this person? Speak or write these judgments until you run out of them. Only move on when you have nothing else to say.
     - If you have resistance moving through this exercise with God’s presence in mind, recall the psalms that cry out against others when the psalmist has been hurt. Trust God to hold your jackal voices with you.

2. Jackal towards Yourself
   - How did you act or respond in this situation of conflict? What judgments do you have towards yourself and how you acted? Speak or write these judgments until you run out of them. Only move on when you have nothing else to say.

3. Giraffe Towards Yourself
   - How do you feel about your own actions in this situation? Our feelings tell us something deeper about our un-met needs. Refer to the Chart on “Feelings when you needs are not satisfied” to help you identify your feelings. (Clear tab section)
   - Our actions arise out of our genuine needs. Even the actions we regret. What un-met needs were you trying to meet when you acted in this situation? Refer to the “Needs Inventory” chart for help (Clear tab section). Take a moment to think about needs that led to your actions and words in the situation of conflict. After you have identified your needs, sit with them for a moment.
     - After realizing the needs that led to your actions in the situation of conflict, stay present to yourself in compassion. Reflect on the compassion that God shows to you in this moment. Thank God for God’s compassion.

4. Giraffe Towards Others
   - Imagine what feelings and needs may have caused the person you had conflict with to act in the way that they did. After identifying potential unmet needs of this person, try to empathize with them.
o After realizing the needs that may have motivated this other person to their actions, hold them with compassion. Reflect on the compassion that God shows for them in this moment. Ask God to open your heart with the same compassion that God shows for them.

5. Reflection.
- After going through this exercise, is there anything that you would like to do to seek resolution and reconciliation in this situation of conflict? Ask God for guidance and listen.
- Is there anything that you have learned about how you would like to address other situations of conflict in the future? Specifically regarding your patterns of being with your enneagram energy? If you feel called to, make a resolution with God and ask God to help you.
Silence

Take a comfortable posture and close your eyes
Try to attain as total a silence as possible of heart, mind and body
Remain silent for a period of ten minutes (you can set a chime on your phone)

After the ten minutes, open your eyes and journal briefly as follows:

• What happened?
• What attempts did you make to attain silence?
• Describe the silence
• What did you experience during the silence?

Close your eyes again and be silent for two minutes
Become aware of your wandering mind
Sense the silence that makes it possible for you to be aware of the wandering of your mind

After the two minutes, open your eyes and journal briefly as follows:

• What did you discover about yourself.

Do not be discouraged. Silence takes PRACTICE. Practice now.
Close your eyes and spend five minutes in silence

After the five minutes, open your eyes and journal briefly:

• What did the silence reveal to you this time that you didn’t notice last time?

Thank God for being present with you in silence
Breath Prayer

Become aware of your breathing for a while.…

Now reflect on the presence of God in the atmosphere all around you.…
Reflect on God’s presence in the air you are breathing.…
Be conscious of God’s presence in the air as you breathe in and out.…
Notice what you feel when you become conscious of God’s presence in the air you are breathing.

Express yourself to God without words, through your breathing only.
Express any of the following that are on your heart, through your breath:
  • “I long for you”
  • “I trust you”
  • “I surrender myself entirely to you”
  • “I love you”
  • “I am grateful to you”
  • “I want to be close to you”
  • “I praise you”

After a time, return to resting peacefully in the awareness of God all around you in the air you are breathing in and out.
Imagine you are standing before a deep dark pool. The pool is your inner self.

The pool has monsters lurking in its depths. The monsters are all your doubts and fears.

Gaze at the waters of the pool

One by one the monsters will come up for air. Look at them closely.

Name each monster as it comes up.

Continue to watch and name until it seems you have seen them all.

Talk to Jesus about what just happened?

Journal briefly on the following:
   Describe what you saw (or make drawings).
   Journal how you felt?
   Where is God is all of this?

Thank God for being present with you in this risky encounter.
Ignatian Contemplation
Re-living a Scene from the life of Christ

Read John 5: 2-9
Sit comfortably and quietly.
Become aware of your breathing
Imagine the pool called Bethesda… the five porches… the pool… the surroundings.
Imagine the whole setting at vividly as possible. What kind of place is it? Clean or dirty?
Large or small? Notice the architecture. Notice the weather.
Let the whole scene come to life now… See the people near the pool.. How many are
there? What sort of people are they? How are they dressed? What are they doing? What kind of illnesses are they suffering from? What are they saying?

Participate in the scene. What are you doing there? Why have you come to this place?
What are your feelings as you survey the scene and watch these people? What are you
doing? Do you speak to anyone? To whom? What do you say to them?

Notice the sick man the Gospel passage speaks about. Where is he in the crowd? How is
he dressed? Is anyone with him? Walk up to him and speak with him. What do you say to
him/ask him? What is his reply? Get as many details of his life and person as possible.
What sort of an impression does he make on you? What are your feelings while you
converse with him?
You notice out of the corner of your eye that Jesus has entered the place. Watch all his
actions and movements. Where does he go? How does he act? What do you think he is
feeling? He comes toward you and the sick man. What are you feeling now? Step aside
when you realize Jesus wants to talk with the sick man. What is Jesus saying to the man?
What does the man answer? Listen to the whole dialogue, filling in the account in the
Gospel.

Dwell on Jesus question, “Do you want to get well?” Then listen to Jesus’ command as
he tells the man to get up and walk. What is the first reaction of the man? What happens?
Notice the reactions of the man, of Jesus and of yourself.

Jesus turns to you and converses with you. Talk to Jesus about the miracle that has just
taken place. Is there any sickness that you are suffering from? Physical? Emotional?
Spiritual? Speak to Jesus about it. What does Jesus have to say? Listen to his words to
you, “Do you want to get well?” Do you really mean what you say when you ask to be
cured? Are you ready to take all the consequences of a cure? What are you feeling? What
does Jesus want to do in you? Spend some time in conversation with Jesus.

Journal briefly on the following:

• What was this experience like for you? What surprised you? What did you find
  out about yourself? About God?

Thank God for being present in this practice.

---

Mandala

What is a mandala?
Mandalas are designs with a center, based on a circle. The circle catches and focuses our attention. The circle-with-a-center pattern is a basic structure of creation seen in biology, geology, chemistry, physics and astronomy. Christians have been using mandalas in prayer for centuries. Walking the labyrinth is an example of using a mandala in prayer.

Why color mandalas?
We are experts at multi-tasking. We need times when we can allow our minds to rest so we can listen for the still, small voice of God. Coloring mandalas can be a liberating way to pray. While the hands are active and creative, the mind has a chance to rest and to focus on God.

Choose one of the Mandalas that are available in the prayer room, along with colored pencils or markers.

Read a passage of Scripture.

Begin to color. Converse with God as you color. Think about the scripture you read. Reflect on your life and your hopes for the future.

Don’t worry if you can’t finish the mandala in one sitting. Simply enjoy this time of peacefulness with God.

At the end of your coloring time, journal briefly on the following:
- What did you notice about God?
- Did you feel God’s love for you?
- What did you discover about yourself?

Thank God for being present with you in this space and time.
The Empty Chair

Find an empty chair and place it very close to you

Imagine Jesus is sitting in the chair. Of course, Jesus isn’t here in the way you are imagining him, but he certainly is here and your imagination helps to make you aware of this. Don’t get distracted by trying to imagine too many details

Now speak to Jesus…If no one is around, speak aloud in a soft voice….Listen to what Jesus says to you in reply….or what you imagine him to say…

If you do not know what exactly to say to Jesus, narrate to him the events of the past day and give him your comment on each of them. Then listen to his comments.

Journal briefly on the following:
   What surprised you about what you said to Jesus?
   What surprised you about what Jesus said to you?
   What will you take away with you from this time?

Thank God for being present with you in this practice
Dialogue with the Area of Avoidance

Have a written conversation between yourself, your avoidance according to your type and Jesus. The goal of facing the avoidance is not to eliminate it, but to integrate it. “Wholeness is achieved as one gradually befriends what is sensed as life threatening. It is a life long journey. This is a process and will take time, for we do not make friends with what is perceived as threatening overnight.”³

Relax and sit comfortably
Become aware of your breathing
Bring to mind your avoidance – imagine it as a person, maybe even give it a name,
Have a conversation with your avoidance
If you wish, also imagine Jesus being present and include him in your conversation
Write down what comes to you, without editing or controlling
Let the dialogue go on until it naturally comes to some sort of ending

Avoidances by type
ONE – anger/resentment
TWO – needs
THREE - failure
FOUR – simple joy or sadness
FIVE – emptiness
SIX – deviance or disobedience
SEVEN – pain
EIGHT - weakness
NINE – conflict or turmoil

Consider the following questions:
What was it like to meditate in this way?
What did you find out?
Thank God for giving you the courage to befriend your avoidance.

The Labyrinth
An act of prayer
An occasion for deepening personal inner stillness
An approach of attentiveness
An opportunity to be present to the Triune God

Reminders about Experiencing Prayer in the Labyrinth:

• Don’t worry about getting some great and profound insight. Try not to fret about the outcome. The intention of seeking God is the most important thing. The idea is not to produce a spiritual peak experience, but rather, to provide inner space for listening to God. Walk with an open heart and an open mind and leave the rest to God. Whatever happens is enough – even if it is simply a quiet space to hear your own breath – it is enough.

• Just like in life, you may meet others on the path. If you wish you can acknowledge your common journey with a nod or a smile or you may maintain your inward journey by not making eye contact. Others are not a distraction; they are companions with similar intent. If you are walking at different paces or meet each other from the opposite direction, simply step to the side and pass each other gently.

• You may pause anywhere along the path as you are so moved.

• You cannot make a mistake because the only decision is to start walking

• Every time you walk the labyrinth is a new journey. You bring to it who you are in Christ at that moment.

• It can be very helpful to reflect after you walk. Wisdom may come in the reflection. Journaling is a wonderful way to capture the essence of your experience.

Walking the Labyrinth
1. Take some moments to still your soul, think about your intention in walking, and pray for an awareness of God’s presence.
2. Enter the Labyrinth when you are ready, walking at a pace that feels comfortable and allows you to be attentive.
3. Pause in the center as long as you wish.
4. After walking, spend time reflecting/journaling.
5. Give thanks for God’s presence and attentiveness.

Optional Starter Questions

• Lord, what are you inviting me to relinquish? What are you inviting me to take up?
• Spirit, what do you wish to reveal to me about myself, be it painful and/or beautiful?
• Triune God, who are you?
• Holy Spirit, what do you wish to speak to me today?
The Daily Examen
Adapted from www.loyolapress.com

Stillness: Recalling God's Presence
Relax in your favorite prayer place and posture. Become aware of God’s presence. Be thankful as you think of the love of God the Father, expressed through Jesus, via the Holy Spirit. Ask the Holy Spirit to help you to look honestly at your day and how you have responded in different situations. With the Spirit's guidance you can recognize what draws you close to God as well as what pulls you away from God.

Gratitude: Expressing Thankfulness
Give thanks to God for the gifts of the day. See what springs to mind as you reflect. Perhaps—the aroma of coffee brewing, a smile from a classmate or a beautiful snowfall. Or—your ability to help in a crisis, your sense of humor, or your patience with a frustrating situation. Pause and express your gratitude to the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit.

Reflection: Looking Back on Your Day
Review the events of the day and become conscious of God's presence in them. Notice how you acted in the many situations in which you found yourself. Recall your feelings and motives to see whether you freely followed God's will. Think about opportunities you had to grow in faith, hope, and charity and when you did or did not take advantage of them. Be grateful for the occasions when you freely chose a course to help others, no matter how small the occasion. When we reflect on the times we did or didn't act with God's grace, we can be more sensitive to developing habits of gracious responses.

Sorrow: Asking for Forgiveness
Express sorrow for the times today when you failed to act in a Christ-like manner. Let yourself feel the sorrow in your heart as you confess. Ask God to strengthen you to more closely follow the leading of the Spirit the next time you encounter a similar situation. Take time to feel God’s loving forgiveness.

Hopefulness: Resolving to Grow
Ask for increasing awareness of God’s presence as you look forward to a new day tomorrow. Resolve to cooperate with the loving guidance of the Holy Spirit, particularly in the areas that were revealed to you during today’s reflection.
Walking on the Earth

Creation can uniquely touch our hearts and souls. Just as we experience something of the lives of artists by paying close attention to their art, so we experience something of the Creator when we consciously attend to creation. Creation was endowed by God with the power to bring forth life. Creation has healing power.

Guide to Walking

- Go outside.
- Ask God to accompany you and enable you to be present to each moment and each gift.
- Walk slowly.
- Become attentive.
- Use all your senses to notice every detail.
- If it helps you to stay focused, take pictures of little things that amaze you.
- After walking, reflect/journal on what God brought to mind.
- Try writing a poem that expresses your experience.
- Thank God for the beauty of creation.
Centering Prayer

My heart is not proud, LORD, my eyes are not haughty;
I do not concern myself with great matters or things too wonderful for me.

But I have calmed and quieted myself,
I am like a weaned child with its mother;
like a weaned child I am content.

Psalm 131:1-2

The Practice
1. Centering Prayer is a practice of BEING with God.

2. Sit in a position that will help you to be comfortable but alert. (IE: sitting on a chair with feet on floor, hands on lap, posture erect or sitting on floor with legs crossed and back straight)

3. Choose a “sacred word” (It is not a mantra. It is a small word, ideally one syllable that helps you come back to your intention of simply being with God)

4. Set a timer for 20 minutes. (If you don’t have a timer available, just practice for what seems like about 20 minutes.)

5. Close your eyes and take two deep, intentional breaths

6. Sit quietly and as each thought appears, let it go on by. If you realize that you have gotten caught up in a thought, think your sacred word and let the thought go.

7. At the end of the 20 minutes, take two deep breaths and enter gently back into consciousness of your surroundings.

8. Take time to reflect on what it was like to pray this way.

Helpful Hints
Nothing obvious is supposed to happen during centering prayer. No need to judge yourself.

If you have a pretty boisterous inner critic - BEWARE – he or she will give you all kinds of input about how badly you are doing with this, how it's not working and consequently what a bad person you are. If that happens, just let that thought go, like all the others

Doing the practice with the intention of being with God is enough.
Living the Story: Creative Contemplation of Scripture

Read John 8:1-11

“While Jesus went to the Mount of Olives. Early in the morning he came again to the temple. All the people came to him and he sat down and began to teach them. The scribes and the Pharisees brought a woman who had been caught in adultery; and making her stand before all of them, they said to him, “Teacher, this woman was caught in the very act of committing adultery. Now in the law Moses commanded us to stone such women. Now what do you say?” They said this to test him, so that they might have some charge to bring against him. Jesus bent down and wrote with his finger on the ground. When they kept on questioning him, he straightened up and said to them, “Let anyone among you who is without sin be the first to throw a stone at her.” And once again he bent down and wrote on the ground. When they heard it, they went away, one by one, beginning with the elders; and Jesus was left alone with the woman standing before him. Jesus straightened up and said to her, “Woman, where are they? Has no one condemned you?” She said, “No one, sir.” And Jesus said, “Neither do I condemn you. Go your way, and from now on do not sin again.”

Draw the scene as you see it in your mind’s eye. Picture yourself in the scene, where are you in relation to the characters? Are you one of the characters? What do you hear the words of Jesus saying to you?

Creatively express (with drawing, words, or poetry) what the words of Jesus mean to you in this story and what they mean to you know in this time and place.

Meditate and reflect on the image that you drew, prayerfully read the story again.
Formation Retreat Evaluation Form  
2016

**Evaluate the Venue of the retreat**
1. Rate the following from 1-5 with 1 being awful and 5 being fantastic.
2. Add comments as desired.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Meals</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lodging</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grounds</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting spaces</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gull Lake staff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Evaluate the following elements of the retreat according to the following:**
1. Should we include this element next year?  
   Absolutely, Yes, Maybe, No, Absolutely not
2. What comments/suggestions would you like to make about this element?
Intro to Enneagram in the Abbey
Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not

Traveling by bus
Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not

Opening Worship
Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not

Morning and Evening Prayers
Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not

Practicing Presence (singing bowl chime)
Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not

Peer group discussions
Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not

Type group discussions
Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not

Individual reflection times
Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not
Substantial afternoon breaks
   Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not

The Enneagram
   Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not

Type Collage project
   Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not

Type Panels during presentations
   Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not

CIQs
   Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not

Community Hang out time in the evenings
   Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not

Skit night
   Absolutely - Yes - Maybe - No - Absolutely not
What else do you wish would have been included?

What other suggestions do you have that will help improve students’ experience next year?

How was your overall experience?
Formation Retreat Bibliography


_________. Ennagram Professional Training Manuel. The Enneagram Institute Faculty, 2008.


Online Resources

www.enneagraminstitute.com/ - The Enneagram Institute
www.9types.com/ - 9types.com - Enneagram tests, type descriptions, forums
http://www.enneagram.net/ - Enneagram Explorations web site
Direction of Disintegration

We tend to move **IN** the **direction** of the arrow during times of **high stress**.

We tend to move **AGAINST** the **direction**
of the arrow in times of low stress.
Appendix C
Detailed Master Schedule

MONDAY

7:30 AM - Pray, load, depart

9:30 AM - Arrive, settle

10:00 AM - OPENING WORSHIP

10:30 - 11:45 AM - SESSION #1
10:30 Welcome
10:35 Presence Intro
10:50 Practicing Presence
11:00 Yes/No in Pairs
11:05 Brief introduction to Enneagram - Brown Paper Person
11:20 Overview of the retreat process
11:25 Housekeeping
11:30 Peer Groups – #1
   4. What is on your heart that you are bringing from Christmas break and/or from last semester?
   5. Where do you find resistance in yourself in regard to the retreat or the enneagram?
   6. In the best case scenario, what do you hope for?
11:50 Dismiss for Lunch

Noon - LUNCH

1:00 – 2:00 PM - SESSION #2
Individual Reflection – See instructions in binder
* Formation team available to help students talk through types

2:00 PM - SESSION #3
2:00 Practicing Presence
2:10 Testimonies
2:15 Instinctual Stack
2:35 Peer Groups #3
   4. What do you think your predominant instinct is? How do you see yourself living that out?
   5. How was the individual reflection time for you? You are invited to share something that was significant for you about your reflection time.
   6. What do you sense God is speaking to you at this point?
2:55 Large group check in
3:00 Type group collage
3:30 Type group presentations
4:00 Type Groups #3

What makes you think you are this type? What did you learn about yourself during the
type collage exercise?

5. What advantage might there be to knowing this information?
6. What danger might there be to knowing this information?
7. How is your soul?

4:30 PM - RESPITE

6:00 PM - DINNER

7:00 – 8:30 PM - SESSION #4
7:00 Practicing Presence
7:05 Instinctual Stack Charades
7:15 Complexities
  • Wings
  • Arrows - demonstrate on the floor - give scenarios and have people move
  • Filters
  • Levels of Health - Use Level Titles and descriptions with Type 9 Examples
7:45 Peer Groups #4
  5. In regard to the three instincts, what tendencies do you notice in yourself? How
does this affect your daily functioning?
  6. What stood out to you in regard to the discussion on the levels of health?
  7. In what range of health do you see yourself hovering? How so?
  8. How has this experience been for you so far? How is your heart?

8:10 Dinner party quiz

8:20 CIQ

8:30 PM - EVENING PRAYERS

9:00 PM - COMMUNITY HANG OUT (Peer Group Facilitators meet with Retreat
Leader)
TUESDAY

8:00 AM - BREAKFAST

9:00 AM - MORNING PRAYERS

9:20 – 11:45 AM - SESSION #5
9:20 Practicing Presence
9:25 CIQ discussion
9:40 Intro Centers
9:45 Gut Center
9:40 Type EIGHT
10:20 Skip
10:25 Break
10:35 Type NINE
11:15 Personal Prayer practice

Noon - LUNCH

12:30 – 3:30 PM - RESPITE
Personal alone time 1:00 – 1:30
Climbing wall open 1:30-3:00

3:30 – 5:45 PM - SESSION #6
3:30 Practicing Presence
3:35 Type ONE
4:15 Peer Group #6
   4. How are you doing so far? What has this experience been like for you?
   5. Share as you are willing about the experience with the prayer practice you chose.
   6. What do you sense God is speaking to you thus far in the retreat?
4:45 Break
4:55 Heart Center
5:00 Type TWO

6:00 PM - DINNER

7:00 – 8:30 PM - SESSION #7
7:00 Practicing Presence
7:05 Type THREE
7:40 Skip
7:45 Type FOUR
CIQ

8:30 PM - EVENING PRAYERS
9:00 PM - COMMUNITY HANG OUT (Peer Group Facilitators meet with Retreat Leader)
WEDNESDAY

8:00 AM - BREAKFAST

9:00 AM - MORNING PRAYERS

9:20 – 11:45 AM - SESSION #8
9:20 Practicing Presence
9:25 CIQ discussion
9:40 Head Center Review
9:45 Type FIVE
10:25 Break
10:35 Type SIX
11:15 Peer groups #8
   4. What was an AHA moment for you today?
   5. What was difficult to hear/learn?
   6. How is your soul?

Noon - LUNCH

12:30 – 3:30 PM - RESPITE
Personal alone time 1:00 – 1:30
Bowling open 1:30 -3:00

3:30 – 5:45 PM - SESSION # 9
3:30 Practicing Presence
3:35 Type SEVEN
4:15 Personal Reflection#9
4:45 Type Group Discussion #9
   4. What have you learned about yourself and what might be the implications for your life?
   5. What, if anything, do you wish to share from your reflections on the levels of health? (This question is purely invitational. No one is required to share)
   6. What are the implications of the Enneagram and the levels of health for ministry?
5:30 Large Group Follow Up

6:00 PM - DINNER

7:00 – 8:30 PM - SESSION #10
7:00 Practicing Presence
7:05 What do you still need to know?
7:30 Things that got missed previously
7: 50 Type Groups #10 - Create Skits
8:20 CIQ
8:30 PM - EVENING PRAYERS
9:00 PM – SKIT NITE (After Skits – Leadership team meets to divvy up additional information)
THURSDAY

8:00 AM - BREAKFAST

9:00 AM - MORNING PRAYERS

9:20 – 11:45 AM - SESSION #11
9:20 Practicing Presence
9:25 Reflection on the morning silence and CIQ discussion
9:35 Answers to Remaining Questions
9:45 Individual Reflection #11 Moving Forward - Personal Journaling

   Journal on the following:
   6. What will I do with this information and experience, moving forward?
   7. What am I willing to commit to regarding my personal formation?
   8. What will be my strategies for keeping those commitments?
   9. How might those strategies involve my peer group?
  10. How have I been formed by this retreat experience?

10:20 Peer groups #11
   Share one person at a time, as you are willing, from your journaling during
   personal reflection time:
   5. What has been your experience this week? How is your heart?
   6. What are your commitments and strategies for moving forward?
   7. How would you like the peer group to help you?
   8. Pray specifically for each person after they share.

11:20 Large Group - what commitments and agreements do we wish to make with each
   other in regard to moving forward? Relating to Each Other with this information
   How can we covenant together?
   Include confidentiality

11:45 Talk about resources available to students on return to WTS

Noon – LUNCH

1-2 PM SESSION #12
1:00 Type Groups #12
   As a group fill out the retreat evaluation form and give it to Beth.
   Include everyone in the process
   Include areas of disagreement.

1:20 Individuals - Post Retreat survey
1:30 Tear Down
1:50 Move to chapel

2:00 PM - CLOSING WORSHIP including large group sharing

3:00 PM - Load and depart
Appendix D
Session Details

Session #1
Introduction to the Retreat
11:00- 11:45 AM

Overview
11:00 Intro Leader
11:05 Intro Presence
11:10 Practicing Presence
11:15 Theology and Purpose
11:20 Enneagram Testimony
11:30 Housekeeping Details
11:35 Small Group

Introduction of Leader
- Who I am
- How I got involved with the Enneagram
- My hopes and prayers for this experience

Intro. Practicing Presence Exercise
We say that we believe that God is Omnipresent, but our modern worldview is set up differently.
We no longer think we live in a world infused with the glory of God
But that is not the Hebrew world view
Not the Biblical world view
Rather
Psalm 33:5 He loves righteousness and justice; The earth is full of the lovingkindness of the LORD. (NASB)
Psalm 119:64 The earth, O LORD, is full of Thy mercy; teach me Thy statutes. (JPS)
Isaiah 6:3 And one called to another and said: "Holy, holy, holy is the LORD of hosts; the whole earth is full of his glory." (NRSV)

We have a closed cosmology – (Diagram) we live in a closed system that is self-sufficient and God is somewhere out there
But the Hebrews had an open cosmology. (Diagram) They lived in an open world that not only received God’s inflow but was absolutely dependent on it. If God were to look away for even a second, the world would disintegrate and cease to exist.
In the beginning, God breathes the Ruach (Spirit, breath) and everything comes into being. God breathes between the waters and forms the Rachia (dome, firmament, living space) without which we would not be able to exist

4 All content pieces rely heavily on Enneagram Institute Training, Part 1, Burlingame, CA, July 2014 and Part 3, Chester, CN, June 2015.
Then God breathes into the newly created humans and gives us life. In fact the tetragrammaton – the four letters which represent God in the Hebrew Scriptures, are the same letters that comprise the being verb. The name of God which is never spoken aloud –God is the basis of all being/all existence. And the tetragrammaton is composed entirely of breath letters. God is as close as our breath. We also say that we believe that the Spirit indwells us.

**Romans 8:9** But you are not in the flesh; you are in the Spirit, since the Spirit of God dwells in you. (NRSV)

**1 Corinthians 3:16** Do you not know that you are a temple of God, and that the Spirit of God dwells in you? (NASB)

**1 Corinthians 6:19** Or do you not know that your body is a temple of the Holy Spirit who is in you, whom you have from God, and that you are not your own? (NASB)

If then the Spirit dwells in us, shouldn’t we pay attention to what is going on inside us? And if our bodies are the temple of the Holy Spirit, shouldn’t we at least notice that we HAVE a body and pay attention to it?

So I want to extend us an invitation to focus on the presence of God, in the world around us, in our breath, and in ourselves. I will talk you into a space of awareness and openness to God’s presence. Then we will remain in that space for some moments. If your mind wanders, simply come back to your breath – the gift of God from moment to moment. Finally, you will hear the singing bowl chime and the meditation lasts until the reverberations of the sound can no longer be heard.

**Initial presence practice**

**Singing Bowl Chime**

I want to invite us now into a time of practicing presence. I know I often live much of my life in my head, not even aware of where I am or what is around me or even what’s going on in my own body.

I invite you to close your eyes. Sit comfortably upright with your feet on the floor and your hands resting on your thighs. After a time of invitation and then a time of silence, the bowl will chime again. The meditation lasts until you can no longer hear the reverberation of the bowl. Try to become aware of the presence of God in this place.

The Spirit is as close as your breath. Become aware of your breathing. Feel your lungs filling with air. Feel the air leaving your lungs. Take an extra deep breath. At the top of your breath, take one extra sip of air and hold there for a moment. Then release the air as fully as you can and hold there for a moment. Now return to breathing normally. Become aware of your body. Notice where you might have some discomfort. Don’t try to change it - just notice it. Notice where you might have some comfort.
Feel your fingers.
Feel your toes.
Feel your feet connected firmly to the floor.
Feel your back against the chair.
Become aware of your heart.
Feel the sensations of your heart.
Become aware of what is going on inside you.
Notice what you are feeling.
Notice any emotional discomfort you might be experiencing.
Don’t try to change it - just notice it.
Notice any emotional comfort you might be experiencing.
Continue to be aware as you enjoy the gift of a few moments of silence.

Silence
Singing Bowl Chime
Thank you.

Why bother
Ask the participants – possible answers:
Essential nature of self-awareness for ministry leaders - being WELL and WHOLE
If we are not self-aware we WILL hurt people.
Increasing compassion and understanding toward others in our lives

Theology of the Enneagram
- 9 facets of the Image of God.
- Helps us find the diamond of our true self, which is a reflection of God and an expression of God.
- Total depravity = everyone’s ego has constructed a false self to allow us to survive in the fallen world. It forms a crust over the true self/image of God in us.
- Redemption = Christ the first-fruits – the true human - as human kind was intended.
- Enneagram is ONE tool to help us live into our true human identity – in other words, to open the way for the Spirit to make us more Christ-like.

Warnings
- Each person has a predominate type energy, but that is not our ONLY energy. We have them all in varying degrees.
- Types are NOT a box. Types can free us from our old patterns and help us become what we were created to be. "Our energy can go to one of two places: it may be poured into maintaining the structures of our personality, or if we dis-identify with those structures, it may be liberated for our development and growth." (The Wisdom of the Enneagram, 348.)
- Don’t ever use types as weapons against each other.
- Knowing your type does not give you an excuse for unhealthy behavior, it gives you the ability to choose healthier behaviors.

Testimony from one of the Retreat Leaders
How has learning about the Enneagram affected his/her life and ministry?

**Housekeeping**

- Invitation to respite from technology - minimize use of cell phones/ social media/electronics.
- Bring to sessions – participant binder, journal, something to write with, slippers, drinks, whatever will help you be present and comfortable.
- Staying engaged - Feel free to get up and re-situate during sessions. You are welcome to stand, sit on the floor, use the restroom. We have a “play” area with items that might help with the long hours (playdough, coloring, stress balls, etc)
- Alone time – a half hour time frame to spend doing something alone (prayer practice, walk, rest, regroup)
- Instructions for session 2.
- Respite time options - Many options are available. Do what will be life-giving and rejuvenating for you.
- Morning silence – Being present. Listen. Pay attention to your food - the tastes, smells, texture, color. Practice sacramental eating.
- Directions to the dining hall.

**Small Group** -

1. What are you most looking forward to this week?
2. What are you least looking forward to this week?
3. What is on your heart that you are bringing with you from Christmas break and/or from last semester?
Session # 2
Individual Reflection
Handout

This is an opportunity for you to review your energy type and your pre-work
1. What do you think your predominant Enneagram type energy is and why do you
think so? (If you are vacillating between multiple types, answer this question for
each of those types) See reminder of steps for determining your type energy
below.
2. What parts of your type energy are you resistant to fully accepting?
3. What do you find comforting about the characteristics of your type energy?
4. Review your journal responses to the pre-reading in order to be prepared for
group discussion. See reminder of pre-reading assignment below.

Steps to help you determine your type:
1. Read through the results of your survey, taking note of the types the survey
identifies as most likely.
2. In the Rohr book – read the chapters for the top two or three types indicated by
the results of your survey. As you read:
   • Mark the statements that seem to fit you.
   • Particularly note where you feel uneasy, embarrassed or even humiliated.
3. If none of the types you read about feel like a fit, continue to read about each type
until something strikes you.
4. When you have a sense of what your type energy might be, or have it narrowed
down to a couple possibilities, talk to someone who knows and loves you about
which characteristics they see in you.
5. If you are older and recognize characteristics from several types in your life, think
back to your early adulthood, especially your early twenties. Ask yourself, “What
was I like back then?”
6. If you still feel confused, come and talk to one of the leaders.

Reading assignment from Richard Rohr and Andreas Ebert, *The Enneagram: A Christian
Perspective*.
Prefaces – Pages ix – xv
Part One – Starting at “A Sobering Aha-Experience.” Pages 23 – 42
Part Three - Pages 199-227.
Optional - If you would like to see how the Enneagram types play out in Jesus,
also read pages 232- 246.
As you read these sections, ask yourself and journal answers to the following:
d. What rings true to me?
e. About what do I feel resistance in myself?
f. What do I sense God is speaking to me through my encounter with these ideas?
Session #3
Intro to Enneagram
3:30 – 5:45 PM

Overview
3:30 Practicing Presence
3:35 Brief introduction to Enneagram
  • What is it?
  • History
  • Moving Parts
3:50 Nine types in brief
4:20 Show “During the Dinner Party” slide
4:25 Type group collage
4:55 Break
5:05 Small groups #1
5:25 Large Group Check in (maybe)
5:30 Small Groups #2

Practicing Presence

What is the Enneagram?
Not just a personality test
A tool for understanding the strategies our ego has developed to cope with the fallen-ness of the world. By recognizing these patterns and strategies in ourselves, the possibility of growth and transformation in opened up to us.
Our purposes at this retreat:
  Not to put us in a box but to free us from the boxes of our own making.
  To affirm, encourage, and challenge each other toward Christ-likeness and toward growing into the person we were each designed by God to be (our best, most fully alive and human self).
  To help us become healthy, mature, loving, godly leaders.
Key assumptions
1. People do not change from one basic Enneagram type to another over the course of their lives.
2. The descriptions of the types are universal and apply equally to males and females, since no type is inherently masculine or feminine.
3. Not everything in the description of your basic type will apply to you all the time because you fluctuate constantly among the free, average, and constricted traits that make up your personality type.
4. The Enneagram uses numbers to designate each of the type energies because numbers are value neutral — they imply the whole range of attitudes and behaviors of each type without specifying anything either positive or negative. Unlike the labels used in psychiatry, numbers provide an unbiased, shorthand way of indicating a lot about a person without being pejorative.
5. The numerical ranking of the types is not significant. A larger number is no better than a smaller number; it is not better to identify with Nine than Two because nine is a bigger number.

6. No type energy is inherently better or worse than any other. While all the types have unique assets and liabilities, some types are often more desirable than others in any given culture or group. Furthermore, for one reason or another, you may not be happy having a particular type energy. You may feel that your type is "handicapped" in some way. As you learn more about all the types, you will see that just as each has unique capacities, each has different limitations. If some types are more esteemed in Western society than others, it is because of the qualities that society rewards, not because of any superior value of those types. The ideal is to become your best self, not to imitate the assets of another type.

7. As we mature, we are able to access the healthy energy of the other types more readily.

History
The Enneagram as we have it today has a long history of development that incorporates ancient wisdom from many sources, from at least as far back as the desert fathers and mothers of the fourth century. When we use the Enneagram system as we have it today, we are not simply looking at another modern psychological explanation of human behavior or personality. Rather, it is a version of the WHOLE of this wisdom and tradition, made accessible to fresh viewers. Today’s circle representation of the nine types of the Enneagram was adapted from the Jewish mystics’ conception of the tree of life. The Tree of Life actually has ten points, the top point of which is the Messiah, represented in the Enneagram as the circle itself.

Moving Parts (explained further in Session 4) - Many factors affect how a person of a certain type functions. Persons of the same type will look remarkably different from one another. And, an individual will embody his/her type differently over time or in various situations.

Brief definitions here:
1. Levels of Freedom
2. Wings
3. Arrows
4. Subtypes

**Pay attention to what parts of the descriptions make you most uncomfortable, what you most don’t want to be. It can help to affirm your type and open your self-awareness.

The Nine Types in Brief – (Including slides with animal caricatures)

Type Eight
The Challenger
(Leader, Solution Master, Maverick, Protector or Intimidator)
Description:
The powerful, aggressive type. People with eight energy are self-confident, strong, and assertive. Protective, resourceful, straight-talking, and decisive, but can also be egocentric and domineering. People with eight energy feel they must control their environment, especially people, sometimes becoming confrontational and intimidating. People with eight energy typically have problems with their tempers and with allowing themselves to be vulnerable.

At their Best: Self-mastering, they use their strength to improve others' lives, becoming heroic, magnanimous, and inspiring.

I care a lot about - advocacy  
Personal mantra – “I am strong”  
At all costs, I avoid – weakness  
Caricature – bull or tiger

Type Nine  
The Peacemaker  
(Mediator, Naturalist, Accommodator or Abdicator)

Description:
The easy-going, self-effacing type. People with nine energy are accepting, trusting, and stable. They are usually grounded, supportive, and often creative, but can also be too willing to go along with others to keep the peace. They want everything to go smoothly and be without conflict, but they can also tend to be complacent and emotionally distant, simplifying problems and ignoring anything upsetting. They typically have problems with inertia and stubbornness.

At their Best: Indomitable and all-embracing, able to bring people together and heal conflicts.

I care a lot about - harmony  
Personal mantra – “I am content”  
At all costs, I avoid – conflict  
Caricature – sloth or dolphin

Type One  
The Reformer  
(Perfectionist, Judge, Crusader or Critic)

Description:
The principled, idealistic type. People with one energy are conscientious and ethical, with a strong sense of right and wrong. They are teachers, crusaders, and advocates for change: always striving to improve things, but afraid of making mistakes. Well-organized, orderly, and fastidious, they try to maintain high standards, but can slip into
being critical and perfectionistic. They typically have problems with resentment and impatience.

At their Best:
Wise, discerning, realistic, and noble. Can be morally heroic.

I care a lot about - perfection
Personal Mantra – “I am right”
At all costs, I avoid – mistakes
Caricature – ant or bee

Type Two
The Helper
(Martyr, Giver, Caretaker, Helper, Nurturer, Advisor or Manipulator)

Description:
The caring, interpersonal type. People with two energy want to be appealing, giving, caring and heartfelt. They are empathetic, sincere, and warm-hearted. They are friendly, generous, and self-sacrificing, but can also be sentimental, flattering, and people-pleasing. They are well-meaning and driven to be close to others, but can slip into doing things for others in order to be needed. They typically have problems with possessiveness and with acknowledging their own needs.

At their Best:
Unselfish and altruistic, they have unconditional love for others.

I care a lot about - getting love
Personal mantra – “I help”
At all costs, I avoid – neediness
Caricature - mule or ‘licky’ puppy dog

Type Three
The Achiever
(Performer, Motivator, Producer or Status Seeker)

Description:
The adaptable, success-oriented type. People with three energy are self-assured, attractive, and charming. Ambitious, competent, and energetic, they can also be status-conscious and highly driven for advancement. They are diplomatic and poised, but can also be overly concerned with their image and what others think of them. They typically have problems with work-aholism and competitiveness.

At their Best:
Self-accepting, authentic, everything they seem to be—role models who inspire others.

I care a lot about – acceptance
Personal Mantra – “I am successful”
Type Four
The Individualist
(Tragic Romantic, Artist, Over-Analyzer, Mystic or Melodramatic Elitist)

Description:
The introspective, romantic type. People with four energy are self-aware, sensitive, and reserved. They are emotionally honest, creative, and personal, but can also be moody and self-conscious. Withholding themselves from others due to feeling vulnerable and defective, they can also feel disdainful and exempt from ordinary ways of living. They typically have problems with melancholy, self-indulgence, and self-pity.

At their Best:
Inspired and highly creative, they are able to renew themselves and transform their experiences.

I care a lot about - being unique
Personal Mantra – “I am different”
At all costs, I avoid – dullness
Caricature – oyster or mourning dove

Type Five
The Investigator
(Wise one, Observer, Thinker, Sage or Voyeur)

Description:
The perceptive, cerebral type. People with five energy are alert, insightful, and curious. They are able to concentrate and focus on developing complex ideas and skills. Independent, innovative, and inventive, they can also become preoccupied with their thoughts and imaginary constructs. They become detached, yet high-strung and intense. They typically have problems with eccentricity, nihilism, and isolation.

At their Best:
Visionary pioneers, often ahead of their time, and able to see the world in an entirely new way

I care a lot about - knowledge
Personal Mantra – “I can master it”
At all costs, I avoid – not knowing
Caricature - owl

Type Six
The Loyalist
(Doubter, Skeptic, Devil's Advocate, Guardian or Rebel)
Description:
The committed, security-oriented type. People with six energy are reliable, hard-working, responsible, and trustworthy. Excellent "troubleshooters," they foresee problems and foster cooperation, but can also become defensive, evasive, and anxious—running on stress while complaining about it. They can be cautious and indecisive, but also reactive, defiant and rebellious. They typically have problems with self-doubt and suspicion.

At their Best:
Internally stable and self-reliant, courageously championing themselves and others.

I care a lot about - security
Personal Mantra – “I do my duty”
At all costs, I avoid – uncertainty
Caricature - German Shepherd or wolf and mouse

Type Seven
The Enthusiast
(Epicure, Entertainer, Optimist, Adventurer or Rationalizer)

Description:
The busy, productive type. People with seven energy are extroverted, optimistic, versatile, and spontaneous. Playful, high-spirited, and practical, they can also misapply their many talents, becoming over-extended, scattered, and undisciplined. They constantly seek new and exciting experiences, but can become distracted and exhausted by staying on the go. They typically have problems with impatience and impulsiveness.

At their Best:
Focus their talents on worthwhile goals, becoming appreciative, joyous, and satisfied.

I care a lot about - fun
Personal Mantra – “I am happy”
I avoid at all costs – pain of any kind
Caricature - Monkey

During the Party
Show “During the Dinner Party” slide from Enneagram Made Easy, initial page II

Type Group Collage
Get in a group with those who have identified as your type. If you have more than five in your group – split into two groups and make two collages. Together prepare a collage that illustrates your type energy, both negative and positive. You can use magazine pictures, drawings, words, poems, are whatever you can put on a piece of poster board. You can continue to add things during the week if you wish.
Come up with 5 descriptive words that exemplify the type energy of your group
Plan a 2 minute presentation involving your collage and your words
**Type Group Presentations**
Presentations starting with Type 8.
Someone puts the poster on the wall at the location of that number
After each presentation ask, “What was it like to work on this project as a group?”

**Small Groups** (Question Set #1)
Discuss your responses to the pre-reading (p23-42 & p.199-227)

1. What felt true to you? How so?
2. What was new or surprising?
3. What do you sense God is speaking to you through these ideas?

**Large Group Check in** (if time allows)

**Small Groups** (Question Set #2)

1. What type energy do you think you have? Why do you think so?
2. What do you like and not like about that so far?
3. What advantage might there be to knowing this information?
4. What danger might there be to knowing this information?
Session #4  
Movement and Mechanics  
7:00 – 8:30 PM

Overview  
7:00  Practicing presence  
7:05  Movement and mechanics  
  •  Wings  
  •  Arrows  
  •  Levels of Freedom  
  •  Instinctual Stack  
  •  Filters  
7:30  Dinner party quiz - Enneagram made easy pg 9  
(before the party) initial page II (during the party) pg 133  
(after the party) 
7:40  Three centers descriptions with drawings  
8:00  Small Group  
8:20  CIQ

Practicing Presence

Levels of Freedom  
*Use a 3D model for visual*  
Layers of the enneagram circle  
Upper levels – more openness and freedom  
Lower levels – more constriction and obsession  
At each level use type nine as an example – talking about how a nine looks at each of the levels. Ask someone to volunteer to take a posture that represents that level of health, utilizing nine chairs at the front of the room, which are labeled from 1 – 9.  
At the end of the descriptions, with all the volunteers still in place ask everyone what they notice.  
Another option could be to draw something on your white board to represent each level.  

(Below, *bolded* describes general characteristics at that level.  
Un-bolded describes characteristics specific to Type Nine.)

Level 1 – Liberation (Balance and Freedom)  
Vibrant, alive, serene  
All embracing  
True connectedness

Level 2 – Full Potential (Identification with values and positive qualities)  
Contemplative  
Connected to earth and nature  
Gentle, peaceful, balanced, humble
Level 3 – Positive impact (Share the riches of our type with others)
Inclusive, patient, steadfast
Unpretentious – love being with you just as you are
Bring peace and calm

Level 4 – Fixation (Losing contact with awareness as the ego strategies go into effect
- beginning of ‘sleep’)
Go along to get along
Say ‘yes’ when they mean ‘no’
Feel they are not being considered

Level 5 – Interpersonal Conflict (Manipulative and Defended)
Our behaviors bring us the exact opposite of what we need and desire
Passive aggressive resistance
Indifferent, placid, disengaged
Turtle mode

Level 6 – Overcompensation (Aggressive defense of false self)
Dismissive
Stubborn
Resigned (“Can’t do anything to change it anyway”)

Level 7 – Violation (Willing to violate self and others to maintain the false self – pathology arises)
Flat trance-like expression (Ghost mode)
Quite non-functional
Attach to abusers

Level 8 - Delusion and Compulsion (Ego out of control and out of touch with reality
– major personality disorders)
Multiple personalities
Lost and confused
Zombie mode

Level 9 – Pathological destructiveness (Psychoses and death)
Catatonic

We each have a set point and we can vary a couple of levels either way from that point, depending on the day, the context, the situation, the stress

Wings
Your Type actually ranges between the halfway points of the numbers to either side of your predominate type.
We tend to take on some of the characteristics of one of the numbers to either side of ours (both the defense mechanisms AND the adaptive mechanisms). That number is called the ‘wing.’
The wing can change during different periods of life. Our wing can offer us additional resources in various situations. Wings will make different people of the same type look different. We experience our wing at the same level of health/freedom we are at in our own type. Pay attention to the descriptions of the numbers on either side of yours and see where you identify.

What are your potential wings?

Wings quiz

Leader gives a type and a characteristic of one of its wings – students write the wing number on their white boards.

- Joe has a lot of 5 energy – He is attracted to dark, forbidden subject matter. He is inventive and whimsical. (Wing type 4)
- Samantha has a lot of 9 energy – She is prim and proper and has a vision for the ideal world. (Wing type 1)
- Darin has a lot of 3 energy – he is friendly, helpful and generous. He has a strong desire for people to like and admire him. (Wing type 2)
- Katrina has a lot of 7 energy – she has a cooperative spirit, and maintaining connections with friends and family is very important to her. (Wing type 6)

Arrows

Each Type has two arrows.
The arrows can help us determine our type if we recognize what we tend towards during stress.

Direction of Disintegration - in the direction of the arrow. (We move toward this type during times of high stress.)

- Happens at levels 4-9
- Always move into the same level of health we are at in our predominant type.
- An adaptation.
- When dominant coping mechanisms aren’t working.
- Like a lateral pass in football – gives us another set of mechanisms to work from.
- Can be enough to stop us from plunging down the levels of freedom.
- Like taking the foot off the gas pedal.

Direction of Integration - against the direction of the arrow. (We move toward this type during times of low stress.)

- Happens at levels 1-4.
- Natural integration of higher levels of other numbers.
- Let go of what blocks us in our own type

Arrows activity:

Have a person of each type volunteer to stand on their predominant type.
Leader reads a scenario. Each person moves appropriately on the diagram.

1. You total your car the week before finals
2. You are going home to your family for the funeral of a high school classmate. Your parents have told you they are getting a divorce but have not told your younger siblings.

3. The fall semester is starting after a summer of a fabulous internship that confirmed your direction. You feel rested and enthusiastic about starting classes again.

Switch participants for each scenario.
Locate your directions of disintegration and integration.
Pay attention to the descriptions of these types.

**Instincts**
Also sometimes called subtypes.
There are three basic animal instincts –
- Self-preservation (staying alive and well) – preoccupied with getting and maintaining physical safety and comfort.
- Social (relating to others) – preoccupied with being accepted and necessary in the world.
- Sexual (keeping the human race going) – preoccupied with a constant search for connection and for intense experiences of all kinds.

One of these is most prominent for each of us and greatly affects how we live out our type.

**Dinner Party Quiz**
Enneagram Made Easy pg 9 (before the party) initial page II (during the party) pg 133 (after the party)
Leader reads the responses – participants write down the type on their white boards (maybe work in pairs).

**Filters**
RAS - The reticular activating system (RAS) is the portal through which nearly all information enters the brain. (Smells are the exception; they go directly into your brain’s emotional area.) The RAS filters the incoming information and affects what you pay attention to, how aroused you are, and what is not going to get access to all three pounds of your brain.

Three types – maximal filters – very closed to stimulus – THREE, SEVEN, EIGHT
Three types – minimal filters – very open to stimulus – FOUR, FIVE, NINE
Three types – moderate filters – average receptivity to stimulus – ONE, TWO, SIX

**Three Centers of Intelligence** (See - The Enneagram and Prayer pg 24-35)
Three ways of functioning and processing the world
- Gut Center (Body Center – Instinctive Center)
  EIGHT – NINE – ONE
  Undercurrent of anger
- Heart Center (Emotional Center - Feeling Center)
  TWO – THREE – FOUR
  Undercurrent of shame
• Head Center (Thinking Center – Cognitive Center)
  FIVE – SIX – SEVEN
  Undercurrent of fear

Someone read aloud from the Enneagram and Prayer about the three cities Pgs 24 – 35
Participants draw a representation and/or write down key words for each city. After each reading they share with a partner what they drew/wrote and why
After the third city share with a partner
  1. In which city would you feel most comfortable?
  2. What appeals to you about that city?
  3. How does that city describe you?

Small Group
  1. Which is your center?
  2. Which tendencies are true for you?
  3. How does this affect your daily functioning?
  4. Give one example.

CIQ
Session #5
Types EIGHT and NINE
9:20 – 11:45 AM

Overview
9:20  Practicing Presence
9:25  CIQ discussion
9:40  Gut Center Review
9:45  Type EIGHT
10:25  Break (10min)
10:35  Type NINE
11:15  Personal Prayer practice

Practicing Presence

CIQ Discussion

Gut Center Review
Tell me something about the Gut/Instinctive Center (everyone write what they remember on whiteboards)

(As each type is presented, put wall cards for that type under the chairs – the person in that chair puts the card on the wall near the type number as that trait is mentioned)

Type EIGHT
Title - Challenger

Type Story
Facet of the Image of God
  Strength
Essential qualities
  Strength
  Vibrancy
  Confidence
Description
  Real, alive, immediate
  Confident
  Easy to love
  Calls forth what others are capable of
  Decide from the gut and then go forward and take others with them
  Inspiring leader
  Big hearted protector – especially of the weak
  When an eight comes in the room – you feel it before they even enter
Primal catastrophe
  Somewhere along the line, they were hurt and unable to protect themselves
  Become terrified of their vulnerability
Basic Fears
  Submitting to others
  Being harmed - “I might get hurt.”
  Not feeling own life -“I can’t feel my own life.’
Core Suffering
  Lose of aliveness
Heart Wound
  Dying heart – my heart light is going out
Unconscious childhood messages
  It’s not okay to be vulnerable
Ego scheme
  Make sure they always have the power,
  Make sure they are never vulnerable
Basic Desires
  To be self-reliant
  To protect themselves – survive on their own terms
  To feel alive
Life Script
  Search for impact and drive for immortality – “nothing can kill me – I am
  untouchable – my will is stronger than your bullet”

Levels
Average
Description
  Dominating
  False sense of strength and aliveness
  People are drawn to them
  Comfortable with power – they like it
  Always sound like they know what’s going on
  Push themselves to the top
  Highly competitive
  Willing to make tough decisions
  Protect the weak
  Can intimidate people
  Great sense of humor
  Confrontational – like conflict
  Not naturally tender or gentle
  Might reject you in advance to prevent being you rejecting them
  Don’t back down – “Make my day”
Barrier
  Lust (for intensity/excessiveness/power) - the desire to utterly possess and control
  another
Fixation
  Objectification – the world is stuff/things/matter
  Even people become objects that may be in the way or need to be manipulated
  Also begin to treat themselves as objects
Defense Mechanisms

Denial

Every five minutes

“Before Enneagram training what I did every five minutes was to analyze the power dynamics around me—‘Who is in control? Am I safe? What would I do to take control if that becomes necessary?’ I still do this to some extent, but now I would say that I am much more often asking the question, ‘Am I using too much force for this situation?’ (The red flag issue for an Eight.) The answer is usually ‘Yes,’ but it is helping me to at least be aware of the dynamic. Several of my relationships have improved when I made this personal insight (that I tend to use too much force as a habit or coping mechanism) overt to my spouse or friends. This allows them both to call me on this dynamic and to empathize (sometimes) rather than being immediately defensive.”

The story they tell themselves

I must make sure that I have the power in the group, so that I can take control of things and not be hurt

*Wake-up Call – Lets us know we are slipping from free levels to average levels
Thinking you must push and struggle to make things happen.

*Red Flag Fear – Lets us know we are slipping from average levels into constricted levels
Others are turning against you and will retaliate.

Unhealthy

Description

Physical fights
Contempt for weakness
Use their power to disempower
Have the aura of—“I could explode at any moment”
Ruthless and abusive
Think they are outside the law
Rage
Drinking leads to murder
No conscience
Deeply psychotic -
Mass destruction – “If I’m gonna go – everything’s goin with me”

*Hints - To move in a healthy direction
Allow yourself to become vulnerable
Allow yourself to surrender to the moment
Let go of the conviction that you must always be in control of your environment
Sit with the basic fear of being harmed

Healthy

Description

Self-reliant
Strong
Action oriented
Resourceful
Leaders
Bring out others strengths
Strategic and decisive
Self-confident

Virtue
Innocence – radical openheartedness born from wisdom

Healthiest possible
Vivid and vibrant
Natural expansiveness
Fully alive
Self-surrendering – Heroic

Eight Energy in Leadership
They will assume leadership
See compromise as weakness
Respect honors leadership.
Likes a worthy opponent
Concerned with justice and protection
Anger is direct and then doesn’t hold grudges
No hidden agenda
Enforces or ignores rules according to their own purposes
Demands to be fully informed

Suggestions from people with eight energy
- Give us places to use our power for good; we can be great advocates for the underprivileged or oppressed.
- Sometimes we just need to vent some of our thoughts and emotion, but don’t want a response.
- Help us identify when we might be using too much power, often without realizing it.
- Encourage us to get in touch with our tenderness – living into our 2 energy will help us be healthier.

Famous Type Eight People
The Incredible Hulk
John Wayne
Sean Connery
MLK Jr
Leaders of many countries

Panel
Panel questions
1. What makes you think this is your type?
2. What’s difficult about being this type?
3. What can you tell us to help us know how to relate to you, especially when you seem a little intimidating?
4. What do you wish we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
5. What is great about being this type?
Ask the onlookers – What was it like for you to experience EIGHT energy in this way?

Type song
   I’ll Stand by You

Break

Type NINE
Title - Peacemaker

Type Story
Facet of the Image of God –
   Peace (Shalom) Hear O Isreal, the Lord is your God. The Lord in one
Essential Qualities
   Wholeness
   Unity
   Well-being
   Peace (SHALOM)
Description
   They create a huge welcome mat to others, accepting each person as they are.
   They are vastly peaceful.
   Type Nines come into the world believing that God and the world are kind and
   that they are completely connected to God and the world.
Primal catastrophe
   Find out that the world is not entirely kind
Basic Fear
   Being disconnected and fragmented and unsettled
Core suffering
   Because of the fragmentation and disconnection– they feel like they just want to
go to sleep from the grief
Heart wound
   Shattered heart – not being unified with everyone and everything
Unconscious childhood messages
   “It’s not okay to assert yourself.”
Ego strategies
   Re-create the peace they feel they have lost
   Trying to get back to peace and wholeness
   Wish they could return to the womb – everything was so peaceful there
Basic Desire
   To be at peace / maintain internal (and external) stability
Life Script
   Search for harmony

Levels
Average
Description
Avoid confrontation at all cost
Easy going – go with the flow
Under lying current of anger – which gets expressed in passive aggressive behaviors
Don’t get in trouble for what they do, but rather what they DON’T do
Try to be invisible so they don’t accidently express aggression
Don’t like up-front stuff
Being assertive = being aggressive – same thing to them
Seem passive – what is actually happening is they don’t show up for their own lives
They are working hard to keep things in balance
Can’t afford to be drawn into external drama – too unsettling
Can’t afford to be in conflict in their relationships
“Don’t engage me.”
Can stay physically present while totally disengaging emotionally in a conversation if conflict is raised
“You WILL NOT affect me.”
Tamp down their emotions and energy
Can’t afford to feel because it will disrupt their delicately balanced inner peace
Must dissociate from anger because it feels like it will destroy everything
They remember their childhood as lovely and caring no matter what it was really like.
Turtle mode
Don’t notice their bodies
Don’t want highs OR lows
Auto pilot
Barrier
Sloth – disengagement (Sloth in this case is not laziness – rather it is that ALMOST all the Type NINEs energy is going into keeping the peace both externally and internally.)
This person is asleep to their own self.
Lose themselves in busy work
Go through the motions without being present
Fixation
Ruminating
Defense Mechanisms
Numbing
Every five minutes
“Smoothing problems over for the sake of peace”
“I ask myself – ‘What can I do or where can I go to be connected to people?’”
“Wonder almost every 5 minutes (if I’m around people) if I did or said something wrong.”
The story they tell themselves
“I am only good and lovable if I’m not angry.”
“If I live my own life others won’t love me and I’ll lose them.”
“I need to have positive regard for everyone in my life.”
“I just want everyone to get along and I can make it happen by erasing myself.”

*Wake-up Call*

Saying “yes” when you mean “no.”

*Red Flag Fear*

You will be forced by reality to deal with your problems

**Unhealthy**

Description

- Massively repressed
- Pretty non-functional
- Door mat – attach to an abuser
- Dissociated – multiple personality disorder
- Zombie
- Disempowered
- Catatonic

*Hints - To move in a healthy direction*

- A pathway to more wholeness is to acknowledge the anger.
- Must move toward the anger, recognize it and sit with it
- Must let go of the conviction that your participation in the world is not important
- Make it a policy not to answer right away – Take time to know what you really mean

**Healthy**

Description

- Solid and stable
- Connected to creation/the natural world
- Love being in nature
- Gentle, peaceful, balanced and humble
- Feel like you are coming into a gentle place where you won’t be judged or criticized
- Naturally non-judgmental
- Good listeners
- Authentic – love being with you
- Create space of people to show up as they are
- Have an energy that calms
- Automatic ability to identify with every point of view and see the truth and validity in it
- They intuit disunity in others and have the ability to heal it
- These are the people who can negotiate peace in world situations
- Value connections with family and friends and stay in those relationships for the long term
- Not big personalities
- Tend to fade into the background
- Often see themselves as less important than other people
- Their bottom line is to maintain peace

Virtue
Engagement – capacity to be with (present)
Healthiest possible
I once heard Richard Rohr say that if the world was perfect, everyone would be type nine.
  Vibrant, alive, serene
  True connectedness but still distinct
  Forgiveness of self

Nine Energy in Leadership
  Relaxes in absence of friction
  Wants to have good feelings on the job
  Flourishes in conditions of positive support
  Avoids self-promotion
  Can go into auto-pilot at high speeds and accomplish a great deal
  Energized by productive routine and other people’s enthusiasm for projects
  Avoids risks that raise hopes, for fear of disappointment
  Stubborn about taking directions from others
  Express anger on the job covertly – ignore problem, blame the structure
  Conflict is very difficult – ambivalence and stubborn non-communication
  Non-action strategy which is infuriating to others

Suggestions from Nines
  • We can forget about our voices and doubt whether or not people want to hear them. We need to feel our opinions are wanted and will be respected before we feel comfortable enough to speak up. That might take a bit more energy from others to be intentional about asking us what we have to say and noticing when we’re not present in a conversation. Being noticed helps us remember that we have value.
  • Conflict can feel hard and scary for us. Encourage us to navigate it anyway, and give us a safe space to do so.
  • Encourage us to make decisions. It is especially difficult for us to make decisions that might affect others, as we want to keep peace and harmony.
  • If we finally express anger (we strongly dislike it), please hold it carefully with respect and affirmation.
  • Encourage us to produce something meaningful—living into our 3 energy will help us be healthier.

Famous Type Nine People
  Mr. Rogers – brought peace and stability into millions of children’s lives
  Norman Rockwell – sentimentalized view of America – everyone is kind and good hearted
  Monet
  Abraham Lincoln
  Garrison Keillor

Panel
Panel questions
  1. What makes you think this is your type?
2. What’s difficult about being this type?
3. How does Turtle mode work for you? How can we reach you when you start to withdraw?
4. What do you we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
5. What is great about being this type?

Ask the onlookers – What was it like for you to experience the NINE energy in this way?

Type song
  It’s a Wonderful World

**Personal Reflection**
Choose a prayer practice from your suggestion list.
Do the practice.
What was it like for you to do that practice?
Session #6
Types ONE and TWO
3:30 – 5:45 PM

Overview
3:30  Practicing Presence
3:35  Type ONE
4:15  Small Group from Session #5
4:45  Break
4:55  Heart Center Review
5:00  Type TWO

Practicing Presence

Type ONE
Title - Reformer

Type Story
Facet of the Image of God
  Goodness
Essential qualities
  Goodness
  Sacredness
  Integrity
  Tov
Description
  They feel the good in you and sense it in themselves
  Naturally aligned with truth
  Their principles are organic and natural
  Reality is a sacred temple
  Can see beyond personal gain to the greater good
Primal catastrophe
  The world is not only good. There is evil in the world and things are not as they should be.
Basic Fear
  Fear of being bad, corrupt, un-redeemable
Core Suffering
  Choked heart
  Loss of a sense of goodness
  No hope
Unconscious childhood messages
  “It’s not okay to make mistakes.”
Ego schemes
  Don’t make any mistakes
  Strive to be pleasing to God
  Be perfect
Basic Desire
   Align with the good
   Have integrity

Life Script
   “I must find my way back into the garden.”
   “I must re-establish perfection.”

Levels

Average
Description
   Keep you at bay with judgements and well-reasoned opinions
   Critical
   Perfectionistic
   Resist inner feelings
   Afraid of anger – if it gets out it might make them do something bad
   Control anger by being tense
   “I’m right. I know better than you.”
   Transmit judgment without even saying anything
   Ruthless inner critic
   Thin skinned
   Ooze disappointment
   Give LOTS of advice
   Create their own rules and structures – not swayed by outside authority

Barriers
   Resentment – “I’m trying SO hard and everyone else is at the beach.”
   “Others aren’t trying hard enough.”

Fixations
   Judging
   Ruminating

The story they tell themselves
   “I am obligated to fix the world”

Defense Mechanism
   Control of reactions

Every five minutes
   Judging someone/something or
   Feeling resentful
   Judging myself
   Check to be sure I'm doing the 'right' thing.

*Wake-up Call
   Judging and condemning yourself and others
   Feeling a sense of personal obligation to fix everything

*Red Flag Fear
   Your ideals are actually wrong and counterproductive

Unhealthy
Description
Start doing what they’ve been preaching against
Self-righteous
Inflexible
OCD
Anorexia
Guilt ridden
Self-punishment
Self-hatred
Sadistic
Self-mutilation
Suicide

*Hints - To move in a healthy direction
- Go to nature as a balm for sadness and frustration
- Sit with the fear of being bad
- Let go of self-image
- Let go of the belief that you can judge
- Accept that you don’t know what is SUPPOSED to happen

Healthy

Description
- Moral courage
- Remembrance of the Imago Dei
- Recognize spiritual dimension in all things
- Realize they are born for a purpose
- Eternal compass in the gut
- Automatically know the right action
- Delicate kindness

Virtue
- Serenity

Healthiest possible
- Accepting
- Wise

One Energy in Leadership
- Like- specific guidelines, schedules, accountability, practicality, ethical behavior from all
- Don’t like - loopholes, mistakes, irresponsibility, taking blame, risks, abstractions, delegating (might not get done right) being wrong
- Takes pleasure in a job well done
- Keep score
- Prone to arguments about who’s right
- Guiding notion – quality control
- Key question – “Who is responsible?”

Suggestions from Ones
- As people with tough inner critics, we are already hard on ourselves. While we do need to hear feedback so we can learn, please give us negative feedback with an extra dose of gentleness and grace.
• Remind us our worth is not in what we do, or how well we do it. We need to hear we are valued even if we make mistakes.
• Give us safe space to have emotions, because it is often scary for us to show them and we are embarrassed when we do.
• Encourage us to take time for fun – living into our 7 energy will help us be healthier.

Famous One Energy People
Ghandi
Plato
Nelson Mandela
Ralph Nader
Joan of Arc
John Calvin

Panel
Panel questions
1. What makes you think this is your type?
2. What’s difficult about being this type?
3. How do you experience the inner critic?
4. What do you we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
5. What is great about being this type?

Ask the onlookers – What was it like for you to experience the ONE energy in this way?

Type song
Impossible Dream

Small group discussion (labeled session 5 on the small group/reflection sheet)
1. Share as you are willing about the experience with the prayer practice you chose.
2. What do you sense God is speaking to you thus far in the retreat?

Break

Heart Center Review
Tell me about the heart center (everyone write what they remember on white boards)

Type TWO
Title - Helper

Type Story
Facet of the Image of God
Love
Essential qualities
Kindness
Compassion
Affection
(AHAVA)
Description
Enter your heart and touch it with kindness
Attuned to the heart of others
Love is a state of being for them
People are their oxygen

Primal catastrophe
Find out the world is not just a pool of love

Basic Fear
Being unloved
Being unlovable
There is no love

Core Suffering
I’m not lovable
Heart wound
Cut off heart – cut off from the whole of love in the universe – all the hearts are together and mine is left out

Unconscious childhood messages
“It’s not okay to have your own needs.”

Ego scheme
Find a way to insure that love will come to them
Get busy recreating love by being helpful, supportive and caring

Basic desire
To be loved

Life Script
Search for closeness
Do the things that bring acceptance
“I must help everybody so that they love me.”
“I do whatever it takes to get people to love me.”

Western Christianity plays heavily into the strategies of the two (selflessness, giving, denial of self).

Levels
Average
Description
They have a genuine impulse to help
All their energy goes out to other people
It must be reflected back to them – that’s the only way they know their strategies are working
Always checking – “Are we OK?”
Want people to like them and affirm that they are lovable
But they can’t call attention to their own deeds because that is NOT acceptable
They can’t appear selfish
Just hope if they take care of their peeps, their peeps will reflect it back to them
Magnetic tractor beam toward other people’s needs – can’t help but go there.
Need others to shore up what they want your opinion of them to be
Want to be indispensable – especially to certain persons
Want to be everyone’s BFF
Create dependencies
Most unaware type and very prone to self-deceit - when they are at level 5 – they think they are at level 2

Barrier
Pride – You are the one who has needs and they are going to help you with them
But they don’t have any needs – They’re the giver/helper

Fixation
Ingratiation – trying to get people to accept them by doing things for them

Defense Mechanism
Repression of needs

Every five minutes
“Thinking about what someone owes me”
“Checking if the relationships I have are still OK”
“Think about if I can do something to enhance that relationship.”
“Making sure I will be loved”

The story they tell themselves
“I need to keep helping people and meeting their needs in order to get the acceptance and love I crave.”

*Wake-up Call
Find yourself trying to elicit responses

*Red Flag Fear
That you are driving friends and loved ones away

Unhealthy
Description
Creating reasons for people to stay by instilling self-doubt in them (“You can’t do anything without me”)
Martyr – use guilt messages
Can’t see the damage they’re doing
Crimes of passion
Stalking
Get love from ANYWHERE – sex workers
Predators
Demanding repayment for all they’ve done
Parasitic
Bitter and enraged
Murder/suicide
Movie – Fatal Attraction

*Hints - To move in a healthy direction
Pay attention to the wake up calls –
Feeling magnetically pulled into helping
Fear that your own needs will hurt your relationships with others
Feeling you are not appreciated
Ask yourself, “What do I need?”
Let go of the idea that there is anything you can do to earn love
Sit in the fear of being unlovable or that there is no love in the universe.

**Healthy**

**Description**
- Warm, loving and considerate
- Others blossom and bloom under the appreciation of a TWO
- Ability to see what is lovely in people and reflect it back to them
- Psychic ability to tune in to other people
- Realize it’s not them loving others – it comes THROUGH them
- Appropriately affectionate
- Nurturing

**Virtue**
- Humility – not diminishing oneself but letting the grace of God come and hold our frailty, messiness, wretchedness

**Healthiest possible**
- Joyous
- Free
- Sincere
- Compassionate
- Consoling

**Two energy in leadership**
- Takes own identity from authorities who can offer support
- Right hand person, IE: secretary who knows the secrets, power behind the throne
- Highly responsive to approval and encouragement
- Crushed by disapproval
- Keeps tabs on office interactions – information pipeline, party coordinator
- Associates with ‘worthwhile’ people
- Unrecognized inner conflict between wanting to be first and wanting to please
- Works for recognition and respect of important people in the field
- Fears opposing power alone
- Safety lies in pleasing authority
- May choose job because it has value to a loved one
- Gives favoritism to the defined ‘in-group’
- Image is crucial
- Become irritable and rejecting at implied disrespect
- Anger dissipates quickly – they forgive AND forget
- Happy twos are a workplace treasure
- Prime directive – attention from significant people

**Suggestions from Twos**
- We have a deep need to be appreciated and needed.
- Expressing gratitude and appreciation for our work (when appropriate) is especially important and life-giving to us. Hearing you say “Thank you! You are so helpful/supportive/caring/loving. How did you know I needed that?” is music to our ears.
- We may avoid bringing up our own needs and will often appear as if everything is just fine. Ask us direct questions about our lives and needs, to help us express ourselves. Here are some example questions:
• “What do you need to help you feel rested this week?”
  • “How did that conversation with your friend go the other day?”
  • “How did that specific situation make you feel?”

- We may take on projects without being honest about our own stress or pain. Give us clear expectations for when our work is especially essential or required, or when we have the option to say no.
- Remind us we have value in who we are, and not just in being needed by someone. This can be a very difficult concept for us to grasp.
- Encourage us to take time for creative activities—living into our 4 energy will help us be healthier.

Famous TWOs
  Desmond Tutu
  Fairy god mother
  Florence Nightingale
  Mother Theresa - maybe

Panel
Panel questions
  1. What makes you think this is your type?
  2. What’s difficult about being this type?
  3. How can we help you get in touch with and tend to your own needs?
  4. What do you wish we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
  5. What is great about being this type?

Ask the onlookers – What was it like for you to experience the TWO energy in this way?

Type song
  Bridge Over Troubled Waters
Session #7
Types THREE and FOUR
7:00 – 8:30 PM

Overview
7:00  Practicing Presence
7:05  Type THREE
7:45  Type FOUR
CIQ

Practicing Presence

Type THREE
Title - Achiever

Type Story
Facet of the Image of God
    Being
Essential qualities
    Existence
    Value
    (HYAH)
Description
    See themselves as being in the world for holy work
    Amazement at the very idea of existence
    Being and doing are not separate
    Success oriented, efficient type
    Practical and pragmatic
    Give their personal best
    Focused
    Disciplined
    Goal oriented
    Golden boys
    Shining examples/role models
    Find what they’re good at and go after it
    Have the feeling that they are going to do something spectacular
    CEOs, movie stars, Olympic athletes
Primal catastrophe
    A loss of the sense of preciousness and shine of being
    Leaves them feeling hollow – like the tin man
    They feel disconnected from their essence and the essence of life
Basic Fear
    Being worthless - “I am worthless.”
    Being deficient
Core Suffering
    Empty heart – “I am always promoting my shiny cover but my heart is empty.”
Fear of looking within because nothing is there
Unconscious childhood messages
  “It’s not okay to have your own feelings and identity.”
Ego scheme
  Do stuff that gives meaning and makes them valuable to others
  Notice that they have gifts – use those gifts to make them feel/seem valuable
Basic Desire
  To be valuable and have meaning
Life Script
  “I will do whatever I can to get positive affirmation.”

Levels
Average

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Performance machine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Image conscious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need to be the STAR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drive to be the best</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competitive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychic ability to know what people value and mirror that – quickly size up values and then mirror them – shape shifter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need validation and attention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They buy into the image they have created for themselves.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disconnected from real self, heart, true desires</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Displacement of feelings for fear it will interfere with their achievements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t realize they are unhealthy until everything crumbles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Think they can do whatever they want. The rules don’t apply to them</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Barriers
  Vanity – believing one is the source of one’s own glory
  Narcissism
Fixation
  Deceit – Deceiving themselves and others

Defense Mechanisms
  Charisma

Every Five Minutes
  “Every 5 min or shorter, I look for things to do; new task, old task, any that can make me feel comfortable. I like the feeling that things get done. My mind keeps searching for what else I can accomplish. What's still on the list? Even last minute before bed, I kind of try to complete as much task as possible. When there is a gap of time between one work and another, I calculate what can be done during this gap.”
  “I think – ‘What should I be doing?’”
The story they tell themselves
  “I am more important than others.”
  “I am the persona I have created.”

*Wake-up Call
Beginning to drive yourself for status and attention

*Red Flag Fear*

That you are failing and your claims are empty and fake.

We have been formed in a THREE culture and American Christianity doesn’t do a very good job of separating this. Achieving/producing are supreme values in American culture and Christianity.

**Unhealthy**

Description

- Make other people feel like nothing
- Self-promoting narcissist
- Icy heart
- Dangerous
- No remorse
- Do anything to preserve the illusion
- Pathological liars
- Hostile
- Truth = whatever they want it to be
- Like a cornered animal
- Murder and suicide
- Psychopath

:*Hints*

To move in a healthy direction

- Let go of the belief that your value comes through your accomplishments
- Sit with the fear of being deficient

**Healthy**

Description

- Absolutely adaptable
- Help other live into their gifts
- Gracious
- Responsive
- Strong self esteem
- Poised
- Radiant
- Like being themselves
- Emotionally honest
- Hard working
- Motivate others

Virtue

- Authenticity

Healthiest possible

- Transcend the need to be approved
- Know what they really want to be and do

**Three Energy in Leadership**

Assume their own abilities
Instant expert
Confuses true self with work role – “I am what I do.”
Priority is efficiency
Feels rage when tasks are interrupted
Values product over process
Being respected for ability is more important than being liked
Machinelike achiever and expects others to work in the same way
Projects a high profile image
Sets power and competes for leadership
Sets clear goals
Wants reward for effort
Avoids failure
Blames others if failure occurs
Intolerant of criticism

Suggestions from Threes
- Because we strongly identify with what we do, criticism can feel very personal. While we need to hear constructive feedback, please give it with kindness and grace. – couch criticism in acknowledgement of what I have done well – speak criticism clearly and briefly – I will get it right away
- Remind us we have value despite what we achieve.
- Affirm me even when I disagree – reassure me that it won’t hurt our relationship
- Don’t reject me if I push back
- When I fail – affirm the effort I put in
- Let me see YOUR weaknesses – then I am more comfortable admitting mine
- Encourage me to try things even if I’m not certain of success
- Say – I believe you can do this but if it doesn’t work out it will be OK
- Affirm me for who I am and not just what I do
- If I’m quiet, ask me what my opinion is (I will tell you my opinion automatically if I agree with you
- Help us discover who we are, and not just who we think others want us to be.
- Encourage us to maintain a healthy balance between work and other areas of life.
- Ask us to think about our own feelings, needs and desires sometimes. We will too quickly focus only on what others want from us.
- Encourage us to take time for real friendships – living into our 6 energy will help us be healthier.

Famous THREEs
Oprah
American Idol
Corporate America
Madonna
Michael Jordan
Tom Cruise
Elvis
Panel
Panel questions
6. What makes you think this is your type?
7. What’s difficult about being this type?
8. How do you notice the chameleon tendency in your life?
9. What do you wish we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
10. What is great about being this type?

Type specific question
How do you notice the chameleon tendency in your life?

Ask the onlookers – What was it like for you to experience the THREE energy in this way?

Type song
Hero – Mariah Carey

**Type FOUR**
Title - Individualist

**Type Story**
Facet of the Image of God
Beauty
Essential qualities
Radiance
Delight

Description
Experience reality as significance and beauty
See beauty everywhere
Look for meaning and mystery in everything
Introspective
Strong longings
Unique and beautiful perspectives

Primal catastrophe
Lose touch with that

Basic Fear
Being without identity “I am nobody”

Core Suffering
Can’t feel myself
Can’t find my identity

Heart wound
Torn and lacerated heart

Unconscious childhood messages
“It’s not okay to be too functional or too happy.”

Ego strategies
Create identity around emotionality
Make sure they always have feelings – the stronger the better
Take action to be unique
Create their own beauty

**Basic Desire**
To be oneself – to find one’s true self and personal significance

**Life Script**
Search for identity
Being unique

**Levels**

**Average**

**Description**
- Addicted to emotional thermostat
- Always feel they are on the outside – pride themselves on this AND suffer from it
- Personal story based on loses and suffering
- Feel like they got in the wrong family – “I don’t fit and can’t relate.”
- Misunderstood
- Strong sadness
- Plug into trauma, abuse and victimization and don’t get over it
- Addicted to wounded-ness and suffering
- Carry suffering and shadows for the whole family
- Sacrifice themselves as evidence that bad things happen – bring tragedy to the table
- Withdraw to secret swamp of imagination – image themselves becoming something exceptional
- Self-absorbed
- Take their suffering and put it into art
- Vacillate between pride in uniqueness and shame of not being ordinary

**Barriers**

- Envy – “You got the instructions and I didn’t. So I hate you (unless you fail – then I love you).”

**Fixation**

- Fantasizing – creating a story about my suffering – keeps my emotions strong

**Defense Mechanisms**

- Artistic Sublimation
- Every five minutes
- “Assessing my emotional state and/or looking for the ways in which I’m screwed up.”
- “Comparing myself to others and seeing what I don’t have.”
- The story they tell themselves
- “There is something that everyone got but I didn’t get it. I am always misperceived and mistreated. Someday I will be something great and that will be my redemption.”

*Wake-up Call*

- Holding on to and intensifying feeling through the imagination
- You find the person who is going to make it all better and you’re still not cured.

*Red Flag Fear*
That you are ruining your life and wasting your opportunities

**Unhealthy**
Description
- Self-indulgent
- Cut off from creativity
- Alienated
- Depressed
- Fascinated by living dead (IE Zombies)
- Tormented
- Hate themselves
- Cutting – to block emotional pain
- Trapped in pain
- Obsessed with death
- Plan suicide in unique ways
- Crimes of passion

*:Hints* - To move in a healthy direction
Create structures to help take action – it gets in the way of fantasy.
Let go of your stories – (difficult because it feels untrue to yourself) – “I am not my story.”
Let go of the belief that you are more inherently flawed than others.
Let go of the conviction that you are missing something that others have.
Sit with the fear of insignificance.

**Healthy**
Description
- Vast container filled with stillness that holds joy, anger and everything else
- Unperturbed in the midst of emotion
- Endless depth to beauty
- Unique radiance and see yours too
- Grounded
- Moment breathes in and out of them
- Intuitive
- Sensitive
- Gentle
- Want connection
- Can stay with you in your pain
- Creativity is a gift to the world
- Eloquent

**Virtue**
- Equanimity – Being able to feel every human emotion and be OK with it – composure

**Healthiest possible**
- Liberated
- Redemptive
- Compassionate
Four Energy in Leadership

Want distinctive work that calls for creativity
Must feel respected
Attention gets displaced from tasks when emotional life takes over
Likes connection to special authority persons who stand for quality
Feels called to emotionally intense lines of work (grief counselor, suicide hotline, etc)
Aggressive and cutting toward competitors
Will not flourish in work environment that requires close cooperation with others who are more skilled, more valued, or better paid.

Suggestions from Fours

- We have a strong desire to be loved and accepted for who we are. Encourage us to be ourselves. Remind us we are not more flawed than others, and we have significance.
- It can be hard to open up about ourselves because others don’t understand us. Help create a safe environment for us to be more open and vulnerable.
- Our emotions can be very intense. Give us space to feel them.
- Encourage us to use our artistic and creative gifts in the church.
- Encourage us to pursue our justice passions – living into our 1 energy will help us be healthier.

Famous FOURs

Bob Dylan
Johnny Depp
The artist formerly known as Prince
Paris, France
Edgar Allen Poe

Panel

Panel questions
1. What makes you think this is your type?
2. What’s difficult about being this type?
3. What is the experience of envy like for you?
4. What do you we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
5. What is great about being this type?

Ask the onlookers – What was it like for you to experience the FOUR energy in this way?

Type song

Both Sides Now

CIQ
Session #8
Types FIVE and SIX
9:20 – 11:45 AM

Overview
9:20 Practicing Presence
9:25 CIQ discussion
9:40 Head Center Review
9:45 Type FIVE
10:25 Break
10:35 Type SIX
11:15 Small group from Session #7

Practicing Presence

CIQ discussion

Head Center Review
What do you remember about the Head Center? (write on white boards)

Type FIVE
Title - Investigator

Type Story
Facet of the Image of God
  Truth
Essential qualities
  Illumination of what actually is
  Clarity
  Consciousness
Description
  Fives push the light as far as possible into the universe
  They probe, explore, ponder
  Want to know how things work
Primal catastrophe
  Find out something they thought was real may not be.
Basic Fear
  Having no ability to know what’s real and true (being lost in ignorance and senselessness)
Core suffering
  Terror of inability to know what’s real and what isn’t
  Makes them feel like they are crazy
Heart wound
  Dry heart - Feel parched
Unconscious childhood messages
  “It’s not okay to be comfortable in the world.”
Ego scheme
Do anything to find out what’s true
Get LOTs of information

Basic Desire
To be competent

Life Script
To understand reality and uncover the essence of things

Levels
Average

Description
Withdraw into head
Less contact with others and outside world
Encyclopedia
Feels risky to show up in the world
Non-conforming
Antagonistic about dumbness
Think they got accidentally dropped on the wrong planet – because everyone is so stupid here
OCD about process
Avoid coming to a conclusion because then it’s over
Inner fort – inner library
3000 miles from head to heart
Minimizing needs – eating, showering
Agitated – can’t sleep
Secretive and reclusive
Electrical lightning storm in the brain
Mistrust the world and themselves
“If I come out of my inner world, I’ll just mess it up anyway
Inappropriate social responses
Absent minded
Preoccupied with death
Existential angst
There is no meaning to life
Switch from testing in the world to entirely in their head
Addicted to the intensity in the brain
Anxious and terrified makes them feel safe because its familiar and lets them know they are real

Barrier
Avarice (with-holding of self)

Fixation
Retention – trying to hang on to all their knowledge – Fact saving pressure

Defense Mechanism
Withdrawal

Every five minutes
“People are stupid.”
The story they tell themselves
“'I am good if I have things figured out.’”
“'I can‘t live in a world without knowing what’s real.’”

*Wake-up Call*
Notice yourself withdrawing into your mind

*Red Flag Fear*
You are never going to find a place in the world or with people

**Unhealthy**
**Description**
Cut off from connections
Nihilism – futility – what’s the point? What’s the use
Boredom
Nothingness
Isolation
Dark fantasies
Depression
Feel toxic – so they stay away from people they love
Feel Helpless
Schizophrenia
Paranoia – A Beautiful Mind movie
Chronic insomnia
Brain on fire with fear
Life is horrifying
Suicide (shoot themselves in the head)
Deranged
Dangerous

*Hints* - To move in a healthy direction
Re-inhabit your body
Make contact with others
Sit with the fears of not knowing what is real and of being useless
Let go of the idea that you am separate from the environment
Be in your own live

**Healthy**
**Description**
Amazingly perceptive observer
Able to see what others don’t see
Accessible
Objective – Just the facts M’am
Okay with disproving their own theories
See numbers
Fine-tuned attention
Matter of fact about death
Tell it like it is
Non sentimental but tenderhearted
Curious
Visionaries with depth
Able to be alone
(aloneness = being present to self  -  loneliness = absence of the other)
Wisdom ahead of their time
Whimsical humor - the far side – absurdist view of life – a little twisted
See elegance and beauty in patterns and symmetry of the universe
Cultivate inner simplicity
Receptive to what others know
Create a niche and master something – take their gifts on the road
“What if we try it this way?”

Virtue
Non-attachment
Healthiest possible
Competent and capable
Pioneering visionary
Illumination
Clarity
Cherish every moment
Life is sacred
Faith filled
Cosmic optimism
Love and compassion for human condition
Smoldering flame behind the eyes

Famous FIVEs
The Joker (and other take -over -the -world villians0
Stephen Hawking
Thomas Aquinas
Rene Descartes
Vincent Van Gogh
Alfred Hitchcock

Five Energy in Leadership
Don’t expect them to speak a lot of affirmation when you do well
Don’t assume that means I don’t appreciate you
Get other’s to give you affirmation if you need that or look for another job with
no hard feelings on the part of the five OR ask for the input you need with direct
questions about your performance.
Expect a lot of critique and constant tweaking
Feeling of limited energy reserves – doesn’t want it used for other people’s
agendas
Needs predictability
Wants to foresee in order to be prepared
Hard to concentrate in the presence of others
Freezes when unexpectedly questioned
Strictly avoids conflict
Values unemotional decision making
Extremely productive when in a decision-making role that is protected from frontline interactions
Lead from behind closed doors

Suggestions from Fives
- We are sometimes more afraid of not knowing something than of failure.
- We might be living a disembodied existence inside our heads and think that something went really well, when it clearly didn't. We may need help understanding the feelings of a situation more clearly.
- Critical feedback is what we welcome more than vain encouragement or sensitivity to our feelings - but we might need help remembering that other people might need things the other way around.
- If we are unsure what to do, we may sit back and observe first, and wait to see what others are doing. In those times, encourage us to come out of our shell and participate anyway.
- Realize that what we experience as putting ourselves out there often comes off as very reserved.
- Encourage us to advocate for those who are oppressed – living into our 8 energy will help us be healthier.

Panel
Panel questions
11. What makes you think this is your type?
12. What’s difficult about being this type?
13. What can we do when you start to withdraw into your head?
14. What do you we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
15. What is great about being this type?

Ask the onlookers – What was it like for you to experience the FIVE energy in this way?

Type song

**Type SIX**
Title - Loyalist

**Type Story**
Facet of the Image of God
Faithfulness
Essential qualities
Awake-ness
Openness
Expansiveness
Description
The fully conscious human
Able to put themselves in the skin of another
Intuitive guidance system
Feel safe
Living faith
Primal catastrophe
Lose touch with my internal guidance. Terrified of being lost and disoriented
Basic Fear
Being without guidance/support “I don’t know what to do”
Core Suffering
Abandoned and forsaken
Heart Wound
Panic stricken heart
Unconscious childhood messages
It’s not okay to trust yourself
Ego scheme
Find guidance from outside myself
Follow authorities, obey rules and laws
Find ways to feel anchored
Be super vigilant
Basic Desire
To be secure
Trustworthy orientation
Life Script
Find solid ground
Providential
Levels
Average
Description
Notice everything that can go wrong
Know that groups are stronger than individuals – team player
Know how to create synergy
Loyal to family and tribe - suspicious of ‘outsiders’
Resistant to change
Similar to ONE is sense of responsibility
Hard to type and hard to self-type
Anxious
Constant question of “Is it safe?”
Hyper alert
Always think more voices = better
Project negative motivations onto others
Engaging endearing quality – puppy dog sweetness
Always second guessing
Looking for a GPS system for all of life
Barrier
Fear
Fixation
Worry and doubt
Defense Mechanisms

Projection

Every five minutes

Every few minutes I worry about relationships or the future. For the former: While 99% of the relationships I have with others are healthy and strong, there is that dreaded 1%. Unfortunately I feel that I spend 99% of my time thinking about that 1% ;) Psychoanalyzing what went wrong, what my part in it was, what their part, etc. Or I stress about how I come across to other people. For example, during the Enneagram course I did not go out of my way to network or connect with many of you. Not to get into it deeply but my Mom had passed away a few months prior and the grief that kept cycling through me didn't leave me with much energy to socialize beyond a few conversations with folks here and there. Yet the entire week I felt embarrassed and bad about how I was coming across to others. For the latter: I think about what my next job will look like, will I be able to find something I truly am passionate about, where I will live, where I should retire, will there be an earthquake, should we buy a house because what if there is an earthquake etc.

The story they tell themselves

“I can’t trust myself to know what to do, so I have to get lots of help from as many sources as possible. I didn’t get the proper equipment for becoming an adult” “I must be loyal to whatever. whoever supports me.”

*Wake-up Call

Becoming dependent on something outside yourself for guidance

Driven and paralyzed by anxiety

*Red Flag Fear

That your own actions have harmed your security

Unhealthy

Description

Rebel against authority

Ally with another group to help me – Cult, gang, neo-Nazis

Panicky

Paranoid

Hysterical

Ethnic Cleansing

Lone vigilante

Tormented and ugly

Our whole society is veering toward the unhealthy levels of SIX

:*Hints - To move in a healthy direction

Let go of addiction to worry

Let go of the conviction that I must rely on someone outside myself for support

Sit with the fear of being lost – let it burn through me

Be present to the anxiety
Healthy
Description
Engaging and faithful friend
A hammock of safety for others
Trustworthy and steadfast
High sense of self and purpose
Keep their word
Move forward decisively

Virtue
Courage

Healthiest possible
Anchor for others
Valiant hero
Quiet mind
Peaceful
Awake and clear

Type Six in Leadership
Strong analytical powers
Overvalue the power of authority
Need to prove themselves
Self-mastery
Sensitive to weak spots in any argument
Sense of endangerment arises with success – maybe can’t live up to it
Second guessing is constant
Doubt disappears when up against a real difficulty rather than imagined worst-case scenario
Cautionary
Antiauthoritarianism

Suggestions from Sixes
- Understand that we will probably bend over backwards to do everything you ask of us.
- Affirmation is important – we need to know if we met your expectations.
- Push us to trust ourselves, and encourage us to make our own decisions. One way to do this is to give us a project with support and loose guidelines, but not step-by-step instructions.
- Ask for our opinions and insights, because we might not quickly share them. However, we probably have some helpful thoughts to share.
- Encourage us to take time for meditation and centering – living into our 9 energy will help us be healthier.

Famous people with Six energy
Moses
CIA/FBI
Airport security
Military
Panel
Panel questions
1. What makes you think this is your type?
2. What’s difficult about being this type?
3. What kinds of things do you do to make sure you are safe and secure?
4. What do you wish we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
5. What is great about being this type?

Ask the onlookers – What was it like for you to experience the SIX energy in this way?

Type song

Small Groups
1. What was an AHA moment for you today?
2. What was difficult to hear/learn?

Check-In
How ya doin’?
Session #9
Type SEVEN
3:30 – 5:45 PM

Overview
3:30  Practicing Presence
3:35  Type SEVEN
4:15  Personal Reflection
4:45  Small Group Discussion
5:15  Large Group Follow Up

Practicing Presence

Type SEVEN
Title – Enthusiast

Type Story
Facet of the Image of God
Joy
Essential qualities
Joy
Freedom
Possibility
Description
Life is a garden of opportunity
Hope and possibility ooze from me
Meet experiences with expectation
Sparkly
Awesome gratitude for the simplest things
Fast learners
Can create excitement and fun
Primal catastrophe
Losing the sense of joy
Basic Fear
Being deprived or being trapped in pain
Core Suffering
Heart Wound
Starving heart – no matter how much I consume, I can’t get satisfied.
Unconscious childhood messages
It’s not okay to depend on anyone for anything
Ego scheme
Create my own joy and avoid pain at all cost
Keep everyone else happy too so they can’t bring me down
Basic Desire
To be happy
Life Script
In search of experience

Levels
Average
Description
Try to be everywhere in case that’s where the joy is (Spring break sign ups)
FOMO
Try everything
Fear of not being in the right place and will miss what is there – consequently not able to receive what is here
Accused of being superficial – but that is not true
HATE – boring
Driven by an inner restlessness
Fear of getting stuck in the pain (not just fear of pain)
Use people as entertainment
Exposure = expertise
Pre-bliss syndrome – just thinking about an adventure gets them enthused

Barrier
Gluttony – fear of not getting what I need

Fixation
Planning and anticipation of the next thing

Defense Mechanisms
Rationalization
Every five minutes
Anticipating something, new, interesting or worrisome... Not so much a thrill, but something to look forward to or something that needs to be done.
Thinking, “I wonder what’s going on. Maybe I’ll go check.”

The story they tell themselves
“If I don’t keep finding exciting things to do, I might have to experience pain and then I could get stuck in it and it would kill me

*Wake-up Call
Feeling that something better is available somewhere else – looking for greener pastures
Not enjoying what I have

*Red Flag Fear
Your activities are bringing you pain and unhappiness

Unhealthy
Description
Selfish
Insensitive
Run harder and faster
Can’t feel satisfaction
Can’t sit still (because if they do, they will be wrenched with sadness)
Life is like channel surfing
Do anything to feel something
Inner numbness
Addictions
Bipolar
Pathological destructiveness – the lucky ones end up in jail

*Hints - To move in a healthy direction
Learn to sit in sadness in order to actually be happy
Learn to be in the present moment instead of wishing for something else
Notice how you have caused other people pain

**Healthy**
Description
Everything thrills them – what is here brings joy now
Awake and living in a state of constant amazement
Infinite possibility
Delight in the creativity of God
The only prayer that makes sense is “THANK YOU”
Want what brings the greatest liberation and happiness to everyone
Ambassadors of hope
Spread light
Stay shiny their whole lives

**Virtue**
Sobriety – the quality of being staid or solemn. (Synonyms: seriousness, gravity, dignity, levelheadedness, common sense, pragmatism, practicality, self-control, self-restraint)

**Healthiest possible**
Happiness does not require certain things
See the universe as in infinite ecstatic expression and myself as part of that
Savor every moment
Content
Grateful

**Type Seven in Leadership**
Want to equalize authority
Insistent about impractical ideas
Don’t want to face routine
Gets around rules by broadening definitions
Inner sense of capability and high self-worth
Positive self-image can be punctured by negative feedback
Bend people’s minds to get support by reframing objections and puffing up possibilities

Suggestions sometimes sound like promises
Delightful to work with
Forgiving and creative during hard times
Ingenuity and invention
Hard to see their own mistakes
Not great on the nitty gritty of detail
Peer acceptance is what matters
Learn quickly

Suggestions from Sevens
- Even though we are very friendly, happy and outgoing, we need affirmation for our achievements and collaboration.
- We have a hard time saying no. Encourage us to establish healthy boundaries and balance between work and other areas of life.
- Help us process painful situations, because we will naturally avoid painful feelings. Encourage us to lean into the pain instead of running from it.
- Include us in the life and energy of the staff team.
- Encourage us to take time for learning and synthesizing – living into our 5 energy will help us be healthier

Famous SEVENs
- Mozart
- Robin Williams
- Jim Carrey
- Lucille Ball
- Elton John
America has SEVENish tendencies – “I want what I want and I want it now” – Shouldn’t ever feel down

Panel
Panel questions
1. What makes you think this is your type?
2. What’s difficult about being this type?
3. How do you go about drumming up excitement in your life?
4. What do you we understood about you? What do you need from the world?
5. What is great about being this type?

Ask – What was it like to experience SEVEN energy in this way?

Type song
59th St Bridge Song

Personal Reflection
Levels of Health – Where do you see yourself? (Handout)

Small Group Discussion
1. What, if anything, do you wish to share from your reflections on the levels of health? (This question is purely invitational. No one is required to share)
2. What are the implications of the Enneagram for ministry?

Large Group Follow up
Session #10
Creating Skits
7:00 – 8:30 PM

7:00  Practicing Presence
7:05  What do you still need to know?
7:30  Type group discussion
7:50  Create Skits
8:20  CIQ

Practicing Presence

What do you still need/want to know?

Type Group Discussion
   1. What have you learned about yourself?
   2. What might be the implications?

Create Type Skits
   Work in type groups.
   Show us what it looks like to be this type.
   Highlight the ego strategies and temptations at work.
   Use whatever materials and props you can find.

CIQs
Session #11
Wrap up
9:20 – 11:15

Overview

9:20  Practicing Presence
9:25  CIQ discussion
9:35  Answers to Remaining Questions
9:45  Moving Forward - Personal Journaling
10:05 Small Group:
10:50  Large Group Sharing

Practicing Presence

CIQ Discussion

Answers to remaining questions from Session #10

Relating to Each Other with this information

Personal Reflection on Moving Forward
Journal Answers to the following:
   How have I been formed by this retreat experience?
   What will I do with this information and experience, moving forward?
   What am I willing to commit to regarding my personal formation?
   What will be my strategies for keeping those commitments?
   How might those strategies involve this small group?

Post-Retreat Survey Monkey Reminder

Small Groups
As a group, fill out the retreat evaluation form and give it to Pam
   1. Share from your journaling during personal reflection time
   2. What are your commitments and strategies for moving forward?
   3. How would you like the group to help you?
   4. Prayer specifically for each person after they share.

Large Group Check in
What would you like to share with the whole group?

Move to Closing Worship
Appendix E
Pre and Post Retreat Surveys and Reflection Assignment

Pre-Retreat Survey

1. Name

2. In what kinds of experiences or practices have you been most aware of your connection to God (Father, Son and Holy Spirit)?

3. What does it mean to be connected to God?

4. How aware are you of the following?
   Scale of 1 – 10. 1 = “I am completely unaware” 10 = “I am completely aware”
   your body
   
   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

   your emotions
   
   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

   your acceptance of other people’s perspectives
   
   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

   how you think and act in order to make sure things are all right in your world
   
   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

   God’s presence
   
   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

5. How do you feel about:
   your body?
   your emotions?
   your thoughts?
   your actions?
   your connection with God?

6. Do you have any prior experience with the Enneagram? YES/NO
   a. If YES, what was your prior experience like?
   b. How do you feel about the prospect of studying the Enneagram?

7. What is prayer?
Post-Retreat Survey

1. Name

2. In what experiences this week, have you been most aware of your connection to God (Father, Son and Holy Spirit)?

3. What does it mean to be connected to God?

4. How much has your awareness of the following increased this week?
   Scale of 1 – 10. 1 = “My awareness has not increased at all.” 10 = “My awareness has increased as much as it would ever be possible for a person’s awareness to increase.”
   - your body
     1  2  3  4  5  6  7  8  9  10
   - your emotions
     1  2  3  4  5  6  7  8  9  10
   - your acceptance of other people’s perspectives
     1  2  3  4  5  6  7  8  9  10
   - how you think and act in order to make sure things are all right in your world
     1  2  3  4  5  6  7  8  9  10
   - God’s presence
     1  2  3  4  5  6  7  8  9  10

5. How have you experienced a change in how you feel about:
   - your body?
   - your emotions?
   - your thoughts?
   - your actions?
   - your connection with God?

6. How has learning the Enneagram been helpful to you?

7. What is prayer?

8. How do you imagine this retreat experience will impact your life and ministry?

9. What do you sense God is nudging you toward being and doing as a result of this retreat?
Enneagram Retreat Reflection Paper Assignment

Write a 500 - 750 word reflection utilizing the following questions:

- How did you experience God working in you via the retreat?
- What transformation do you sense God is nudging you towards as a result?
- What might be the implications for your ministry leadership?
- What is one way you plan to continue your learning and open yourself to transformation in the months ahead?
Appendix F
Focus Groups

E-mail sent to invite students to participate in Focus Groups

Dear Enneagram Retreat participants, As I told the formation class last year, I am enfolding the Formation Retreat Experience from last January into the research for my Doctor of Ministry project.

As part of the research, I would like to convene a couple of small groups to get feedback from some of you about if and how the retreat experience and your exposure to the Enneagram have impacted you in the months since the retreat.

Please let me know if you are interested in participating in one of these groups, which will last for about an hour or so. If you are not interested, no worries, but it would be helpful for me to know that as well.

If you are interested, which of these times would be a possibility for you? List all that could work
A Tuesday at 10:30 am
A Wednesday at 10:30 am
A Wednesday at 2:15 pm
A lunch time on Wed,
A lunch time on Thurs
A lunch time on Friday

Thanks much and blessings on your unfolding semester. Pam Bush

PAM BUSH
Associate Director of Student Care

ph 616.392.8555 x191
101 East 13th Street, Holland MI 49423-3622

Agenda for Focus Groups

Explain the Procedure
I want to thank you for coming today. As you know, you’ve been asked to be a part of this group because I am doing research on the impact the Junior Formation Retreat and you were all participants. In addition to the research purposes, I am also interested in how your experiences might inform providing the most effective and impactful retreat possible, for future students. Thank you so much for taking the time to share your experiences with me.
In a group interview like this it is really important that you feel free to express your feelings and ideas openly and honestly. There are no right or wrong answers, we just want to know what YOU are experiencing. You’re the experts, because you were the participants. As the moderator, the only thing that I try to do is keep us focused on the topic at hand and keep us moving along from question to question so that we can both cover the questions and finish on time. I am your moderator but I want you to have a conversation with each other, as well as with me. I am recording the session in order to ensure accuracy when I write my report.

Because I am recording, I may remind you occasionally to speak up or talk one at a time so that I can hear you clearly when I review the recordings. Your responses will not be linked with your name in the final reporting – so your responses are confidential. But for the sake of the transcriptionist let’s start with each of you sharing your first name and something you particularly remember from the retreat last winter. Then we will launch into the official questions. Someone start us out and then when they’re done, someone else just jump in. We don’t need to go in any type of order.

Ask the Research Questions

- How has the experience of the formation retreat impacted you personally?
  Your understanding of yourself
  Becoming a healthier person
  Becoming a more mature person
- How has the experience of the formation retreat impacted your relationships with others?
  Your personal relationships
  Your ministry engagement with people
  Becoming a healthier leader
- How has the experience of the formation retreat impacted your relationship with God?
  Your understanding and experience of prayer
  Being aware of God’s presence
  Being connected with God
• What do you sense God is nudging you toward being and doing as a result of this retreat experience?
• What suggestions do you have for making this experience more impactful for future students?

Offer thanks for their participation.
Appendix G
Informed Consent

Sample of E-mail Sent to Introduce Informed Consent

Potential focus group participants,

This is a friendly reminder that the focus group will meet next week. I have attached the consent form, so that you can read it before you make a final decision about whether to participate. If you choose to attend, I will have a hard copy available for your signature at the group. If you choose not to attend, which is a completely acceptable option, please notify me of that to help me with planning. If you have questions, do not hesitate to ask me about them.

We will meet Tuesday, Nov 3 in room 154 at 10:30 AM. I will provide snacks.

Thank you for your consideration, Pam Bush

PAM BUSH
Associate Director of Student Care

ph 616.392.8555 x191
101 East 13th Street, Holland MI 49423-3622
Informed Consent for Research

Formative Value of Contemplative Enneagram Retreat Research Project
Consent to Participation

You are invited to participate in a research study about the formative value of a contemplative Enneagram retreat for students at Western Theological Seminary. You were selected because you participated in the FR 101 Retreat for Christian Formation in January 2015. We ask that you read this form and ask any questions you may have before agreeing to be part of the study. This study is being conducted by me, Pam Bush as part of my doctor of ministry (D.Min.) project at Western Theological Seminary. My advisor is Dr. Kyle Small, Director of the Doctor of Ministry Program at Western Theological Seminary.

Purpose of the Study:
The purpose of this study is to explore the effectiveness of a contemplative Enneagram retreat in laying a foundation for seminary students to become better connected with God, themselves and others.

Procedures:
If you agree to be part of the study, I will be able to use the information you gave in conjunction with the retreat, as data for this study. That would include the pre and post retreat surveys and sharing and reflections from the retreat sessions, as well as the anonymous feedback in CIQs, and retreat evaluations, including those from February and March, 2015. You will also be invited to participate in a focus group in the fall or winter of 2015, which would revisit how your experience with the learning of the retreat is affecting your life and ministry, the information from which would be included in the study. Signing this consent form does not obligate you to attend a focus group.

Risks of Participation in the Study:
The research assistant for this study is Jenna Harms. I will remove your names from pre and post survey data before Jenna utilizes it. But since Jenna is your classmate and was a participant in the retreat, it may be possible for her to identify from whom some of the comments originated.

Benefits of Participation in the Study
Participating in this study will afford you an opportunity for further reflection on the Enneagram. You will have the opportunity to give input as to the formative potential of the Enneagram. Your participation will help to shape the formation process at WTS.

Confidentiality:
The records for this study will be kept confidential. None of the records will become part of any of Western Theological Seminary’s evaluative processes. If I publish any type of report, I will not include information that will identify you. Only my research assistant, Jenna Harms and I will work with the raw data, which will be eliminated at the conclusion of the project, by May, 2018. While I will make every effort to maintain
confidentiality, anonymity cannot be completely guaranteed due to the small number of participants.

**Voluntary Nature of the Study:**
Your agreement to participation in this study is voluntary and your decision about whether to participate will not affect your current or future relations with Western Theological Seminary. Likewise, at any point you can choose to withdraw from participation without negative repercussions.

**Contact Information**
The researcher initiating this study is Pam Bush. You may ask whatever questions you have about the research now or in the future. I can be reached via email at pam@westernsem.edu or via cell phone at 616-283-7755.

**Statement of Consent:**
I have read the above information and have received answers to any questions I asked. I consent to participate in the study. I consent to allow use of my direct quotes, anonymously, in the published thesis document.

Signature  _____________________________________________________

Printed name __________________________________________________

Date _________________________________________________________
Informed Consent for Focus Groups

Formative Impact of Contemplative Enneagram Retreat Research Project

Consent to Participation in Focus Group

You are invited to participate in a focus group as part of a research study on the formative impact of a contemplative Enneagram retreat for students at Western Theological Seminary. You were selected because you participated in the FR 101 Retreat for Christian Formation in January 2015. We ask that you read this form and ask any questions you may have before agreeing to be part of the focus group. This study is being conducted by me, Pam Bush, as part of my doctor of ministry (D.Min.) research at Western Theological Seminary.

Purpose of the Study:
The purpose of the study is to explore the impact of a contemplative Enneagram retreat in laying a foundation for seminary students to become better connected with God, themselves and others.

Procedure:
If you agree to be part of the focus group, I will use the information you contribute as data for this study. The session will be audio recorded and then transcribed. Your responses will be reported anonymously.

Risks of Participation in the Study:
I have contracted with fellow student, Jenna Harms, to be the research assistant for this study. Jenna will not be asked to transcribe the focus group recordings, so the data will come to her anonymously, but since Jenna is your classmate and was a participant in the retreat, it may be possible for her to identify from whom some of the comments originated.

Benefits of Participation in the Study
Participating in this focus group affords you an opportunity for further reflection on the Enneagram. You will have the opportunity to give input about the formative potential of the Enneagram. Your participation will help to shape the formation process at WTS.

Confidentiality:
The records for this study will be kept confidential. None of the records will become part of any of Western Theological Seminary’s evaluative processes. I will not include information that will identify you. Only my research assistant, Jenna Harms and I will work with the raw data. The data will be kept for five years after the compilation of the project (May 2023). While I will make every effort to maintain confidentiality, anonymity cannot be completely guaranteed due to the small number of participants.
Voluntary Nature of the Study:
Your agreement to participation in the focus group is voluntary and your decision about whether to participate will not affect your current or future relations with Western Theological Seminary. Likewise, at any point you can choose to withdraw from participation.

Contact Information
The researcher initiating this study is Pam Bush. You may ask whatever questions you have about the research now or in the future. I can be reached via email at pam@westernsem.edu or via cell phone at 616-283-7755.

Statement of Consent:
I have read the above information and have received answers to any questions I asked. I consent to participate in the study. I consent to allow use of my direct quotes, anonymously, in the published thesis document.

Signature _______________________________________________________

Printed name ______________________________________________________

Date _____________________________________________________________
Appendix H
Resources for Learning More about the Enneagram

Introduction to the Enneagram


(Briefly introduces to the Enneagram and the types, beginning with a self-inventory to help determine type)


(Introduces types as well as other facets of the Enneagram)


(Playfully introduces the Enneagram with easy-read text, cartoons, and inventories)

[www.9types.com/](http://www.9types.com/)

(Offers type information, inventories, and resources)

Digging Deeper into the Nuances of the Enneagram


(Encompasses the various facets of the Enneagram with clarity, utilizing helpful charts and illustrations)


(Comprehensively outlines each of the nine types specifically related to dominant instincts)

[www.enneagraminstitute.com/](http://www.enneagraminstitute.com/)

(Offers information, type inventories, workshops, and other resources including ‘Ennea Thought for the Day,’ a type-specific daily email, which consists of one or two sentences that challenge and/or encourage people according to their type)
The Enneagram and Christianity/Spirituality

(Frames the Enneagram specifically within Christian understanding)

Maitri, Sandra. *The Spiritual Dimension of the Enneagram: Nine Faces of the Soul* (Emphasizes spiritual essence and development related to each of the types)

(Explores the three basic spiritual pathways of the Enneagram)

(Provides self-statements for growth according to enneagram type)

(Provides a biblical framework for the enneagram as well as type specific spiritual disciplines)

The Enneagram in Roles and Relationships

(Considers how specific Enneagram types interact in relationships)

(Focuses on work relationships related to enneagram type)

(Considers the influence and potential of the types in leadership)
Bibliography

Augustine. *Sermon 52. c.6, 16, PL38.*

Augustine. *St. Augustine's Confessions.* Lib 1,1-2,2.5,5: CSEL 33, 1-5.


Calvin, John; John T. McNeill [Editor]; Ford Lewis Battles [Translator], *Calvin:*


Kushner, Rabbi Lawrence. *Eyes Remade for Wonder: A Lawrence Kushner Reader*. 369

_________. *God Was In this Place, &I, I Did Not Know*. Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 1994.


Riso, Don Richard, and Russ Hudson and The Enneagram Institute Faculty. Enneagram


